



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
The National Assembly for Wales**

**Cofnod y Trafodion
The Record of Proceedings**

**Dydd Mercher, 27 Mehefin 2012
Wednesday, 27 June 2012**

Cynnwys
Contents

3	Ethol Dirprwy Lywydd Dros Dro Election of Temporary Deputy Presiding Officer
3	Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Questions to the Minister for Health and Social Services
28	Cwestiynau i Weinidog yr Amgylchedd a Datblygu Cynaliadwy Questions to the Minister for Environment and Sustainable Development
48	Cwestiynau i Gomisiwn y Cynulliad Questions to the Assembly Commission
52	Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Materion Cyfansoddiadol a Deddfwriaethol ar Roi Pwerau i Weinidogion Cymru yn Neddfau'r DU The Constitutional and Legislative Affairs Committee's Report on Powers Granted to Welsh Ministers in UK Laws
75	Ymchwiliad y Pwyllgor Plant a Phobl Ifanc i Weithredu Mesur Dysgu a Sgiliau (Cymru) 2009 The Children and Young People Committee's Inquiry into the Implementation of the Learning and Skills (Wales) Measure 2009
95	Dadl y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig: Iechyd Welsh Conservatives Debate: Health
123	Cyfnod Pleidleisio Voting Time

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynnddi. Yn y golofn dde, cynhwysir trawsgrifiad o'r cyfieithu ar y pryd.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken. The right-hand column contains a transcription of the simultaneous interpretation.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 1.30 p.m. gyda'r Dirprwy Lywydd (David Melding) yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 1.30 p.m. with the Deputy Presiding Officer (David Melding) in the Chair.*

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Dyma ddechrau National Assembly for Wales is now in trafodion Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru. session.

Ethol Dirprwy Lywydd Dros Dro Election of Temporary Deputy Presiding Officer

The Deputy Presiding Officer: In the absence of the Presiding Officer, I ask the Assembly to elect a temporary Deputy Presiding Officer for the duration of today's Plenary meeting. Therefore, I invite nominations.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Yn absenoldeb y Llywydd, gofynnaf i'r Cynulliad ethol Dirprwy Lywydd dros dro ar gyfer Cyfarfod Llawn heddiw. Felly, rwyf yn gwahodd enwebiadau.

Sandy Mewies: I nominate Peter Black.

Sandy Mewies: Rwyf yn enwebu Peter Black.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I therefore declare that Peter Black is elected as temporary Deputy Presiding Officer for the duration of today's Plenary meeting.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Rwyf yn datgan felly fod Peter Black wedi ei ethol yn Ddirprwy Lywydd Dros Dro ar gyfer Cyfarfod Llawn heddiw.

Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Questions to the Minister for Health and Social Services

GIG

I. Mohammad Asghar: *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am berfformiad y GIG yn ne-ddwyrain Cymru. OAQ(4)0136(HSS)*

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Lesley Griffiths): The national health service is working collaboratively across Wales to deliver services and improvements to meet the standards set out in a challenging financial climate.

Mohammad Asghar: Thank you very much for that reply, Minister. You are on record as promising to all but eliminate the problem of patients facing a long wait for trauma and orthopaedic treatment by March 2012. In the Aneurin Bevan Local Health Board area, over 1,500 patients have been waiting for treatment for longer than 26 weeks. According to the latest figures for April 2012, that is out of a total of over 13,000 patients.

NHS

I. Mohammad Asghar: *Will the Minister make a statement on the performance of the NHS in south east Wales. OAQ(4)0136(HSS)*

Y Gweinidog Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Lesley Griffiths): Mae'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yn gweithio'n gydweithredol ledled Cymru i ddarparu gwasanaethau a gwelliannau er mwyn bodloni'r safonau a bennwyd mewn hinsawdd ariannol heriol.

Mohammad Asghar: Diolch yn fawr iawn am yr ymateb hwnnw, Weinidog. Ceir cofnod ohonoch yn addo cael gwared bron yn llwyr â phroblem cleifion yn wynebu cyfnod hir o aros am driniaeth orthopedig a thriniaeth ar gyfer trawma, a hynny erbyn mis Mawrth 2012. Yn ardal Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Aneurin Bevan, mae mwy na 1,500 o gleifion wedi bod yn aros am driniaeth am fwy na 26 wythnos. Yn ôl y ffigurau diweddaraf ar

What action does the Minister intend to take to meet the promise to eliminate this problem, albeit belatedly?

Lesley Griffiths: The Member will be aware that £63 million of additional funding was put into orthopaedic services, which has greatly improved waiting times across Wales, so that no patient, at the end of March this year, was waiting for over 26 weeks.

Lindsay Whittle: In your manifesto, one of the key pledges was to extend the opening hours of general practitioner surgeries, yet recently released figures from the Government show that only 70% of GP practices in the Aneurin Bevan health board area were open for at least 95% of their core hours. That was actually one of the better health boards in Wales. Given that low starting base, do you accept that you will not be able to fulfil that manifesto pledge in the Aneurin Bevan health board area, let alone anywhere else in Wales, without significantly more resources and/or a renegotiation of the general medical services contract?

Lesley Griffiths: No, I do not accept that. I certainly will not be renegotiating the contract. We have made a significant amount of improvement in GP access and we will continue to do so. It is a manifesto pledge and it is in our programme for government. By the end of this term, I expect to see a huge improvement in access to GP surgeries.

Clefyd Rhwystrol Cronig yr Ysgyfaint

2. Sandy Mewies: *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am nifer y bobl yng Nghymru sydd wedi cael diagnosis eu bod yn dioddef o Glefyd Rhwystrol Cronig yr Ysgyfaint. OAQ(4)0146(HSS)*

Lesley Griffiths: There were approximately 65,000 patients recorded on the quality outcomes framework chronic obstructive pulmonary disease register in Wales in 2010-11. This equates to approximately 2% of the

gyfer Ebrill 2012, mae hynny allan o gyfanswm o fwy na 13,000 o gleifion. Pa gamau y mae'r Gweinidog yn bwriadu eu cymryd i wireddu'r addewid i ddileu'r broblem hon, er ei bod yn hwyr yn y dydd?

Lesley Griffiths: Bydd yr Aelod yn gwybod y darparwyd £63 miliwn o gyllid ychwanegol ar gyfer gwasanaethau orthopedig, a wnaeth wella amseroedd aros yn fawr ledled Cymru, fel nad oedd dim un claf, ddiwedd Mawrth eleni, yn aros mwy na 26 wythnos.

Lindsay Whittle: Un o'r prif addewidion yn eich maniffesto oedd ymestyn oriau agor meddygfeydd meddygon teulu, ac eto mae ffigurau a ryddhawyd yn ddiweddar gan y Llywodraeth yn dangos mai dim ond 70 y cant o bractisau meddygon teulu yn ardal Bwrdd Iechyd Aneurin Bevan oedd ar agor am o leiaf 95 y cant o'u horiau craidd. Roedd y bwrdd iechyd hwnnw mewn gwirionedd yn un o'r byrddau iechyd gorau yng Nghymru. Gan gofio'r man cychwyn isel hwnnw, a ydych yn derbyn na fyddwch yn gallu bodloni'r addewid hwnnw sydd yn y maniffesto yn ardal Bwrdd Iechyd Aneurin Bevan, heb sôn am unrhyw le arall yng Nghymru, heb gryn dipyn yn rhagor o adnoddau a/neu ail-drafod y contract gwasanaethau meddygol cyffredinol?

Lesley Griffiths: Na, nid wyf yn derbyn hynny. Ni fyddaf fi'n bendant yn ail-drafod y contract. Rydym wedi gwella cryn dipyn ar fynediad at feddygon teulu, a byddwn yn parhau i wneud hynny. Mae'n un o addewidion y maniffesto, ac yn ein rhaglen lywodraethu. Erbyn diwedd y tymor hwn, rwyf yn disgwyl gweld gwelliant mawr o ran mynediad at feddygfeydd meddygon teulu.

Chronic Obstructive Pulmonary Disease

2. Sandy Mewies: *Will the Minister make a statement on the number of people in Wales diagnosed as suffering from Chronic Obstructive Pulmonary Disease. OAQ(4)0146(HSS)*

Lesley Griffiths: Yn 2010-11, roedd oddeutu 65,000 o gleifion ar gofrestr clefyd rhwystrol cronig yr ysgyfaint y Fframwaith Ansawdd a Chanlyniadau yng Nghymru. Mae hyn yn cyfateb i oddeutu 2 y cant o boblogaeth

population of Wales.

Sandy Mewies: I am sure that you are aware that a new report from the British Lung Foundation has found further evidence demonstrating links between smoking cannabis and a range of lung and respiratory conditions, which include lung cancer. However, the research also revealed that a third of the population still do not think that cannabis is harmful. Therefore, with one in five 15-year-olds in Wales saying that they have used the drug, would you consider a public awareness campaign on the dangers of smoking cannabis?

Lesley Griffiths: You are probably aware that we jointly fund, with the four Welsh police forces, an all-Wales substance misuse education programme in 97% of primary and secondary schools across Wales. Education on the dangers of cannabis is a key part of that programme. I will ensure that the research, to which you referred, is made available to the project co-ordinator, so that lesson plans can be updated appropriately. We should also consider using the social networking pages of the Dan 24/7 website, which I am sure that you are aware of, to raise awareness of this important issue.

Janet Finch-Saunders: Thank you for your answer, Minister. In relation to the 65,000 patients you just mentioned, that is an increase of 2000 from 2009-10. Given the increase in such a debilitating condition, and the fact that the British Lung Foundation has highlighted its belief that community pharmacists have a vital role to play in supporting patients with this condition, what precise measures are you taking to ensure that community pharmacists address this condition and that all aspects of delivery are fully integrated into COPD plans?

Lesley Griffiths: Community pharmacists obviously have a vital role to play in primary care. COPD is a chronic condition, and people with chronic conditions are probably

Cymru.

Sandy Mewies: Rwyf yn siŵr eich bod yn ymwybodol bod adroddiad newydd gan Sefydliad Prydeinig yr Ysgyfaint wedi dod o hyd i ragor o dystiolaeth sy'n dangos y cysylltiad rhwng ysmegu canabis ac ystod o gyflyrau sy'n ymwneud ag anadlu a'r ysgyfaint, gan gynnwys canser yr ysgyfaint. Fodd bynnag, roedd yr ymchwil hefyd yn dangos bod traean o'r boblogaeth yn dal ddim yn credu bod canabis yn niweidiol. Felly, gydag un o bob pum plentyn 15 mlwydd oed yng Nghymru yn dweud ei fod wedi defnyddio'r cyffur, a fyddech yn ystyried ymgyrch i godi ymwybyddiaeth y cyhoedd am beryglon ysmegu canabis?

Lesley Griffiths: Mae'n siŵr eich bod yn ymwybodol ein bod, gyda phedwar heddlu Cymru, yn cyd-gyllido rhaglen addysg ym maes camddefnyddio sylweddau ar gyfer Cymru gyfan, yn 97 y cant o ysgolion cynradd ac uwchradd Cymru. Mae addysg ar beryglon canabis yn rhan allweddol o'r rhaglen honno. Byddaf yn rhoi sicrwydd bod yr ymchwil yr oeddech yn cyfeirio ati yn cael ei darparu i gydlynnydd y prosiect, er mwyn gallu diweddarau'r cynlluniau gwers yn briodol. Dylem hefyd ystyried defnyddio'r tudalennau rhwydweithio cymdeithasol ar wefan Dan 24/7—gwefan yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn gwybod amdani—er mwyn codi ymwybyddiaeth o'r mater pwysig hwn.

Janet Finch-Saunders: Diolch ichi am eich ateb, Weinidog. O ran y 65,000 o gleifion rydych newydd sôn amdanynt, mae hynny'n 2000 o gynnydd o 2009-10. O ystyried y cynnydd mewn cyflwr mor wanychol, a'r ffaith bod Sefydliad Prydeinig yr Ysgyfaint wedi dweud ei fod o'r farn bod gan fferyllwyr cymunedol rôl hollbwysig i'w chwarae wrth gefnogi cleifion â'r cyflwr hwn, pa fesurau penodol rydych yn eu cymryd i sicrhau bod fferyllwyr cymunedol yn rhoi sylw i'r cyflwr hwn a bod pob agwedd ar gyflwyno yn cael ei chynnwys yn llawn mewn cynlluniau clefyd rhwystrol cronig yr ysgyfaint?

Lesley Griffiths: Yn amlwg, mae gan fferyllwyr cymunedol rôl hollbwysig o ran gofal sylfaenol. Mae clefyd rhwystrol cronig yr ysgyfaint yn gyflwr cronig, ac mae'n

the main users of the NHS in Wales, so the more that we can keep out of hospitals, the better. There is this cycle that I would very much like to break of a patient with a chronic condition going into hospital, getting better and then having a relapse and going back into hospital. Community pharmacists can have a huge role to play in keeping people with this condition out of hospital and treated in the community.

Rebecca Evans: What plans does the Welsh Government have to increase the number of people who have access to pulmonary rehabilitation, via initiatives such as telehealth?

Lesley Griffiths: I thank the Member for the question. Telehealth and telemedicine fit very well with the commitments made in 'Together for Health' and the programme for government, supporting people to manage their own health at home or closer to home. We are very keen to explore both of these for people with all conditions right across Wales. You will have heard my answer to Janet Finch-Saunders about keeping people out of hospitals and breaking that cycle for patients with chronic conditions. We have not yet determined our strategy for telehealth and telemedicine in Wales, but we are exploring how we can maximise their positive impact, particularly through the rural health plan, which I know you will be particularly interested in, which is looking at ways of expanding the use of both telemedicine and telehealth to improve access to care closer to home.

Lindsay Whittle: Minister, you have already said that COPD is one of the most serious respiratory conditions people can have. In an emergency, people need treatment fast. You will no doubt be aware that the University of Sheffield's study into the relationship between distance from hospital and mortality found that a 10 km increase in distance is associated with around a 1% increase in mortality. What assessment have you made, therefore, of the effects that the so-called centralisation of services will have on COPD mortality rates?

debyg mai pobl â chyflyrau cronig yw prif ddefnyddwyr y GIG yng Nghymru, felly po fwyaf o bobl y gallwn eu cadw allan o ysbytai, gorau oll. Ceir enghreifftiau o gleifion â chyflwr cronig yn mynd i'r ysbyty, yn gwella ac yna'n cael ail bwl o salwch a mynd yn ôl i mewn i'r ysbyty. Mae hwn yn gylch y byddwn yn hoffi ei dorri yn fawr iawn. Gall fferyllwyr cymunedol fod â rôl fawr i'w chwarae wrth gadw pobl â'r cyflwr hwn allan o'r ysbyty a'u trin yn y gymuned.

Rebecca Evans: Pa gynlluniau sydd gan Lywodraeth Cymru i gynyddu nifer y bobl sydd â mynediad at wasanaethau adsefydlu cleifion yr ysgyfaint, drwy gyfrwng mentrau fel teleiechyd?

Lesley Griffiths: Diolch i'r Aelod am y cwestiwn. Mae teleiechyd a thelefeddygaeth yn cyd-fynd yn dda iawn â'r ymrwymadau a wnaed yn 'Law yn Llaw at Iechyd' a'r rhaglen lywodraethu, gan gynorthwyo pobl i reoli eu hiechyd eu hunain yn eu cartrefi neu'n nes at eu cartrefi. Rydym yn awyddus iawn i edrych ar y ddau o'r rhain ar gyfer pobl â phob un o'r cyflyrau ledled Cymru. Byddwch wedi clywed fy ateb i Janet Finch-Saunders am gadw pobl allan o ysbytai a thorri'r cylch hwnnw ar gyfer cleifion â chyflyrau cronig. Nid ydym wedi penderfynu eto ar ein strategaeth ar gyfer teleiechyd a thelefeddygaeth yng Nghymru, ond rydym yn ystyried sut y gallwn fanteisio i'r eithaf ar eu heffaith gadarnhaol, yn enwedig drwy'r cynllun iechyd gwledig—y gwn y bydd gennych ddiddordeb arbennig ynddo—sy'n edrych ar ffyrdd o ddefnyddio mwy ar defeddygaeth a theleiechyd i wella mynediad at ofal yn nes at gartrefi pobl.

Lindsay Whittle: Weinidog, rydych eisoes wedi dweud bod clefyd rhwystrrol cronig yr ysgyfaint yn un o'r cyflyrau anadlol mwyaf difrifol y gall pobl ei gael. Mewn argyfwng, mae angen triniaeth ar bobl, a hynny'n gyflym. Mae'n siŵr y gwyddoch fod astudiaeth Prifysgol Sheffield i'r berthynas rhwng pellter o'r ysbyty a marwolaethau yn dangos bod cynnydd o 10 km yn y pellter yn golygu oddeutu 1 y cant o gynnydd yn nifer y marwolaethau. Pa asesiad rydych wedi'i wneud felly o'r effaith y bydd yr hyn a elwir yn ganoli gwasanaethau yn ei chael ar gyfraddau marwolaethau sy'n gysylltiedig â

chlefyd rhwystrol cronig yr ysgyfaint?

Lesley Griffiths: I am on record as saying that I do not want to see all services centralised. I want patients to have services closer to home, but we all have to accept that some specialist services will have to be provided centrally, and officials will be monitoring that. The national clinical forum will look at that as reconfiguration plans are put forward.

Lesley Griffiths: Ceir cofnod ohonof yn dweud nad wyf am weld yr holl wasanaethau'n cael eu canoli. Rwyf am i gleifion gael gwasanaethau'n nes at eu cartrefi, ond rhaid i bob un ohonom dderbyn y bydd yn rhaid i rai gwasanaethau arbenigol gael eu darparu'n ganolog, a bydd swyddogion yn monitro hynny. Bydd y Fforwm Clinigol Cenedlaethol yn edrych ar hynny wrth i gynlluniau ad-drefnu gael eu cyflwyno.

Gwasanaethau Iechyd yng Ngorllewin De Cymru

Health Services in South Wales West

3. Suzy Davies: *A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am y camau y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn eu cymryd i wella gwasanaethau iechyd yng Ngorllewin De Cymru. OAQ(4)0148(HSS)*

3. Suzy Davies: *Will the Minister provide an update on the actions the Welsh Government is taking to improve health services in South Wales West. OAQ(4)0148(HSS)*

Lesley Griffiths: Our proposals for the future of the NHS across Wales are set out in 'Together for Health' and in our programme for government.

Lesley Griffiths: Mae ein cynigion ar gyfer dyfodol y GIG ar hyd a lled Cymru wedi eu nodi yn 'Law yn Llaw at Iechyd' ac yn ein rhaglen lywodraethu.

Suzy Davies: As you know, the Abertawe Bro Morgannwg University Local Health Board recently launched a consultation on a major reorganisation of services in South Wales West. Those plans seem to include the downgrading of the accident and emergency service at the Princess of Wales Hospital in Bridgend, which would mean that patients in the region would need to travel to Morriston Hospital, which already sees long waiting times. What consideration was given to the capacity at Morriston before those plans were drafted, particularly with the additional anticipated pressure coming from Llanelli?

Suzy Davies: Fel y gwyddoch, yn ddiweddar, mae Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Prifysgol Abertawe Bro Morgannwg wedi lansio ymgynghoriad ar ad-drefnu gwasanaethau'n helaeth yng Ngorllewin De Cymru. I bob golwg, mae'r cynlluniau hynny'n cynnwys israddio'r gwasanaeth damweiniau ac achosion brys yn Ysbyty Tywysoges Cymru ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr. Golyga hynny y byddai angen i gleifion yn y rhanbarth deithio i Ysbyty Treforys, lle mae'r amseroedd aros eisoes yn hir. Pa ystyriaeth a roddwyd i'r capasiti yn Nhreforys cyn i'r cynlluniau hynny gael eu llunio, yn enwedig gyda'r pwysau ychwanegol a ragwelir o Lanelli?

Lesley Griffiths: You have had sight of plans that I have not seen. South Wales is obviously a very complex area. There are four health boards working together, as well as working with Powys. I just mentioned the national clinical forum, which will be looking very closely at those plans. Those plans will be out for consultation a little later than those for Hywel Dda and Betsi Cadwaladr health boards, because of the complex issue of the

Lesley Griffiths: Rydych chi wedi cael golwg ar gynlluniau nad wyf fi wedi'u gweld. Mae De Cymru yn amlwg yn ardal gymhleth iawn. Mae pedwar bwrdd iechyd yn gweithio gyda'i gilydd, ac yn gweithio gyda Phowys hefyd. Rwyf newydd grybwyll y Fforwm Clinigol Cenedlaethol, a fydd yn edrych yn ofalus iawn ar y cynlluniau hynny. Bydd y cynlluniau hynny'n destun ymgynghori ychydig yn hwyrach na'r rhai ar gyfer

four health boards working together, along with Powys, as I said. Once those plans have come forward, we can see what services will be suggested, but I certainly do not want to see any downgrading of any services.

Bethan Jenkins: Minister, when I questioned you about Neath Port Talbot Hospital services on 23 May, you told us that,

‘I can reassure you that there will be no downgrading, because I do not want to see any downgrading of services.’

You said that you had received assurances from the chairman of Abertawe Bro Morgannwg health board that that was the case, but, the following day, I received a letter from the chief executive of the board, in which he confirmed that some changes to bed configuration and service provision within Neath Port Talbot were being proposed this year, and added that further changes will also need to be made beyond 2012-13. Can you provide me with what you understand to be the definition of ‘downgrading’?

Lesley Griffiths: Services are going to change; there are no two ways about it. If we want to see an improvement in services, we all have to accept that there are going to be changes. I am very pleased that the chief executive set that out to you. I do not want to see any downgrading. What do I mean by that? I do not want to see services get worse. Upgrading means services getting better and I would have thought that that is what all of us would want to see, right across Wales.

Mike Hedges: On a more positive note, I thank the Minister for the substantial investment that has already taken place at Morriston Hospital. Would she outline what further developments are due to take place there?

Lesley Griffiths: Thank you for that

Byrddau Iechyd Hywel Dda a Betsi Cadwaladr, gan fod y pedwar bwrdd iechyd yn gweithio gyda'i gilydd, ynghyd â Phowys, fel y dywedais, a bod hynny'n gymhleth. Pan fydd y cynlluniau hynny wedi cael eu cyflwyno, gallwn weld pa wasanaethau fydd yn cael eu hawgrymu, ond yn sicr nid wyf am weld unrhyw wasanaethau'n cael eu hisraddio.

Bethan Jenkins: Weinidog, pan wnes eich holi ynghylch gwasanaethau Ysbyty Castell-nedd Port Talbot ar 23 Mai, dyma beth ddywedoch wrthym:

‘Gallaf eich sicrhau na fydd unrhyw israddio yn digwydd, oherwydd nid wyf am weld unrhyw wasanaethau'n cael eu hisraddio.’

Gwnaethoch ddweud eich bod wedi cael sicrwydd gan gadeirydd Bwrdd Iechyd Abertawe Bro Morgannwg mai dyna oedd yr achos. Fodd bynnag, y diwrnod canlynol, cefais lythyr gan brif weithredwr y bwrdd. Yn y llythyr hwnnw, roedd yn cadarnhau bod newidiadau'n cael eu cynnig eleni o ran addrefnu gwelyau a darpariaeth gwasanaethau o fewn Castell-nedd Port Talbot, ac ychwanegodd y bydd angen gwneud newidiadau pellach hefyd y tu hwnt i 2012-13. A allwch ddweud wrthyf beth yw eich diffiniad chi o ‘israddio’?

Lesley Griffiths: Mae gwasanaethau'n mynd i newid; nid oes amheuaeth am hynny. Os ydym am weld gwasanaethau'n gwella, rhaid inni i gyd dderbyn bod newidiadau'n mynd i ddigwydd. Rwyf yn falch iawn bod y prif weithredwr wedi dweud hynny wrthyf. Nid wyf am weld unrhyw israddio. Beth rwyf fi'n ei olygu wrth hynny? Nid wyf am weld gwasanaethau'n mynd yn waeth. Mae uwchraddio'n golygu gwasanaethau'n gwella, a byddwn yn meddwl mai dyna beth fyddai pob un ohonom am ei weld, ar hyd a lled Cymru.

Mike Hedges: Ar nodyn mwy cadarnhaol, hoffwn ddiolch i'r Gweinidog am y buddsoddiad sylweddol sydd eisoes wedi digwydd yn Ysbyty Treforys. A wnaiff hi ddweud pa ddatblygiadau pellach fydd yn digwydd yno?

Lesley Griffiths: Diolch am y cwestiwn

question. The key role of Morriston in ABMU's overall service strategy is set out in its five-year plan. The investment in the scheme to which you referred—redevelopment phase 1B—has included £63 million, and we have invested heavily in that. It will redevelop the main entrance, improve clinical accommodation for out-patient renal dialysis, endoscopy and maxillofacial services, and it will also provide a new education centre. The full business case for the capital investment was submitted on 1 June and is going through the normal approval process for further improvement.

Peter Black: You will be aware of the recent publicity about autism, and you may also know that the Government-commissioned children's diagnostic services report identified that, in ABMU, there was no tertiary or specialist diagnostic service and no routine reporting of diagnostic case times. My casework has also found that there is no specialist in autism in Wales, and that anyone requiring a specialist diagnosis has to leave Wales to receive that. In light of these facts, what concrete actions have been undertaken since the publication of the ASD strategic action plan in 2008 that have to lead to improvements in diagnostic services?

Lesley Griffiths: You will be aware that the Deputy Minister for Children and Social Services has been very clear that access to services is not always dependent on the same things. She fully expects professionals to ensure that families receive the appropriate support at the right time. Work is ongoing, as you are aware, to improve diagnosis for both children and adults, but there has to be greater consistency in its application across Wales.

Canlyniadau Iechyd

4. Paul Davies: *Beth y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn ei wneud i wella canlyniadau*

hwnnw. Mae rôl allweddol Treforys yn strategaeth gwasanaethau cyffredinol Prifysgol Abertawe Bro Morgannwg wedi'i nodi yn y cynllun pum mlynedd. Mae'r buddsoddiad yn y cynllun y gwnaethoch gyfeirio ato—cam ailddatblygu 1B—wedi cynnwys £63 miliwn, ac rydym wedi buddsoddi'n sylweddol yn hynny. Bydd yn ailddatblygu'r brif fynedfa, yn gwella llety clinigol ar gyfer cleifion allanol sy'n cael dialysis arenol, gwasanaethau endosgopi a gwasanaethau gê'n ac wyneb, ac yn darparu canolfan addysg newydd hefyd. Cyflwynwyd yr achos busnes llawn ar gyfer y buddsoddiad cyfalaf ar 1 Mehefin, ac mae'n mynd drwy'r broses gymeradwyo arferol ar gyfer gwelliannau pellach.

Peter Black: Byddwch yn ymwybodol o'r cyhoeddusrwydd diweddar am awtistiaeth, ac efallai y byddwch hefyd yn gwybod bod yr adroddiad a gomisiynwyd gan y Llywodraeth ynghylch gwasanaethau diagnostig plant yn dangos nad oedd dim gwasanaeth diagnostig trydyddol nac arbenigol, a dim adroddiadau rheolaidd am amseroedd achosion diagnostig, ym Mhrifysgol Abertawe Bro Morgannwg. Mae fy ngwaith achos hefyd wedi canfod nad oes dim arbenigedd mewn awtistiaeth yng Nghymru, a bod unrhyw un sydd angen diagnosis arbenigol yn gorfod gadael Cymru i dderbyn hynny. Yn wyneb y ffeithiau hyn, pa gamau pendant sydd wedi cael eu cymryd ers cyhoeddi'r cynllun gweithredu strategol ar gyfer anhwylderau yn y sbectrwm awtistig yn 2008 sydd wedi arwain at welliannau mewn gwasanaethau diagnostig?

Lesley Griffiths: Byddwch yn ymwybodol bod y Dirprwy Weinidog Plant a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol wedi dweud yn glir iawn nad yw mynediad at wasanaethau bob amser yn dibynnu ar yr un pethau. Mae hi'n llawn ddisgwyl i weithwyr proffesiynol sicrhau bod teuluoedd yn cael y cymorth priodol ar yr adeg briodol. Mae gwaith yn mynd rhagddo, fel y gwyddoch, i wella diagnosis ar gyfer plant ac oedolion, ond rhaid cael mwy o gysondeb yn y modd y gweithredir hyn drwy Gymru.

Health Outcomes

4. Paul Davies: *What is the Welsh Government doing to improve health*

iechyd i bobl Cymru. OAQ(4)0138(HSS)

outcomes for the people of Wales. OAQ(4)0138(HSS)

Lesley Griffiths: Our plans and priorities for the health service for the whole of Wales can be found in our programme for government.

Lesley Griffiths: Mae ein cynlluniau a'n blaenoriaethau ar gyfer y gwasanaeth iechyd drwy Gymru gyfan i'w gweld yn ein rhaglen lywodraethu.

Paul Davies: I am grateful to the Minister for that answer. Surely positive health outcomes are dependent on health services being delivered locally. It is clear from my postbag that people in Pembrokeshire are worried about the future of services at Withybush General Hospital, as was demonstrated by Pembrokeshire residents outside this place today. Hywel Dda health board will now start its next consultation process on 6 August, in the middle of a holiday period. Does the Minister agree that continuing to provide local health services in Pembrokeshire will improve patient outcomes? Does she also agree that starting a consultation process in the middle of the holiday period is at best unhelpful and inconsiderate?

Paul Davies: Rwyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Gweinidog am yr ateb hwnnw. Heb os nac oni bai, mae canlyniadau iechyd cadarnhaol yn ddibynnol ar wasanaethau iechyd yn cael eu darparu'n lleol. Mae'n amlwg o fy mag post fod pobl sir Benfro yn poeni am ddyfodol gwasanaethau yn Ysbyty Cyffredinol Llwynhelyg, fel y dangoswyd gan drigolion sir Benfro y tu allan i'r fan hon heddiw. Bydd Bwrdd Iechyd Hywel Dda yn dechrau ar ei broses ymgynghori nesaf ar 6 Awst, yng nghanol cyfnod o wyliau. A yw'r Gweinidog yn cytuno y bydd parhau i ddarparu gwasanaethau iechyd lleol yn sir Benfro yn gwella'r canlyniadau i gleifion? A yw hi hefyd yn cytuno bod cychwyn proses ymgynghori yng nghanol y gwyliau yn anfuddiol ac yn anystyriol ar y gorau?

Lesley Griffiths: I do not see it as unhelpful and inconsiderate. You have to remember that it is a 12-week process, so that includes all of August, September and October—three months. We have had a lot of pre-consultation engagement with Hywel Dda health board. Only yesterday I announced funding of £7.5 million for a 21-station renal dialysis unit in the hospital grounds, which is something that you have campaigned for, along with colleagues, so I am sure that you will welcome that. [*Interruption.*]

Lesley Griffiths: Nid yw'n anfuddiol nac yn anystyriol yn fy marn i. Rhaid ichi gofio ei bod yn broses 12 wythnos, felly mae hynny'n cynnwys Awst, Medi a Hydref i gyd—tri mis. Rydym wedi cael llawer o gyswllt cyn-ymgysylltu gyda Bwrdd Iechyd Hywel Dda. Dim ond ddoe, cyhoeddais £7.5 miliwn o gyllid ar gyfer uned dialysis arenol 21 gorsaf ar dir yr ysbyty. Mae hynny'n rhywbeth rydych wedi bod yn ymgyrchu drosto, ynghyd â'ch cyd-Aelodau, felly rwyf yn siŵr y byddwch yn croesawu hynny. [*Torri ar draws.*]

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. You have had your chance. William Graham is next.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Rydych wedi cael eich cyfle. William Graham sydd nesaf.

William Graham: To improve health outcomes for people in Wales we have to address levels of ill health arising from major public health concerns—smoking, obesity, excessive drinking, and a lack of regular exercise. Progress in tackling these lifestyle choices is sadly failing to keep pace with the cost of treating the resultant ill health. How do you intend to raise awareness of these

William Graham: Er mwyn gwella canlyniadau iechyd i bobl Cymru, rhaid inni fynd i'r afael â'r lefelau o salwch sy'n deillio o'r prif bryderon sy'n ymwneud ag iechyd y cyhoedd—ysmygu, gordewdra, yfed gormod, a diffyg ymarfer corff rheolaidd. Yn anffodus, nid yw cynnydd wrth fynd i'r afael â dewisiadau pobl ynghylch eu ffordd o fyw yn llwyddo i gadw i fyny â'r gost o drin

problems?

Lesley Griffiths: Public health is very important. Only today we have seen a report from Public Health Wales on smoking, which showed that, last year, 27,700 hospital admissions to NHS Wales were caused by illnesses related to smoking. It is something that is obviously of great concern. It places a huge burden on the NHS.

You mentioned obesity, and one of my concerns is that we have so little control over advertising. I had a discussion with the Chief Medical Officer for Wales this week about the fact that two of the main sponsors of the Olympics are McDonald's and Coca-Cola. We have had McDonald's showing us that the biggest restaurant is going to be built within sight of the Olympic park, and it is very concerning that we have that issue.

You will be aware of the smoking programmes that we have, and it is important that we help people not to start smoking, as well as help to support people to stop smoking.

1.45 p.m.

William Graham: Thank you for that answer, Minister, but may I tackle you again on smoking in general? The report 'Tobacco and Health in Wales', published today, states that 16% of mothers in Wales smoked throughout their pregnancy in 2010, whereas the average in the UK was 12%. Given this unquestionable evidence concerning the detrimental consequences of smoking for foetal and infant development, will the Minister specify a target and a timetable for the reduction of such smoking?

Lesley Griffiths: One in six women continued to smoke in pregnancy. More worryingly, one in three women under the age of 20 who were pregnant continued to smoke. When I was at the University Hospital of Wales on Monday to launch National Breastfeeding Week, I spoke to midwives about this issue. Midwives are

salwch sy'n deillio o hynny. Sut rydych yn bwriadu codi ymwybyddiaeth o'r problemau hyn?

Lesley Griffiths: Mae iechyd y cyhoedd yn bwysig iawn. Dim ond heddiw, rydym wedi gweld adroddiad gan Iechyd Cyhoeddus Cymru ar ysmegu, a oedd yn dangos bod 27,700 o'r derbyniadau i ysbyty yn y GIG yng Nghymru yn deillio o salwch cysylltiedig ag ysmegu y llynedd. Mae'n amlwg yn rhywbeth sy'n destun cryn bryder. Mae'n rhoi andros o faich ar y GIG.

Gwnaethoch sôn am ordewdra, ac un o fy mhryderon yw bod gennym cyn lleied o reolaeth dros hysbysebu. Cefais drafodaeth â Phrif Swyddog Meddygol Cymru yr wythnos hon am y ffaith mai dau o brif noddwyr y Gemau Olympaidd yw McDonald's a Coca-Cola. Mae McDonald's wedi dangos inni fod y bwyty mwyaf yn mynd i gael ei adeiladu o fewn golwg y parc Olympaidd. Mae'n destun pryder ein bod yn wynebu'r mater hwnnw.

Byddwch yn ymwybodol o'r rhaglenni ysmegu sydd gennym, ac mae'n bwysig ein bod yn helpu pobl i beidio â dechrau ysmegu, yn ogystal â helpu i gynorthwyo pobl i roi'r gorau i ysmegu.

William Graham: Diolch am yr ateb hwnnw, Weinidog, ond a gaf fi eich holi eto am ysmegu yn gyffredinol? Mae'r adroddiad 'Tybaco ac Iechyd yng Nghymru', a gyhoeddwyd heddiw, yn dweud bod 16 y cant o famau yng Nghymru wedi ysmegu drwy gyfnod eu beichiogrwydd yn 2010—12 y cant oedd cyfartaledd y DU. O ystyried y dystiolaeth ddiamheuol hon ynghylch canlyniadau niweidiol ysmegu ar ddatblygiad y ffetws a babanod, a wnaiff y Gweinidog bennu targed ac amserlen ar gyfer lleihau lefelau ysmegu o'r fath?

Lesley Griffiths: Parhaodd un o bob chwech o fenywod i ysmegu yn ystod eu beichiogrwydd. Mae'n fwy o destun pryder byth bod un o bob tri o fenywod beichiog o dan 20 oed wedi parhau i ysmegu. Pan oeddwn yn Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru ddydd Llun i lansio Wythnos Genedlaethol Bwydo ar y Fron, siaradais â bydwagedd am y mater

working hard with these groups, particularly with the under 20s, to try to increase awareness of the dangers of smoking. It is something that officials will be monitoring closely.

Elin Jones: In your previous question session a month ago, you told me that you would consider regularly releasing local health boards' risk registers. Have you considered the matter and will you be releasing the risk-register information?

Lesley Griffiths: I have considered the matter very carefully. I was looking at some figures only yesterday. I will be making representations to the chairs of all health boards this week regarding that issue.

Elin Jones: I take it from that answer that you will be asking the local health boards to release the risk-register information. Some health boards have resisted freedom of information requests to release their risk registers. I hope that you are more successful in your advice to local health boards that they should regularly release these risk registers. You and the First Minister have said that you want to see safe services in the NHS in Wales. Given that the NHS is about to start a major consultation on the future of services, how can the public in Wales know which services are safe and which are not, unless these risk registers are released before the consultation begins?

Lesley Griffiths: When I looked into the issue more carefully, I found that some health boards publish them on their websites as a matter of course, but not all do that. I want all of them to put them on their websites as a matter of course.

Kenneth Skates: One issue raised with me in recent casework has been waiting times for cataract surgery. Some patients in my area who were referred by their local general practitioner or optician as urgent cases were subsequently marked as routine cases when they arrived at the hospital. Will you look at

hwn. Mae bydwragedd yn gweithio'n galed gyda'r grwpiau hyn, yn enwedig gyda phobl ifanc o dan 20 oed, i geisio cynyddu ymwybyddiaeth o beryglon ysmegu. Mae'n rhywbeth y bydd swyddogion yn ei fonitro'n ofalus.

Elin Jones: Yn eich sesiwn holi flaenorol fis yn ôl, dywedoch wrthyf y byddech yn ystyried rhyddhau cofrestrau risg byrddau iechyd lleol yn rheolaidd. A ydych wedi ystyried y mater ac a fyddwch yn rhyddhau'r wybodaeth ar gofrestrau risg?

Lesley Griffiths: Rwyf wedi ystyried y mater yn ofalus iawn. Roeddwn yn edrych ar rai ffigurau ddoe ddiwethaf. Byddaf yn gwneud sylwadau i gadeiryddion yr holl fyrddau iechyd yr wythnos hon ynghylch y mater hwnnw.

Elin Jones: Rwyf yn cymryd o'r ateb hwnnw y byddwch yn gofyn i'r byrddau iechyd lleol ryddhau'r wybodaeth sydd ar eu cofrestr risg. Mae rhai byrddau iechyd wedi gwrthod ceisiadau rhyddid gwybodaeth i ryddhau eu cofrestrau risg. Gobeithio y byddwch yn fwy llwyddiannus yn eich cyngor i fyrddau iechyd lleol. Mae arnaf eisiau ichi roi arweiniad i'r byrddau iechyd lleol y dylent ryddhau'r cofrestrau risg hyn yn rheolaidd. Rydych chi a'r Prif Weinidog wedi dweud eich bod am weld gwasanaethau diogel yn y GIG yng Nghymru. Gan gofio bod y GIG ar fin cychwyn ymgynghoriad mawr ar ddyfodol gwasanaethau, sut gall y cyhoedd yng Nghymru wybod pa wasanaethau sy'n ddiogel a pha rai sydd ddim, oni bai fod y cofrestrau risg hyn yn cael eu rhyddhau cyn dechrau'r cyfnod ymgynghori?

Lesley Griffiths: Pan edrychais ar y mater yn fwy gofalus, gwelais fod rhai byrddau iechyd yn eu cyhoeddi ar eu gwefannau fel mater o drefn, ond nid yw pob un yn gwneud hynny. Rwyf am i bob un ohonynt eu rhoi ar eu gwefannau fel mater o drefn.

Kenneth Skates: Un mater a godwyd gyda mi mewn gwaith achos diweddar yw amseroedd aros ar gyfer llawdriniaethau cataractau. Cafodd rhai cleifion yn fy ardal a oedd wedi cael eu cyfeirio gan eu meddyg teulu neu'u hoptegydd lleol fel achosion brys eu nodi fel achosion rheolaidd ar ôl hynny

what we can do to improve waiting times for cataract patients in north Wales and ensure that those in urgent need of advice and treatment are seen as quickly as possible?

Lesley Griffiths: I expect all patients to be seen in order of clinical need. It is up to the clinician, the consultant ophthalmic surgeon, when he gets the referral, to decide whether the case is routine or urgent. However, as I say, I expect all patients to be seen in order of clinical need, within the waiting-time target of 26 weeks. There have been issues in relation to follow-up appointments in Betsi Cadwaladr University Local Health Board, which are being addressed, but that is having a knock-on effect on some waiting times. However, I expect to see improvements over the coming months. We have seen a huge decrease in the length of time that patients are waiting for cataract surgery over the past few years.

Trefniadau Diogelu yn Sir Benfro

5. Joyce Watson: *A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am y camau sydd wedi cael eu cymryd yn dilyn adroddiad Arolygiaeth Gofal a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Cymru am drefniadau diogelu yn Sir Benfro. OAQ(4)0153(HSS)*

The Deputy Minister for Children and Social Services (Gwenda Thomas): On Thursday, we received a response to our letter from Pembrokeshire County Council. We have taken advice from our inspectorates and we have taken advice from and met with our board. Subsequently, the Minister for Education and Skills and I met as Ministers and we have asked for further legal advice. We are considering options for action and we will make a statement when we are ready.

Joyce Watson: Thank you for that answer, Deputy Minister. I am sure that you understand that the people in Pembrokeshire are anxious to receive an update following

wedi iddynt gyrraedd yr ysbyty. A wneuch ystyried beth y gallwn ei wneud i wella amseroedd aros ar gyfer cleifion cataractau yn y gogledd a sicrhau bod y rheini sydd angen cyngor a thriniaeth brys yn cael eu gweld cyn gynted ag y bo modd?

Lesley Griffiths: Rwyf yn disgwyl i bob claf gael ei weld yn ôl ei angen clinigol. Y clinigwr, y llawfeddyg offthalmig ymgynghorol—pan fydd claf yn cael ei gyfeirio ato—sydd yn penderfynu a yw'r achos yn un rheolaidd ynteu'n un brys. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedaf, rwyf yn disgwyl i bob claf gael ei weld yn ôl ei angen clinigol, o fewn y targed ar gyfer amseroedd aros, sef 26 wythnos. Bu problemau mewn perthynas ag apwyntiadau dilynol ym Mwrdd Iechyd Lleol Prifysgol Betsi Cadwaladr, ac mae'r rhain yn cael sylw, ond mae hynny yn ei dro yn effeithio ar rai amseroedd aros. Fodd bynnag, rwyf yn disgwyl gweld gwelliannau dros y misoedd nesaf. Rydym wedi gweld gostyngiad enfawr yn yr amser y mae cleifion yn aros am lawdriniaeth cataractau yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf.

Safeguarding Arrangements in Pembrokeshire

5. Joyce Watson: *Will the Minister provide an update on action undertaken following the Care and Social Services Inspectorate Wales report on safeguarding arrangements in Pembrokeshire. OAQ(4)0153(HSS)*

Y Dirprwy Weinidog Plant a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Gwenda Thomas): Ddydd Iau, cawsom ymateb i'n llythyr gan Gyngor Sir Penfro. Rydym wedi derbyn cyngor gan ein harolygiaethau ac rydym wedi cyfarfod â'n bwrdd ac wedi derbyn cyngor ganddo. Yn dilyn hynny, cyfarfu'r Gweinidog Addysg a Sgiliau a minnau fel Gweinidogion, ac rydym wedi gofyn am ragor o gyngor cyfreithiol. Rydym yn ystyried opsiynau ar gyfer gweithredu, a byddwn yn gwneud datganiad pan fyddwn yn barod.

Joyce Watson: Diolch am yr ateb hwnnw, Ddirprwy Weinidog. Rwyf yn siŵr eich bod yn deall bod pobl sir Benfro yn awyddus i glywed y wybodaeth ddiweddaraf yn dilyn

Jamie Adams's response to the Government last Thursday. My constituents rightly expect local leaders to be held to account if they are found to be failing in the protection of children. I welcome your statement, Deputy Minister, and my question to you is this: as soon as you know the way forward, will you be making a statement to this Chamber?

Gwenda Thomas: We have, throughout the process, kept Members fully informed of our actions. I give that commitment that we will issue a statement to Members in this Chamber.

Paul Davies: A all y Dirprwy Weinidog roi braslun o ba gamau y bydd y Llywodraeth yn eu cymryd yn y dyfodol agos ynghylch y mater hwn? A allwch roi rhyw fath o fraslun inni heddiw?

Gwenda Thomas: Ni allaf wneud hynny ar hyn o bryd. Rydym am weld beth yw'r cyngor cyfreithiol a gweithredu o fewn y cyngor hwnnw.

Rebecca Evans: Deputy Minister, can you tell us what discussions the Welsh Government has had with the children's commissioner regarding safeguarding arrangements in Pembrokeshire?

Gwenda Thomas: The children's commissioner is well aware of the issues in Pembrokeshire. As I have said, we have taken advice since we received the leader's letter, and that included a discussion with the children's commissioner.

Simon Thomas: Diolch am eich datganiad heddiw, Dirprwy Weinidog. Rydym yn gwerthfawrogi'r ffaith eich bod chi a'r Gweinidog Addysg a Sgiliau yn dod i'r Siambr i wneud datganiadau o'r fath. Fy mhryder, o weld yr hyn sy'n digwydd yn sir Benfro ar hyn o bryd, yw nad oes newid diwylliant sylweddol a digonol wedi bod, dim ond symud penolau o sedd i sedd y tu fewn i'r cabinet. Ymhlyg yn y ffordd rydych wedi ateb y cwestiwn heddiw yw'r ffaith nad ydych, fel Gweinidogion, wedi'ch bodloni ag ymateb sir Benfro ychwaith, gan eich bod yn chwilio am gyngor cyfreithiol. A wnewch

ymateb Jamie Adams i'r Llywodraeth ddydd Iau diwethaf. Mae fy etholwyr, a hynny'n briodol, yn disgwyl i arweinwyr lleol gael eu dal yn gyfrifol os canfyddir nad ydynt yn llwyddo i amddiffyn plant. Rwyf yn croesawu eich datganiad, Ddirprwy Weinidog, a hwn yw fy nghwestiwn ichi: cyn gynted ag y byddwch yn gwybod y ffordd ymlaen, a fyddwch yn gwneud datganiad i'r Siambr hon?

Gwenda Thomas: Drwy gydol y broses, rydym wedi sicrhau bod yr Aelodau yn gwbl ymwybodol o'n gweithredoedd. Rwyf yn rhoi'r ymrwymiad hwnnw, y byddwn yn rhoi datganiad i Aelodau yn y Siambr hon.

Paul Davies: Can the Deputy Minister give an outline of what steps the Government will be taking in the near future with regard to the issue? Can you give us an outline today?

Gwenda Thomas: I cannot do so at the moment. We wish to see what the legal advice is and work within that advice.

Rebecca Evans: Ddirprwy Weinidog, a allwch ddweud wrthym pa drafodaethau y mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi eu cael gyda'r comisiynydd plant ynglŷn â threfniadau diogelu yn sir Benfro?

Gwenda Thomas: Mae'r comisiynydd plant yn ymwybodol iawn o'r problemau yn sir Benfro. Fel yr wyf wedi'i ddweud, rydym wedi derbyn cyngor ers inni dderbyn llythyr yr arweinydd, ac roedd hynny'n cynnwys trafodaeth gyda'r comisiynydd plant.

Simon Thomas: Thank you for your statement today, Deputy Minister. We appreciate the fact that you and the Minister for Education and Skills come to the Chamber to make such statements. My concern, from seeing what is happening in Pembrokeshire at present, is that there has not been a fundamental and adequate change in culture, only a shifting of people from one cabinet seat to another. Implicit in the way that you have answered the question today is the fact that you, as Ministers, are not content with the response of Pembrokeshire either, as you seeking legal advice. Will you confirm

gadarnhau nad ydych wedi'ch bodloni â'r ymateb, ac ar y sail honno eich bod yn chwilio am y cyngor pellach hwnnw?

Gwenda Thomas: Mae pryderon yn parhau, ac rydym wedi gofyn am gyngor cyfreithiol, fel y dywedais wrth Paul Davies. Unwaith bydd y cyngor hwnnw wedi dod i law, byddwn yn penderfynu sut mae gweithredu orau.

that you are not content with the response, and that it is on that basis that you are seeking that future advice?

Gwenda Thomas: There are continuing concerns and we have sought legal advice, as I told Paul Davies. Once we have that legal advice, we will decide how best to act.

Nyrsys Arbenigol

6. Antoinette Sandbach: *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am swyddogaeth nyrsys arbenigol yng Ngogledd Cymru. OAQ(4)0147(HSS)*

Lesley Griffiths: Specialist nurses form an integral and important part of health services and I recognise the importance of their role in the NHS in Wales. They provide valuable help and support to some of the most vulnerable people in society in a wide variety of clinical areas.

Antoinette Sandbach: Minister, I am delighted to hear that you recognise the importance of the role of specialist nurses, because there has been understandable concern among patients and families in north Wales that specialist nurses will be replaced by generic specialists, which are not the same thing. What assurances can you give patients and families in north Wales that specialist nurses for conditions such as Parkinson's disease and multiple sclerosis will remain and that the care provided by these nurses will not be sidelined?

Lesley Griffiths: I can give assurances that they will remain and I can also give assurances that there is no target to reduce the numbers of specialist nurses.

Llyr Huws Gruffydd: Mae'r Cyngor Nyrsio a Bydwreigiaeth wedi dweud ei fod am ymgynghori ar godi'r ffi flynyddol i bob nyrs cofrestredig o £76 i £120 y flwyddyn. Nid yw nyrsys cofrestredig yn mwynhau'r cyflogau gorau yn barod, a byddai codi'r ffi yn gyfystyr, mewn gwirionedd, â thoriad cyflog. Yn y dyddiau anodd hyn, yn enwedig o gofio'r trafferthion recriwtio nyrsys i'r GIG,

Specialist Nurses

6. Antoinette Sandbach: *Will the Minister make a statement on the role of specialist nurses in North Wales. OAQ(4)0147(HSS)*

Lesley Griffiths: Mae nyrsys arbenigol yn rhan annatod a phwysig o wasanaethau iechyd ac rwyf yn cydnabod pwysigrwydd eu rôl yn y GIG yng Nghymru. Maent yn darparu cymorth a chefnogaeth werthfawr i rai o'r bobl fwyaf agored i niwed yn y gymdeithas mewn amrywiaeth eang o feysydd clinigol.

Antoinette Sandbach: Weinidog, rwyf yn falch iawn o glywed eich bod yn cydnabod pwysigrwydd rôl nyrsys arbenigol, oherwydd bu pryder dealladwy ymhlith cleifion a theuluoedd yn y gogledd y bydd nyrsys arbenigol yn cael eu disodli gan arbenigwyr generig, sydd ddim yr un peth. Pa sicrwydd y gallwch ei roi i gleifion a theuluoedd yn y gogledd y bydd nyrsys arbenigol ar gyfer cyflyrau fel clefyd Parkinson a sglerosis ymledol yn parhau ac na fydd y gofal a ddarperir gan y nyrsys hyn yn cael ei roi i'r nail ochr?

Lesley Griffiths: Gallaf roi sicrwydd y byddant yn aros, a gallaf roi sicrwydd hefyd nad oes targed i leihau nifer y nyrsys arbenigol.

Llyr Huws Gruffydd: The Nursing and Midwifery Council has said that it is to consult on increasing the annual fee for each registered nurse from £76 to £120 per annum. Registered nurses do not enjoy the most generous wages in any case, and an increase in the fee would be akin to a wage cut. In these difficult times, particularly bearing in mind the difficulties in recruiting nurses to

a wnewch annog y Cyngor Nyrsio a Bydwreigiaeth i wydroi ei benderfyniad?

Lesley Griffiths: Yes. It is something that has been encouraged. My chief nursing officer, Professor Jean White, is having discussions on that issue.

Aled Roberts: Weinidog, rwyf am fynd ar ôl eich ymateb i Antoinette Sandbach ynghylch nyrsys arbenigol. Yng nghyfarfod o'r grŵp trawsbleidiol ar gyflyrau niwrolegol ym mis Ebrill, cafwyd trafodaeth â chynrychiolwyr o Fwrdd Iechyd Lleol Prifysgol Betsi Cadwaladr. Roeddent yn ei wneud yn eithaf plaen, o hyn ymlaen, o dan gyngor Canolfan Walton yn Lerpwl, y byddant ond yn penodi nyrsys generig yn hytrach na nyrsys arbenigol mewn un maes. Hefyd, pan fydd y nyrsys arbenigol sydd wedi'u penodi ar hyn o bryd yn gadael eu swyddi, ni fydd y swyddi hynny yn cael eu llenwi. Beth ydych, fel Llywodraeth, yn mynd i'w wneud lle mae bwrdd iechyd yn gwneud datganiad o'r fath, sy'n mynd yn erbyn yr hyn rydych wedi'i ddweud wrthym yw eich bwriad fel Gweinidog?

Lesley Griffiths: Betsi Cadwaladr University Local Health Board currently employs 214 specialist nurses. As I said, they form an integral and very important part of health services. The health boards are responsible for ensuring that they have the right skills mix. I have not been made aware of the issue that you have raised, but I will talk to the chair of BCU local health board about that issue and write to you.

Sgrinio Serfigol

7. Jenny Rathbone: *Beth y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn ei wneud i gynyddu lefelau sgrinio serfigol. OAQ(4)0137(HSS)*

Lesley Griffiths: The Welsh Government's recently launched cancer delivery plan seeks to cut cancer cases and focuses on better take-up of screening and early diagnosis. Cervical Screening Wales manages the cervical screening programme, working with health boards and others to promote screening and targeting those less likely to

the NHS, will you encourage the Nursing and Midwifery Council to overturn its decision?

Lesley Griffiths: Gwnaf. Mae'n rhywbeth sydd wedi cael ei hybu. Mae fy mhrif swyddog nyrsio, yr Athro Jean White, yn cael trafodaethau ar y mater hwnnw.

Aled Roberts: Minister, I would like to pursue your response to Antoinette Sandbach regarding specialist nurses. In a meeting of the cross-party group on neurological conditions in April, we had a discussion with representatives from the Betsi Cadwaladr University Local Health Board. They made it quite plain that, from now on, under advice from the Walton Centre in Liverpool, they will only appoint generic nurses rather than specialist nurses in one field. Also, when the specialist nurses that are already appointed leave their posts, those posts will not be filled. What are you, as a Government, going to do where the health board is making such a statement that is contrary to what you have told us is your intention as Minister?

Lesley Griffiths: Ar hyn o bryd, mae Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Prifysgol Betsi Cadwaladr yn cyflogi 214 o nyrsys arbenigol. Fel y dywedais, maent yn ffurfio rhan annatod a phwysig iawn o wasanaethau iechyd. Mae'r byrddau iechyd yn gyfrifol am sicrhau eu bod yn meddu ar y gymysgedd briodol o sgiliau. Nid wyf wedi clywed am y mater a godwyd gennych, ond byddaf yn siarad â chadeirydd Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Prifysgol Betsi Cadwaladr am y mater hwnnw ac yn ysgrifennu atoch.

Cervical Screening

7. Jenny Rathbone: *What is the Welsh Government doing to increase levels of cervical screening. OAQ(4)0137(HSS)*

Lesley Griffiths: Nod y cynllun cyflawni cancer a lanswyd gan Lywodraeth Cymru yn ddiweddar yw lleihau nifer yr achosion o ganser, ac mae'n canolbwyntio ar gynyddu nifer y menywod sy'n mynd am brawf sgrinio serfigol, ac ar ddiagnosis cynnar. Sgrinio Serfigol Cymru sy'n rheoli'r rhaglen sgrinio serfigol, gan weithio gyda byrddau

participate.

Jenny Rathbone: You will probably be aware that only one in four women in Wales goes for cervical screening, which is below the rate for the UK as a whole, and that the lowest rate of all is in Cardiff. What is your ministry doing to ensure that one of the strategic objectives of health boards is ensuring that GP practices, in particular, target the women who should be coming forward for screening, given that it is such an effective way of preventing women from dying of cervical cancer?

Lesley Griffiths: It is very effective, and I know that the take-up of cervical screening is marginally lower in Cardiff than in other health board areas. I think that, sometimes, GP practices and primary care can be a bit of a barrier, because people have problems accessing GP appointments for cervical screening. That is one of the reasons for the commitment in our manifesto and programme for government to increase access to GP surgeries. I am not aware of any concerns raised by patients in relation to different staff who offer cervical cytology screening within GP teams not being the most appropriate, but we need to make sure that one in four women does not fail to go to screening; we want to see the number taking up screening increasing, and that is a piece of work that we will be doing.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Minister, you have touched on the one in four figure, and on Cardiff having the lowest take-up of screening, which is disappointing for me as a Member for South Wales Central. You also touched on the manifesto commitment to increase GP opening times. One of the findings of a Jo's Cervical Cancer Trust report was that GP opening times were a key factor in people accessing the service. Can you outline what actions, 14 to 15 months into this Government, you are taking to increase GP opening times so that we can get a better take-up of cervical screening?

iechyd ac eraill i hybu sgrinio a thargedu'r rheini sy'n llai tebygol o fynd am brawf sgrinio.

Jenny Rathbone: Mae'n siŵr y byddwch yn gwybod mai dim ond un o bob pedair menyw yng Nghymru sy'n mynd i gael prawf sgrinio serfigol. Mae hynny'n is na'r gyfradd ar gyfer y DU gyfan, ac yng Nghaerdydd y mae'r gyfradd isaf un. Beth mae eich gweinyddiaeth yn ei wneud i sicrhau mai un o amcanion strategol y byrddau iechyd yw sicrhau bod practisau meddygon teulu yn enwedig yn targedu menywod a ddylai fod yn mynd i gael prawf sgrinio, gan gofio bod hyn yn ffordd mor effeithiol o atal menywod rhag marw o ganser ceg y groth?

Lesley Griffiths: Mae'n effeithiol iawn, a gwn fod y nifer sy'n mynd i gael prawf sgrinio ychydig yn is yng Nghaerdydd nag mewn ardaloedd byrddau iechyd eraill. Credaf weithiau y gall practisau meddygon teulu a gofal sylfaenol fod yn dipyn o rwystr, gan fod pobl yn cael problemau wrth drefnu apwyntiadau sgrinio serfigol gyda'u meddyg teulu. Dyna un o'r rhesymau dros yr ymrwymiad yn ein maniffesto a'n rhaglen lywodraethu i gynyddu mynediad at feddygfeydd meddygon teulu. Nid wyf yn ymwybodol o unrhyw bryderon a godwyd gan gleifion ynghylch y ffaith nad yw gwahanol aelodau o staff sy'n cynnig profion sgrinio sytolog serfigol o fewn timau meddygon teulu y rhai mwyaf priodol. Fodd bynnag, mae angen inni wneud yn siŵr bod yr un o bob pedair menyw yn mynd am brawf sgrinio; rydym am i'r nifer sy'n mynd am brawf sgrinio gynyddu, ac mae hwnnw'n ddarn o waith y byddwn yn ei wneud.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Weinidog, rydych wedi crybwyll y ffigur un o bob pedwar, ac yng Nghaerdydd y mae'r nifer isaf o fenywod sy'n mynd am brawf sgrinio. Mae hynny'n siomedig i mi fel Aelod dros Ganol De Cymru. Gwnaethoch hefyd grybwyll yr ymrwymiad yn y maniffesto i gynyddu oriau agor meddygfeydd. Un o ganfyddiadau *Jo's Cervical Cancer Trust* oedd bod amseroedd agor meddygfeydd yn ffactor allweddol o ran pobl yn defnyddio'r gwasanaeth. Ar ôl 14 i 15 mis o'r Llywodraeth hon, a allwch amlinellu pa gamau rydych yn eu cymryd i gynyddu oriau agor meddygfeydd fel bod

mwy o fenywod yn gallu manteisio ar brofion sgrinio serfigol?

Lesley Griffiths: As you know, our term of Government is five years, and we are doing a great deal of work at the moment. We are focusing on offering appointments in the evening after people have finished work. I did say that it has been raised with me that not being able to get an appointment is a barrier for some women in getting access to cervical screening, so it is important that we pursue the issue, and that is what we will be doing as we go through the term of Government.

Bethan Jenkins: Weinidog, mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn edrych i godi'r oedran sgrinio serfigol i dros 25 oed, yn unol â chanllawiau Sefydliad Iechyd y Byd. Fodd bynnag, o ystyried cyflwr gwael iechyd rhannau o'r boblogaeth yng Nghymru, a oes achos dros barhau i sgrinio menywod o dan 25 oed sydd yn y grwpiau sydd mewn perygl o'r afiechyd hwn?

Lesley Griffiths: It is something that we will have to consider. As you mentioned, the Wales screening committee is considering the findings of the UK national screening committee's consultations, and it will put forward recommendations to me. There is not any consistency across the four countries of the UK. In Wales, we screen every woman aged between 20 and 64 every three years. Scotland screens every woman aged between the ages of 20 and 60 every three years. England and Northern Ireland are different again; they have two levels. We need to look at this carefully, and, when I have those recommendations, we will make a decision.

Darparu Gwasanaethau i Gleifion Canser

8. Kirsty Williams: *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ddarparu gwasanaethau i gleifion cancer yng Nghymru. OAQ(4)0141(HSS)*

Lesley Griffiths: The Welsh Government's cancer delivery plan, which I launched on 14 June, sets out the Welsh Government's expectations of the NHS in Wales in tackling cancer and planning and delivering effective

Lesley Griffiths: Fel y gwyddoch, mae tymor ein Llywodraeth yn bum mlynedd, ac rydym yn gwneud llawer iawn o waith ar hyn o bryd. Rydym yn canolbwyntio ar gynnig apwyntiadau gyda'r nos ar ôl i bobl orffen gweithio. Dywedais y soniwyd wrthyf fod methu â chael apwyntiad yn un o'r rhwystrau sy'n atal rhai menywod rhag cael mynediad at brawf sgrinio serfigol. Mae'n bwysig felly ein bod yn mynd ar drywydd y mater, a dyna beth fyddwn yn ei wneud wrth inni fynd drwy dymor y Llywodraeth.

Bethan Jenkins: Minister, the Welsh Government is looking to increase the age for cervical screening to over 25, in accordance with World Health Organization guidelines. However, given the poor health of parts of the population in Wales, is there a case for continuing to screen women under the age of 25 who are in the groups at risk of this disease?

Lesley Griffiths: Mae'n rhywbeth y bydd yn rhaid inni ei ystyried. Fel y dywedoch, mae pwyllgor sgrinio Cymru yn ystyried canfyddiadau sy'n deillio o ymgynghoriadau pwyllgor sgrinio cenedlaethol y DU, a bydd yn cyflwyno'r argymhellion i mi. Nid oes unrhyw gysondeb ar draws pedair gwlad y DU. Yng Nghymru, rydym yn sgrinio pob menyw rhwng 20 a 64 oed bob tair blynedd. Mae'r Alban yn sgrinio pob menyw rhwng 20 a 60 oed bob tair blynedd. Mae Lloegr a Gogledd Iwerddon yn wahanol eto; mae ganddynt ddwy lefel. Mae angen inni edrych ar hyn yn ofalus, a phan fydd yr argymhellion hynny wedi dod i law, byddwn yn gwneud penderfyniad.

Provision of Services for Cancer Patients

8. Kirsty Williams: *Will the Minister make a statement on the provision of services for cancer patients in Wales. OAQ(4)0141(HSS)*

Lesley Griffiths: Mae cynllun cyflawni cancer Llywodraeth Cymru, a gafodd ei lansio gennyf ar 14 Mehefin, yn nodi disgwyliadau Llywodraeth Cymru ar gyfer y GIG yng Nghymru, o ran mynd i'r afael â

cancer services for people of all ages in Wales, whatever their circumstances.

Kirsty Williams: When will you be able to assure cancer patients, wherever they live in Wales, that they will begin their treatment for an urgent suspected cancer within the Government's own target waiting times?

2.00 p.m.

Lesley Griffiths: That is a priority for us. We have the two targets, and we know that, for one of them, there is variation across Wales. You will have heard the First Minister say very clearly yesterday that, while there is a performance difference between different health boards, and some of them are falling below target, we do not accept that and I expect all boards right across Wales to improve.

Kirsty Williams: With all due respect, Minister, I have heard this talk of priorities all before in the Chamber, yet only one of your local health boards is meeting your own target to treat people who have an urgent suspected cancer. Less than a quarter of people who have an urgent suspected head or neck cancer are seen in the time within which you tell local health boards they should treat patients. If this is your priority, and if the statistics do not improve within the next year, what will you do about it?

Lesley Griffiths: I expect to see an improvement within the year. I just mentioned that I launched the cancer delivery plan on 14 June, and I will be monitoring that very carefully, as will my officials. We have set out certain indicators so that we can measure success, both in meeting targets and in cancer incidence and mortality rates and one and five-year cancer survival rates.

Antoinette Sandbach: Minister, I am sure that you will have been shocked to hear of the cancer patient who is a constituent of mine, who has been forced to rent

chanser a chynllunio a darparu gwasanaethau cancer effeithiol ar gyfer pobl o bob oed yng Nghymru, beth bynnag fo'u hamgylchiadau.

Kirsty Williams: Pryd y byddwch yn gallu sicrhau cleifion cancer, ble bynnag y maent yn byw yng Nghymru, y byddant yn dechrau ar eu triniaeth ar gyfer achos brys lle amheuir cancer o fewn targed y Llywodraeth ei hun ar gyfer amseroedd aros?

Lesley Griffiths: Mae hynny'n flaenoriaeth i ni. Mae gennym y ddau darged, ac ar gyfer un ohonynt, gwyddom fod amrywiaeth ar draws Cymru. Byddwch wedi clywed y Prif Weinidog yn dweud yn glir iawn ddoe—er bod gwahaniaeth rhwng perfformiad gwahanol fyrddau iechyd, ac ambell un ohonynt ddim yn llwyddo i gyrraedd y targed—nad ydym yn derbyn hynny, ac rwyf yn disgwyl gweld gwelliannau ym mhob bwrdd ledled Cymru.

Kirsty Williams: Gyda phob dyledus barch, Weinidog, rwyf wedi clywed y sôn hwn am flaenoriaethau o'r blaen yn y Siambr, ond eto, dim ond un o'ch byrddau iechyd lleol sy'n cyrraedd eich targed chi i drin achosion brys lle amheuir cancer. Mae llai na chwarter y bobl mewn achosion brys lle amheuir cancer y pen neu'r gwddf yn cael eu gweld o fewn yr amser rydych chi'n dweud wrth fyrddau iechyd lleol y dylent drin eu cleifion. Os hyn yw eich blaenoriaeth, ac os nad yw'r ystadegau'n gwella o fewn y flwyddyn nesaf, bydd fyddwch chi'n ei wneud am y peth?

Lesley Griffiths: Rwyf yn disgwyl gweld gwelliant o fewn y flwyddyn. Rwyf newydd sôn fy mod wedi lansio'r cynllun cyflawni cancer ar 14 Mehefin, a byddaf yn monitro hwnnw'n ofalus iawn, yn yr un modd â fy swyddogion. Rydym wedi nodi dangosyddion penodol er mwyn inni allu mesur llwyddiant, o ran cyrraedd targedau ac o ran achosion o ganser a chyfraddau marwolaethau a chyfraddau goroesi cancer un flynedd a phum mlynedd.

Antoinette Sandbach: Weinidog, rwyf yn siŵr y byddwch wedi eich synnu wrth glywed am un o fy etholwyr sy'n dioddef o ganser. Mae wedi cael ei orfodi i rentu llety

accommodation across the border in Stockport to get access to a potentially lifesaving drug, through the English cancer fund. How many patients from north Wales will have to move across the border to England for treatment before your Government backs down from its opposition to a Welsh cancer drugs fund?

Lesley Griffiths: I will not, as you call it, back down. I do not think that a cancer drugs fund is the way to go, and I completely reject the notion. Even with such a fund, England still spends less on cancer care than we do. [Interruption.] It is absolutely true. There are no drugs available in England that are not available in Wales. The Rarer Cancers Foundation alleged that 24 cancer drugs were not available in Wales, but it is simply not true: 16 of them have been used, and eight have not been requested. Where do you stop? Where do you take that money from? It is not new money in England; it all comes from the same pot. As one oncologist said to me last week, 'If you introduced a cancer drugs fund, would you then have a neurology drugs fund—where do you stop?' We will not be having one. Every cancer treatment that is available in England is available in Wales.

Anhwylderau'r Sbectrwm Awtistig

9. Aled Roberts: *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddarparu'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf ynghylch gweithredu'r Cynllun Gweithredu Strategol ar gyfer Anhwylderau'r Sbectrwm Awtistig. OAQ(4)0149(HSS)*

Gwenda Thomas: Yn ystod y pedair blynedd ers inni gyflwyno'r cynllun gweithredu strategol ar gyfer anhwylderau'r sbectrwm awtistig, bu'r pwyslais ar sefydlu seilwaith ASD o fewn yr awdurdodau statudol, ar godi ymwybyddiaeth o ASD ac ar hyfforddi. Byddwn yn ceisio barn ar gyfeiriad y cynllun gweithredu i'r dyfodol yn ystod yr haf.

Aled Roberts: Thank you for the answer. I am sure that you are aware, given that you appeared on the *Dragon's Eye* programme

dros y ffin yn Stockport er mwyn gallu cael gafael ar gyffur a allai achub ei fywyd, drwy gronfa canser Lloegr. Faint o gleifion o'r gogledd fydd yn gorfod symud dros y ffin i Lloegr am driniaeth cyn i'ch Llywodraeth ildio a rhoi'r gorau i wrthwynebu cronfa cyffuriau canser ar gyfer Cymru?

Lesley Griffiths: Ni fyddaf yn ildio, fel y dywedwch. Nid wyf yn credu mai cronfa cyffuriau canser yw'r ffordd ymlaen, ac rwyf yn gwrthod y syniad yn llwyr. Hyd yn oed gyda chronfa o'r fath, mae Lloegr yn dal yn gwario llai ar ofal canser na ni. [Torri ar draws.] Mae'n gwbl wir. Nid oes unrhyw gyffuriau ar gael yn Lloegr nad ydynt ar gael yng Nghymru. Roedd y Sefydliad Canserau Mwy Prin yn honni bod 24 o gyffuriau ar gyfer canser nad ydynt ar gael yng Nghymru, ond nid yw hynny'n wir: mae 16 ohonynt wedi cael eu defnyddio, ac nid oes cais wedi'i wneud am wyth ohonynt. Ble mae'r pen draw? O ble rydych chi'n cymryd yr arian hwnnw? Nid yw'n arian newydd yn Lloegr; mae'r cyfan yn dod o'r un pwrs. Fel y dywedodd un oncolegydd wrthyf yr wythnos diwethaf, 'Pe baech chi'n cyflwyno cronfa cyffuriau canser, a fydddech wedyn yn cael cronfa cyffuriau niwroleg—ble mae rhywun yn stopio?' Ni fyddwn yn cael un. Mae pob triniaeth ar gyfer canser sydd ar gael yn Lloegr ar gael yng Nghymru.

Autism Spectrum Disorders

9. Aled Roberts: *Will the Minister provide an update on the implementation of the Autistic Spectrum Disorder (ASD) Strategic Action Plan. OAQ(4)0149(HSS)*

Gwenda Thomas: In the four years since the introduction of our autistic spectrum disorder strategic action plan, the emphasis has been on establishing an ASD infrastructure within the statutory authorities, on raising awareness of ASD and on training. Over the summer, we will be seeking views on the future direction of the action plan.

Aled Roberts: Diolch am yr ateb. Gan gofio eich bod wedi ymddangos ar raglen *Dragon's Eye* yr wythnos diwethaf, rwyf yn siŵr eich

last week, of the report published in December 2010 on the current situation, which talks of a definite postcode lottery in Wales. In some areas of Wales, 63% of children come from Welsh-speaking homes, and yet only 30% of them are assessed in Welsh. There are no diagnostic tools available in Welsh, and, more worryingly, the report says that there is a distinct lack of continuity and consistency, with families moving from different areas of Wales not being able to be assured that they will get the same level of service when they move to a new place.

Deputy Minister, I accept that you launched this strategy, but when will we move from having a glossy document to seeing real progress on the ground?

Gwenda Thomas: I am aware of the National Autistic Society's fiftieth birthday survey report, and there were things to celebrate in it. I acknowledge the very positive comments made by the chair of NAS about what is happening in Wales. The survey undertaken by the NAS revealed, as you say, that more people in Wales are waiting more than three years for a diagnosis compared with their counterparts in England. However, the survey provides an interesting snapshot of an individual's historic experiences, and cannot therefore demonstrate progress in recent years. I believe that the Wales autism research centre has offered to work with NAS to analyse the data to ensure that the outcomes provide qualitative and quantitative scrutiny. That will be a useful piece of work, and I hope that it can happen.

I am quite proud of what has happened in Wales. We know that we have heavily influenced the strategy in Scotland that was launched in 2011, and also the strategy in Northern Ireland that we hope to see launched in 2013. Positive things are happening, but I take this opportunity to repeat what the Minister for health has said this afternoon: I expect services to be delivered to families when they need them,

bod yn gwybod am yr adroddiad a gyhoeddwyd ym mis Rhagfyr 2010 ar y sefyllfa bresennol, sy'n dweud yn bendant bod loteri cod post yng Nghymru. Mewn rhai ardaloedd yng Nghymru, mae 63 y cant o blant yn dod o gartrefi Cymraeg eu hiaith, ac eto dim ond 30 y cant ohonynt sy'n cael eu hasesu yn Gymraeg. Nid oes unrhyw offer diagnostig ar gael yn y Gymraeg ac mae'r adroddiad yn dweud bod diffyg amlwg o barhad a chysondeb, sy'n destun pryder go iawn, wrth i deuluoedd symud o wahanol ardaloedd yng Nghymru heb y sicrwydd y byddant yn cael yr un lefel o wasanaeth pan fyddant yn symud i le newydd.

Ddirprwy Weinidog, rwyf yn derbyn ichi lansio'r strategaeth hon, ond pryd y byddwn yn symud oddi wrth y ddogfen sgleiniog at gynnydd go iawn ar lawr gwlad?

Gwenda Thomas: Gwn am arolwg y Gymdeithas Genedlaethol Awtistiaeth i nodi pen-blwydd y Gymdeithas yn hanner cant oed, ac roedd yr adroddiad a oedd yn deillio o'r arolwg hwnnw yn cynnwys pethau i'w dathlu. Rwyf yn cydnabod y sylwadau cadarnhaol iawn a wnaed gan gadeirydd y Gymdeithas Genedlaethol Awtistiaeth am yr hyn sy'n digwydd yng Nghymru. Datgelodd yr arolwg a gynhaliwyd gan y Gymdeithas, fel y dywedwch, fod mwy o bobl yng Nghymru yn aros mwy na thair blynedd i gael diagnosis o'u cymharu â'u cymheiriaid yn Lloegr. Fodd bynnag, mae'r arolwg yn rhoi cipolwg diddorol o brofiadau hanesyddol unigolyn, ac felly ni ellir dangos cynnydd yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf. Credaf fod canolfan ymchwil i awtistiaeth Cymru wedi cynnig gweithio gyda'r Gymdeithas i ddadansoddi'r data er mwyn sicrhau y gellir craffu'n ansoddol a meintiol ar y canlyniadau. Bydd hwnnw'n ddarn defnyddiol o waith, a gobeithio y gall ddigwydd.

Rwyf yn bur falch o'r hyn sydd wedi digwydd yng Nghymru. Rydym yn gwybod ein bod wedi dylanwadu'n fawr ar y strategaeth yn yr Alban, a lansiwyd yn 2011, a hefyd ar y strategaeth yng Ngogledd Iwerddon yr ydym yn gobeithio y bydd yn cael ei lansio yn 2013. Mae pethau cadarnhaol yn digwydd, ond rwyf am achub ar y cyfle hwn i ailadrodd yr hyn y mae'r Gweinidog Iechyd wedi'i ddweud y

and there is not always the need to wait for a diagnosis.

Mark Isherwood: You made a statement to the Assembly on 25 April that you had asked the Wales autism research centre to evaluate children's diagnostic services for ASD in Wales. It was subsequently discovered that the report that Aled Roberts refers to was published in December 2010, and was commissioned by the Welsh Government from the Wales autism research centre on that very issue. I have just come from a meeting of the cross-party group on autism, which I chair, and we heard an Asperger's syndrome pioneer saying that adults in Wales are worried about how the autism action plan is leaving them out, especially with regard to diagnosis. When will you publicly respond to the recommendations in the report commissioned by the Welsh Government, which you have had, if the date on the front is correct, since December 2010? When will you respond to the National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence guidelines published today on the diagnosis and treatment of adults who have autism, following its guidelines for children, published last October?

Gwenda Thomas: Thank you, Mark Isherwood, for that. We are funding two key work streams, aimed at improving diagnosis in children and adults, and at ensuring greater consistency in its application throughout Wales. Through Betsi Cadwaladr University Local Health Board, we are funding the development of a diagnosis and counselling service for adults, and the implementation of the network of expertise and mentoring recommended by the Wales autism research centre will begin this year. That addresses one of the recommendations of its evaluation of children's diagnostic services in Wales.

Darparu Gwasanaethau IVF

10. Kirsty Williams: *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ddarparu IVF yn y GIG yng Nghymru. OAQ(4)0140(HSS)*

prynhawn yma: rwyf yn disgwyl i wasanaethau gael eu darparu i deuluoedd pan fydd arnynt eu hangen, ac nad oes angen aros am ddiagnosis bob amser.

Mark Isherwood: Gwnaethoch ddatganiad i'r Cynulliad ar 25 Ebrill eich bod wedi gofyn i ganolfan ymchwil i awtistiaeth Cymru werthuso gwasanaethau diagnostig plant ar gyfer anhwylderau yn y sbectwm awtistig yng Nghymru. Canfuwyd yn ddiweddarach y bu i'r adroddiad y mae Aled Roberts yn cyfeirio ato gael ei gyhoeddi ym mis Rhagfyr 2010, ac iddo gael ei gomisiynu gan Lywodraeth Cymru gan y ganolfan ymchwil i awtistiaeth ar yr union fater hwnnw. Rwyf newydd ddod o gyfarfod y grŵp trawsbleidiol ar awtistiaeth—fi yw'r cadeirydd—a chlywsom unigolyn blaenllaw ar syndrom Asperger yn dweud bod oedolion yng Nghymru yn poeni bod y cynllun gweithredu ar awtistiaeth yn eu hepgor, yn enwedig o ran diagnosis. Pryd y byddwch yn ymateb yn gyhoeddus i'r argymhellion yn yr adroddiad a gomisiynwyd gan Lywodraeth Cymru— adroddiad rydych wedi'i gael, os yw'r dyddiad ar y tu blaen yn gywir, ers mis Rhagfyr 2010? Pryd y byddwch yn ymateb i ganllawiau'r Sefydliad Cenedlaethol dros Iechyd a Rhagoriaeth Glinigol a gyhoeddwyd heddiw ar ddiagnosis a thriniaeth oedolion ag awtistiaeth, yn dilyn ei ganllawiau ar gyfer plant, a gyhoeddwyd fis Hydref y llynedd?

Gwenda Thomas: Diolch am hynny, Mark Isherwood. Rydym yn cyllido dwy ffrwd waith allweddol, gyda'r nod o wella diagnosis plant ac oedolion, a sicrhau mwy o gysondeb yn y modd y gweithredir hyn ledled Cymru. Drwy Fwrdd Iechyd Lleol Prifysgol Betsi Cadwaladr, rydym yn cyllido'r gwaith o ddatblygu gwasanaeth diagnosis a chwmsela ar gyfer oedolion, a bydd y rhwydwaith arbenigedd a mentora a argymhellir gan ganolfan ymchwil i awtistiaeth Cymru yn dechrau cael ei roi ar waith eleni. Mae hynny'n mynd i'r afael ag un o'r argymhellion sy'n dilyn ei werthusiad o wasanaethau diagnostig plant yng Nghymru.

The Provision of IVF Services

10. Kirsty Williams: *Will the Minister make a statement on the provision of IVF on the NHS in Wales. OAQ(4)0140(HSS)*

Lesley Griffiths: The planning and provision of IVF treatment for the people of Wales is the responsibility of the local health boards through the Welsh health specialised services committee.

Kirsty Williams: Minister, NICE has recently made recommendations about extending NHS IVF provision for women over the age of 40. Will you be instructing the Welsh Institute for Health and Social Care and local health boards to provide IVF services for women over the age of 40? If so, given the restrictions currently on the service in Cardiff, and the disruption as we change services in Swansea, are you confident that women over the age of 40 will be able to access those services?

Lesley Griffiths: Officials are currently looking at this issue of over-40s, and I will make an announcement in due course. You will be aware of the opening of the new facilities at Neath Port Talbot, which are likely to be ready in the autumn of this year. I expect patients to start receiving treatment in the new facilities in the new year, but there are no issues at present with patients accessing the IVF cycles that they require.

Ysmygu

11. Julie Morgan: *Pa gynlluniau pellach sydd gan y Gweinidog i annog pobl i roi'r gorau i ysmygu. OAQ(4)0145(HSS)*

Lesley Griffiths: The tobacco control action plan for Wales aims to drive down smoking levels to 16% by 2020. Our current programme of measures, which include Assist, Stop Smoking Wales and Smokers Helpline Wales, help to discourage young people from starting to smoke and supports those who want to give up smoking.

Julie Morgan: I thank the Minister for that

Lesley Griffiths: Y byrddau iechyd lleol, drwy bwyllgor gwasanaethau iechyd arbenigol Cymru, sy'n gyfrifol am gynllunio a darparu triniaeth IVF ar gyfer pobl Cymru.

Kirsty Williams: Weinidog, mae'r Sefydliad Cenedlaethol dros Iechyd a Rhagoriaeth Glinigol wedi gwneud argymhellion yn ddiweddar ynghylch ymestyn darpariaeth IVF y GIG ar gyfer menywod dros 40 oed. A fyddwch yn rhoi cyfarwyddyd i Athrofa Iechyd a Gofal Cymdeithasol Cymru ac i'r byrddau iechyd lleol ddarparu gwasanaethau IVF i fenywod dros 40 oed? Os felly, o ystyried y cyfyngiadau sydd ar y gwasanaeth yng Nghaerdydd ar hyn o bryd, a'r tarfu wrth inni newid gwasanaethau yn Abertawe, a ydych yn ffyddiog y bydd menywod dros 40 oed yn gallu cael mynediad at y gwasanaethau hynny?

Lesley Griffiths: Mae swyddogion wrthi'n edrych ar y mater hwn sy'n ymwneud â menywod dros 40 oed, a byddaf yn gwneud cyhoeddiad maes o law. Byddwch yn gwybod bod cyfleusterau newydd yn cael eu hagor yng Nghastell-nedd Port Talbot, sy'n debygol o fod yn barod yn yr hydref eleni. Rwyf yn disgwyl y bydd cleifion yn dechrau derbyn triniaeth yn y cyfleusterau newydd yn y flwyddyn newydd, ond nid oes unrhyw broblemau ar hyn o bryd o ran cleifion yn cael mynediad at y cylchoedd IVF y mae eu hangen arnynt.

Smoking

11. Julie Morgan: *What further plans does the Minister have to encourage people to stop smoking. OAQ(4)0145(HSS)*

Lesley Griffiths: Mae Cynllun Gweithredu Cymru ar Reoli Tybaco yn anelu at leihau lefelau ysmygu i 16 y cant erbyn 2020. Mae ein rhaglen gyfredol o fesurau, sy'n cynnwys y Treial Rhoi'r Gorau i Ysmygu mewn Ysgolion, Dim Smygu Cymru a'r Llinell Gymorth i Smygwyr yng Nghymru, yn helpu i atal pobl ifanc rhag dechrau ysmygu ac yn cefnogi'r rheini sydd am roi'r gorau i ysmygu.

Julie Morgan: Diolch i'r Gweinidog am yr

reply. What is the Welsh Government's view of the health implications of using electronic cigarettes, which many people use to try to stop smoking? Is the Minister aware of the recent case of my constituent from Llandaff North, who was asked to leave a bingo hall for using such a device in public?

Lesley Griffiths: No, I am not aware of that case. However, if you would like to write to me about it, I will get my officials to look into it for you. Electronic cigarettes are unregulated products that are not licensed as aids to smoking cessation. The Chief Medical Officer for Wales has advised caution until more is known about the long-term safety of e-cigarettes. As you know, we encourage smokers to give up and to speak to their GP or contact Stop Smoking Wales. You will have heard my earlier answer to William Graham about the programmes that we have to assist people.

Gwella Bywydau Plant

12. Christine Chapman: *Beth y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn ei wneud i wella bywydau plant yng Nghymru. OAQ(4)0143(HSS)*

Gwenda Thomas: We are committed to ensuring that children are safe, enjoy good education, health and wellbeing, and have a voice on matters that affect them. Our key commitments in our programme for government demonstrate that commitment alongside significant investment.

Christine Chapman: You will be aware that we are getting evidence about the growing problem of child neglect. Recent figures from the National Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Children in Wales show that there has been a 67% increase in reports to its helpline involving cases so serious that they were referred to the police or social services. As you will be aware, child neglect is extremely damaging to children, having an impact on their development and future life chances. Evidence shows that, unfortunately,

ymateb hwnnw. Beth yw barn Llywodraeth Cymru ynghylch goblygiadau iechyd defnyddio sigarêts electronig, sy'n cael eu defnyddio gan lawer o bobl i geisio rhoi'r gorau i ysmegu? A yw'r Gweinidog yn ymwybodol o'r hyn a ddigwyddodd i un o fy etholwyr yn Ystum Taf yn ddiweddar—gofynnwyd iddo adael neuadd bingo am ddefnyddio dyfais o'r fath yn gyhoeddus?

Lesley Griffiths: Na, nid wyf yn ymwybodol o'r achos hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, os hoffech ysgrifennu ataf yn ei gylch, byddaf yn gofyn i fy swyddogion edrych ar y mater ar eich rhan. Mae sigarêts electronig yn gynhyrchion heb eu rheoleiddio nad ydynt wedi'u trwyddedu fel cymhorthion i roi'r gorau i ysmegu. Mae Prif Swyddog Meddygol Cymru wedi cynghori y dylid bod yn ofalus nes ein bod yn gwybod mwy am ddiogelwch hirdymor e-sigarêts. Fel y gwyddoch, rydym yn annog ysmegwyr i roi'r gorau i ysmegu ac i siarad â'u meddyg teulu neu gysylltu â Dim Smygu Cymru. Byddwch wedi clywed fy ateb i William Graham yn gynharach am y rhaglenni sydd gennym i gynorthwyo pobl.

Improving the Lives of Children

12. Christine Chapman: *What is the Welsh Government doing to improve the lives of children in Wales. OAQ(4)0143(HSS)*

Gwenda Thomas: Rydym wedi ymrwymo i sicrhau bod plant yn ddiogel, yn mwynhau iechyd, lles ac addysg dda, ac yn cael llais mewn materion sy'n effeithio arnynt. Mae ein hymrwymiaid allweddol yn ein rhaglen lywodraethu yn dangos yr ymrwymiad hwnnw ochr yn ochr â chryn dipyn o fuddsoddiad.

Christine Chapman: Byddwch yn ymwybodol ein bod yn cael tystiolaeth am broblem gynyddol esgeuluso plant. Mae ffigurau diweddar gan y Gymdeithas Genedlaethol er Atal Creulondeb i Blant yng Nghymru yn dangos y bu cynnydd o 67 y cant yn nifer y galwadau i'w llinell gymorth a oedd yn ymwneud ag achosion digon difrifol i gael eu cyfeirio at yr heddlu neu'r gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Fel y gwyddoch, mae esgeuluso plant yn niweidiol iawn i blant, ac yn effeithio ar eu datblygiad ac ar eu

many cases of neglect are not identified early enough by practitioners. Therefore, do you agree that early intervention is the key? Will the Welsh Government give due consideration to that when introducing the social services Bill?

Gwenda Thomas: Thank you for that. I believe that neglect is a form of abuse. Figures show that a high percentage of children who are referred suffered from neglect. As you know, we have developed programmes, including Flying Start and Families First, as well as the integrated family support teams. There is early evidence that the integrated family support teams are identifying problems earlier and are able to intervene earlier. However, I believe that the scope of the social services Bill will allow us to look at this.

Gwasanaethau Iechyd yn Aberafan

13. David Rees: *A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu ei blaenoriaethau ar gyfer cyflenwi gwasanaethau iechyd o ansawdd i bobl Aberafan. OAQ(4)0151(HSS)*

Lesley Griffiths: Our proposals on the future of the NHS in Wales are set out in 'Together for Health' and our programme for government.

David Rees: Thank you for that answer, Minister. The Welsh Government is clearly focused on ensuring that the Welsh NHS provides safe services to all in Wales. Abertawe Bro Morgannwg University Local Health Board has already started its consultation process, as was mentioned earlier this afternoon, on service provision and putting the case for change, although I have not yet seen any specific changes. I encourage everyone in my area to take part in that process. The Government has often commented that centres of excellence as one way forward to access these services will be critical for constituents who use our NHS. What discussions have you had with the Welsh Ambulance Services NHS Trust and your colleague responsible for transport to help people to attend those services? Will

cyfleoedd bywyd yn y dyfodol. Dengys y dystiolaeth, yn anffodus, nad yw llawer o achosion o esgeulustod yn cael eu canfod yn ddigon cynnar gan ymarferwyr. Felly, a ydych yn cytuno bod ymyrryd yn gynnar yn allweddol? A wnaiff Llywodraeth Cymru ystyried y mater yn briodol pan fydd yn cyflwyno'r Bil gwasanaethau cymdeithasol?

Gwenda Thomas: Diolch am hynny. Rwyf yn credu bod esgeulustod yn fath o gamdriniaeth. Mae ffigurau'n dangos bod canran uchel o blant sy'n cael eu cyfeirio wedi dioddef esgeulustod. Fel y gwyddoch, rydym wedi datblygu rhaglenni, gan gynnwys Dechrau'n Deg a Teuluoedd yn Gyntaf, yn ogystal â'r timau integredig cymorth i deuluoedd. Ceir tystiolaeth gynnar bod y timau integredig cymorth i deuluoedd yn canfod problemau'n gynt ac yn gallu ymyrryd yn gynharach. Fodd bynnag, rwyf yn credu y bydd cwmpas y Bil gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn caniatáu inni edrych ar hyn.

Health Services in Aberavon

13. David Rees: *Will the Minister outline her priorities for delivering quality health services to the people of Aberavon. OAQ(4)0151(HSS)*

Lesley Griffiths: Mae ein cynigion ar gyfer dyfodol y GIG yng Nghymru wedi eu nodi yn 'Law yn Llaw at Iechyd' ac yn ein rhaglen lywodraethu.

David Rees: Diolch am yr ateb hwnnw, Weinidog. Mae'n amlwg bod Llywodraeth Cymru yn canolbwyntio ar sicrhau bod GIG Cymru yn darparu gwasanaethau diogel i bawb yng Nghymru. Fel y soniwyd yn gynharach y prynhawn yma, mae Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Prifysgol Abertawe Bro Morgannwg eisoes wedi dechrau ymgynghori ar ddarpariaeth gwasanaethau a chyflwyno'r achos dros newid, er nad wyf wedi gweld unrhyw newidiadau penodol eto. Rwyf yn annog pawb yn fy ardal i gymryd rhan yn y broses honno. Mae'r Llywodraeth wedi dweud yn aml fod canolfannau rhagoriaeth, fel un ffordd ymlaen i gael mynediad at y gwasanaethau hyn, yn hanfodol i etholwyr sy'n defnyddio ein GIG. Pa drafodaethau a gawsoch gydag Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwasanaethau Ambiwlans Cymru a'ch cyd-

you ensure that transportation to those services is high on the agenda for all boards considering service change?

Lesley Griffiths: Yes, transportation is certainly high on the agenda, and this relies very much on strong partnership working. I have been discussing the need to look at transport links and public transport services with my colleague, Carl Sargeant. I am due to meet him again early in the new term, in September. However, I have ongoing discussions with him. In relation to the Wales ambulance services trust, I want it to be seen increasingly as a clinical service and not merely a transport service. We should also be having discussions with the third sector. Just last week, I went with my colleague, Jane Hutt, the Leader of the House, to the University Hospital of Wales, where we saw a brilliant invest-to-save scheme with St John Ambulance, which is being used to take people home from hospital. We need to work with many partners to progress this.

Meddyginiaethau Homeopathi

14. Rhodri Glyn Thomas: *Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cael gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Iechyd y DU ynglŷn ag argaeledd meddyginiaethau homeopathi. OAQ(4)0154(HSS)*

Lesley Griffiths: Diolch. Although health is a devolved matter, the licensing and regulation of medicines are not devolved matters. My officials have been fully consulted by their colleagues in the Department of Health and the Medicines and Healthcare products Regulatory Agency about the changes to the Medicines Act 1968. There has been a dialogue between them.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Weinidog, pe bai'r newidiadau hyn yn dod i fodolaeth, byddai'n rhaid cofrestru pob meddyginiaeth homeopathi. Byddai'n golygu mai dim ond

Weinidog sy'n gyfrifol am drafnidiaeth er mwyn helpu pobl i gyrraedd y gwasanaethau hynny? A wnewch sicrhau bod trafnidiaeth er mwyn cyrraedd y gwasanaethau hynny ar frig agendâu pob un o'r byrddau sy'n ystyried newid y gwasanaeth?

Lesley Griffiths: Mae trafnidiaeth yn sicr yn uchel ar yr agenda, ac mae hyn yn dibynnu'n fawr iawn ar waith partneriaeth cryf. Rwyf wedi bod yn trafod yr angen i edrych ar gysylltiadau trafnidiaeth a gwasanaethau trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus gyda fy nghyd-Weinidog, Carl Sargeant. Byddaf yn cyfarfod ag ef eto yn fuan yn y tymor newydd, ym mis Medi. Fodd bynnag, byddaf yn cael trafodaethau parhaus ag ef. O ran ymddiriedolaeth gwasanaethau ambiwlans Cymru, rwyf am iddi gael ei gweld fwyfwy fel gwasanaeth clinigol, ac nid dim ond fel gwasanaeth cludiant. Dylem hefyd fod yn cael trafodaethau â'r trydydd sector. Dim ond yr wythnos diwethaf, es gyda fy nghyd-Weinidog, Jane Hutt, Arweinydd y Tŷ, i Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru, lle y gwelsom gynllun buddsoddi i arbed gwych gydag Ambiwllans Sant Ioan, sy'n cael ei ddefnyddio i fynd â phobl adref o'r ysbyty. Mae angen inni weithio gyda llawer o bartneriaid i ddatblygu hyn.

Homeopathic Medication

14. Rhodri Glyn Thomas: *What discussions has the Minister had with the UK Secretary of State for Health on the availability of homeopathic medication. OAQ(4)0154(HSS)*

Lesley Griffiths: Diolch. Er bod iechyd yn fater datganoledig, nid yw trwyddedu na rheoleiddio meddyginiaethau yn faterion datganoledig. Mae eu cydweithwyr yn yr Adran Iechyd ac yn yr Asiantaeth Rheoleiddio Meddyginiaethau a Chynhyrchion Gofal Iechyd wedi ymgynghori'n llawn â'm swyddogion ynghylch y newidiadau i Ddeddf Meddyginiaethau 1968. Maent wedi cael trafodaethau â'i gilydd.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Minister, if these changes were to come to pass, every homeopathic medicine would have to be registered. That would mean that only those

pobl sydd wedi cael hyfforddiant meddygol ac sydd â chymwysterau meddygol a fyddai'n gallu rhoi presgripsiynau ar eu cyfer. Gallai hynny olygu fod pobl na chawsant unrhyw fath o hyfforddiant mewn homeopathi yn gwneud hynny. A ydych yn hapus gyda'r sefyllfa honno?

who have received medical training and have medical qualifications would be able to prescribe them. That could mean that that was being done by people who had not received any training at all in homeopathy. Are you content with that situation?

2.15 p.m.

Lesley Griffiths: No, and it is something that, as we have this dialogue with the UK Government, we are looking at very closely. I have asked my officials to specifically look at the points you raise.

Lesley Griffiths: Na, ac wrth inni gael y drafodaeth hon â Llywodraeth y DU, rydym yn edrych ar y mater yn fanwl iawn. Rwyf wedi gofyn i fy swyddogion edrych yn benodol ar y pwyntiau rydych yn eu codi.

Safonau Gofal Diabetes

Diabetes Care Standards

15. Joyce Watson: *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am safonau gofal diabetes yng Nghanolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru. OAQ(4)0150(HSS)*

15. Joyce Watson: *Will the Minister make a statement on diabetes care standards in Mid and West Wales. OAQ(4)0150(HSS)*

Lesley Griffiths: I expect all health boards, including those serving mid and west Wales's residents, to plan and deliver high-quality and sustainable diabetes services in line with national standards and guidelines.

Lesley Griffiths: Rwyf yn disgwyl i bob bwrdd iechyd, gan gynnwys y rheini sy'n gwasanaethu trigolion y canolbarth a'r gorllewin, gynllunio a darparu gwasanaethau diabetes cynaliadwy o safon uchel yn unol â chanllawiau a safonau cenedlaethol.

Joyce Watson: I thank you for that answer, Minister. Rebecca Evans and I recently met with the family of David Joseph, who died following failures by medical staff at Bronglais hospital. I know that you have also met that family. I would like to pay tribute to the family, which has pursued the case with dignity and diligence. As well as discussing the particular circumstances of Mr Joseph's case, they raised the issue about diabetes care standards in Wales more generally. Minister, could you ensure that the recommendations made by the Public Services Ombudsman for Wales are implemented by Hywel Dda Local Health Board and that the lessons learned regarding blood sugar monitoring and diabetic care standards are shared across Wales? Will you also review standards of diabetes care throughout Wales to ensure that Wales is delivering first-class care for diabetes patients in Wales?

Joyce Watson: Diolch am yr ateb hwnnw, Weinidog. Yn ddiweddar, cyfarfu Rebecca Evans a minnau â theulu David Joseph, a fu farw yn dilyn methiannau staff meddygol yn Ysbyty Bronglais. Gwn eich bod chithau hefyd wedi cwrdd â'r teulu hwnnw. Hoffwn dalu teyrnged i'r teulu, sydd wedi bwrw ymlaen â'r achos yn ddiwyd a chydag urddas. Yn ogystal â thrafod amgylchiadau penodol achos Mr Joseph, gwnaethant godi mater safonau gofal diabetes yng Nghymru yn fwy cyffredinol. Weinidog, a allech sicrhau bod Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Hywel Dda yn rhoi'r argymhellion a wnaed gan Ombwdsmon Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus Cymru ar waith a bod y gwersi a ddysgwyd ynghylch monitro lefelau siwgr yn y gwaed a safonau gofal i bobl â diabetes yn cael eu rhannu ledled Cymru? A wnewch hefyd adolygu safonau gofal diabetes drwy Gymru i sicrhau bod Cymru yn darparu gofal o'r radd flaenaf i gleifion diabetes yng Nghymru?

Lesley Griffiths: It is a particularly sad case to which you refer. Clearly, standards fell

Lesley Griffiths: Mae'r achos rydych yn cyfeirio ato yn arbennig o drist. Yn amlwg,

way below what we would want and expect. You mentioned that I met with the two daughters of Mr Joseph, along with my chief nursing officer, and we listened very much to their concerns and gave them sincere assurances that action will be taken and lessons will be learned not just with Hywel Dda Local Health Board, but more widely within NHS Wales.

In relation to the PSOW's recommendations, the chief executive of NHS Wales has written to all health boards expressing his concern and to ensure that the recommendations are being fully implemented. I have reiterated that with my chairs, and officials will be monitoring this very closely.

disgynnodd y safonau i lefelau is o lawer na'r hyn y byddai arnoch ei eisiau a'r hyn y byddech yn ei ddisgwyl. Gwnaethoch sôn fy mod wedi cwrdd â dwy ferch Mr Joseph, ynghyd â'm prif swyddog nyrsio. Gwnaethom wrando'n astud ar eu pryderon a'u sicrhau'n ddiffuant y bydd camau'n cael eu cymryd a gwersi'n cael eu dysgu, nid ym Mwrdd Iechyd Lleol Hywel Dda yn unig, ond yn fwy eang o fewn GIG Cymru.

O ran argymhellion Ombwdsmon Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus Cymru, mae prif weithredwr GIG Cymru wedi ysgrifennu at bob bwrdd iechyd yn mynegi ei bryder, ac i sicrhau bod yr argymhellion yn cael eu gweithredu'n llawn. Rwyf finnau wedi ailadrodd hynny wrth fy nghadeiryddion, a bydd swyddogion yn monitro hyn yn ofalus iawn.

Cwestiynau i Weinidog yr Amgylchedd a Datblygu Cynaliadwy **Questions to the Minister for Environment and Sustainable Development**

Llifogydd

1. Simon Thomas: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y camau sydd wedi cael eu cymryd i atal llifogydd yng Nghanolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru. OAQ(4)0138(ESD)

Gweinidog yr Amgylchedd a Datblygu Cynaliadwy (John Griffiths): Mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi buddsoddi dros £30 miliwn ar gynlluniau lliniaru llifogydd yn y canolbarth a'r gorllewin, gyda chefnogaeth cronfa datblygu rhanbarthol Ewrop. Mae'r buddsoddiad hwn yn cefnogi ein strategaeth genedlaethol ar gyfer rheoli perygl llifogydd ac erydu arfordirol a'n hymrwymiad i leihau effaith a chanlyniadau llifogydd.

Simon Thomas: I thank the Minister for his reply. I want to use this opportunity to put on record my thanks to the emergency services and the volunteers who helped out with the recent floods in Ceredigion and Gwynedd. Minister, what steps is the Government taking as it reforms and looks at planning policy and the sustainable development Bill to ensure that we plan our developments in the best way possible to deal with flood prevention and to ensure that our buildings

Floods

1. Simon Thomas: Will the Minister make a statement on the action taken to prevent floods in Mid and West Wales. OAQ(4)0138(ESD)

The Minister for Environment and Sustainable Development (John Griffiths): The Welsh Government has invested over £30 million on flood alleviation schemes in mid and west Wales, supported by the European regional development fund. This investment supports our national strategy for flood and coastal erosion risk management and our commitment to reducing the impacts and consequences of flooding.

Simon Thomas: Diolch i'r Gweinidog am ei ateb. Carwn ddefnyddio'r cyfle hwn i ddiolch ar goedd i'r gwasanaethau brys a'r gwirfoddolwyr a fu'n helpu yn y llifogydd diweddar yng Ngheredigion a Gwynedd. Weinidog, pa gamau y mae'r Llywodraeth yn eu cymryd wrth iddi ddiwygio ac edrych ar bolisi cynllunio a'r Bil datblygu cynaliadwy er mwyn sicrhau ein bod yn cynllunio ein datblygiadau yn y ffordd orau bosibl i geisio atal llifogydd ac i sicrhau bod modd adfer ein

are able to recover from floods when they occur? It seems that climate change is bringing some more extreme events to parts of Wales. What is the Government doing in discussion with insurance companies to ensure that those who have suffered floods are being fully looked after and are able to reinsure themselves wherever possible, taking into account the investment that the Government is making in flood prevention measures?

John Griffiths: I thank Simon Thomas for those very important points. Recent events in Ceredigion and south Gwynedd have illustrated the great dangers of flooding. It really is a danger to life and limb as well as to properties, so it must be an absolute priority for the Welsh Government and our partners. It is absolutely right, of course, that the forecast and the climate change are concerning with regard to rising sea level, for example, and to the greater frequency of extreme weather events. The rainfall that we saw in a small area, with regard to the recent flooding, is perhaps an example of that sort of event.

I very much agree that we owe great gratitude to the emergency services and must thank them. When I went up there, it was clear from speaking to local residents that they very much valued that assistance and that the plan had been executed effectively. So, I very much agree with that. Also, our planning system, as it stands, has important safeguards in place, but we look to futureproofing and to the sustainable development Bill. We will seek to learn any lessons that we can from recent events. Finally, on the insurance situation, we have been in communication with the Association of British Insurers and the UK Government so that when the current statement of principles expires next year, we can address the way forward in terms of cover and affordable cover.

William Powell: In February 2010, the Environment Agency Wales conducted a flooding modelling exercise on Afon Leri around Dol-y-bont and Tal-y-bont. That report highlighted the risk that those

hadeiladau pan fydd llifogydd yn digwydd? Ymddengys fod newid yn yr hinsawdd yn achosi digwyddiadau mwy eithafol mewn rhannau o Gymru. Beth y mae'r Llywodraeth yn ei wneud mewn trafodaeth â chwmnïau yswiriant i sicrhau bod y rheini sydd wedi dioddef llifogydd yn cael gofal llawn a'u bod yn gallu ailyswirio eu hunain lle bo hynny'n bosibl, gan ystyried y buddsoddiad y mae'r Llywodraeth yn ei wneud o ran mesurau atal llifogydd?

John Griffiths: Diolch i Simon Thomas am y pwyntiau pwysig iawn hynny. Mae'r digwyddiadau diweddar yng Ngheredigion a de Gwynedd wedi dangos y peryglon mawr a ddaw yn sgîl llifogydd. Mae wir yn berygl i fywyd yn ogystal ag i eiddo, felly mae'n rhaid i hyn fod yn flaenoriaeth lwyr i Lywodraeth Cymru a'n partneriaid. Mae'n gwbl briodol, wrth gwrs, bod y rhagolygon a'r newid yn yr hinsawdd yn ymwneud â lefel y môr yn codi, er enghraifft, ac yn ymwneud â'r ffaith ein bod yn gweld mwy o dywydd eithafol. Mae'r glaw a welsom mewn ardal fach, o ran y llifogydd diweddar, o bosibl yn enghraifft o'r math hwnnw o ddigwyddiad.

Rwyf yn cytuno'n fawr iawn ein bod yn ddyledus iawn i'r gwasanaethau brys a rhaid diolch iddynt. Pan es i yno, roedd yn amlwg wrth siarad â thrigolion lleol eu bod yn gwerthfawrogi'r cymorth hwnnw yn fawr iawn a bod y cynlluniau wedi cael eu rhoi ar waith yn effeithiol. Felly, rwyf yn cytuno'n fawr iawn â hynny. Hefyd, mae gan ein system gynllunio, fel y mae, fesurau diogelu pwysig, ond rydym yn awyddus i allu diogelu ar gyfer y dyfodol ac edrychwn at y Bil datblygu cynaliadwy yn hyn o beth. Byddwn yn ceisio dysgu unrhyw wersi a allwn o ddigwyddiadau diweddar. Yn olaf, ynghylch y sefyllfa yswiriant, rydym wedi bod yn cyfathrebu gyda Chymdeithas Yswirwyr Prydain a Llywodraeth y DU felly pan fydd y datganiad presennol o egwyddorion yn dod i ben y flwyddyn nesaf, gallwn drafod y ffordd ymlaen o ran yswiriant ac yswiriant fforddiadwy.

William Powell: Ym mis Chwefror 2010, cynhaliodd Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd Cymru ymarfer modelu llifogydd ar Afon Leri o amgylch Dol-y-bont a Thal-y-bont. Yn yr adroddiad hwnnw, tynnwyd sylw at y risg

communities face from severe storms, as has been borne out in the last three weeks, and you and I have personally seen the consequences of that disaster. What action did the Welsh Government take at that time and, if there are further actions that need to be taken, will you undertake to prioritise them, Minister?

John Griffiths: My understanding from the initial assessment by the Environment Agency is that the weather event in question was something like a one-in-200-years event, whereas preparations had been based on a one-in-100-years event. However, I stress that that is an initial assessment and there is work to be done before any definitive verdict can be given as to the circumstances of the flooding. A lesson-learning exercise is under way. The Environment Agency across England and Wales is looking at recent flooding and it will draw lessons from that. Once that information is available, we will want to consider it carefully. When I was in Tal-y-bont and Dol-y-bont, local people talked about local residents in their 80s who had never experienced flooding on anything like that scale previously. We have to understand those circumstances but, of course, we have to learn lessons and be as best prepared as we can.

William Powell: Thank you very much for that answer, Minister. To what extent do you consider that the human intervention of the targeted release of water to relieve pressure on dams plays a part in such incidents, and will you undertake to commission a study as to whether or not that had any impact on this particular occasion?

John Griffiths: I am sure that the lesson-learning exercise will factor in all potential circumstances and factors involved in the flooding and that what William Powell mentioned will be among those factors. There are safety risks in terms of reservoirs, and when water behind dams gets to a certain level there has to be a controlled release, which has to be done with the approval of the Environment Agency. Therefore, there are necessary safeguards involved here, but if

y mae'r cymunedau hynny yn ei hwynebu yn sgîl stormydd difrifol, fel y digwyddodd yn y tair wythnos diwethaf, ac rydych chi a minnau wedi gweld canlyniadau'r trychineb hwnnw yn bersonol. Pa gamau a gymerodd Llywodraeth Cymru yr adeg honno ac, os oes angen cymryd camau pellach, a wnewch chi ymrwymo i roi blaenoriaeth iddynt, Weinidog?

John Griffiths: Yn ôl yr hyn a ddeallaf o'r asesiad cychwynnol gan Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd, mae'r digwyddiad tywydd dan sylw yn ddigwyddiad un-mewn-200-mllynedd, tra bod paratodau wedi cael eu seilio ar ddigwyddiad un-mewn-100-mllynedd. Fodd bynnag, rwyf yn pwysleisio mai asesiad cychwynnol yw hwn ac mae gwaith i'w wneud cyn y gellir gwneud unrhyw benderfyniad pendant ynghylch amgylchiadau'r llifogydd. Mae ymarfer dysgu gwersi ar y gweill. Mae Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd yng Nghymru a Lloegr yn edrych ar lifogydd diweddar a bydd yn dysgu gwersi o hynny. Pan fydd y wybodaeth honno ar gael, byddwn yn ei hystyried yn ofalus. Pan oeddwn yn Nhal-y-bont a Dol-y-bont, bu pobl leol yn siarad am drigolion lleol yn eu 80au nad oeddent erioed wedi dioddef llifogydd ar y raddfa honno o'r blaen. Rhaid inni ddeall yr amgylchiadau hynny ond, wrth gwrs, mae'n rhaid inni ddysgu gwersi a bod yn barod gorau ag y gallwn.

William Powell: Diolch yn fawr iawn am yr ateb hwnnw, Weinidog. I ba raddau ydych chi'n ystyried bod ymyrraeth ddynol i ryddhau dŵr yn benodol er mwyn lleihau'r pwysau ar argaeau yn chwarae rhan mewn digwyddiadau o'r fath, ac a wnewch ymrwymo i gomisiynu astudiaeth i weld a gafodd hynny unrhyw effaith ar yr achlysur penodol hwn?

John Griffiths: Rwyf yn siŵr y bydd yr ymarfer dysgu gwersi yn cynnwys yr holl amgylchiadau posibl a'r ffactorau a oedd yn gysylltiedig â'r llifogydd ac y bydd yr hyn a grybwyllodd William Powell ymysg y ffactorau hynny. Mae risgiau diogelwch gyda chronfeydd dŵr, a phan mae'r dŵr y tu ôl i argaeau yn cyrraedd lefel benodol mae'n rhaid ei ryddhau mewn ffordd reoledig. Rhaid gwneud hynny gyda chymeradwyaeth Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd. Felly, mae

there are lessons to be learned, we will all be keen to learn them.

Keith Davies: Yn sgîl yr adrodd cenedlaethol ar gyfaint ac effeithiau'r llifogydd yng nghanol a gorllewin Cymru, mae'n hanfodol ein bod yn cynllunio i atal llifogydd. Mewn cyfarfod diweddar gyda chi, Weinidog, Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd a Dŵr Cymru, dynodwyd Llanelli fel un o'r ddwy ardal yng Nghymru sydd â'r perygl mwyaf o lifogydd. Mae'r consyrn yn amlwg yn fy etholaeth, gyda chyfarfod misol o'r fforwm llifogydd, ac mae Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd wedi dechrau gwahanu carthffosiaeth a dŵr glaw i gadw lefelau yn isel. Pa gamau y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn eu cymryd i leihau ymhellach y perygl o lifogydd yn Llanelli?

John Griffiths: I was pleased to be at that meeting with the Member, which was informative and instructive. As ever, there are many issues involved in addressing flood issues in the Llanelli area. Dŵr Cymru has a considerable programme of investment planned that will address these issues. I am keen to address flood risk in future work and to work in partnership with Environment Agency Wales and local authorities to collectively prioritise, working with local communities, where the risk is greatest and then to have a single programme of investment, pulling those partners together and, hopefully, leveraging in the moneys so that we can take work forward effectively. All areas of Wales will be involved in that exercise.

Ynni Adnewyddadwy

2. Mohammad Asghar: *Beth y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn ei wneud i hybu cynhyrchu ynni adnewyddadwy yng Nghymru. OAQ(4)0129(ESD)*

John Griffiths: I thank Mohammad Asghar for that question. 'Energy Wales: A Low Carbon Transition' sets out the Government's approach to harnessing our energy potential to create a sustainable, low carbon economy for Wales.

Mohammad Asghar: Thank you very much

mesurau diogelu angenrheidiol ar waith yma, ond os oes gwersi i'w dysgu, bydd pob un ohonom yn awyddus i'w dysgu.

Keith Davies: Given the national reporting of the volume and impacts of the floods in mid and west Wales, it is crucial that we plan for flood prevention. At a recent meeting with you, Minister, the Environment Agency and Welsh Water, Llanelli was identified as one of two areas in Wales most at risk of flooding. The concern is obvious in my constituency, with a monthly meeting of the flood forum, and the Environment Agency has started to separate sewage and rainwater to keep levels low. What steps is the Welsh Government taking to reduce further the risk of flooding in Llanelli?

John Griffiths: Roeddwn yn falch o fod yn y cyfarfod hwnnw gyda'r Aelod, a oedd yn gyfarfod addysgiadol ac yn llawn gwybodaeth. Fel erioed, mae llawer o faterion sy'n ymwneud â mynd i'r afael â llifogydd yn ardal Llanelli. Mae gan Dŵr Cymru raglen sylweddol o fuddsoddiad ar y gweill a fydd yn mynd i'r afael â'r materion hyn. Rwyf yn awyddus i fynd i'r afael â risgiau llifogydd mewn gwaith yn y dyfodol ac i weithio mewn partneriaeth ag Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd Cymru ac awdurdodau lleol i gyd-flaenoriaethu, gweithio gyda chymunedau lleol, lle mae'r perygl mwyaf, ac yna i gael un rhaglen o fuddsoddiad, gan dynnu'r partneriaid hynny ynghyd a, gobeithio, denu arian fel y gallwn fwrw ymlaen â'r gwaith yn effeithiol. Bydd pob rhan o Gymru yn rhan o'r ymarfer hwnnw.

Renewable Energy

2. Mohammad Asghar: *What is the Welsh Government doing to promote renewable energy generation in Wales. OAQ(4)0129(ESD)*

John Griffiths: Diolch i Mohammad Asghar am y cwestiwn hwnnw. Mae 'Ynni Cymru: Newid Carbon Isel' yn nodi dull y Llywodraeth i harneisio ein potensial ynni i greu economi gynaliadwy, garbon isel ar gyfer Cymru.

Mohammad Asghar: Diolch yn fawr iawn

for that answer, Minister. Technical advice note 8 places too much focus on wind energy in that it has 12 pages dedicated to wind power, and only three pages for all other types of renewable energy. What is the Welsh Government doing to promote other forms of renewable energy, particularly the wave power, tidal power and hydroelectric power schemes needed here?

John Griffiths: Actually, TAN 8 is about a mix of renewable energy sources, and everything that the Welsh Government has said and has in its policy documents and strategies is about that energy mix, and 'Energy Wales' also makes that very clear. I am therefore very happy to confirm for the Member that the Welsh Government is committed to that mix and that marine, biomass, solar and other forms of renewable energy are uppermost in our minds as we take policy forward.

Alun Ffred Jones: Mae potensial mawr i gael ynni a thrydan o ddŵr, ac mae nifer o gynlluniau yng nghefn gwlad sy'n barod i fynd, gyda'r caniatâd cynllunio a llawer o'r gwaith paratoi wedi cael eu wneud. Yn anffodus, nid oes llinellau trydan sy'n ddigon cryf i gario'r trydan, ac felly mae llawer o gymunedau ac unigolion ar eu colled. Pryd fydd y Llywodraeth yn cysylltu â'r cwmnïau trydan i sicrhau bod y llinellau angenrheidiol, sef rhai *three phased*, yng nghefn gwlad fel y gall y gwaith hwn symud ymlaen?

John Griffiths: I thank Alun Ffred Jones for those comments. It is important that we facilitate and encourage those community energy projects and hydroelectric projects as effectively as we can. I am pleased that Community Energy Wales has recently come on the scene, as I think it will be a very important development—that sort of approach has been very effective in Scotland, for example. Ynni'r Fro is there to assist as well. Clearly, there are issues with connections and cost, and we will work closely with the energy companies and the grid to look at some of these issues.

am yr ateb hwnnw, Weinidog. Mae Nodyn Cymorth Technegol 8 yn rhoi gormod o bwyslais ar ynni gwynt, hynny yw, mae'n cynnwys 12 o dudalennau yn benodol ar ynni gwynt, a dim ond tair tudalen ar gyfer pob math arall o ynni adnewyddadwy. Beth y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn ei wneud i hybu mathau eraill o ynni adnewyddadwy, yn enwedig ynni'r tonnau, ynni'r llanw a chynlluniau pŵer trydan dŵr y mae eu hangen yma?

John Griffiths: A dweud y gwir, mae TAN 8 yn cyfeirio at gymysgedd o ffynonellau ynni adnewyddadwy, ac mae popeth y mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi'i ddweud ac wedi'i nodi yn ei dogfennau polisi a'i strategaethau yn ymwneud â'r cymysgedd ynni hwnnw, ac mae 'Ynni Cymru' hefyd yn gwneud hynny'n glir iawn. Rwyf yn hapus iawn i gadarnhau wrth yr Aelod felly fod Llywodraeth Cymru wedi ymrwymo i'r cymysgedd hwnnw a bod ynni morol, biomas, solar a ffurfiau eraill o ynni adnewyddadwy yn cael y flaenoriaeth fwyaf gennym wrth inni symud ymlaen â'r polisi.

Alun Ffred Jones: There is huge potential to gain energy and electricity from hydro sources, and several schemes in rural Wales are ready to go, with the planning permission and much of the preparatory work already in place. Unfortunately, there are no electricity lines that are strong enough to carry the electricity, so many communities and individuals are losing out. When will the Government get in touch with the electricity companies to ensure that, where necessary, the three-phased lines are available in rural Wales so that this work can proceed?

John Griffiths: Diolch i Alun Ffred Jones am y sylwadau hynny. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn hwyluso ac yn annog y prosiectau ynni cymunedol hynny a'r prosiectau pŵer trydan dŵr mor effeithiol ag y gallwn. Rwyf yn falch bod Ynni Cymunedol Cymru wedi cael ei ddatblygu'n ddiweddar, gan fy mod yn credu y bydd yn ddatblygiad pwysig iawn—mae'r math hwnnw o ddull gweithio wedi bod yn effeithiol iawn yn yr Alban, er enghraifft. Mae Ynni'r Fro yno i helpu hefyd. Yn amlwg, mae materion yn codi gyda chysylltiadau a chost, a byddwn yn gweithio'n agos gyda'r cwmnïau ynni a'r grid

However, it also comes back to the great need for further powers to be devolved to the Welsh Government, so that we can deal with all of these issues in the round and have these really important matters within our own control.

Blaenoriaethau ar gyfer Cynaliadwyedd

3. Nick Ramsay: *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ei flaenoriaethau ar gyfer cynaliadwyedd. OAQ(4)0134(ESD)*

John Griffiths: My priorities are to promote the economic, social and environmental wellbeing of people and communities in Wales through the delivery of our programme for government commitments, which reflect sustainable development as our central organising principle. This includes our proposals for a sustainable development Bill.

Nick Ramsay: Thank you, Minister; it was a broad question. I would like to ask you about the single environmental body that you are proposing, as you clearly believe it is sustainable to bring together the Forestry Commission Wales, Environment Agency Wales and the Countryside Council for Wales. Specifically, will you make a commitment to consider the role of local drainage boards as part of this proposal? I met representatives of the Caldicot and Wentlooge Levels Internal Drainage Board not too long ago, and they were quite concerned about uncertainties regarding the future. The levels are largely in your constituency, and I am sure that they have been protecting the people and properties of the area since the time of Henry VIII in one form or another and have since been guaranteed by Acts of Parliament. What is your outlook on their future and will you commit to retain the huge amount of knowledge and experience that they have built up over the years, which has led to the people of those areas placing an enormous amount of trust in them?

2.30 p.m.

John Griffiths: I thank Nick Ramsay for that supplementary question. We are carrying out a separate consultation on the future of the

i edrych ar rai o'r materion hyn. Ond, daw hyn â ni'n ôl hefyd at yr angen mawr i ddatganoli rhagor o bwerau i Lywodraeth Cymru, er mwyn inni allu ymdrin â phob un o'r materion hyn yn annibynnol, a bod y materion pwysig iawn hyn o fewn ein rheolaeth.

Priorities for Sustainability

3. Nick Ramsay: *Will the Minister make a statement on his priorities for sustainability. OAQ(4)0134(ESD)*

John Griffiths: Fy mlaenoriaethau yw hyrwyddo lles economaidd, cymdeithasol ac amgylcheddol pobl a chymunedau yng Nghymru drwy gyflwyno ein rhaglen ar gyfer ymrwymadau'r llywodraeth, sy'n adlewyrchu datblygu cynaliadwy fel ein prif egwyddor drefniadol. Mae hyn yn cynnwys ein cynigion ar gyfer Bil datblygu cynaliadwy.

Nick Ramsay: Diolch Weinidog; roedd yn gwestiwn eang. Hoffwn ofyn ichi am yr un corff amgylcheddol rydych yn ei gynnig, gan eich bod yn amlwg yn credu ei bod yn gynaliadwy dod â Chomisiwn Coedwigaeth Cymru, Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd Cymru a Chyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru ynghyd. Yn benodol, a wnewch chi addo ystyried rôl y byrddau draenio lleol fel rhan o'r cynnig hwn? Ychydig yn ôl, cefais gyfarfod â chynrychiolwyr Bwrdd Draenio Mewnol Gwastadeddau Cil-y-coed a Gwynllŵg, ac roeddent yn bryderus iawn am yr ansicrwydd ynglŷn â'r dyfodol. Mae'r gwastadeddau yn eich etholaeth yn bennaf, ac rwyf yn siŵr eu bod wedi bod yn diogelu pobl ac eiddo yn yr ardal ers dyddiau Harri VIII mewn rhyw ffordd neu'i gilydd, ac maent wedi cael sicrwydd dan Ddeddfau Seneddol ers hynny. Beth yw eich barn am eu dyfodol ac a wnewch chi ymrwymo i gadw'r swm enfawr o wybodaeth a phrofiad y maent wedi'u datblygu dros y blynyddoedd, sydd wedi arwain at bobl yr ardaloedd hynny yn rhoi llawer iawn o ymddiriedaeth ynddynt?

John Griffiths: Diolch i Nick Ramsay am y cwestiwn atodol hwnnw. Rydym yn cynnal ymgynghoriad ar wahân ar ddyfodol y

drainage boards, alongside our consultation on the single body and 'Sustaining a Living Wales'. So, we will await the outcome of that consultation and consider carefully the responses before deciding on the way forward.

Llyr Huws Gruffydd: Rwy'n siŵr, Weinidog, y byddwch, fel nifer ohonom, wedi clywed rhaglen *Manylu* ar BBC Radio Cymru yr wythnos hon yn sôn am y parthau cadwraeth morol a theimladau cryfion rhai trigolion ynghylch y cynlluniau arfaethedig. Pa mor allweddol yw sicrhau cefnogaeth budd-ddeiliaid lleol cyn y gall eich cynlluniau arfaethedig weithio?

John Griffiths: I thank the Member for that important and timely question, given the current concern and given our proposals and the events that have taken place around the proposals in Wales. I know that there was a well-attended meeting in north Wales recently. We are committed to that sort of engagement. We are listening carefully to the responses to the proposals. We are in the first stage of a three-stage consultation process and it is very much about information-gathering at the moment to better understand the socioeconomic impacts of highly protected designation in particular. We are very much in listening mode and we will listen carefully. I can give you, and all of the stakeholders and interest groups involved, that assurance.

Llyr Huws Gruffydd: Rwy'n falch o glywed eich bod yn barod i wrando. Yn yr ysbryd hwnnw, i ba raddau y byddech yn barod, fel rhan o'r ymgynghoriad, i dderbyn ac i ystyried opsiynau amgen a fyddai efallai yn cael eu cynnig er mwyn sicrhau lefelau uwch o warchodaeth yn y parthau hyn, ond heb, o reidrwydd, yr un lefel o wahardd ar weithgarwch?

John Griffiths: We would very much welcome alternative suggestions, because, as I said, this is the early stage of a protracted consultation process, designed to get it right so that, when we take forward marine conservation zones, we will have struck the correct balance between ecological protection and socioeconomic interests. We would very

byrddau draenio, ochr yn ochr â'n hymgyngoriad ar yr un corff a 'Cynnal Cymru Fyw'. Felly, byddwn yn aros am ganlyniad yr ymgynghoriad hwnnw ac yn ystyried yr ymatebion yn ofalus cyn penderfynu ar y ffordd ymlaen.

Llyr Huws Gruffydd: I am sure, Minister, that you, like many of us, will have heard the *Manylu* programme on BBC Radio Cymru this week talking about the marine conservation zones and the strong feelings of some residents with regard to those proposals. How crucial is it to secure the support of local stakeholders before your proposals can work?

John Griffiths: Diolch i'r Aelod am y cwestiwn pwysig ac amserol hwnnw, o ystyried y pryder ar hyn o bryd ac o gofio ein cynigion a'r digwyddiadau a welwyd yn ymwneud â'r cynigion yng Nghymru. Gwn fod llawer wedi dod i gyfarfod a gynhaliwyd yn y gogledd yn ddiweddar. Rydym wedi ymrwmo i'r math hwnnw o ymgysylltu. Rydym yn gwranddo'n ofalus ar yr ymatebion i'r cynigion. Rydym yng nghan cyntaf proses ymgynghori sy'n dri cham, a'r bwriad ar hyn o bryd yw casglu gwybodaeth er mwyn deall yn well beth, yn arbennig, yw'r effeithiau economaidd-gymdeithasol yn sgîl dynodi ardaloedd gwarchoddedig iawn. Rydym yn barod iawn i wrando a byddwn yn gwranddo'n ofalus. Gallaf eich sicrhau chi, a'r holl fudd-ddeiliaid a grwpiau diddordeb dan sylw, o hynny.

Llyr Huws Gruffydd: I am pleased to hear that you are willing to listen. In that spirit, to what extent are you, as part of the consultation, willing to accept and consider alternative options that may be put forward in order to ensure higher levels of conservation within these zones without necessarily the same prohibition of activities?

John Griffiths: Byddem yn croesawu awgrymiadau eraill yn fawr iawn, oherwydd, fel y dywedais, mae hyn yn gyfnod cynnar mewn proses ymgynghori faith, sydd â'r bwriad o gael hyn yn iawn. Felly pan fyddwn yn bwrw ymlaen â pharthau cadwraeth morol, byddwn wedi taro'r cydbwysedd cywir rhwng gwarchod elfennau ecolegol a

much welcome any alternative proposals that groups wish to put forward.

Jenny Rathbone: Referring back to your earlier response on floods in Wales, we can see the consequences of not getting to grips with climate change. Before you left for Rio de Janeiro, I raised a statement of opinion, suggesting that Wales should lead the world in the transition to a fair and green economy. That has been signed by Members across all four parties. Could you tell us what was achieved in Rio? Given that Rio+20 was an important milestone in this regard, how has it strengthened the UK Government's resolve to carry forward the groundbreaking Climate Change Act 2008?

John Griffiths: I thank Jenny Rathbone for that question. It was important that Wales and the Welsh Government had a presence at Rio+20. It was heartening in terms of the international recognition of Wales having put itself at the forefront of responding to climate change in taking forward sustainable development. While I was there, we were able to hold an important event on our sustainable development Bill and get important feed-in from a range of organisations and countries. We had some important bilateral meetings that we will follow up over the months and years to come. Being there as part of the UK Government delegation by UK Government invitation was an important recognition of the role of sub-national and regional Government in terms of delivering on sustainable development, the response to climate change and taking forward a green economy. We have important responsibilities in transport, housing, energy and other areas, so that was heartening. While I was there, I was able to sign two declarations of international groupings of regional and sub-national Governments committing to policies within our ambitions and strategies, to again put Wales at the forefront of the international effort.

Cynllun Rheoli Adnoddau Naturiol

4. Rhodri Glyn Thomas: *Sut y bydd Cynllun Rheoli Adnoddau Naturiol arfaethedig*

buddiannau economaidd-gymdeithasol. Byddem yn rhoi croeso mawr i unrhyw gynigion eraill yr hoffai grwpiau eu cyflwyno.

Jenny Rathbone: Gan gyfeirio'n ôl at eich ymateb yn gynharach ar lifogydd yng Nghymru, gallwn weld canlyniadau peidio â mynd i'r afael â'r newid yn yr hinsawdd. Cyn ichi adael am Rio de Janeiro, cyflwynais ddatganiad barn, a oedd yn awgrymu y dylai Cymru arwain y byd yn y newid i gael economi deg a gwyrdd. Mae Aelodau o'r pedair plaid wedi'i lofnodi. A allech ddweud wrthym yr hyn a gyflawnwyd yn Rio? O gofio bod Rio+20 yn garreg filltir bwysig yn hyn o beth, sut mae hynny wedi cryfhau penderfyniad Llywodraeth y DU i fwrw ymlaen â Deddf Newid yn yr Hinsawdd 2008 sy'n ddeddf arloesol?

John Griffiths: Diolch i Jenny Rathbone am y cwestiwn hwnnw. Roedd yn bwysig i Gymru a Llywodraeth Cymru fod yn bresennol yn Rio+20. Roedd yn galonogol cael cydnabyddiaeth ryngwladol i'r ffaith bod Cymru wedi'i rhoi ei hun ar flaen y gad wrth ymateb i newid yn yr hinsawdd wrth fwrw ymlaen â datblygu cynaliadwy. Pan oeddwn i yno, llwyddom i gynnal digwyddiad pwysig ar ein Bil datblygu cynaliadwy a chael adborth pwysig gan ystod o sefydliadau a gwledydd. Cawsom gyfarfodydd dwyochrog pwysig a byddwn yn sicrhau dilyniant dros y misoedd a'r blynnyddoedd i ddod. Roedd bod yno fel rhan o ddirprwyaeth Llywodraeth y DU drwy wahoddiad Llywodraeth y DU yn gydnabyddiaeth bwysig o rôl Llywodraeth ranbarthol ac is-genedlaethol o ran cyflawni ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy, yr ymateb i newid yn yr hinsawdd a datblygu economi werdd. Mae gennym gyfrifoldebau pwysig o ran trafniadaeth, tai, ynni a meysydd eraill, felly roedd hynny'n galonogol. Pan oeddwn i yno, cefais gyfle i lofnodi dau ddatganiad lle roedd grwpiau rhyngwladol Llywodraethau ranbarthol ac is-genedlaethol yn ymrwymo i bolisïau o fewn ein huchelgeisiau a'n strategaethau, unwaith eto yn rhoi Cymru ar flaen y gad yn yr ymdrech ryngwladol.

Natural Resource Management Plan

4. Rhodri Glyn Thomas: *How will the Welsh Government's proposed Natural Resource*

Llywodraeth Cymru yn plethu â rheoli'r arfordir yn gynaliadwy yng Nghymru yng ngoleuni'r Strategaeth Genedlaethol ar gyfer Rheoli Perygl Llifogydd ac Erydu Arfordirol. OAQ(4)0147(ESD)

John Griffiths: Byddwn yn ystyried yn llawn y strategaeth genedlaethol ar gyfer rheoli perygl llifogydd ac erydu arfordirol wrth ddatblygu ein cynigion ar gyfer cynllun rheoli adnoddau naturiol. Rydym yn cydweithio gydag Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd ac awdurdodau lleol er mwyn penderfynu pa seilwaith, asedau a chymunedau sydd mewn perygl ar hyd ein harfordir er mwyn gweithredu dull integredig.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Derbyniaf yr hyn mae'r Gweinidog wedi'i ddweud, ond a wnaiff ymrwymo y prynhawn yma i sicrhau y bydd Llywodraeth Cymru yn gwneud popeth o fewn ei gallu i ddiogelu bywyd gwyllt a'r adnoddau naturiol hyn sy'n bodoli ar yr arfordir? Wrth reswm, wrth ichi gyflwyno'r cynlluniau hyn, mae'r tir yn cael ei fwya ac mae cynefinoedd yn cael eu symud. A wnaiff y Gweinidog yr ymrwymiad hwnnw y prynhawn yma, os gwelwch i fod yn dda?

John Griffiths: I am pleased to reassure the Member, and all Members here, that biodiversity, and wildlife as part of biodiversity in Wales, is at the forefront of the strategies that we are taking forward, and central to 'Sustaining a Living Wales.'

Antoinette Sandbach: Minister, your Government's approach to the proposed marine conservation zones in north Wales has been seen by some as a textbook example of how not to do it. Local fishermen and tourism businesses have been left in fear of their livelihoods because of the way in which your Government's proposals have been presented, in that they are seen to represent a wish to ban a whole range of everyday activities on the coast, which is already highly protected. I heard your answer to Llyr Huws Gruffydd earlier, but do you accept that your Government's proposals cannot succeed without the support of local communities, and will you give a commitment to meet with local communities in north Wales that have to make a living in

Management Plan (NRMP) link with sustainable coastline management in Wales in light of the National Strategy for Flood and Coastal Erosion Risk Management. OAQ(4)0147(ESD)

John Griffiths: We will consider fully the national strategy for flood and coastal erosion risk management in developing our proposals for natural resource management. We are working with the Environment Agency and local authorities to determine which communities, assets and infrastructure are at risk along our coastline to inform an integrated approach.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I accept what the Minister has said, but will he commit this afternoon to ensuring that the Welsh Government does everything that it can to safeguard the wildlife and natural resources that are to be found along the coast? Naturally, as you introduce these schemes, the land is being eroded and habitats are being moved. Will the Minister give that commitment this afternoon, please?

John Griffiths: Mae'n bleser gennyf sicrhau'r Aelod, a phob Aelod yma, fod bioamrywiaeth, a bywyd gwyllt fel rhan o fioamrywiaeth yng Nghymru, yn cael lle blaenllaw yn y strategaethau yr ydym yn bwrw ymlaen â hwy, a bod hyn yn ganolog i 'Cynnal Cymru Fyw.'

Antoinette Sandbach: Weinidog, mae ffordd eich Llywodraeth o weithredu ynghylch y parthau cadwraeth morol arfaethedig yn y gogledd wedi cael ei hystyried gan rai fel enghraifft berffaith o sut i beidio â gwneud hyn. Mae busnesau twristiaeth a physgotwyr lleol yn poeni'n enbyd am eu bywoliaeth oherwydd y ffordd y cyflwynwyd cynigion eich Llywodraeth. Maent fel petaent yn cyfleu dymuniad i wahardd ystod gyfan o weithgareddau bob dydd ar yr arfordir, sydd eisoes yn warchoddedig iawn. Clywais eich ateb i Llyr Huws Gruffydd yn gynharach, ond a ydych yn derbyn na all cynigion eich Llywodraeth lwyddo heb gefnogaeth y cymunedau lleol, ac a fyddwch yn ymrwymo i gwrdd â chymunedau lleol yn y gogledd sy'n gorfod

this environment?

John Griffiths: I am very happy to reassure Antoinette Sandbach that the Welsh Government is very much committed to working with local communities and all stakeholders in the way that I outlined earlier. That is the sort of process that we want, and we will want to maximise meetings with all concerned.

Datganoli Polisi Ynni

5. Rhodri Glyn Thomas: *A wnaiff y Gweinidog gadarnhau safbwynt Llywodraeth Cymru ar ddatganoli polisi ynni ymhellach. OAQ(4)0146(ESD)*

John Griffiths: Rydym am i bobl Cymru gael gwir reolaeth dros eu hadnoddau, gan gynnwys cynhyrchu ynni. Mae datganoli caniatadau ynni wedi cael ei godi'n gyson gan Weinidogion Cymru â Llywodraeth y DU. Byddwn yn parhau i godi'r mater ar bob cyfle.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Mae'n ymddangos eich bod wedi symud rhyw ychydig o'r ymrwymiad yn eich maniffesto yn 2011 i geisio datganoli polisi ynni hyd at 100 MW. Clywais y Prif Weinidog yn gwneud datganiad—ar y teledu, fel y mae'n tueddu i wneud y dyddiau hyn—yn dweud eich bod wedi gwneud cais i ddatganoli hyd at 100 MW, a bod hynny'n rhesymol, ond oherwydd bod Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig wedi bod yn afresymol wrth wrthod hynny, eich bod bellach am weld y polisi ynni yn cael ei ddatganoli yn ei gyfanrwydd. A allwch ein goleuo ni ynglŷn â beth yn union yr oedd y Prif Weinidog yn ceisio'i ddweud?

John Griffiths: The First Minister's words speak for themselves, and he has never been reluctant to address any issue, here in Plenary or anywhere else. It is quite clear that the Welsh Government, on behalf of the people of Wales—there is widespread support for this here in the Assembly—wishes to have further devolution of power over energy so that we can properly shape and take forward our strategies and policies here in Wales. In that regard, we do not limit ourselves at 100 MW.

gwneud bywoliaeth yn yr amgylchedd hwn?

John Griffiths: Rwyf yn hapus iawn i sicrhau Antoinette Sandbach fod Llywodraeth Cymru wedi ymrwymo'n fawr iawn i weithio gyda chymunedau lleol a'r holl randdeiliaid yn y ffordd a nodwyd gennyf yn gynharach. Dyna'r math o broses rydym am ei gael, a byddwn yn awyddus i gael cymaint o gyfarfodydd ag y bo modd gyda phawb dan sylw.

Devolution of Energy Policy

5. Rhodri Glyn Thomas: *Will the Minister confirm the Welsh Government's position on the further devolution of energy policy. OAQ(4)0146(ESD)*

John Griffiths: We want the people of Wales to have proper control over their resources, including energy generation. The devolution of energy consents has regularly been raised with the UK Government by Welsh Ministers. We will continue to press the issue at every opportunity.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: It seems that you have shifted somewhat from your manifesto commitment in 2011 to seek the devolution of energy policy up to 100 MW. I heard the First Minister make a statement—on television, as he tends to make them these days—saying that you had asked for devolution of up to 100 MW, and that that was reasonable, but because the UK Government had been unreasonable in rejecting that, that you now want to see energy policy devolved in its entirety. Can you enlighten us as to what exactly the First Minister was trying to say?

John Griffiths: Mae geiriau'r Prif Weinidog yn ddigon clir, ac nid yw erioed wedi bod yn amharod i fynd i'r afael ag unrhyw fater, yma yn y Cyfarfod Llawn nac yn unrhyw le arall. Mae'n hollol amlwg bod Llywodraeth Cymru, ar ran pobl Cymru—mae cefnogaeth eang ar gyfer hyn yma yn y Cynulliad—yn dymuno bod rhagor o bŵer dros ynni yn cael ei ddatganoli er mwyn inni allu siapio a datblygu ein strategaethau a'n polisiau yn briodol yma yng Nghymru. Yn hynny o beth, nid ydym yn ein cyfyngu ein hunain ar 100

MW.

Russell George: I appreciate that the Minister will not have had time to examine the report of the Environment and Sustainability Committee that was published today. However, one of the headline recommendations for the Government is to clearly set out its case for the further devolution of powers. Minister, you have cross-party support in the Chamber on this issue. Will you take the opportunity afforded to you by this recommendation and set out how you will use any additional powers over energy consenting to put in place a single, streamlined, transparent process for Wales?

John Griffiths: Obviously, as Minister for Environment and Sustainable Development in the Welsh Government I work very closely with the Environment and Sustainability Committee. We will want to carefully consider this important report and respond in the usual way.

Rhywogaethau Goresgynnol Estron

6. David Rees: *Pa gamau y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn eu cymryd i fynd i'r afael â Rhywogaethau Goresgynnol Estron. OAQ(4)0144(ESD)*

John Griffiths: I thank David Rees for that question. My officials are working with partners, including statutory agencies and voluntary groups, to determine priority actions to control and eradicate invasive alien species where appropriate. A European Union invasive alien species directive is anticipated in the third quarter of this year, and planning is under way to determine how this might be transposed.

David Rees: I thank you for that answer and look forward to the EU directive. It is important that our environment tackles alien species such as Himalayan balsam, Japanese knotweed and killer shrimp, all of which exist in my constituency. Many constituents come to my office to seek help with Japanese knotweed in particular. The existence of this plant in neighbouring gardens causes damage to walls, concrete paths and so on, and can also cause problems for anyone trying to sell

Russell George: Rwyf yn sylweddoli na fydd y Gweinidog wedi cael amser i archwilio adroddiad y Pwyllgor Amgylchedd a Chynaliadwyedd a gyhoeddwyd heddiw. Fodd bynnag, un o'r prif argymhellion ar gyfer y Llywodraeth yw ei bod yn nodi ei hachos yn glir dros ddatganoli rhagor o bwerau. Weinidog, mae gennych gefnogaeth drawsbleidiol yn y Siambr ar y mater hwn. A wnewch fanteisio ar y cyfle a roddir ichi gan yr argymhelliad hwn a nodi sut y byddwch yn defnyddio unrhyw bwerau ychwanegol dros ganiatâd ynni i sefydlu un proses syml a thryloyw ar gyfer Cymru?

John Griffiths: Yn amlwg, fel Gweinidog yr Amgylchedd a Datblygu Cynaliadwy yn Llywodraeth Cymru, rwyf yn gweithio'n agos iawn gyda'r Pwyllgor Amgylchedd a Chynaliadwyedd. Byddwn am ystyried yr adroddiad pwysig hwn yn ofalus ac yn ymateb yn y ffordd arferol.

Invasive Alien Species

6. David Rees: *What action is the Welsh Government taking to tackle Invasive Alien Species. OAQ(4)0144(ESD)*

John Griffiths: Diolch i David Rees am y cwestiwn hwnnw. Mae fy swyddogion yn gweithio gyda phartneriaid, yn cynnwys asiantaethau statudol a grwpiau gwirfoddol, i benderfynu ar y camau blaenoriaethol i reoli a dileu rhywogaethau goresgynnol estron lle y bo'n briodol. Rhagwelir y ceir cyfarwyddeb yr Undeb Ewropeaidd ar rywogaethau goresgynnol estron yn nhrydydd chwarter y flwyddyn hon, ac mae cynllun ar y gweill i benderfynu sut y gellir trosi hyn.

David Rees: Diolch ichi am yr ateb hwnnw ac edrychaf ymlaen at gyfarwyddeb yr UE. Mae'n bwysig bod ein hamgylchedd yn mynd i'r afael â rhywogaethau estron fel Jac y Neidiwr, clymog Japan a'r ferdysen reibus. Mae pob un ohonynt yn bodoli yn fy etholaeth. Mae llawer o etholwyr yn dod i'm swyddfa i ofyn am help gyda chlymog Japan yn enwedig. Mae bodolaeth y planhigyn hwn mewn gerddi cyfagos yn achosi difrod i waliau, llwybrau concrid ac yn y blaen, a gall

their home. What action is the Welsh Government taking to support local authorities and other bodies to address this problem, and what discussions are you having with ministerial colleagues about reassuring homeowners that, where this plant grows on neighbouring land, the local authority can take action to eradicate it?

John Griffiths: Again, I thank David Rees for that question. I hope that we do not get into the debate as to what constitutes invasive alien species in the political world in Wales. These matters are very important indeed, and I know that they matter greatly to many communities. We want to work with the group that has been set up on Wales's invasive, non-native species. It is chaired by one of my officials and has representation from the Countryside Council for Wales, the Environment Agency, local authorities and others. We recently issued updated guidance on the control of Japanese knotweed as far as construction and landscape contracts are concerned, which will help local authorities and other developers. Also, I know that the Royal Institution of Chartered Surveyors has consulted its members and produced guidance. There is much work going on around this, and I hope very much that the single body will turn its mind to these issues once it comes into being.

Peter Black: Like David Rees, I have had many complaints about Japanese knotweed. When you discuss it with local council officers, they say that, although they can deal with it on the council's own land, they have little or no powers to force other landowners to take action against this weed. If, however, Japanese knotweed was listed as an injurious or specified weed under the Weeds Act 1959, in the same way as ragwort or spear thistle, local authorities would have a great deal more scope to take action against this weed. Will you consider looking at this issue and specifying it in this way?

hefyd achosi problemau i unrhyw un sy'n ceisio gwerthu ei gartref. Pa gamau y mae Llywodraeth Cymru'n eu cymryd i gefnogi awdurdodau lleol a chyrrff eraill i fynd i'r afael â'r broblem hon, a pha drafodaethau rydych yn eu cael gyda chyd-Weinidogion ynghylch rhoi sicrwydd i berchnogion tai y gall yr awdurdod lleol gymryd camau i ddileu'r planhigyn hwn pan fydd yn tyfu ar dir cyfagos?

John Griffiths: Eto, diolch i David Rees am y cwestiwn hwnnw. Gobeithio na fyddwn yn cychwyn dadl ynglŷn â beth yw rhywogaethau goresgynnol estron yn y byd gwleidyddol yng Nghymru. Mae'r materion hyn yn bwysig iawn yn wir, ac rwyf yn gwybod eu bod yn bwysig iawn i lawer o gymunedau. Rydym yn awyddus i weithio gyda'r grŵp sydd wedi cael ei sefydlu ar rywogaethau goresgynnol anffrodorol yng Nghymru. Un o'm swyddogion sy'n cadeirio'r grŵp hwnnw ac mae'n cynnwys cynrychiolaeth o Gyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru, Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd, awdurdodau lleol ac eraill. Yn ddiweddar, gwnaethom gyhoeddi'r canllawiau diweddaraf ar reoli clymog Japan yng nghyd-destun contractau adeiladu a thirwedd, a bydd hyn yn helpu awdurdodau lleol a datblygwyr eraill. Hefyd, rwyf yn gwybod bod Sefydliad Brenhinol y Syrfewyr Siartredig wedi ymgynghori â'i aelodau ac wedi cynhyrchu canllawiau. Mae llawer o waith yn digwydd ar hyn, a gobeithiaf yn fawr y bydd yr un corff yn canolbwyntio ar y materion hyn pan ddaw i rym.

Peter Black: Fel David Rees, rwyf finnau wedi cael nifer o gwynion am glymog Japan. Pan fyddwch yn trafod hyn gyda swyddogion y cyngor lleol, maent yn dweud, er eu bod yn gallu trin y planhigyn ar dir y cyngor ei hun, ychydig o bwerau, os o gwbl, sydd ganddynt i orfodi tiffeddianwyr eraill i gymryd camau i ddileu'r chwynnyn hwn. Ond pe byddai clymog Japan yn cael ei restru fel chwynnyn niweidiol neu chwynnyn penodedig o dan Ddeddf Chwyn 1959, yn yr un modd â llysiâu'r gingroen neu farchysgallen, byddai gan awdurdodau lleol lawer mwy o ryddid i ddelio â'r chwynnyn hwn. A wnewch chi ystyried edrych ar y mater hwn a'i restru yn y modd hwn?

John Griffiths: I thank Peter Black for that question. The Wildlife and Countryside Act 1981 is the relevant legislation for Japanese knotweed, but it is growing or planting the weed that is controlled rather than preventing its spread where it already exists on a property. I understand that there are legal gaps that need to be closed. The EU directive will obviously be significant. I am happy to look at the Act that the Member mentioned, although I suspect that it may be framed in terms of weeds that are injurious to agricultural livestock and, in which case, we may have a real problem. However, I am happy to write to the Member on that issue.

John Griffiths: Diolch i Peter Black am y cwestiwn hwnnw. Deddf Bywyd Gwyllt a Chefn Gwlad 1981 yw'r ddeddfwriaeth berthnasol ar gyfer clymog Japan, ond tyfu neu blannu'r chwynnyn sy'n cael ei reoli yn hytrach na'i atal rhag lledaenu lle mae eisoes yn bodoli ar eiddo. Rwyf ar ddeall bod bylchau cyfreithiol y mae angen eu cau. Bydd cyfarwyddeb yr UE yn bwysig iawn wrth reswm. Rwyf yn fodlon edrych ar y Ddeddf a grybwyllwyd gan yr Aelod, er fy mod yn amau ei bod wedi'i llunio yng nghyd-destun chwyn sy'n niweidiol i dda byw amaethyddol ac, os felly, efallai bod gennym broblem go iawn. Ond, rwyf yn hapus i ysgrifennu at yr Aelod am y mater hwnnw.

2.45 p.m.

Mike Hedges: Minister, could you provide an update on the progress in the test areas of the native Japanese insect that was introduced when your predecessor was in post to try to stop knotweed? When will the results of the tests be available so that the programme can hopefully be rolled out and the knotweed problem, which greatly affects my constituency, can be eradicated?

Mike Hedges: Weinidog, a allech roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am y cynnydd yn yr ardaloedd prawf pan gyflwynwyd y pryf brodorol o Siapan pan oedd eich rhagflaenydd yn y swydd i geisio atal clymog Siapan? Pryd fydd canlyniadau'r profion ar gael er mwyn gallu cyflwyno'r rhaglen, gobeithio, a gallu dileu'r broblem gyda'r clymog, sy'n effeithio'n fawr iawn ar fy etholaeth?

John Griffiths: I thank Mike Hedges for that question. That control effort of what is essentially a sap-sucking insect is proceeding under licence. We are now into the third year in terms of the release of the insect into a number of sites around England and Wales, but although it is being closely monitored, it is too early to assess its effectiveness. I am happy to write to the Member with an indication of when we might expect meaningful results.

John Griffiths: Diolch i Mike Hedges am y cwestiwn hwnnw. Mae'r ymdrech honno i reoli gan ddefnyddio pryf sy'n amsugno sudd yn mynd rhagddi o dan drwydded. Erbyn hyn, rydym yn y drydedd flyyddyn o ran rhyddhau'r pryf i nifer o safleoedd ledled Cymru a Lloegr, ond er ei fod yn cael ei fonitro'n agos, mae'n rhy gynnar i asesu ei effeithiolrwydd. Rwyf yn fodlon ysgrifennu at yr Aelod gyda syniad o pryd y gallwn ddisgwyl canlyniadau ystyrlon.

Diwydiant Coedwigaeth

7. Kenneth Skates: *A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu sut y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn bwriadu cefnogi'r diwydiant coedwigaeth yng Nghymru. OAQ(4)0142(ESD)*

John Griffiths: The Government's strategy for forestry, 'Woodlands for Wales', describes its vision for the future of forestry in Wales and the ways in which we support the forestry sector, both public and private.

Forestry Industry

7. Kenneth Skates: *Will the Minister outline how the Welsh Government plans to support the forestry industry in Wales. OAQ(4)0142(ESD)*

John Griffiths: Mae strategaeth y Llywodraeth ar gyfer coedwigaeth, 'Coetiroedd i Gymru', yn disgrifio ei gweledigaeth ar gyfer dyfodol coedwigaeth yng Nghymru a'r ffyrdd rydym yn cefnogi'r sector coedwigaeth, yr ochr gyhoeddus a'r

ochr breifat.

Kenneth Skates: As you will know, forestry is a hugely significant and valuable industry, employing over 10,000 people across Wales and generating more than £840 million in revenue every year. The responsibility for forestry is currently shared: your remit covers the woodland strategy, the Deputy Minister for Agriculture, Food, Fisheries and European Programmes has responsibility for the rural development programme and the Minister for Business, Enterprise, Technology and Science takes a lead on its economic role. With the coming of the single environment body, will you take this opportunity to look at how forestry policy currently operates and ensure that the sector thrives in the next few years, through co-ordinated and strong leadership right across Government?

John Griffiths: I thank Ken Skates for those pertinent questions. I am pleased to give reassurance that forestry remains central to Welsh Government policy and particularly the single body. I was pleased to visit the Clifford Jones Group of Companies near Rhuthun some time ago and, more recently, BSW Timber Group to discuss these issues, which I also discussed with the Confederation of Forest Industries (UK) Ltd. I very much hope that, working with stakeholders, we can take policy forward.

Russell George: The forestry industry in Wales continues to be concerned about the creation of the single environment body. Those concerns have been exasperated by the draft Natural Resources Body for Wales (Establishment) Order 2012 and the powers that it extends to Welsh Ministers. The section on general financial duties—article 13, paragraphs (5) and (6)—conveys powers on Welsh Ministers to extract sums of money from the new body as directed. Why does the Minister feel that he needs the powers to extract potential surplus from this new body back to central funds? Should such surpluses not be reinvested in the organisation?

Kenneth Skates: Fel y gwyddoch, mae coedwigaeth yn ddiwydiant sylweddol a gwerthfawr iawn, ac mae'n cyflogi dros 10,000 o bobl ar draws Cymru ac yn cynhyrchu mwy na £840 miliwn mewn refeniw bob blwyddyn. Mae'r cyfrifoldeb dros goedwigaeth yn cael ei rannu ar hyn o bryd: mae eich cylch gwaith yn cynnwys y strategaeth coetiroedd, mae'r Dirprwy Weinidog Amaethyddiaeth, Bwyd, Pysgodfeydd a Rhaglenni Ewropeaidd yn gyfrifol am y rhaglen datblygu gwledig ac mae'r Gweinidog Busnes, Menter, Technoleg a Gwyddoniaeth yn rhoi arweiniad ar ei rôl economaidd. Gyda dyfodiad yr un corff amgylcheddol, a wnewch chi fanteisio ar y cyfle hwn i edrych ar sut mae polisi coedwigaeth yn gweithredu ar hyn o bryd a sicrhau bod y sector yn ffynnu yn y blynyddoedd nesaf, drwy arweinyddiaeth gydlynol a chadarn ar draws y Llywodraeth?

John Griffiths: Diolch i Ken Skates am y cwestiynau perthnasol hynny. Rwyf yn falch o roi sicrwydd bod coedwigaeth yn dal yn ganolog i bolisi Llywodraeth Cymru ac, yn arbennig, yr un corff. Roeddwn yn falch o ymweld â Grŵp Cwmnïau Clifford Jones ger Rhuthun beth amser yn ôl ac, yn fwy diweddar, â Grŵp BSW Timber i drafod y materion hyn. Bûm hefyd yn trafod gyda Chyddfederasiwn Diwydiannau Coedwigoedd (DU) Ltd. Rwyf yn mawr obeithio y gallwn fynd â'r polisi ymlaen, gan weithio gyda rhanddeiliaid.

Russell George: Mae'r diwydiant coedwigaeth yng Nghymru yn dal i bryderu am greu un corff amgylcheddol. Cynyddodd y pryderon hynny yn sgîl Gorchymyn drafft Corff Adnoddau Naturiol Cymru (Sefydlu) 2012 a'r pwerau y mae hynny'n ei ymestyn i Weinidogion Cymru. Mae'r adran ar ddyletswyddau ariannol cyffredinol—erthygl 13, paragraffau (5) a (6)—yn trosglwyddo pwerau i Weinidogion Cymru i dynnu symiau o arian oddi ar y corff newydd yn ôl y cyfarwyddyd. Pam mae'r Gweinidog yn teimlo bod angen y pwerau arno i dynnu'r arian posibl dros ben oddi ar y corff newydd hwn i'r cronfeydd canolog? Oni ddylid ail-fuddsoddi arian o'r fath yn y corff?

John Griffiths: These provisions are in accordance with general governmental arrangements in matters such as these. However, the two Orders that will create the new body and transfer functions will be subject to the scrutiny procedures of this Assembly.

Russell George: My second question is in relation to articles 5 and 11, which relate to the amount of direct input that will be afforded to Ministers in relation to directing how the new organisation discharges its function. These are seen by many in the forestry industry as significant powers of interference. Why does the Minister believe that it is necessary to have so much power of interference in the running of this new body?

John Griffiths: Again, what is proposed is very much in accordance with normal Welsh Government relationships with arm's-length bodies. I see nothing out of the ordinary as far as that is concerned, but, again, I am sure that the scrutiny processes of the Assembly can address these matters.

Simon Thomas: Un o'r pethau allweddol i greu diwydiant coedwigaeth ffyniannus yng Nghymru, wrth gwrs, yw cryfhau'r farchnad ar gyfer cynnyrch coed Cymru. Mae cwmni Coed Cymru yn gwneud tipyn o waith ymchwil ar y mater hwn, yn arbennig o ran y cynllun Tŷ Unnos, sy'n defnyddio cynnyrch coed o Gymru mewn ffordd ddyfeisgar newydd i adeiladu tai fforddiadwy. Pa drafodaethau a ydych yn eu cael gyda'ch cyd-Weinidog Huw Lewis i sicrhau bod cefnogaeth i'r rhan honno o'r farchnad a bod modd inni ddefnyddio coed adnewyddadwy Cymru er mwyn adeiladu tai fforddiadwy i bobl Cymru?

John Griffiths: I regularly discuss with ministerial colleagues, including Huw Lewis, how we can work across portfolios on all aspects of affordable housing, including the provision of good-quality timber and innovative developments around that in Wales.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I call on Ken Skates to ask question 8.

John Griffiths: Mae'r darpariaethau hyn yn unol â threfniadau llywodraethol cyffredinol mewn materion fel y rhain. Fodd bynnag, bydd gweithdrefnau craffu'r Cynulliad hwn yn berthnasol i'r ddau Orchymyn a fydd yn creu'r corff newydd ac yn trosglwyddo swyddogaethau.

Russell George: Mae fy ail gwestiwn yn gysylltiedig ag erthyglau 5 a 11, sy'n ymwneud â faint o fewnbwn uniongyrchol a roddir i Weinidogion mewn perthynas â chyfarwyddo sut y mae'r corff newydd yn cyflawni ei swyddogaeth. Ystyrir y rhain gan lawer yn y diwydiant coedwigaeth fel pwerau sylweddol i ymyrryd. Pam mae'r Gweinidog yn credu ei bod yn angenrheidiol i gael cymaint o bŵer i ymyrryd yn y gwaith o redeg y corff newydd hwn?

John Griffiths: Unwaith eto, mae'r hyn a gynigir i raddau helaeth yn unol â pherthynas arferol Llywodraeth Cymru gyda chyrrff hyd braich. Ni welaf ddim anghyffredin yn hynny, ond, unwaith eto, rwyf yn siŵr y gall prosesau craffu'r Cynulliad fynd i'r afael â'r materion hyn.

Simon Thomas: One of the keys to creating a prosperous forestry industry in Wales, of course, is to strengthen the market for Welsh timber products. Coed Cymru, the company, does a great deal of research in this area, particularly with the Tŷ Unnos scheme, which uses Welsh timber in an innovative and new way to build affordable homes. What discussions are you having with your ministerial colleague Huw Lewis to ensure that there is support for that part of the market and that we can use renewable Welsh timber to build affordable homes for the people of Wales?

John Griffiths: Byddaf yn trafod yn rheolaidd gyda chyd-Weinidogion, gan gynnwys Huw Lewis, sut y gallwn weithio ar draws portffolios ar bob agwedd ar dai fforddiadwy, gan gynnwys darparu datblygiadau pren o ansawdd da ac arloesol o gwmpas hynny yng Nghymru.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Galwaf ar Ken Skates i ofyn cwestiwn 8.

Kenneth Skates: Deputy Presiding Officer, I am content with an answer given earlier by the Minister. Therefore, I will not ask my question.

Kenneth Skates: Dirprwy Lywydd, rwyf yn fodlon ag ateb a roddwyd yn gynharach gan y Gweinidog. Felly, ni fyddaf yn gofyn fy nghwestiwn.

*Ni ofynnwyd cwestiwn 8, OAQ(4)0141(ESD).
Question 8, OAQ(4)0141(ESD), not asked.*

Ardaloedd Coetir

9. Gwyn R. Price: *Beth y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn ei wneud i gynyddu nifer yr ardaloedd coetir yn ein cymunedau trefol. OAQ(4)0135(ESD)*

John Griffiths: I am undertaking a range of programmes that are delivering new planting in urban areas as well as enabling increased community use of existing woodland in Wales. Examples of key activities include a study of urban trees, the Plant! scheme and a wonderful woodland plan for the Heads of the Valleys strategic regeneration area.

Gwyn R. Price: Minister, I thank you for opening the Aberbargoed Grasslands nature reserve. The project is a fantastic one and will make a great contribution to the area. Of course, urban woodlands, as well as other urban nature reserves, can play a crucial part in educating local children. With this in mind, will you join me in congratulating the volunteers of Pengam and Cefn Fforest eco park in Islwyn, which contains a large urban woodland, who have recently been awarded over £20,000 from the Tidy Towns fund?

John Griffiths: I thank Gwyn Price for those remarks and that question. I was very pleased to be at the Aberbargoed Grasslands project and to recognise the great enthusiasm from the community and the volunteers, as well as from local politicians. The Tidy Towns initiative and the provision of the £20,000 are good examples of how we can work with local communities and volunteers. I congratulate everyone involved.

Blaenoriaethau

10. Elin Jones: *Beth fydd blaenoriaethau'r Gweinidog dros y chwe mis nesaf.*

Woodland Areas

9. Gwyn R. Price: *What is the Welsh Government doing to increase the number of woodland areas in our urban communities. OAQ(4)0135(ESD)*

John Griffiths: Rwyf yn cyflwyno ystod o raglenni sy'n sicrhau bod plannu o'r newydd yn digwydd mewn ardaloedd trefol yn ogystal â galluogi'r gymuned i ddefnyddio mwy o'r coetiroedd sydd eisoes yn bodoli yng Nghymru. Mae enghreifftiau o weithgareddau allweddol yn cynnwys astudiaeth o goed trefol, y cynllun Plant! a chynllun coetir gwych ar gyfer ardal adfywio strategol Blaenau'r Cymoedd.

Gwyn R. Price: Weinidog, diolch ichi am agor gwarchodfa natur Glaswelltiroedd Aberbargoed. Mae'r prosiect yn un gwych a bydd yn gwneud cyfraniad mawr i'r ardal. Wrth gwrs, gall coetiroedd trefol, yn ogystal â gwarchodfeydd natur trefol eraill, chwarae rhan hanfodol o ran addysgu plant lleol. Gyda hyn mewn golwg, a wnewch ymuno â mi i longyfarch gwirfoddolwyr parc eco Pengam a Chefn Fforest yn Islwyn, sydd â choetir trefol mawr, a gafodd dros £20,000 o'r gronfa Trefi Taclus yn ddiweddar?

John Griffiths: Diolch i Gwyn Price am y sylwadau hynny ac am y cwestiwn hwnnw. Roeddwn yn falch iawn o fod ym mhrosiect Glaswelltiroedd Aberbargoed ac i gydnabod brwdfrydedd mawr y gymuned a'r gwirfoddolwyr, yn ogystal â'r gwleidyddion lleol. Mae'r fenter Trefi Taclus a'r £20,000 a roddwyd yn enghreifftiau da o sut y gallwn weithio gyda chymunedau lleol a gwirfoddolwyr. Hoffwn longyfarch pawb sy'n gysylltiedig.

Priorities

10. Elin Jones: *What will the Minister's priorities be for the next six months.*

OAQ(4)0137(ESD)

John Griffiths: Rydw i wedi ymrwymo i wireddu, ledled Cymru, yr ymrwymadau sydd wedi eu gosod ar gyfer fy mhortffolio yn y rhaglen lywodraethu.

Elin Jones: Fel yr ydym wedi clywed eisoes y prynhawn yma, Weinidog, rydych yn ymgynghori ar hyn o bryd ar y parthau cadwraeth morol. Rwy'n ddiolchgar iawn i chi fel Gweinidog am gytuno i fynychu cyfarfod ar 18 Gorffennaf i gwrdd â physgotwyr Cymru gydag Aelodau Cynulliad ar draws y pleidiau, gobeithio. Fodd bynnag, a wnewch ymrwymo i gyflwyno dadl ar lawr y Cynulliad yn amser y Llywodraeth ar y parthau cadwraeth morol, yn dilyn cau'r ymgynghoriad hwn ar ddiwedd mis Gorffennaf, fel y gallwn gael trafodaeth lawn ar fater sy'n amlwg yn bwysig i bysgotwyr ac i eraill yng Nghymru?

John Griffiths: I thank Elin Jones for that question. I look forward to meeting with the fishermen and fisherwomen—the fisherpeople. At this stage, I would not want to give any cast-iron commitment to a debate in Government time, because there are Government channels that address such matters. However, I will say that I have no problem with debating these matters with Members. I look forward to that debate taking place, and perhaps I can have some conversations following questions today.

Rheoli Perygl Llifogydd ac Erydu Arfordirol

11. Rebecca Evans: *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y Strategaeth Genedlaethol ar gyfer Rheoli Perygl Llifogydd ac Erydu Arfordirol. OAQ(4)0131(ESD)*

John Griffiths: I have published a national strategy in November of last year. It sets out the risks that we face and the overarching objectives for managing those risks in Wales.

Rebecca Evans: Risk-management strategies identified in the plan include increasing individual and community preparedness for flooding and supporting the actions of individuals, communities and infrastructure

OAQ(4)0137(ESD)

John Griffiths: I am committed to fulfilling, across Wales, the commitments that are set out for my portfolio in the programme for government.

Elin Jones: As we have already heard this afternoon, Minister, you are currently consulting on the marine conservation zones. I am very grateful to you as Minister for agreeing to attend the meeting on 18 July to meet the fishermen and women of Wales, alongside Assembly Members from all parties, I hope. However, will you commit to bringing forward a debate in the Assembly in Government time on the marine conservation zones, following the conclusion of this consultation at the end of July, so that we can have a full discussion on an issue that is obviously important to fishermen and women and others across Wales?

John Griffiths: Diolch i Elin Jones am y cwestiwn hwnnw. Edrychaf ymlaen at gwrdd â'r pysgotwyr. Ar hyn o bryd, ni fyddwn am roi unrhyw ymrwymiad cadarn i ddadl yn ystod amser y Llywodraeth, gan fod sianeli Llywodraeth ar gael sy'n rhoi sylw i faterion o'r fath. Fodd bynnag, gwnaf ddweud nad oes gennyf broblem o gwbl gyda thrafod y materion hyn gydag Aelodau. Edrychaf ymlaen at y drafodaeth honno, ac efallai y gallaf gael ambell sgwrs yn dilyn y cwestiynau heddiw.

Flood and Coastal Erosion Risk Management

11. Rebecca Evans: *Will the Minister make a statement on the National Strategy for Flood and Coastal Erosion Risk Management. OAQ(4)0131(ESD)*

John Griffiths: Cyhoeddais strategaeth genedlaethol ym mis Tachwedd y llynedd. Ynddi, mae'n nodi'r risgiau sy'n ein hwynebu a'r amcanion cyffredinol ar gyfer rheoli'r risgiau hynny yng Nghymru.

Rebecca Evans: Mae'r strategaethau rheoli risg a nodir yn y cynllun yn cynnwys paratoi unigolion a chymunedau i fod yn fwy parod am lifogydd a chefnogi gweithredoedd unigolion, cymunedau a darparwyr seilwaith i

providers to build their resilience to the consequences of a flood event. How is the Welsh Government driving these actions forward? What can be learnt from the recent events in Ceredigion?

John Griffiths: I thank Rebecca Evans for that supplementary question. Through the flood awareness Wales campaign, we work closely with the Environment Agency, which has been doing a great deal of awareness raising by working with local communities and making sure that flood warnings and alerts work more effectively because of that engagement. There are always lessons to be learned, and as I said earlier, there will be an exercise to learn those lessons following the recent flooding events.

Llosgyddion Gwastraff

12. Nick Ramsay: *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ynghylch rheolaethau ar losgyddion gwastraff sydd ar waith yng Nghymru. OAQ(4)0133(ESD)*

John Griffiths: Stringent operating controls on waste incinerators in Wales are set through permits issued to operators by the Environment Agency under the environmental permitting regulations. These regulations in turn implement exacting operating standards and limits, set with regard to the waste incineration directive.

Nick Ramsay: Thank you, Minister. You will know that there has been a great deal of concern over recent years regarding some incinerator applications and the types of technology that are being proposed in Wales—some types that have long since been abandoned in the US. How do you intend to continue moving towards achieving the aims of your zero waste strategy while taking on board the concerns of people who do not want to have the sorts of negative effects that incinerators could pose?

John Griffiths: I thank Nick Ramsay for those questions. I think that we have a successful waste programme, ‘Towards Zero Waste’, which has set us at the forefront of

feithrin eu gallu i wrthsefyll canlyniadau llifogydd. Sut y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn rhoi hwb i'r camau gweithredu hyn? Beth y gellir ei ddysgu o'r digwyddiadau diweddar yng Ngheredigion?

John Griffiths: Diolch i Rebecca Evans am y cwestiwn atodol hwnnw. Drwy'r ymgyrch ymwybyddiaeth o lifogydd yng Nghymru, rydym yn gweithio'n agos gydag Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd, sydd wedi bod yn codi llawer iawn o ymwybyddiaeth drwy weithio gyda chymunedau lleol a gwneud yn siŵr bod rhybuddion llifogydd yn gweithio'n fwy effeithiol yn sgîl yr ymgysylltiad hwnnw. Mae gwersi i'w dysgu bob amser, ac fel y dywedais yn gynharach, bydd ymarfer i ddysgu o'r gwersi hynny yn dilyn y llifogydd diweddar.

Waste Incinerators

12. Nick Ramsay: *Will the Minister make a statement regarding controls on waste incinerators operating in Wales. OAQ(4)0133(ESD)*

John Griffiths: Mae rheolaethau gweithredu llym ar losgyddion gwastraff yng Nghymru yn cael eu gosod drwy drwyddedau gwaith a roddir i weithredwyr gan Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd o dan y rheoliadau trwyddedu amgylcheddol. Mae'r rheoliadau hyn, yn eu tro, yn cyflawni safonau gweithredu a therfynau manwl, a osodir yng nghyd-destun y gyfarwyddeb llosgi gwastraff.

Nick Ramsay: Diolch, Weinidog. Byddwch yn gwybod bod llawer iawn o bryder wedi bod dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf ynglŷn ag ambell gais am losgydd a'r mathau o dechnoleg sy'n cael eu cynnig yng Nghymru—mae'r Unol Daleithiau wedi rhoi'r gorau i ddefnyddio rhai mathau ers tro byd. Sut rydych yn bwriadu parhau i symud tuag at gyflawni amcanion eich strategaeth dyfodol diwastraff ac ystyried hefyd pryderon y bobl nad ydynt am gael y math o effeithiau negyddol y gallai llosgyddion eu hachosi?

John Griffiths: Diolch i Nick Ramsay am y cwestiynau hynny. Rwyf yn meddwl bod gennym raglen gwastraff lwyddiannus, ‘Tuag at Ddyfodol Diwastraff’, sydd wedi ein gosod

that work in the UK and beyond. The waste hierarchy that we have puts energy from waste above landfill but, obviously, behind reducing, reusing and recycling, and we have to see it in that context. It is for residual waste that we are unable to recycle. The Health Protection Agency deals with health issues and we abide by its advice, and it has a position statement. We are technology neutral; we have brought local authorities together in consortia, and we are working with them in collaboration. They have decided on the most appropriate way forward, and we facilitate and work with them, and we will continue to do that.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Question 13, OAQ(4)0143(ESD), has been withdrawn.

Bridio Cŵn

14. Andrew R.T. Davies: *A wnaiiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am gynnydd y ddeddfwriaeth arfaethedig ar fridio cŵn. OAQ(4)0132(ESD)*

John Griffiths: The consultation on the draft Animal Welfare (Breeding of Dogs) (Wales) Regulations 2012 closed on 23 May 2012. We are now evaluating those responses.

Andrew R.T. Davies: There is legislation on this in Scotland, namely the Control of Dogs Act (Scotland) 2010. I think that you are familiar with it, because, like me, you have been lobbied on this issue by the Kennel Club and Dogs Trust. Given your understanding of that legislation, is there any ability for the Welsh Government to take that legislation and use it in Wales as a short-cut method of making sure that we have robust measures to protect the public and genuine dog breeders in providing the services and facilities that we would like to see in Wales?

John Griffiths: I am mindful of what they have done in Scotland, which is along the same lines as the action that we envisage in Wales. We would also work closely with a range of animal welfare organisations, including the Royal Society for the

ar y blaen yn y gwaith hwnnw yn y DU a thu hwnt. Mae'r hierarchaeth gwastraff sydd gennym yn rhoi ynni o wastraff yn uwch na thirlenwi ond, yn amlwg, y tu ôl i leihau, ailddefnyddio ac ailgylchu, ac mae'n rhaid inni weld hynny yn y cyd-destun hwnnw. Mae hyn ar gyfer gwastraff gweddilliol nad ydym yn gallu ei ailgylchu. Mae'r Asiantaeth Diogelu Iechyd yn delio â materion iechyd ac rydym yn cadw at ei chyngor. Mae ganddi ddatganiad sefyllfa. Rydym yn niwtral o ran technoleg; rydym wedi dod ag awdurdodau lleol ynghyd mewn consortia, ac rydym yn gweithio ar y cyd gyda hwy. Maent wedi penderfynu ar y ffordd fwyaf priodol ymlaen, ac rydym yn hwyluso ac yn gweithio gyda hwy, a byddwn yn parhau i wneud hynny.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Tynnwyd cwestiwn 13, OAQ(4)0143(ESD), yn ôl.

Breeding of Dogs

14. Andrew R.T. Davies: *Will the Minister provide an update on the progress of the proposed legislation on the breeding of dogs. OAQ(4)0132(ESD)*

John Griffiths: Daeth yr ymgynghoriad ar Reoliadau drafft Lles Anifeiliaid (Bridio Cŵn) (Cymru) 2012 i ben ar 23 Mai 2012. Rydym yn gwerthuso'r ymatebion hynny yn awr.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Mae deddfwriaeth ar gael ar hyn yn yr Alban, sef Deddf Rheoli Cŵn (Yr Alban) 2010. Credaf eich bod yn gyfarwydd â hi, oherwydd, fel fi, rydych wedi cael eich llobio ar y mater hwn gan y Kennel Club a Dogs Trust. O ystyried eich dealltwriaeth o'r ddeddfwriaeth honno, a oes unrhyw obaith i Lywodraeth Cymru allu cymryd y ddeddfwriaeth honno a'i defnyddio yng Nghymru fel ffordd gyflym o wneud yn siŵr bod gennym fesurau cadarn i amddiffyn y cyhoedd a bridwyr cŵn dilys wrth ddarparu'r gwasanaethau a'r cyfleusterau yr hoffem eu gweld yng Nghymru?

John Griffiths: Rwyf yn ymwybodol o'r hyn y maent wedi ei wneud yn yr Alban, sydd yn debyg i'r camau yr ydym yn eu rhagweld yng Nghymru. Byddem hefyd yn gweithio'n agos gydag ystod o sefydliadau lles anifeiliaid, gan gynnwys y Gymdeithas Frenhinol er Atal

Prevention of Cruelty to Animals, which I think has a Bill on the stocks, as it were, that we would also want to consider. That is part of the wider picture in terms of controlling dogs: we have the dog breeding regulations and compulsory microchipping, and we have to deal with the control of dogs in terms of the Dangerous Dogs Act 1991 as well.

Perchnogion Cŵn Cyfrifol

15. Julie Morgan: *Pa drafodaethau y mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi'u cael gyda Llywodraeth y DU ynghylch y cynigion i hybu bod yn berchnogion cŵn cyfrifol fel y nodwyd ym Mhapur Gwyn y Swyddfa Gartref 'Putting Victims First' a gyhoeddwyd ym mis Mai 2012. OAQ(4)0139(ESD)*

John Griffiths: I thank Julie Morgan for that question. The Minister for Local Government and Communities has written to the UK Home Secretary expressing concern over the potential impact of the White Paper's proposals on the welfare of dogs. Officials are also in discussions with the UK Government.

Julie Morgan: I thank the Minister for that response. Does he agree that the minimal proposals in the Westminster White Paper that deal with anti-social or irresponsible dog owners will not begin to meet the need for proactive, protective powers, which were highlighted by all the key agencies that he met at the meeting in the Pierhead? Will he confirm that he still intends to bring forward a Bill as early as possible with a package of reforms promoting education and training, and enabling the relevant authorities to intervene before more children are seriously injured or killed by menacing or threatening dogs.

3.00 p.m.

John Griffiths: I thank Julie Morgan for that supplementary question and congratulate her on that well attended event at the Pierhead building. I think that the case has effectively been made as to what is the most effective approach, and I think that it is along the lines that the Member suggests. We would want to have a preventive, training and education

Creulondeb i Anifeiliaid, a chredaf fod ganddi Fil ar y gweill, fel petai, y byddem am ei ystyried hefyd. Mae hynny'n rhan o'r darlun ehangach o ran rheoli cŵn: mae gennym reoliadau bridio cŵn a gosod microsglodion gorfodol, a rhaid inni ddelio â rheoli cŵn o ran Deddf Cŵn Peryglus 1991 hefyd.

Responsible Dog Ownership

15. Julie Morgan: *What discussions have the Welsh Government had with the UK Government regarding the proposals for promoting responsible dog ownership set out in the Home Office White Paper 'Putting Victims First' published in May 2012. OAQ(4)0139(ESD)*

John Griffiths: Diolch i Julie Morgan am y cwestiwn hwnnw. Mae'r Gweinidog Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau wedi ysgrifennu at Ysgrifennydd Cartref y DU yn mynegi pryder am effaith bosibl cynigion y Papur Gwyn ar les cŵn. Mae swyddogion hefyd yn cynnal trafodaethau gyda Llywodraeth y DU.

Julie Morgan: Diolch i'r Gweinidog am yr ateb hwnnw. A yw'n cytuno na fydd y cynigion lleiaf ym Mhapur Gwyn San Steffan sy'n delio â pherchnogion cŵn gwrthgymdeithasol neu anghyfrifol yn dechrau diwallu'r angen am bwerau diogelu rhagweithiol a amlygwyd gan yr holl asiantaethau allweddol y cyfarfu â hwy yn y cyfarfod yn y Pierhead? A wnaiff gadarnhau ei fod yn dal yn bwriadu cyflwyno Bil cyn gynted â phosibl gyda phe cyn o ddiwygiadau sy'n hyrwyddo addysg a hyfforddiant, ac yn galluogi'r awdurdodau perthnasol i ymyrryd cyn bod mwy o blant yn cael eu hanafu'n ddifrifol neu eu lladd gan gŵn peryglus neu fygythiol.

John Griffiths: Diolch i Julie Morgan am y cwestiwn atodol hwnnw a charwn ei llongyfarch ar y digwyddiad poblogaidd hwnnw yn adeilad y Pierhead. Credaf fod yr achos wedi cael ei wneud yn effeithiol o ran beth yw'r ffordd fwyaf effeithiol, ac rwyf yn meddwl ei bod yn debyg i'r hyn a awgryma'r Aelod. Byddem yn awyddus i gael dull ataliol

approach to dangerous dogs, through their owners, with dog control notices, and to close that gap in relation to private property that currently exists under the Dangerous Dogs Act 1999.

Sadly, in my area, in Newport, there was an attack on a young girl, who suffered facial disfigurement, by a neighbour's Rottweiler on private property just this week. That is just one example of many, unfortunately, and it shows the urgent need to take action on this front, and I am very committed to doing that.

William Graham: The Minister will know that the Dogs Trust provides free educational workshops, covering a variety of themes, particularly responsible dog ownership, which is an important aspect of safety with regard to dogs. Will the Minister commit to having further discussions with the charities that are particularly concerned about this issue?

John Griffiths: I very much welcome that question from William Graham. I will be very pleased to have further discussions with those organisations with experience and expertise. In fact, the Dogs Trust has made a very kind offer of helping with the cost of compulsory microchipping, which we very much appreciate.

sy'n cynnig hyfforddiant ac addysg am gŵn peryglus, drwy eu perchnogion, gyda hysbysiadau rheoli cŵn, ac i gau'r bwlch hwnnw mewn perthynas ag eiddo preifat sy'n bodoli ar hyn o bryd o dan Ddeddf Cŵn Peryglus 1999.

Yn anffodus, yn fy ardal i, yng Nghasnewydd, yr wythnos hon yn unig bu ymosodiad ar ferch ifanc gan Rottweiler cymydog ar eiddo preifat, ac anffurfiwyd wyneb y ferch. Un enghraifft yn unig yw hon o blith llawer, yn anffodus, ac mae'n dangos yr angen brys i weithredu ar hyn, ac rwyf yn ymrwymedig iawn i wneud hynny.

William Graham: Bydd y Gweinidog yn gwybod bod Dogs Trust yn darparu gweithdai addysgol yn rhad ac am ddim. Maent yn cynnwys amrywiaeth o themâu, yn enwedig perchnogion cŵn cyfrifol, sy'n agwedd bwysig ar ddiogelwch o ran cŵn. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ymrwymo i gael trafodaethau pellach gyda'r elusennau sy'n arbennig o bryderus ynghylch y mater hwn?

John Griffiths: Rwyf yn croesawu'r cwestiwn hwnnw gan William Graham yn fawr iawn. Byddaf yn falch iawn o gael trafodaethau pellach gyda'r sefydliadau hynny sydd â phrofiad ac arbenigedd. Mewn gwirionedd, mae'r Dogs Trust wedi gwneud cynnig caredig iawn i helpu gyda'r gost o osod microsglodion gorfodol, ac rydym yn gwerthfawrogi hynny'n fawr iawn.

Cwestiynau i Gomisiwn y Cynulliad Questions to the Assembly Commission

Hyfforddiant i Aelodau Cynulliad

1. Elin Jones: *Pa gynlluniau sydd gan y Comisiwn i ddarparu hyfforddiant i Aelodau Cynulliad. OAQ(4)0059(AC)*

Assembly Commissioner (Peter Black): Thank you for that question. Following feedback from Members in the third Assembly, the Commission has developed a range of professional development opportunities in consultation with Members, their staff and party groups. These are flexible and varied, and designed to meet the specific needs and requirements of the

Training for Assembly Members

1. Elin Jones: *What plans does the Commission have to provide training for Assembly Members. OAQ(4)0059(AC)*

Comisiynydd y Cynulliad (Peter Black): Diolch am y cwestiwn hwnnw. Yn dilyn adborth gan Aelodau yn y trydydd Cynulliad, mae'r Comisiwn wedi datblygu ystod o gyfleoedd datblygu proffesiynol mewn ymgynghoriad ag Aelodau, eu staff a grwpiau plaid. Mae'r rhain yn hyblyg ac yn amrywiol, ac wedi'u cynllunio i ddiwallu anghenion a gofynion penodol yr unigolion a'r grwpiau

individuals and groups concerned. Feedback on the professional development programme has been very positive. Other UK legislatures have admired the approach and would like to replicate it for themselves.

Elin Jones: Diolch i chi am yr ateb hwnnw. Mae'n beth da bod y Comisiwn yn darparu hyfforddiant i ni fel Aelodau'r Cynulliad. Nid oes un ohonom yn berffaith mae'n siŵr, er bod ambell un ohonom yn meddwl ein bod. A wnewch chi gadarnhau bod y ddarpariaeth hyfforddiant sy'n cael ei gyflenwi yn uniongyrchol gan y Comisiwn yn fewnol yn cael ei chynnig i Aelodau'r Cynulliad a staff yn Gymraeg ac yn Saesneg, a bod y ddarpariaeth hyfforddiant sy'n cael ei gomisiynu yn allanol yn cael ei chynnig i Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn eu dewis iaith?

Peter Black: Thank you for that supplementary question, Elin. Wherever possible, we will identify providers that can deliver professional development opportunities in the preferred language of the applicant or political group. That may not always prove possible, particularly where we commission training from external providers. We do, of course, provide bilingual training materials. However, I will get more detail on this and I will write to you on that specific issue.

Ap Ffôn Deallus

2. Mike Hedges: *A wnaiff y Comisiwn roi brasamcan o gost darparu ap ffôn deallus Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru. OAQ(4)0060(AC)*

Peter Black: Thank you for that question. The Assembly maintains many digital channels by means of which any member of the public can engage and interact—the websites, Facebook, Twitter feeds and seneddtv. As I have indicated previously, I am informed that the likely cost of developing a smartphone application would be between £12,000 and £25,000, depending on the level of functionality. I can also confirm again that we are looking at this and at other ways of ensuring that young people and others can readily access information about the Assembly.

dan sylw. Mae'r adborth ar y rhaglen datblygiad proffesiynol wedi bod yn gadarnhaol iawn. Mae deddfwrfeydd eraill y DU wedi edmygu'r ffordd o weithio a hoffent ei defnyddio eu hunain.

Elin Jones: Thank you for that response. It is good that the Commission provides training for us as Assembly Members. None of us is perfect, I am sure, although some of us may think we are. Will you confirm that the training provision that is provided directly by the Commission internally is offered to Assembly Members and staff in Welsh and English, and that the training provision that is commissioned externally is offered to Assembly Members in their language of choice?

Peter Black: Diolch am y cwestiwn atodol hwnnw, Elin. Lle bynnag y bo'n bosibl, byddwn yn dod o hyd i ddarparwyr sy'n gallu darparu cyfleoedd datblygiad proffesiynol yn newis iaith yr ymgeisydd neu'r grŵp gwleidyddol. Efallai na fydd hynny'n bosibl bob amser, yn enwedig pan fyddwn yn comisiynu hyfforddiant gan ddarparwyr allanol. Rydym, wrth gwrs, yn darparu deunyddiau hyfforddi dwyieithog. Fodd bynnag, caf fwy o fanylion am hyn, a byddaf yn ysgrifennu atoch am y mater penodol hwnnw.

Smartphone App

2. Mike Hedges: *Will the Commission give an approximate cost for the provision of a National Assembly for Wales smart phone app. OAQ(4)0060(AC)*

Peter Black: Diolch am y cwestiwn hwnnw. Mae gan y Cynulliad lawer o sianeli digidol a gall unrhyw aelod o'r cyhoedd eu defnyddio i gysylltu a rhyngweithio—y gwefannau, Facebook, sylwadau Twitter a seneddtv. Fel rwyf eisoes wedi'i ddweud, rwyf ar ddeall y byddai'r gost debygol o ddatblygu rhaglen ffôn deallus rhwng £12,000 a £25,000, yn dibynnu ar lefel y swyddogaeth. Gallaf gadarnhau unwaith eto hefyd ein bod yn edrych ar hyn ac ar ffyrdd eraill o sicrhau y gall pobl ifanc ac eraill gael gafael ar wybodaeth am y Cynulliad yn rhwydd.

Mike Hedges: I thank the Commissioner for that response. Can he tell me how he arrived at a cost of £12,000 to £25,000?

Peter Black: I think, Mike, that it depends on what exactly you want out of an application. Obviously, I could put a teenager in a room and develop an application in an afternoon, but whether that would deliver the functionality that you require, and whether that would meet the standards that the Assembly would require of that application, and not put people off from accessing the Assembly website, for example, is another matter.

Clearly, the issue is not just about developing the application, but making sure that the Assembly websites themselves are accessible and useable on a mobile phone or other mobile device. It is very difficult to give you a precise costing, or reasons for arriving at a costing, without knowing what we are costing, and that is why we are doing this work at the moment to look at exactly what is required and how we propose to deliver it. Once we have gone down that road, we will be able to give you more detail as to where we are and exactly what the cost will be.

Ffioedd gan Gwmnïau Teledu

3. Simon Thomas: *A wnaiff y Comisiynydd ddatganiad am y ffioedd y mae'r Comisiwn yn eu derbyn gan gwmnïau teledu sy'n gweithredu yn y Cynulliad. OAQ(4)0061(AC)*

Peter Black: The Assembly Commission receives payment for rent and service charges from two television companies, the BBC and ITV, for office and studio space within Tŷ Hywel. When television companies film within the Assembly estate we do, from time to time, charge for additional running costs such as staff overtime or additional maintenance support. No other fees are received.

Simon Thomas: I thank the Commissioner for that information. Are these fees are kept under continual review, particularly in the light of inflation, for example? As the

Mike Hedges: Diolch i'r Comisiynydd am yr ateb hwnnw. A all ddweud wrthyf sut y cafodd y gost o £12,000 i £25,000?

Peter Black: Rwyf yn meddwl, Mike, ei fod yn dibynnu ar beth yn union rydych am ei gael o'r rhaglen. Yn amlwg, gallwn roi person yn ei arddedau mewn ystafell a datblygu rhaglen mewn prynhawn, ond mater arall yw a fyddai hynny'n cyflawni'r swyddogaeth sydd ei hangen arnoch, ac a fyddai'n cyrraedd y safonau y byddai'r Cynulliad yn eu disgwyl o'r rhaglen honno, a ddim yn gwneud i bobl beidio â mynd ar wefan y Cynulliad, er enghraifft.

Yn amlwg, nid mater o ddatblygu rhaglen yn unig mo hyn, ond am wneud yn siŵr bod gwefannau'r Cynulliad yn hygyrch a bod modd eu defnyddio ar ffôn symudol neu ddyfais arall symudol. Mae'n anodd iawn rhoi union gost, neu'r rhesymau dros gyrraedd cost benodol, heb wybod beth rydym yn ei gostio, a dyna pam ein bod yn gwneud y gwaith hwn ar hyn o bryd i edrych ar beth yn union sydd ei angen a sut y bwriadwn gyflawni hyn. Ar ôl inni wneud hynny, byddwn yn gallu rhoi mwy o fanylion ynghylch ein sefyllfa a beth fydd y gost yn union.

Fees from Television Companies

Simon Thomas: *Will the Commissioner make a statement on the fees received by the Commission from television companies operating in the Assembly. OAQ(4)0061(AC)*

Peter Black: Mae Comisiwn y Cynulliad yn cael taliad am rent a thaliadau gwasanaeth gan ddau gwmni teledu, y BBC ac ITV, ar gyfer swyddfeydd a gofod stiwdio yn Nhŷ Hywel. Pan fydd cwmnïau teledu yn ffilmio ar ystâd y Cynulliad, rydym, o bryd i'w gilydd, yn codi tâl am gostau rhedeg ychwanegol fel goramser staff neu gymorth cynnal a chadw ychwanegol. Nid oes ffioedd eraill yn cael eu derbyn.

Simon Thomas: Diolch i'r Comisiynydd am y wybodaeth honno. A yw'r ffioedd hyn yn cael eu hadolygu'n barhaus, yn enwedig yn sgîl chwyddiant, er enghraifft? Gan fod y

Commission is facing austerity, like the rest of us, it needs to maximise the income that it can raise. It often appears that this place is used as a free studio and backdrop for television companies, not all of whom are filming things that are directly relevant to the Assembly's work. I ask him to keep this continually under review to ensure that the maximum income is received for the use of this building by television companies and other broadcasters.

Peter Black: Thank you for that supplementary question. We keep all fees and income coming into the Commission, as well as expenditure, under review, and we will continue to do so. I am happy to give that assurance. The balance that we have to strike as an Assembly is between the income that can be generated from the use of the Senedd as a tv studio, for example, as the Member describes, and how accessible we are as a democratic institution in terms of television companies, broadcasters and other media that seek to report what happens here and also to analyse and scrutinise the Government as part of their work. I would not want to put fees and other obstacles in the way of that process, which is important in terms of informing the people of Wales about what Welsh democracy is delivering for them.

Trafodaethau gyda Sefydliadau a Landlordiaid

4 Julie Morgan: *Pa drafodaethau y mae Comisiwn y Cynulliad wedi'u cael yn ddiweddar gyda sefydliadau a landlordiaid gerllaw ystâd y Cynulliad. OAQ(4)0062(AC)*

Peter Black: We have a range of contacts in the locality to explore joint working, activities and events. For example, we attend the Waterfront Partners forum, which includes local government, charity outlets, developers and private businesses operating within Cardiff bay.

Julie Morgan: I thank the Commissioner for that response. Has the Commission considered entering into negotiations with the owners of the empty sites around this building in order to develop food-growing

Comisiwn yn wynebu caledi, fel y gweddill ohonom, mae angen iddo godi cymaint o incwm ag sy'n bosibl. Yn aml, ymddengys fod y lle hwn yn cael ei ddefnyddio fel stiwdio a chefnidir am ddim i gwmnïau teledu, ac nid yw pob un ohonynt yn ffilmio pethau sy'n uniongyrchol berthnasol i waith y Cynulliad. Gofynnaf iddo sicrhau bod hyn yn cael ei adolygu drwy'r amser er mwyn gwneud yn siŵr bod yr incwm mwyaf posibl yn cael ei godi i ddefnyddio'r adeilad hwn gan gwmnïau teledu a darlledwyr eraill.

Peter Black: Diolch am y cwestiwn atodol hwnnw. Adolygir pob ffi ac incwm a ddaw i'r Comisiwn, yn ogystal â gwariant, a byddwn yn parhau i wneud hynny. Rwyf yn hapus i roi'r sicrwydd hwnnw. Rhaid inni fel Cynulliad daro cydbwysedd rhwng yr incwm y gellir ei gynhyrchu o ddefnyddio'r Senedd fel stiwdio deledu, er enghraifft, fel y disgrifia'r Aelod, a pha mor hygyrch yr ydym fel sefydliad democrataidd o ran cwmnïau teledu, darlledwyr a chyfryngau eraill sy'n ceisio adrodd ar yr hyn sy'n digwydd yma a hefyd dadansoddi a chraffu ar y Llywodraeth fel rhan o'u gwaith. Ni fyddwn am i ffioedd a rhwystrau eraill lesteirio'r broses honno, sy'n bwysig o ran hysbysu pobl Cymru am yr hyn y mae democratiaeth Cymru yn ei darparu ar eu cyfer.

Discussions with Organisations and Landlords

Julie Morgan: *What recent discussions has the Assembly Commission had with organisations and landlords adjacent to the Assembly estate. OAQ(4)0062(AC)*

Peter Black: Mae gennym amrywiaeth o gysylltiadau yn yr ardal leol i edrych ar weithio ar y cyd, gweithgareddau a digwyddiadau. Er enghraifft, rydym yn mynychu fforwm Partneriaid y Glannau, sy'n cynnwys llywodraeth leol, siopau elusen, datblygwyr a busnesau preifat sy'n gweithio ym mae Caerdydd.

Julie Morgan: Diolch i'r Comisiynydd am yr ateb hwnnw. A yw'r Comisiwn wedi ystyried dechrau cyd-drafod gyda pherchnogion y safleoedd gwag o gwmpas yr adeilad hwn er mwyn datblygu prosiectau tyfu bwyd sy'n

projects involving staff and Assembly Members? That could be done in partnership with organisations such as the Urdd. I am already growing tomatoes on the window sill in my room, as I know are other Members, and I know that the Commission wants to encourage this type of activity.

Peter Black: I commend the Member on her tomato-growing activities; I am sure that she will be offering them around at a future date for us to taste. The issue here is one of resources in terms of staff and the time available to Members and anyone else who might undertake this activity. We have very limited green spaces in the area, and, while there is a plot of land adjacent to the Senedd, it is not owned by the Assembly. We would have to make a judgment as to whether we would want our staff out there tending to vegetables as opposed to delivering the service that Members have come to expect of them. If the Member does not mind, I will take that under advisement and discuss it further, rather than giving any positive response at this time.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Question 5, OAQ(4)0063(AC), has been withdrawn.

cynnwys staff ac Aelodau Cynulliad? Gellid gwneud hynny mewn partneriaeth â sefydliadau fel yr Urdd. Rwyf eisoes yn tyfu tomatos ar sil ffenestr fy ystafell, ac rwyf yn gwybod bod Aelodau eraill yn gwneud hynny hefyd, a gwn fod y Comisiwn am annog y math hwn o weithgaredd.

Peter Black: Cymeradwyaf yr Aelod am dyfu tomatos; rwyf yn siŵr y bydd yn cynnig blas inni yn y dyfodol. Y broblem yma yw adnoddau o ran staff a'r amser sydd ar gael i Aelodau ac unrhyw un arall a allai ymgymryd â'r gweithgaredd hwn. Ychydig iawn o fannau gwyrdd sydd gennym yn yr ardal, ac, er bod llain o dir ger y Senedd, nid y Cynulliad sy'n berchen arno. Byddai'n rhaid inni benderfynu a fyddem am weld ein staff yn trin llysiau yn hytrach nag yn darparu'r gwasanaeth y mae Aelodau wedi dod i ddisgwyl ganddynt. Os nad oes gwahaniaeth gan yr Aelod, byddaf yn ystyried hyn ac yn ei drafod ymhellach, yn hytrach na rhoi unrhyw ymateb cadarnhaol ar hyn o bryd.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Tynnwyd cwestiwn 5, OAQ(4)0063(AC), yn ôl.

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd Dros Dro (Peter Black) i'r Gadair am 3.09 p.m.
The Temporary Deputy Presiding Officer (Peter Black) took the Chair at 3.09 p.m.*

**Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Materion Cyfansoddiadol a Deddfwriaethol ar Roi
Pwerau i Weinidogion Cymru yn Neddfau'r DU
The Constitutional and Legislative Affairs Committee's Report on Powers
Granted to Welsh Ministers in UK Laws**

Cynnig NDM5022 David Melding

Motion NDM5022 David Melding

Cynnig bod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

The National Assembly for Wales:

Yn nodi adroddiad y Pwyllgor Materion Cyfansoddiadol a Deddfwriaethol ar yr ymchwiliad i'r pwerau a roddir i Weinidogion Cymru yn neddfau'r DU, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ddydd Gwener 23 Mawrth 2012.

Notes the report of the Constitutional and Legislative Affairs Committee on its inquiry into the granting of powers to Welsh Ministers in UK laws, which was laid in the Table Office on Friday 23 March 2012.

David Melding: I move the motion.

David Melding: Cynigiau y cynnig.

I am pleased to open this debate on the Constitutional and Legislative Affairs

Mae'n bleser gennyf agor y ddadl hon am ymchwiliad y Pwyllgor Materion

Committee's inquiry into the granting of powers to Welsh Ministers in UK laws. The committee agreed to carry out this inquiry because Westminster legislation continues to confer powers directly on Welsh Ministers and make laws in areas that are within the legislative competence of the National Assembly. The Public Bodies Act 2011 and the Localism Act 2011 are two notable and fairly recent examples. However, this is not a historical anomaly. Within the past month, the Government has tabled memorandums seeking the Assembly's consent to provisions in the Enterprise and Regulatory Reform Bill and the Local Government Finance Bill, both of which are currently before Parliament. In the latter case, the legislation is of great significance and will have a real impact on public policy in Wales.

Our inquiry looked at how legislative consent is dealt with in the National Assembly and whether scrutiny mechanisms, including our Standing Orders, are effective, particularly in comparison with other devolved legislatures. We also looked at the arrangements between the UK and the devolved Governments and at whether these need to be updated in light of recent Welsh constitutional developments.

A number of themes emerged from the evidence we received. Foremost among these is the need for the Assembly to be able to scrutinise legislative consent proposals effectively and hold Welsh Ministers to account when they propose to use legislative powers. Legislative consent motions can often be an effective and efficient way of dealing with technical and non-contentious matters, particularly where these involve cross-border issues. Far from them diminishing in number, the evidence we received suggested that we can expect to see more use of them in future. However, LCMs should not be used for significant or politically contentious pieces of legislation that could be made in Acts of the Assembly, unless the matter is clearly urgent or involves issues of cross-border provision that cannot be dealt with in any other way.

Cyfansoddiadol a Deddfwriaethol i ganiatáu pwerau i Weinidogion Cymru yng nghyfreithiau'r DU. Cytunodd y pwyllgor i gynnal yr ymchwiliad gan fod deddfwriaeth San Steffan yn dal i roi pwerau'n uniongyrchol i Weinidogion Cymru a gwneud cyfreithiau mewn meysydd sydd o fewn cymhwysedd deddfwriaethol y Cynulliad. Mae Deddf Cyrff Cyhoeddus 2011 a Deddf Lleoliaeth 2011 yn ddwy enghraifft amlwg ac eithaf diweddar. Fodd bynnag, nid yw hyn yn beth anrheolaidd yn hanesyddol. O fewn y mis diwethaf, mae'r Llywodraeth wedi cyflwyno memoranda i geisio cydsyniad y Cynulliad i ddarpariaethau yn y Bil Menter a Diwygio Rheoleiddio ac yn y Bil Cyllid Llywodraeth Leol, sydd ill dau gerbron y Senedd ar hyn o bryd. Yn yr ail achos, mae'r deddfwriaeth yn arwyddocaol iawn a chaiff effaith wirioneddol ar bolisi cyhoeddus yng Nghymru.

Edrychodd ein hymchwiliad ar sut y mae'r Cynulliad yn ymdrin â chydsyniad deddfwriaethol ac a yw mecanweithiau craffu, gan gynnwys ein Rheolau Sefydlog, yn effeithiol, yn enwedig o gymharu â deddfwrfeydd datganoledig eraill. Edrychasom hefyd ar y trefniadau rhwng y DU a'r Llywodraethau datganoledig gan ystyried a oes angen diweddarau'r rhain yng ngoleuni datblygiadau cyfansoddiadol diweddar yng Nghymru.

Daeth nifer o themâu i'r amlwg o'r dystiolaeth a gawsom. Yr amlycaf o'r rhain yw bod angen i'r Cynulliad allu craffu'n effeithiol ar gynigion cydsyniad deddfwriaethol a dal Gweinidogion Cymru i gyfrif pan maent yn cynnig defnyddio pwerau deddfwriaethol. Yn aml, gall cynigion cydsyniad deddfwriaethol fod yn ffordd effeithiol ac effeithlon o ymdrin â materion technegol nad ydynt yn ddadleuol, yn enwedig os ydynt yn ymwneud â materion trawsffiniol. Yr oedd y dystiolaeth a gawsom yn awgrymu y gallwn ddisgwyl gweld mwy o'u defnyddio yn y dyfodol, nid llai. Fodd bynnag, ni ddylid defnyddio cynigion cydsyniad deddfwriaethol ar gyfer deddfwriaeth arwyddocaol neu wleidyddol ddadleuol y gellid eu gwneud mewn Deddfau'r Cynulliad, oni bai ei bod yn amlwg bod y mater yn fater brys neu'n ymwneud â darpariaeth drawsffiniol nad oes

The guiding principle should be that the Assembly should be fully in control of the scrutiny and approval of powers that affect its competence and the powers of Ministers accountable to it. The committee believes that the changes we have recommended to the Assembly's Standing Orders will help to turn this principle into practice. We also believe that there should be earlier and better warning of UK Bills that have implications for the Assembly's competence. This means that Whitehall needs to understand better the new devolution settlement in Wales and to take it into account at an earlier stage. This has been achieved to a great extent in Scotland, and there is no reason why there should not be similar co-operation between Whitehall departments and the Welsh Government to ensure that the Assembly is able to consider LCMs in good time.

Turning to some of our specific recommendations, legislative consent motions arise from the Sewel convention. This was explained during the passage of the 1998 Scotland Act by the Scottish Office Minister Lord Sewel as

'a convention...that Westminster would not normally legislate with regard to devolved matters in Scotland without the consent of the Scottish Parliament.'

Since the National Assembly gained primary legislative powers, this principle has also been extended to Wales. It was restated last year in a revised memorandum of understanding between the UK Government, Scottish Ministers, Welsh Ministers and the Northern Ireland Executive. The convention in its current form is, therefore, primarily an agreement between Governments and has never been formally endorsed by the National Assembly. It was put to us that the Assembly itself might wish to endorse the convention and set out what it considers it means and what action the Welsh Government should take to comply with it, and we agree. For this reason, we have recommended that the Assembly should consider a declaratory motion setting out clearly the Assembly's understanding of the convention and how the Welsh Government should act in compliance

modd delio â hi mewn unrhyw ffordd arall.

Dylai mai'r egwyddor arweiniol yw bod gan y Cynulliad reolaeth lwyr dros graffu ar bwerau sy'n effeithio ar ei gymhwysedd ac ar bwerau Gweinidogion sy'n atebol iddo, a dros gymeradwyo'r pwerau hyn. Mae'r pwyllgor yn credu y bydd y newidiadau yr ydym wedi eu hargymell i Reolau Sefydlog y Cynulliad yn helpu i droi'r egwyddor hwn yn arfer. Credwn hefyd y dylid cael rhybudd cynharach a gwell o Filiau'r DU â goblygiadau i gymhwysedd y Cynulliad. Mae hyn yn golygu bod ar Whitehall angen gwell dealltwriaeth o'r setliad datganoli newydd yng Nghymru a'i ystyried ar gam cynharach. Mae hyn wedi'i gyflawni i raddau helaeth yn yr Alban, ac nid oes dim rheswm pam na ddylid sicrhau cydweithredu tebyg rhwng adrannau Whitehall a Llywodraeth Cymru i sicrhau y gall y Cynulliad ystyried cynigion cydsyniad deddfwriaethol mewn da bryd.

I droi at rai o'n hargymhellion penodol, mae cynigion cydsyniad deddfwriaethol yn deillio o gonfensiwn Sewel. Eglurwyd hwn gan Weinidog Swyddfa'r Alban, yr Arglwydd Sewel, pan basiodd Ddeddf yr Alban 1998 fel

confensiwn...na fyddai San Steffan fel rheol yn deddfu mewn meysydd datganoledig yn yr Alban heb gydsyniad Senedd yr Alban.

Ers i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol gael pwerau deddfu sylfaenol, mae'r egwyddor hon wedi'i hymestyn i Gymru hefyd. Cafodd ei hailddatgan y llynedd mewn memorandwm dealltwriaeth diwygiedig rhwng Llywodraeth y DU, Gweinidogion yr Alban, Gweinidogion Cymru a Gweithrediaeth Gogledd Iwerddon. Felly, mae'r confensiwn, ar ei ffurf bresennol, yn gytundeb rhwng Llywodraethau yn bennaf ac ni chafodd erioed ei gymeradwyo'n ffurfiol gan y Cynulliad. Awgrymwyd wrthym y dymunai'r Cynulliad ei hun, efallai, gymeradwyo'r confensiwn ac amlinellu'r hyn y mae'n ystyried ei fod yn ei olygu a'r camau y dylai Llywodraeth Cymru eu cymryd i gydymffurfio ag ef, ac yr ydym yn cytuno. Am y rheswm hwn, yr ydym wedi argymell y dylai'r Cynulliad ystyried cynnig datganiadol i amlinellu'n glir beth yw dealltwriaeth y

with it.

As I mentioned earlier, it is likely that there will be a continuing need for legislative consent motions. In Scotland, there have been more than 100 such motions since the Scottish Parliament was established. The opportunity to use Westminster Bills for minor and technical reasons, or in an emergency, should not be discounted, but we were pleased to note the First Minister's clear view in evidence to us that, in future, he expected that Assembly Bills would be the normal mechanism for conferring powers on Welsh Ministers.

3.15 p.m.

If the Assembly is to be able to properly scrutinise those LCMs that come forward, it needs to be told of proposals at the earliest opportunity. In Scotland, the Government provides information at an early stage in a letter to the Presiding Officer about the implications of the Bills announced in each Queen's Speech at Westminster. This is copied to all Members of the Scottish Parliament including committee conveners and is made publicly available. We see no reason why a similar approach should not be followed in Wales, and we have recommended accordingly.

Of course, the Welsh Government can provide information to the Assembly in a timely fashion only if it is consulted in good time by the UK Government. In Scotland, legislative consent memorandums are usually available within days of a Westminster Bill being published, which suggests a high level of contact between civil servants in Scotland and Whitehall prior to publication. In Wales, memos are often produced at a much later stage, which allows less time for effective scrutiny. The supplementary LCM on the Welfare Reform Bill is a case in point. It had been the subject of four committee reports in the Scottish Parliament before Welsh amendments were laid before the Assembly for consideration. Part of the reason for that may be a difference between the Scottish Parliament's Standing Orders and ours, which may have unintentionally created a

Cynulliad o'r confensiwn a sut y dylai Llywodraeth Cymru weithredu i gydymffurfio ag ef.

Fel y nodais yn gynharach, mae'n debygol y bydd angen parhaus am gynigion cydsyniad deddfwriaethol. Yn yr Alban, cafwyd dros 100 cynnig o'r fath ers sefydlu Senedd yr Alban. Ni ddylid diystyru'r cyfle i ddefnyddio Biliau San Steffan am resymau mân a thechnegol, nac mewn argyfwng, ond yr oeddem yn falch o nodi barn glir y Prif Weinidog mewn tystiolaeth inni ei fod yn disgwyl mai Biliau'r Cynulliad, yn y dyfodol, fyddai'r mecanwaith arferol ar gyfer rhoi pwerau i Weinidogion Cymru.

Er mwyn i'r Cynulliad allu craffu'n briodol ar y cynigion cydsyniad deddfwriaethol a gyflwynir, mae angen iddynt gael gwybod am gynigion cyn gynted â phosibl. Yn yr Alban, mae'r Llywodraeth yn rhoi gwybodaeth yn gynnar mewn llythyr i'r Llywydd am oblygiadau'r Biliau a gyhoeddir ym mhob un o Areithiau'r Frenhines yn San Steffan. Anfonir copi o hwn i holl Aelodau Senedd yr Alban gan gynnwys cynullyddion pwyllgorau ac mae ar gael i'r cyhoedd. Ni welwn ddim rheswm pam na ddylid defnyddio dull tebyg yng Nghymru, ac yr ydym wedi argymhell hynny.

Wrth gwrs, ni all Llywodraeth Cymru roi gwybodaeth amserol i'r Cynulliad oni bai bod Llywodraeth y DU yn ymgynghori â hi mewn da bryd. Yn yr Alban, fel rheol mae memoranda cydsyniad deddfwriaethol ar gael o fewn dyddiau ar ôl i Fil San Steffan gael ei gyhoeddi, sy'n awgrymu lefel uchel o gyswllt rhwng gweision sifil yn yr Alban a Whitehall cyn eu cyhoeddi. Yng Nghymru, yn aml caiff y memos eu cynhyrchu'n llawer diweddarach, sy'n rhoi llai o amser i graffu arnynt yn effeithiol. Mae'r cynnig cydsyniad deddfwriaethol atodol ar y Bil Diwygio Lles yn enghraifft dda. Bu'n destun pedwar adroddiad pwyllgor yn Senedd yr Alban cyn i ddiwygiadau Cymru gael eu gosod gerbron y Cynulliad i'w hystyried. Efallai mai rhan o'r rheswm am hynny yw gwahaniaeth rhwng Rheolau Sefydlog Senedd yr Alban a'n rhai ni; gallai hyn yn anfwriadol fod wedi creu

perverse incentive to provide the Assembly with information only when agreement has been reached on all details. That can have the effect of allowing little time for scrutiny and means that the scrutiny process cannot influence the final shape of the legislative proposal concerned.

The Welsh Government also needs to ensure that it has the right mechanisms and resources in place to engage with Whitehall in a timely manner. We have recommended that the Welsh Government establish a central unit that has the task of keeping abreast of any legislative developments in Whitehall and Westminster that might affect Wales and the Assembly.

Of course, it is the Assembly that has the main and ultimate responsibility for giving legislative consent, and it is important that our scrutiny procedures be fit for purpose. In our view, the fundamental principle should be that Welsh Ministers should be fully accountable to the National Assembly. If this principle is to be meaningful, the Assembly must be able to properly scrutinise all legislative consent proposals and must be satisfied that it has had a proper opportunity to do so.

Our current scrutiny arrangements are set out in Standing Order Nos. 29 and 30. They are similar to those in the Scottish Parliament. In both cases, the Government is required to lay a memorandum, setting out the reasons for the proposed provisions, their effect and why the Government believes they are needed. Consent is then required through consideration of a motion in Plenary.

However, there are also significant differences between our and the Scottish procedures. Our Standing Orders differentiate between provisions that are within legislative competence and those that impact only on the functions of Ministers, with no requirement for consent to be given to the latter category involving functions of Ministers. No such distinction is made in Scotland. In the Assembly, whether an LCM is referred to a committee for detailed scrutiny is at the discretion of the Business Committee. In Scotland, LCMs must be referred to a

cymhelliad gwrthnysig i beidio â rhoi gwybodaeth i'r Cynulliad tan y cytunir ar bob manylyn. Gall hynny achosi diffyg amser i graffu gan olygu na all y broses graffu ddylanwadu ar siâp terfynol y cynnig deddfwriaethol dan sylw.

Mae angen i Lywodraeth Cymru sicrhau hefyd bod ganddi'r mecanweithiau a'r adnoddau cywir i gysylltu'n amserol â Whitehall. Yr ydym wedi argymhell bod Llywodraeth Cymru'n sefydlu uned ganolog â'r dasg o gasglu'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am unrhyw ddatblygiadau deddfwriaethol yn Whitehall a San Steffan a allai effeithio ar Gymru a'r Cynulliad.

Wrth gwrs, y Cynulliad sydd â'r cyfrifoldeb pennaf a therfynol am roi cydsyniad deddfwriaethol, ac mae'n bwysig bod ein gweithdrefnau craffu'n addas at eu diben. Yn ein barn ni, dylai mai'r egwyddor sylfaenol yw y dylai Gweinidogion Cymru fod yn gwbl atebol i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Er mwyn i'r egwyddor hon fod yn ystyrlon, rhaid i'r Cynulliad allu craffu'n briodol ar bob cynnig cydsyniad deddfwriaethol a bod yn fodlon eu bod wedi cael cyfle priodol i wneud hynny.

Mae ein trefniadau craffu presennol wedi'u hamlinellu yn Rheolau Sefydlog Rhif 29 a 30. Maent yn debyg i rai Senedd yr Alban. Yn y naill achos a'r llall, mae'n ofynnol i'r Llywodraeth osod memorandwm, yn amlinellu'r rhesymau am y darpariaethau arfaethedig, eu heffaith a pham mae'r Llywodraeth yn credu bod eu hangen. Yna bydd gofyn cael cydsyniad drwy ystyried cynnig mewn Cyfarfod Llawn.

Fodd bynnag, ceir gwahaniaethau pwysig hefyd rhwng ein gweithdrefnau ni a rhai'r Alban. Mae ein Rheolau Sefydlog ni'n gwahaniaethu rhwng darpariaethau sydd o fewn cymhwysedd deddfwriaethol a rhai sy'n effeithio ar swyddogaethau Gweinidogion yn unig, ac nid oes angen rhoi cydsyniad i'r ail gategori sy'n ymwneud â swyddogaethau Gweinidogion. Nid yw'r Alban yn gwahaniaethu fel hyn. Yn y Cynulliad, mater i'r Pwyllgor Busnes yw penderfynu a gaiff cynnig cydsyniad deddfwriaethol ei gyfeirio at bwyllgor i graffu arno'n fanwl. Yn yr

committee for scrutiny and they cannot be considered by the Scottish Parliament as a whole until the committee has reported.

There was broad support among those who gave evidence that the Assembly should strengthen its Standing Orders to bring them, essentially, into line with the arrangements that apply in Scotland. We have made a number of specific recommendations for changes to Standing Orders towards that end.

I look forward to the contributions from the Leader of the House on behalf of the Business Committee. I am glad that the Government has accepted most of our recommendations, but I must confess to some initial disappointment that the Government seems to have rejected some of the central recommendations that we made. However, having read its reasons, I am inclined to view the response as accepting the central principles that we advocated, and the real concern that the Government had was how best to apply those principles in practice. The response of the Business Committee clarifies this matter, and I would be grateful if the Minister would give her assurance that what I have interpreted as being the case is actually the situation. I conclude by thanking all those who gave evidence to the committee, the committee members and, most of all, the committee staff, whose sterling work helped us to prepare this important report.

Simon Thomas: Mae'n dda gennyf gael y cyfle i siarad yn gryno am yr adroddiad hwn, sy'n bwysig ac yn amserol, fel y mae'r Cadeirydd newydd ei amlinellu, a ninnau fel Cynulliad ond wedi trafod cynnig cydsyniad deddfwriaethol ddoe. Roedd hwnnw, efallai, yn ddadleuol o ran polisi ac o ran sut yr oedd y Llywodraeth wedi delio ag ef. Gobeithio y bydd nifer o'r argymhellion yn yr adroddiad hwn yn gwneud delio â'r broses hon yn symlach, yn eglurach ac, yn bwysicach byth, yn fwy parod. Hynny yw, byddwn ni fel Cynulliad yn cael gwybod dipyn mwy o flaen llaw am yr angen i roi cydsyniad deddfwriaethol ac felly mewn sefyllfa well i'w drafod a'i ystyried yn llawn.

Alban, rhaid i bob cynnig cydsyniad deddfwriaethol gael ei gyfeirio at bwyllgor i graffu arno ac ni all holl Senedd yr Alban ei ystyried tan mae'r pwyllgor wedi rhoi adroddiad.

Cafwyd cefnogaeth gyffredinol ymysg y rheini a roddodd dystiolaeth y dylai'r Cynulliad gryfhau eu Rheolau Sefydlog i'w gwneud yr un fath, i bob diben, â'r trefniadau a ddefnyddir yn yr Alban. Yr ydym wedi gwneud nifer o argymhellion penodol am newidiadau i Reolau Sefydlog at y diben hwnnw.

Edrychaf ymlaen at y cyfraniadau gan Arweinydd y Tŷ ar ran y Pwyllgor Busnes. Yr wyf yn falch bod y Llywodraeth wedi derbyn y rhan fwyaf o'n hargymhellion, ond rhaid imi gyfaddef y cefais fy siomi ychydig i ddechrau gan ei bod yn ymddangos bod y Llywodraeth wedi gwrthod rhai o'n hargymhellion canolog. Fodd bynnag, ar ôl darllen eu rhesymau, ystyriaf eu bod wedi derbyn yr egwyddorion canolog yr oeddem yn eu hawgrymu, a bod gwir bryder y Llywodraeth yn ymwneud â'r ffordd orau o roi'r egwyddorion hynny ar waith yn ymarferol. Mae ymateb y Pwyllgor Busnes yn egluro hyn, a byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe bai'r Gweinidog yn rhoi ei sicrwydd mai'r hyn yr wyf wedi'i ddehongli yw'r sefyllfa wirioneddol. Diweddaf drwy ddiolch i bawb a roddodd dystiolaeth i'r pwyllgor, i aelodau'r pwyllgor ac, yn bennaf, i staff y pwyllgor; eu gwaith caled hwy a'n helpodd i baratoi'r adroddiad pwysig hwn.

Simon Thomas: I am pleased to have the opportunity to speak briefly about this report, which is important and timely, as the Chair has just outlined, given that we as an Assembly were only yesterday discussing a legislative consent motion. That one was, perhaps, contentious in respect of policy and in how the Government had dealt with it. I hope that many of the recommendations in this report will make dealing with this process simpler, clearer and, even more importantly, better prepared. That is, we as an Assembly will have a bit more prior notice of the need to give legislative consent and will therefore be in a better position to discuss and consider it fully.

I mi, roedd gan y pwyllgor dri phrif bwynt. Yn gyntaf oll, fel y dywedodd y Cadeirydd, dylai pob cynnig cydsyniad deddfwriaethol gael ei gyfeirio at bwyllgor i'w graffu. Mae'n wir fod y rhan fwyaf o'r cynigion hyn yn dechnegol eu natur heb godi unrhyw bryder nac angen am graffu—dim pellach na'r ffaith eu bod wedi'u cyfeirio at bwyllgor. Fodd bynnag, mae'r broses yn un pwysig, mae'n gweithio'n dda yn yr Alban, ac mae'n selio hawl y Cynulliad i oruchwyllo'r broses hon. Ennill grymoedd i Gymru fel cenedl yr ydym yn y bôn. Waeth a yw'r grymoedd hynny yn mynd i'r Senedd neu i Weinidogion, maent yn adeiladu ar y grymoedd datganoledig yng Nghymru, ac mae'n bwysig ein bod, fel Senedd sydd wedi'i hethol, yn goruchwyllo'r broses honno.

Yr ail fater yr oedd y pwyllgor yn ei bwysleisio oedd y dylid cael gwared ar y gwahaniaeth sydd rhwng Rheolau Sefydlog Rhifau 29 a 30, fel y dywedodd y Cadeirydd. Esboniodd y Cadeirydd yn glir pam mae angen gwneud hynny ac, unwaith eto, pam mae hynny'n gweithio'n dda mewn seneddau datganoledig eraill ym Mhrydain.

Y pwynt olaf yn adroddiad y pwyllgor yr wyf am ei bwysleisio yw ei bod yn bwysig ein bod yn cael ystyried egwyddor a mater cynigion cydsyniad deddfwriaethol o flaen llaw, efallai cyn iddynt fod yn rhy ffurfiol. Mae hwn yn bwynt pwysig iawn. Cwynais ddoe yn y Siambr ein bod yn gweld y cynnig cydsyniad deddfwriaethol yn rhy hwyr yn y dydd ac nad oedd modd, felly, inni roi ystyriaeth lawn iddo. Pe bai modd i'r Llywodraeth ddod ag argymhellion gerbron, heb inni orfod mynd drwy broses ffurfiol o dan y Rheolau Sefydlog, byddai'n cryfhau'r gwaith craffu, yn cyfoethogi'r ddadl ac yn ei gwneud yn haws i'r Llywodraeth a'r Senedd ddod i gytundeb a dealltwriaeth o ran yr angen i ddeddfu mewn lle arall yn hytrach na drwy Fil yn y fan hon.

Yn fwy penodol, mae'r tri mater hwnnw yn troi o gwmpas argymhellion 5, 6 a 7. Rwy'n siomedig, braidd, fod y Llywodraeth wedi gwrthod argymhellion 6 a 7, sy'n ymwneud â newid y Rheolau Sefydlog. Fel y dywedodd y Cadeirydd, mae gan y Pwyllgor Busnes ateb mwy positif i'r mater hwn. Rydym mewn

For me, the committee had three main points. First of all, as the Chair said, every legislative consent motion should be referred to a committee for scrutiny. It is true that the majority of these motions are technical in nature and would not give rise to any concerns or any need for scrutiny—no more than the fact that they have been referred to a committee. However, it is an important process, it works well in Scotland, and it secures the Assembly's right to have oversight of this process. In essence, we are gaining powers for Wales as a nation. Regardless of whether those powers go to the Assembly or to Ministers, they add to the devolved powers of Wales, and it is important that we, as a Senedd that has been elected, have that overview of the process.

The second issue that the committee emphasised was the need to remove the difference between Standing Order Nos. 29 and 30, as the Chair said. The Chair clearly explained why that needs to be done, and, once again, why that works well in other devolved parliaments in the UK.

The final point in the committee's report that I want to emphasise is that it is important that we should consider the principle and substance of legislative consent motions beforehand, prior to their becoming too formal. That is a very important point. I complained in the Chamber yesterday that we were seeing the legislative consent motion too late in the day and that it was therefore not possible for us to give it our full consideration. If the Government were able to bring forward recommendations without the need to go through the formal procedure in Standing Orders, it would strengthen scrutiny, enhance the debate and make it easier for the Government and the Assembly to reach an agreement and an understanding on the need for legislation in another place rather than by a Bill in this place.

More specifically, those three issues revolve around recommendations 5, 6 and 7. I am a little disappointed that the Government has rejected recommendations 6 and 7, which relate to changes to Standing Orders. As the Chair said, the Business Committee has a more positive solution to the issue. We are in

perygl o fynd i ddadl braidd yn ddiwinyddol o ran beth yw eithriadau a'r beth sy'n normal ac ati. Yn y bôn, yr egwyddor yw os ydym i ddeddfu, os ydym i ganiatáu i Weinidogion ennill grymoedd, neu os ydym i ganiatáu deddfu yn San Steffan yn hytrach nag yn y fan hon, fel rheol, dylai hynny gael ei ystyried gan bwyllgor a chan y Senedd. Dylai gael ei ystyried mewn da bryd hefyd, fel ein bod yn deall y rhesymau y tu ôl i wneud hynny. Mae cynigion y Pwyllgor Busnes yn cynnig ffordd ymlaen. Os ydym yn eu derbyn fel Cynulliad, gan gydweithio â'r Llywodraeth, byddwn yn cryfhau ein gwaith craffu ac yn cyfoethogi democratiaeth o ryw fymryn.

Suzy Davies: Before I begin, I also thank the Chair, the clerk, the deputy clerk and all the witnesses who took part in this inquiry.

As Members will see, the committee report shows a significant level of examination of the evidence in what can be a rather difficult and detailed subject for investigation. We have called in witnesses to examine their views, and we have tested the implications, even the unintended implications, of our suggestions for a way forward. In short, we have given this matter the level of scrutiny that we, on behalf of the Assembly, considered appropriate.

The scrutiny of legislation that affects Wales, however it arises, is one of the main functions of the Assembly, and it should be of especial interest where that legislation seeks to give powers to Welsh Ministers, powers that they can exercise over our constituents.

The inquiry was guided by the general principle that powers should be granted to Welsh Ministers in devolved areas only with the informed consent of the National Assembly, which should be able to exercise appropriate scrutiny over the process concerned. In evidence, the First Minister set out the Welsh Government principle that primary legislation in devolved areas should be enacted by the National Assembly. However, he also cited a number of examples in which the convenience of the legislative

danger of getting into an almost theological debate about what the exceptions are and what is normal and so on. In essence, the principle is that if we are to legislate, if we are to allow Ministers to gain powers, or if we are to allow Westminster to legislate rather than this place, as a rule, that should be considered by a committee and by the Assembly. It should also be considered in plenty of time, so that we understand the reasoning behind it. The Business Committee's proposals offer a way forward. If we accept them as an Assembly, working together with the Government, we will strengthen our scrutiny and enhance democracy a little more.

Suzy Davies: Cyn imi ddechrau, carwn ddiolch hefyd i'r Cadeirydd, y cler, y dirprwy glerc a'r holl dystion a gymerodd ran yn yr ymchwiliad hwn.

Fel y gwêl Aelodau, mae adroddiad y pwyllgor yn dangos lefel sylweddol o archwilio'r dystiolaeth mewn pwnc sy'n gallu bod yn eithaf anodd a manwl i ymchwilio iddo. Yr ydym wedi galw ar dystion i archwilio eu barn, ac yr ydym wedi profi goblygiadau, hyd yn oed oblygiadau anfwriadol, ein hawgrymiadau ar gyfer y ffordd ymlaen. Yn gryno, yr ydym wedi craffu ar y mater hwn i raddau yr oeddem ni, ar ran y Cynulliad, yn ystyried eu bod yn briodol.

Mae craffu ar ddeddfwriaeth sy'n effeithio ar Gymru, o ble bynnag y daw, yn un o brif swyddogaethau'r Cynulliad, a dylai fod o ddiddordeb arbennig os yw'r ddeddfwriaeth honno'n ceisio rhoi pwerau i Weinidogion Cymru, pwerau y gallant eu defnyddio dros ein hetholwyr.

Llywiwyd yr ymchwiliad gan yr egwyddor gyffredinol mai dim ond â chydysyniad deallus y Cynulliad y dylid rhoi pwerau i Weinidogion Cymru mewn meysydd datganoledig, ac y dylai'r Cynulliad allu craffu'n briodol ar y broses dan sylw. Mewn tystiolaeth, amlinellodd y Prif Weinidog egwyddor Llywodraeth Cymru mai'r Cynulliad ddylai gyflawni deddfu sylfaenol mewn meysydd datganoledig. Fodd bynnag, enwodd hefyd nifer o enghreifftiau lle gallai cyfleustra trefn cynnig cydsyniad

consent motion procedure might be appropriate instead, including for matters that are minor, technical or non-contentious—and I agree with Simon Thomas that these do not really require much Assembly time.

The first of the other areas in which the First Minister thought that LCMs might be useful is where a Bill covers devolved and non-devolved matters, or matters over which the two administrative regimes are so intertwined that it would only be practical to proceed together in one Bill.

Secondly, the First Minister said that LCMs would be useful where the UK's legislative proposal would be appropriate in Wales but there is no time to bring forward similar proposals in the Assembly.

Thirdly, he suggested that UK Bills that extend the powers of Welsh Ministers or the Assembly itself outside current devolved competences may confer those powers via LCM.

In all those cases, I am sure that all Members would acknowledge the obligation to give the LCM their full consideration, to be sure that their consent is informed consent. If you start from the First Minister's presumption, that we make our own laws in areas of devolved competence, we must have good reason to depart from that principle. To assess whether there is good reason, the Assembly must have the opportunity to scrutinise what is proposed, and the Assembly must carry out that scrutiny as it thinks appropriate, especially as we have no second chamber to rectify errors. It is not sufficient, as the First Minister said in his response to this report, merely to allow that

'The Welsh Government will always seek to respect the Assembly's desire for full scrutiny by the relevant Committee for the Legislative Consent Motions'.

deddfwriaethol fod yn briodol yn lle hynny, gan gynnwys ar gyfer materion sy'n fân, yn dechnegol neu nad ydynt yn ddadleuol—a chytunaf â Simon Thomas nad oes gwir angen rhoi llawer o amser y Cynulliad i'r rhain.

Y cyntaf o'r meysydd eraill lle'r oedd y Prif Weinidog yn credu y gallai cynigion cydsyniad deddfwriaethol fod yn ddefnyddiol yw pan mae Bil yn ymwneud â materion datganoledig a rhai heb eu datganoli, neu â materion lle mae'r ddwy drefn weinyddol wedi'u plethu i'r fath raddau fel na fyddai'n ymarferol symud ymlaen mewn mwy nag un Bil.

Yn ail, dywedodd y Prif Weinidog y byddai cynigion cydsyniad deddfwriaethol yn ddefnyddiol pan fyddai cynnig deddfwriaethol y DU yn briodol yng Nghymru, ond na fyddai amser i gyflwyno cynigion tebyg yn y Cynulliad.

Yn drydydd, awgrymodd y gallai Biliau'r DU sy'n ymestyn pwerau Gweinidogion Cymru neu'r Cynulliad ei hun y tu allan i gymwyseddau sydd wedi'u datganoli ar hyn o bryd roi'r pwerau hynny drwy gyfrwng cynnig cydsyniad deddfwriaethol.

Yn yr achosion hynny i gyd, yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai pob Aelod yn cydnabod yr ymrwymiad i ystyried y cynnig cydsyniad deddfwriaethol yn llawn, i fod yn siŵr bod eu cydsyniad yn gydsyniad deallus. Gan ddechrau o ragdybiaeth y Prif Weinidog, sef ein bod yn gwneud ein cyfreithiau ein hunain mewn meysydd cymhwysedd datganoledig, rhaid inni fod â rheswm da i adael yr egwyddor honno. I asesu a oes rheswm da, rhaid i'r Cynulliad gael cyfle i graffu ar yr hyn a gynigir, a rhaid i'r Cynulliad gyflawni'r gwaith craffu hwnnw mewn modd y mae'n credu ei fod yn briodol, yn enwedig gan nad oes gennym ail siambr i gywiro gwallau. Nid yw'n ddigonol, fel y dywedodd y Prif Weinidog yn ei ymateb i'r adroddiad hwn, i ganiatáu yn unig

bydd Llywodraeth Cymru bob amser yn ceisio parchu dyhead y Cynulliad am i'r Pwyllgor perthnasol graffu'n llawn ar y Cynigion Cydsyniad Deddfwriaethol.

It is not the Assembly's 'desire' that we are talking about but the Assembly's duty. It is not for the Welsh Government to 'seek' to respect this duty; it must respect it. The Welsh Government is accountable to the Assembly, and it is for the Assembly to decide what constitutes appropriate scrutiny.

Of course, that presents practical problems. I accept that, and I welcome the fact that the Welsh Government has agreed to some of the recommendations to overcome those problems. However, in rejecting recommendations 7 and 8, I believe that the Welsh Government is still resistant to addressing timing problems, which the Chair and Simon Thomas have alluded to, which prevent scrutiny to a standard that I as an Assembly Member would like. Bearing in mind the contributions from other Members yesterday on the Local Government Finance Bill LCM, as well as Members' views on the Welfare Reform Bill LCM and the views expressed about the LCM-style Order on the natural resources body in the Environment and Sustainability Committee, I know that I am not the only Member worried about fulfilling the duty to provide quality scrutiny.

Leader of the House, Scotland manages, with its different Standing Orders, to allow the Scottish Parliament to influence relevant UK legislation at different stages in the passage of a Bill. There is no last-minute dash to comply with a UK parliamentary deadline, nor is there any breach of intergovernmental confidence. A UK parliamentary deadline should not be the driver of badly scrutinised legislation on those occasions when we are capable of legislating for ourselves. However, if changes to Standing Orders can make the most of the advantages of the LCM system, I recommend that we debate and make those changes. As the First Minister says, changes to Standing Orders are a matter for the Assembly. I hope that if we do debate this, the party in government here will not be minded to prevent those changes, just because the First Minister himself may have rejected them.

3.30 p.m.

Nid am 'ddyhead' y Cynulliad yr ydym yn sôn, ond am ddyletswydd y Cynulliad. Nid lle Llywodraeth Cymru yw 'ceisio' parchu'r ddyletswydd hon; rhaid iddi ei pharchu. Mae Llywodraeth Cymru'n atebol i'r Cynulliad, a lle'r Cynulliad yw penderfynu beth yw craffu priodol.

Wrth gwrs, mae hynny'n achosi problemau ymarferol. Derbyniaf hynny, a chroesawaf y ffaith bod Llywodraeth Cymru wedi cytuno â rhai o'r argymhellion i oresgyn y problemau hynny. Fodd bynnag, wrth wrthod argymhellion 7 ac 8, credaf fod Llywodraeth Cymru'n dal i wrthod rhoi sylw i broblemau amseru—cyfeiriodd y Cadeirydd a Simon Thomas at hyn—sy'n atal craffu at safon yr hoffwn ei gweld fel Aelod Cynulliad. Ac ystyried y cyfraniadau gan Aelodau eraill ddoe ar gynnig cydsyniad deddfwriaethol y Bil Cyllid Llywodraeth Leol, yn ogystal â barn Aelodau am gynnig cydsyniad deddfwriaethol y Bil Diwygio Lles a'r farn a fynegwyd am y gorchymyn tebyg i gynnig cydsyniad deddfwriaethol am gorff adnoddau naturiol y Pwyllgor Amgylchedd a Chynaliadwyedd, gwn nad fi yw'r unig Aelod sy'n pryderu am gyflawni'r ddyletswydd i graffu mewn modd safonol.

Arweinydd y Tŷ, mae'r Alban yn llwyddo, gyda'u Rheolau Sefydlog gwahanol, i alluogi Senedd yr Alban i ddylanwadu ar ddeddfwriaeth berthnasol y DU ar wahanol gamau yn y broses o basio Bil. Nid oes rhuthr munud olaf i gydymffurfio â dyddiad cau seneddol y DU, ac ni thorrir cyfrinachedd rhynglywodraethol ychwaith. Ni ddylai dyddiad cau seneddol y DU achosi inni beidio â chraffu'n briodol ar ddeddfwriaeth ar yr achlysuron hynny pan allwn ddeddfu drosom ein hunain. Fodd bynnag, os gall newidiadau i Reolau Sefydlog wneud y mwyaf o fanteision y system cynigion cydsyniad deddfwriaethol, argymhellaf ein bod yn dadlau ac yn gwneud y newidiadau hynny. Fel y dywed y Prif Weinidog, mater i'r Cynulliad yw newid Rheolau Sefydlog. Gobeithiaf, os cawn ddadl am hyn, na fydd y blaid sy'n llywodraethu yma'n bwriadu atal y newidiadau hynny, am ddim rheswm heblaw bod y Prif Weinidog ei hun wedi eu gwrthod.

Julie James: I wish to thank the Chair, the committee's staff and all of the witnesses who gave evidence in this interesting and important inquiry, which was enjoyable, although at first, one might have thought, from the title, that it would be quite dry. This is very much an ongoing process and I entirely adopt the views of other committee members about the importance of scrutiny and the role of the Assembly. It is important for the Government to strike the right balance between allowing proper scrutiny and the practicalities of day-to-day need to pass legislation in a timely and appropriate fashion. However, we want that legislation to be good legislation that is not subject to endless judicial reviews and the wrangling of lawyers in the courts and so on. So, the scrutiny process is an essential one.

I was encouraged by the remarks of the First Minister and of the Counsel General in evidence to us yesterday, that the desire is very much to make the law here, and not by secondary means, which is to be applauded. However, inevitably, that will mean that some legislation is done for statutory reasons. I will not go through all of the reasons because I think that Suzy Davies set them out beautifully in her contribution. It is an ongoing process, and as we debate the practicalities of this, as we see how many such issues arise in this way and as we look at the timing and proposals and so on, we ought to continue to keep our Standing Orders and procedures under review.

The committee has moved on to its next inquiry and, as a result of that, we recently visited Belfast. While we were there, we met an interesting individual, who rejoices in the title of 'the examiner of statutory rules', which is a fascinating title. However, we did not particularly look at the Northern Irish example when we were conducting this inquiry; we looked at the Scottish example quite a lot. One interesting point about the examiner of statutory rules is that he works on behalf of the Northern Irish Assembly committees. The committees can delegate the technical scrutiny of statutory instruments to that individual and he can report, on their behalf, back to their Plenary sessions and Government and so on. The Standing Orders are quite fascinating and I regret that I did not

Julie James: Hoffwn ddiolch i'r Cadeirydd, staff y pwyllgor a'r holl dystion a roddodd dystiolaeth yn yr ymchwiliad diddorol a phwysig hwn; mwynheais yr ymchwiliad, er i'w deitl awgrymu y byddai'n un digon sych. Yn sicr, mae'r broses hon yn parhau a chytunaf yn llwyr â safbwyntiau aelodau eraill y pwyllgor am bwysigrwydd craffu a swyddogaeth y Cynulliad. Mae'n bwysig bod y Llywodraeth yn taro'r cydbwysedd cywir rhwng caniatáu craffu priodol a materion ymarferol yr angen bob dydd i basio deddfwriaeth mewn modd amserol a phriodol. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym am i'r ddeddfwriaeth honno fod yn ddeddfwriaeth dda nad yw'n destun adolygiadau barnwrol diddiwedd a ffraeo rhwng barnwyr yn y llysoedd ac ati. Felly, mae'r broses graffu'n un hanfodol.

Cefais fy nghalonogi gan sylwadau'r Prif Weinidog a'r Cwnsler Cyffredinol yn eu tystiolaeth inni ddoe, sef mai'r dyhead cryf yw gwneud y gyfraith yma, ac nid mewn modd eilaidd; dylid cymeradwyo hynny. Fodd bynnag, yn anochel, bydd hynny'n golygu gwneud rhywfaint o ddeddfu am resymau statudol. Ni af drwy'r holl resymau oherwydd credaf fod Suzy Davies wedi eu hamlinellu'n wych yn ei chyfraniad. Mae'n broses barhaus, ac wrth inni drafod y materion ymarferol, wrth inni weld faint o faterion o'r fath sy'n codi fel hyn ac wrth inni edrych ar yr amseru a chynigion ac ati, dylem barhau i adolygu ein Rheolau Sefydlog a'n gweithdrefnau.

Mae'r pwyllgor wedi symud ymlaen i'w ymchwiliad nesaf ac, o ganlyniad i hynny, ymwelsom â Belfast yn ddiweddar. Yno, cawsom gyfarfod ag unigolyn diddorol sy'n ymfalchïo yn ei deitl o 'archwiliwr rheolau statudol', sy'n deitl cyfareddol. Fodd bynnag, ni edrychasom yn fanwl ar enghraifft Gogledd Iwerddon wrth gynnal yr ymchwiliad hwn; edrychasom eithaf llawer ar enghraifft yr Alban. Un pwynt diddorol am yr archwiliwr rheolau statudol yw ei fod yn gweithio ar ran pwyllgorau Cynulliad Gogledd Iwerddon. Gall y pwyllgorau ddirprwyo gwaith craffu technegol ar offerynnau statudol i'r unigolyn hwnnw a gall ef adrodd, ar eu rhan, yn ôl i'w sesiynau Cyfarfod Llawn a'r Llywodraeth ac ati. Mae'r Rheolau Sefydlog yn ddiddorol iawn

read them before. However, in that way, you get more time to deal with the more substantive LCMs. I recommend that the Government considers this and that, as part of this ongoing practical process, we also consider it because it seems that there is more than one way of getting this right.

I very much welcome the response of the Business Committee to this report. As the Chair said, that clarifies the Government's response and makes it look a bit more positive. However, I think that the committee has done good work and I commend it to the Government.

Eluned Parrott: As a member of the Constitutional and Legislative Affairs Committee, I welcome the opportunity to debate some important points of principle with regard to how subordinate legislation is used in the Assembly. I, too, thank the Chair, the clerks and the staff for their work in this respect.

It is a timely inquiry. Having redefined our relationship with Westminster in last year's referendum, it is right that we also explore the implications of that new relationship, the practicalities and how we work together as legislatures. However, as we have heard, the Sewel convention, which is thought to act as a guiding principle, in fact guides the relations between the two Governments and not the two Parliaments. We also need to understand how the legislatures interrelate.

During the 2011 referendum, one of the main reasons offered for giving the Assembly primary law-making powers was that the tortuously slow progress of legislative competence Orders through Westminster was stymying the Assembly's ability to act quickly for the people of Wales. I find it ironic that when the Welsh Government asks for additional powers or for Westminster to legislate on our behalf, the reason most often given is that it is quick, convenient or efficient. However, when the issues at stake are technical and minor in nature, efficiency is important, but we have to strike the right

ac yr wyf yn edifar na ddarllenais hwy'n gynharach. Fodd bynnag, fel yna, cewch fwy o amser i roi sylw i'r cynigion cydsyniad deddfwriaethol mwy sylweddol. Argymhellaf fod y Llywodraeth yn ystyried hyn a'n bod ninnau hefyd yn ei ystyried fel rhan o'r broses ymarferol barhaus hon, oherwydd mae'n ymddangos bod mwy nag un ffordd o wneud hyn yn iawn.

Rhoddaf groeso cynnes i ymateb y Pwyllgor Busnes i'r adroddiad hwn. Fel y dywedodd y Cadeirydd, mae'n egluro ymateb y Llywodraeth ac yn gwneud iddo edrych ychydig yn fwy cadarnhaol. Fodd bynnag, credaf fod y pwyllgor wedi gwneud gwaith da a chymeradwyaf ef i'r Llywodraeth.

Eluned Parrott: Fel aelod o'r Pwyllgor Materion Cyfansoddiadol a Deddfwriaethol, croesawaf y cyfle i ddadlau am rai pwyntiau egwyddor pwysig o ran sut y defnyddir is-ddeddfwriaeth yn y Cynulliad. Diolch hefyd i'r Cadeirydd, y clercod a'u staff am eu gwaith yn hyn o beth.

Mae'r ymchwiliad yn un amserol. Wedi inni ailddiffinio ein perthynas â San Steffan yn refferendwm y llynedd, mae'n briodol ein bod hefyd yn archwilio goblygiadau'r berthynas newydd honno, y materion ymarferol a sut y cydweithiwn fel deddfwrfeydd. Fodd bynnag, fel y clywsom, mae confensiwn Sewel, er y credir ei fod yn gweithredu fel egwyddor arweiniol, mewn gwirionedd yn arwain y berthynas rhwng y ddwy Lywodraeth, nid y ddwy Senedd. Mae angen inni hefyd ddeall y gydberthynas rhwng y deddfwrfeydd.

Yn ystod refferendwm 2011, un o'r prif resymau a gynigiwyd am roi pwerau deddfu sylfaenol i'r Cynulliad oedd y ffaith bod symudiad arteithiol o araf Gorchmynion cymhwysedd deddfwriaethol drwy San Steffan yn llesteirio gallu'r Cynulliad i weithredu'n gyflym dros bobl Cymru. Mae'n eironig, yn fy marn i, mai'r rheswm a roddir amlaf am i Lywodraeth Cymru ofyn am bwerau ychwanegol neu ofyn i San Steffan weithredu ar ein rhan, yw bod hynny'n gyflym, yn gyfleus neu'n effeithlon. Fodd bynnag, pan mae'r materion dan sylw'n rhai technegol a mân, mae effeithlonrwydd yn

balance between efficiency and the ability to scrutinise legislation properly. There are legislative consent motions that have caused significant concern over the last weeks, to which Simon Thomas and Suzy Davies both referred.

My concern is that subordinate legislation often seems to slip under the radar in the public consciousness and, dare I say it, in this place too. It receives less scrutiny, less consultation and much less of our time than primary legislation does. However, there are two constitutional dangers to being complacent with this form of legislation. First, the danger of Westminster encroaching on devolved matters because the nature of our relationship has not been properly discussed or understood, or perhaps for political reasons too. Secondly, the opportunity for a future Welsh Government to use the LCM process to avoid scrutiny and attention for potentially controversial powers. This is a point of principle that could be extremely important in avoiding politically charged arguments between the two legislatures or two Governments in the future.

During our inquiry, we heard evidence about the importance of the Sewel convention, but we also heard very worrying evidence which queried how well used and understood the memoranda of understanding and the devolution guidance notes that guard those principles really are. Clearly, this is cause for real concern. A lack of clarity is dangerous at any time, but when there are administrations of different colours in Westminster and Cardiff bay, the opportunity for our own constitutional position as a legislature to be used as a political football becomes all the greater. There will be those people, perhaps opposed to devolution in the first place, who will be only too pleased to leap on the first sign of dissent. As we respect the institution of the National Assembly for Wales, we have a responsibility, individually and collectively, to try to diffuse any constitutional struggles by being perfectly clear and open about how we understand the relationship between ourselves and Westminster not only as Governments, but as Parliaments. That is

bwysig, ond rhaid inni daro'r cydbwysedd cywir rhwng effeithlonrwydd a'r gallu i graffu'n briodol ar ddeddfwriaeth. Mae rhai cynigion cydsyniad deddfwriaethol wedi achosi cryn bryder dros yr wythnosau diwethaf; cyfeiriodd Simon Thomas a Suzy Davies ill dau at y rhain.

Fy mhryder yw bod is-ddeddfwriaeth yn aml fel pe bai'n llithro islaw ymwybyddiaeth y cyhoedd ac, os caf ddweud, islaw ein hymwybyddiaeth ninnau hefyd. Mae'n destun llai o graffu, llai o ymgynghori a llawer llai o'n hamser na deddfwriaeth sylfaenol. Fodd bynnag, mae dau berygl cyfansoddiadol ynghlwm â chymryd y math hwn o ddeddfwriaeth yn ganiataol. Yn gyntaf, y perygl y gallai San Steffan lechfeddiannu materion datganoledig gan nad yw natur ein perthynas wedi'i thrafod neu ei deall yn briodol, neu efallai am resymau gwleidyddol hefyd. Yn ail, y cyfle i Lywodraeth Cymru yn y dyfodol ddefnyddio'r broses cynnig cydsyniad deddfwriaethol i osgoi craffu ar, a rhoi sylw i, bwerau a all fod yn ddadleuol. Mae hwn yn bwynt egwyddor a allai fod yn bwysig dros ben wrth osgoi ffraeo gwleidyddol rhwng y ddwy ddeddfwriaeth neu'r ddwy Lywodraeth yn y dyfodol.

Yn ystod ein hymchwiliad, clywsom dystiolaeth am bwysigrwydd confensiwn Sewel, ond clywsom hefyd dystiolaeth sy'n peri cryn bryder a oedd yn holi faint o ddefnydd a dealltwriaeth sydd mewn gwirionedd o'r memoranda dealltwriaeth a'r canllawiau ar ddatganoli sy'n gwarchod yr egwyddorion hynny mewn gwirionedd. Yn amlwg, mae hyn yn destun pryder gwirioneddol. Mae diffyg eglurder yn beryglus unrhyw bryd, ond pan geir gweinyddiaethau o liwiau gwahanol yn San Steffan a bae Caerdydd, ceir mwy o gyfle i ddefnyddio ein safle cyfansoddiadol ni fel deddfwriaeth fel pêl-droed wleidyddol. Bydd rhai pobl, a oedd efallai'n gwrthwynebu datganoli o'r dechrau, yn fodlon iawn i lamu ar yr arwydd cyntaf o anghydfurfio. Gan ein bod yn parchu sefydliad Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, mae gennym gyfrifoldeb, yn unigol ac ar y cyd, i geisio tawelu unrhyw anghydfodau cyfansoddiadol drwy fod yn gwbl glir ac agored am sut yr ydym yn deall y berthynas rhyngom a San

why I think that some of the recommendations in this report that refer specifically to how we understand that relationship are so very important.

This report examines many practical and apparently technical issues, but they all speak to much broader questions of principle, and I would ask Members to give this report the full weight of their attention and the full weight of their support, to hopefully help us to develop this apolitical and constructive understanding of how we work not only now, but in the future.

Antoinette Sandbach: I start by thanking the Chair and members of the committee for producing this report. With the increasing number of powers conferred on Welsh Ministers, it is vital that the Assembly is given adequate opportunity to scrutinise legislation. This report makes an invaluable contribution towards this evolving. As the report illustrates, these legislative consent motions have not just been on minor technical issues. The Farmers Union of Wales, in its evidence, highlighted the Public Bodies Bill, which provided the powers to merge the three environmental bodies—a matter of considerable public interest, with very long-term implications for many of my constituents. Undoubtedly, there are entirely reasonable circumstances for choosing to legislate in this way rather than by a Welsh Bill, as the report illustrates. These include, for example, instances where there was no time for the Assembly to do so; where, from an administrative perspective, it was the most practical to take forward legislation through the same instrument, or where the matters in question were minor, technical and non-contentious. However, I echo the concerns that LCMs may be used, as they have on occasion been in Scotland, as a vehicle for the most controversial cases, and in doing so, avoid appropriate scrutiny in the Assembly. It is concerning that the Welsh Government has chosen to reject the three recommendations, numbered 6, 7 and 8, which would have strengthened committee scrutiny, and I completely echo the concerns that Suzy Davies raised in her submission today; I do not think I could have put them better than

Steffan, nid yn unig fel Llywodraethau, ond fel Seneddau. Dyna pam y credaf fod rhai o'r argymhellion yn yr adroddiad hwn, sy'n cyfeirio'n benodol at sut yr ydym yn deall y berthynas honno, mor bwysig.

Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn archwilio nifer o faterion ymarferol a rhai sy'n ymddangos yn dechnegol, ond maent i gyd yn ymwneud â mater mwy cyffredinol o egwyddor, a gofynnaf i Aelodau roi eu holl sylw i'r adroddiad hwn, a'u holl gefnogaeth, gyda'r gobaith y gallwn ddatblygu dealltwriaeth anwleidyddol ac adeiladol o sut yr ydym yn gweithio, nid yn unig nawr, ond yn y dyfodol.

Antoinette Sandbach: Dechreuaf drwy ddiolch i'r Cadeirydd ac aelodau'r pwyllgor am gynhyrchu'r adroddiad hwn. Gyda'r cynnydd yn nifer y pwerau a roddir i Weinidogion Cymru, mae'n hollbwysig bod y Cynulliad yn cael digon o gyfle i graffu ar deddfwriaeth. Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn gyfraniad amhrisiadwy at yr esblygiad hwn. Fel y mae'r adroddiad yn dangos, nid yw'r cynigion cydsyniad deddfwriaethol hyn wedi ymwneud â mân faterion technegol yn unig. Yn eu tystiolaeth, rhoddodd Undeb Amaethwyr Cymru sylw i'r Bil Cyrff Cyhoeddus, a ddarparodd y pwerau i uno'r tri chorff amgylcheddol—mater o gryn ddiddordeb i'r cyhoedd, gyda goblygiadau hirdymor iawn i lawer o fy etholwyr. Nid oes amheuaeth bod amgylchiadau cwbl resymol i ddewis deddfu yn y ffordd hon yn hytrach na drwy gyfrwng Bil Cymru, ac mae'r adroddiad yn dangos hynny. Mae'r rhain yn cynnwys, er enghraifft, enghreifftiau pan nad oedd amser i'r Cynulliad wneud hynny; pan fyddai, o safbwynt gweinyddol, yn fwy ymarferol symud ymlaen â deddfwriaeth drwy'r un offeryn, neu pan fyddai'r materion dan sylw'n rhai mân, technegol a heb fod yn ddadleuol. Fodd bynnag, ategaf bryderon am ddefnyddio cynigion cydsyniad deddfwriaethol, fel sydd wedi digwydd yn achlysurol yn yr Alban, fel cyfrwng ar gyfer yr achosion mwyaf dadleuol, a drwy hynny, osgoi craffu priodol yn y Cynulliad. Mae'n destun pryder bod Llywodraeth Cymru wedi dewis gwrthod y tri argymhelliad, rhifau 6, 7 ac 8, a fyddai wedi cryfhau pwerau craffu'r pwyllgorau, a chytunaf yn llwyr â'r pryderon a gododd Suzy Davies yn ei chyflwyniad

her.

Additionally, I would like to highlight the paragraphs at the end of the report on the scrutiny of Orders made by UK Ministers that impact on the Assembly's legislative competence, in particular in relation to the Public Bodies Act 2011, as it is now. In a number of questions that Russell George put to the Minister for environment today, the Minister gave the answer that it was for scrutiny in committee. The difficulty with the Order, as it has been laid before the committee, which has been highlighted in our proceedings today, is that it has not been laid in sufficient time for us to go through, as it were, the enhanced procedure. We are, therefore, being told as a committee that if we scrutinise to the level that we perhaps might have liked to have done, we will delay the setting up of the natural resources body. It is unacceptable for a committee to be placed in a situation where it is told that it cannot scrutinise because it will delay an important piece of Government legislation.

Julie James: I agree with that, but I wanted to put on record the fact that the Minister has bent over backwards in view of the second Order.

Antoinette Sandbach: The Minister has made substantial concessions in a written letter to us, which will allow us to amend a subsequent Order. However, it does not allow us to amend the Order that is currently before us, which includes sweeping provisions. Bear in mind that this body will have the power to perhaps introduce criminal sanctions, fine people, give consent to large-scale energy projects and look at those types of issues. They are matters that will affect all of our constituents, yet with the provisos that Julie has mentioned, we have not been able to amend that Order in any way. It is unusual for me, and other Members of this Assembly, to have constituents writing to us about an Order that has only recently been made public, but that has happened in my case and in that of others.

I therefore recognise what has been laid out

heddiw; ni chredaf y gallwn fod wedi eu cyfleu'n well.

Hoffwn hefyd dynnu sylw at y paragraffau ar ddiwedd yr adroddiad am graffu ar Orchmynion a wneir gan Weinidogion y DU sy'n effeithio ar gymhwysedd deddfwriaethol y Cynulliad, yn enwedig mewn perthynas â Deddf Cyrff Cyhoeddus 2011, fel y'i gelwir nawr. Mewn nifer o gwestiynau a ofynnodd Russell George i'r Gweinidog dros yr amgylchedd heddiw, atebodd y Gweinidog ei fod yn fater i bwyllgor graffu arno. Yr anhawster gyda'r Gorchymyn, fel y mae wedi'i osod gerbron y pwyllgor—a rhoddwyd sylw i hyn yn ein trafodion heddiw—yw nad yw wedi'i gyflwyno mewn pryd inni fynd drwy'r weithdrefn fanwl, fel petai. Felly, dywedir wrthym fel pwyllgor, os craffwn mor fanwl ag y byddem efallai wedi dymuno gwneud, y byddwn yn achosi oediad cyn sefydlu'r corff adnoddau naturiol. Mae'n annerbyniol bod pwyllgor yn cael ei roi mewn sefyllfa lle dywedir wrtho na all graffu gan y bydd hynny'n oedi darn pwysig o deddfwriaeth Llywodraeth.

Julie James: Cytunaf â hynny, ond hoffwn ddweud ar gofnod bod y Gweinidog wedi gwneud popeth dan haul o ran yr ail Orchymyn.

Antoinette Sandbach: Mae'r Gweinidog wedi gwneud consesiynau sylweddol mewn llythyr ysgrifenedig atom, a fydd yn ein galluogi i ddiwygio Gorchymyn dilynol. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'n ein galluogi i ddiwygio'r Gorchymyn sydd ger ein bron ar hyn o bryd, sy'n cynnwys darpariaethau ysgubol. Cofiwch y gallai fod gan y corff hwn y pŵer i gyflwyno cosbau troseddol, dirwyo pobl, rhoi caniatâd i brosiectau egni ar raddfa fawr ac edrych ar y mathau hyn o faterion. Maent yn faterion a fydd yn effeithio ar ein hetholwyr i gyd, ac eto heblaw am yr eithriadau a nododd Julie, nid ydym wedi gallu diwygio'r Gorchymyn hwnnw mewn unrhyw ffordd. Mae'n anarferol imi, ac i Aelodau eraill y Cynulliad hwn, fod etholwyr yn ysgrifennu atom am Orchymyn sydd newydd gael ei wneud yn gyhoeddus, ond mae hynny wedi digwydd imi ac i bobl eraill.

Felly, yr wyf yn cydnabod yr hyn sydd wedi

in this report, but I would ask the Constitutional and Legislative Affairs Committee to look urgently at this process in relation to the Order because this report identifies that there is a gap in our Standing Orders regarding how this is dealt with, and that this is being dealt with by way of a temporary procedure for considering Orders. It would have been perfectly possible for the Minister for Environment and Sustainable Development to have tabled the draft Order in relation to the natural resources body in good time, which would have allowed the enhanced procedure to be adopted. That has not happened and I would therefore ask that further inquiries and evolution around this continue.

William Graham: It is a pleasure and a privilege to speak in this debate on behalf of the Business Committee. I would like to start by thanking the Constitutional and Legislative Affairs Committee for conducting this most timely of inquiries. Its report has brought to the fore the issue of how the Assembly gives its consent to UK legislation within its competence.

Though the Assembly's Standing Orders were reviewed only a little over a year ago, much has changed. The extension of the Assembly's law-making powers to cover all the 20 subjects listed in Schedule 7 to the Government of Wales Act 2006 has inevitably meant that incidences where UK legislation impacts on devolved competence are now much more common. It is crucial, therefore, that the Assembly's procedures are brought up to date. We must be in a position to make properly informed decisions when we come to decide whether the UK Parliament should be able to legislate on our behalf.

For that reason, the Business Committee is pleased to be able to respond positively to all the recommendations in the report that call for the Assembly's Standing Orders to be revised. The Business Committee wishes to see a process put in place that allows the Government to share as much information as possible with the Assembly at an early stage. This would allow the Assembly the maximum opportunity to scrutinise legislative consent memoranda so as to

cael ei amlinellu yn yr adroddiad hwn, ond gofynnwn i'r Pwyllgor Materion Cyfansoddiadol a Deddfwriaethol edrych ar frys ar y broses hon mewn perthynas â'r Gorchymyn oherwydd mae'r adroddiad hwn yn nodi y ceir bwlch yn ein Rheolau Sefydlog o ran ymdrin â hyn, a'i fod yn cael sylw gan weithdrefn dros dro o ystyried Gorchymynion. Byddai wedi bod yn ddigon posibl i Weinidog yr Amgylchedd a Datblygu Cynaliadwy gyflwyno'r Gorchymyn drafft sy'n ymwneud â'r corff adnoddau naturiol mewn da bryd, gan ganiatáu inni ddefnyddio'r weithdrefn fanwl. Nid yw hynny wedi digwydd felly gofynnaf am barhau ag ymholiadau ac esblygiad pellach yn hyn o beth.

William Graham: Mae'n bleser ac yn fraind cael siarad yn y ddadl hon ar ran y Pwyllgor Busnes. Hoffwn ddechrau drwy ddiolch i'r Pwyllgor Materion Cyfansoddiadol a Deddfwriaethol am gynnal yr ymchwiliad hwn sydd mor amserol. Mae eu hadroddiad wedi amlygu mater sut y mae'r Cynulliad yn cydsynio â deddfwriaeth y DU o fewn ei gymhwysedd.

Er i Reolau Sefydlog y Cynulliad gael eu hadolygu ychydig dros flwyddyn yn ôl, mae llawer wedi newid. Yn anochel, mae ymestyn pwerau deddfu'r Cynulliad i gynnwys pob un o'r 20 pwnc a restrir yn Atodlen 7 Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 2006 wedi golygu bod achosion lle mae deddfwriaeth y DU yn effeithio ar gymhwysedd datganoledig yn llawer mwy cyffredin. Mae'n hollbwysig, felly, bod gweithdrefnau'r Cynulliad yn cael eu diweddarau. Rhaid inni fod mewn sefyllfa i wneud penderfyniadau priodol ddeallus wrth benderfynu a ddylai Senedd y DU allu deddfu ar ein rhan.

Am y rheswm hwnnw, mae'n bleser gan y Pwyllgor Busnes allu ymateb yn gadarnhaol i bob argymhelliad yn yr adroddiad sy'n galw am ddiwygio Rheolau Sefydlog y Cynulliad. Dymuna'r Pwyllgor Busnes weld proses yn cael ei sefydlu sy'n galluogi'r Llywodraeth i rannu cymaint â phosibl o wybodaeth â'r Cynulliad yn gynnar. Byddai hyn yn rhoi'r cyfle gorau posibl i'r Cynulliad graffu ar femoranda cydsyniad deddfwriaethol er mwyn dylanwadu ar gynnwys y cynnig

influence the content of the final legislative consent motion.

We recognise of course the necessary constraints of confidentiality surrounding negotiations between Governments. There is no reason at all, however, why a procedure cannot be put in place that allows scrutiny and debate in the Assembly to take place concurrently with those intergovernmental discussions. The committee's recommendations all point towards making such a process a reality, and we welcome the Government's own positive response to the report. It is clear that there is a synergy of visions regarding what the LCM process should look like. Where there is disagreement among us, it is over how precisely that vision can best be put into practice. Further discussion will be required to resolve these issues, but I have no doubt that our differences will disappear.

The Business Committee agrees with the Constitutional and Legislative Affairs Committee and the Government that Standing Order No. 30 should be removed and its provisions brought within the scope of Standing Order No. 29. The distinction that has existed thus far is no longer useful and the Assembly should be required to consent to any UK Bill that amends either its own or Welsh Ministers' competences in any way. There is consensus between us, too, that referral of LCMs to a committee should be routine, and the committee should be able to report before a motion is considered by the Assembly in Plenary. We also agree that it should be made clear in the Standing Orders that the Government may table a motion after it has laid a memorandum, rather than having to do it at the same time.

The Business Committee is also happy give consideration to the Government's suggestion that not every memorandum should necessarily be followed by a motion. We are aware that this is the system that operates in Scotland and we will look at whether it can be made to work in the Assembly. We also support the committee's recommendation to put in place a process for the Assembly to give consent to subordinate legislation made

terfynol am gydsyniad deddfwriaethol.

Wrth gwrs, yr ydym yn cydnabod bod angen cyfyngiadau cyfrinachedd pan mae Llywodraethau'n negodi. Nid oes dim rheswm, fodd bynnag, pam na ellid sefydlu gweithdrefn sy'n caniatáu craffu a dadlau yn y Cynulliad ar yr un pryd â'r trafodaethau rhynglywodraethol hynny. Mae argymhellion y pwyllgor i gyd yn awgrymu gwneud proses o'r fath yn realaeth, a chroesawn ymateb cadarnhaol y Llywodraeth ei hun i'r adroddiad. Mae'n amlwg y ceir synergedd rhwng gweledigaethau am sut broses y dylid ei chael ar gyfer cynigion cydsyniad deddfwriaethol. Mae unrhyw anghytundeb rhyngom yn ymwneud â'r union ffordd orau o roi'r weledigaeth honno ar waith. Bydd angen trafodaethau pellach i ddatrys y materion hyn, ond nid oes gennyf amheuaeth y bydd yr anghytundeb yn diflannu.

Mae'r Pwyllgor Busnes yn cytuno â'r Pwyllgor Materion Cyfansoddiadol a Deddfwriaethol a'r Llywodraeth y dylid dileu Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 30 a dod â'i darpariaethau o fewn cwmpas Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 29. Nid yw'r gwahaniaeth sydd wedi bodoli hyd yma'n ddefnyddiol mwyach, a dylai fod yn ofynnol i'r Cynulliad gydsynio ag unrhyw Fil y DU sy'n diwygio ei gymwyseddau ei hunan, neu gymwyseddau Gweinidogion Cymru, mewn unrhyw ffordd. Ceir consensws rhyngom hefyd y dylid cyfeirio cynigion cydsyniad deddfwriaethol at bwyllgor fel mater o drefn, ac y dylai'r pwyllgor allu llunio adroddiad cyn i gynnig gael ei ystyried gan y Cynulliad mewn Cyfarfod Llawn. Cytunwn hefyd y dylid egluro yn y Rheolau Sefydlog y caiff y Llywodraeth gyflwyno cynnig ar ôl gosod memorandwm, yn hytrach na gorfod gwneud y ddau beth ar yr un adeg.

Mae'r Pwyllgor Busnes hefyd yn fodlon ystyried awgrym y Llywodraeth na ddylid dilyn pob memorandwm â chynnig o reidrwydd. Yr ydym yn ymwybodol mai dyma'r system a ddefnyddir yn yr Alban, ac edrychwn ar y posibilrwydd y gallai weithio yn y Cynulliad. Yr ydym hefyd o blaid argymhellid y pwyllgor i sefydlu proses i'r Cynulliad roi cydsyniad i is-ddeddfwriaeth a wneir gan Weinidogion y DU sydd o fewn

by UK Ministers that is within or affects the Assembly's competence. A temporary procedure has already been used for Orders under the Public Bodies Act 2011, and we will work with the Government to write a permanent process into the Assembly's Standing Orders. The committee's insights on how the temporary process has worked so far will be vital in informing our thinking on this.

3.45 p.m.

The LCM process also involves the United Kingdom Parliament and Government. We recognise that the Welsh Government will need to negotiate changes to the devolution guidance notes with its UK counterpart, so that any changes to our procedures here are reflected in inter-governmental processes. I hope that the strong consensus for change that exists here, as demonstrated in this debate today, will provide an impetus to those negotiations, and that we will see a successful outcome very soon.

To conclude, the Business Committee is committed to taking forward the changes that are required to achieve the objective that we all share of ensuring robust scrutiny by the Assembly of relevant United Kingdom legislation. We will look at all the issues covered in the report over the coming months, with a view to bringing forward proposals for amendments to Standing Orders after the summer recess.

The Minister for Finance and Leader of the House (Jane Hutt): I am also very pleased to welcome this important report by the Constitutional and Legislative Affairs Committee. The Government will be supporting the motion this afternoon. It is vital that our procedures are examined in a rigorous and constructive manner and I commend the committee for its work and welcome the contributions made by Members today, which further inform my response this afternoon on behalf of the Welsh Government.

A clear 'yes' result in last year's referendum resulted in a step change in the Assembly's legislative powers. We sought and acquired

cymhwysedd y Cynulliad neu'n effeithio arno. Mae gweithdrefn dros dro eisoes wedi cael ei defnyddio ar gyfer Gorchmynion dan Ddeddf Cyrff Cyhoeddus 2011, a gweithiwn gyda'r Llywodraeth i ysgrifennu proses barhaol yn Rheolau Sefydlog y Cynulliad. Bydd safbwyntiau'r pwyllgor am sut y mae'r broses dros dro wedi gweithio hyd yma'n sail hollbwysig i'n meddyliau am hyn.

Mae'r broses cynigion cydsyniad deddfwriaethol hefyd yn cynnwys Senedd a Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig. Yr ydym yn cydnabod y bydd angen i Lywodraeth Cymru negodi newidiadau i'r canllawiau ar ddatganoli gyda Llywodraeth y DU, fel bod unrhyw newidiadau i'n gweithdrefnau yma'n cael eu hadlewyrchu mewn prosesau rhynglywodraethol. Gobeithiaf y bydd y consensws cryf dros newid sy'n bodoli yma, fel y dangoswyd yn y ddatl hon heddiw, yn sbardun i'r negodi hwnnw, ac y gwelwn ganlyniad llwyddiannus yn fuan iawn.

I gloi, mae'r Pwyllgor Busnes yn ymroddedig i symud ymlaen â'r newidiadau sy'n ofynnol i gyflawni'r amcan yr ydym i gyd yn ei rannu i sicrhau craffu cadarn gan y Cynulliad ar deddfwriaeth berthnasol y Deyrnas Unedig. Edrychwn ar bob mater sy'n cael sylw yn yr adroddiad dros y misoedd nesaf, gyda golwg ar gyflwyno cynigion am ddiwygiadau i Reolau Sefydlog ar ôl toriad yr haf.

Y Gweinidog Cyllid ac Arweinydd y Tŷ (Jane Hutt): Yr wyf hefyd yn falch iawn o groesawu'r adroddiad pwysig hwn gan y Pwyllgor Materion Cyfansoddiadol a Deddfwriaethol. Bydd y Llywodraeth yn cefnogi'r cynnig brynhawn heddiw. Mae'n hollbwysig bod ein gweithdrefnau'n cael eu harchwilio mewn modd trwyadl ac adeiladol a chymeradwyaf y pwyllgor am eu gwaith a chroesawaf y cyfraniadau gan Aelodau heddiw, sy'n rhoi mwy o sail i fy ymateb brynhawn heddiw ar ran Llywodraeth Cymru.

Ar ôl canlyniad 'ie' clir yn refferendwm y llynedd, cafwyd newid sylweddol ym mhwerau deddfu'r Cynulliad. Yr ydym wedi

these powers and now we have an opportunity to challenge our processes to ensure that they are as robust as possible. Therefore, I thank the committee for its comprehensive report into powers granted to Welsh Ministers in UK laws. As we have consistently said, the Welsh Government follows the principle that legislation for Wales in devolved areas should be enacted by the National Assembly. However, as highlighted by Suzy Davies, Julie James and other Members, there are times when it makes sense for us to consider whether a UK Bill is appropriate to make law for Wales in devolved areas. When that happens, the Assembly's status as a legislature making primary legislation for Wales must be respected. The legislative consent process is therefore of the utmost importance. Without it, the legislative framework for Wales could be severely undermined, as the Chair clearly outlined in his opening speech.

The Welsh Government's response to the committee's report has been laid before the Assembly. We agree the guiding principles for a review of Standing Orders, as covered in the Business Committee's response to this report and outlined by William Graham this afternoon. The committee's recommendations in the report fit closely with our current position and practices and with our aspirations for the Assembly, in line with the endorsement of the referendum last year. We were pleased to be able to accept, or accept in principle or in part, the majority of the committee's recommendations, but I confirm to the Constitutional and Legislative Affairs Committee and to Members today that we are responding constructively to all recommendations in the report. It is now a question of working, particularly with the Constitutional and Legislative Affairs Committee, through the Business Committee, as William Graham said, to deliver on the recommendations of this report.

Turning to the recommendations, I am pleased to say that we, for example, accept in part recommendation 2, to which the Chair referred. We have already fulfilled the commitment of informing the Assembly about UK Bills impacting on the Assembly's competence or the powers of Welsh Ministers following the Queen's Speech; I wrote to the

ceisio a chael y pwerau hyn, a nawr mae gennym gyfle i herio ein prosesau i sicrhau eu bod mor gadarn â phosibl. Felly, diolch i'r pwyllgor am eu hadroddiad cynhwysfawr am bwerau a roddwyd i Weinidogion Cymru yng nghyfreithiau'r DU. Fel yr ydym wedi dweud yn gyson, mae Llywodraeth Cymru'n dilyn yr egwyddor y dylai deddfwriaeth i Gymru mewn meysydd datganoledig gael ei deddfu gan y Cynulliad. Fodd bynnag, fel y nododd Suzy Davies, Julie James ac Aelodau eraill, ar adegau mae'n gwneud synnwyr inni ystyried a yw Bil y DU yn briodol i wneud cyfraith i Gymru mewn meysydd datganoledig. Pan mae hynny'n digwydd, rhaid parchu statws y Cynulliad fel deddfwrfa sy'n gwneud deddfwriaeth sylfaenol i Gymru. Felly, mae'r broses cydsyniad deddfwriaethol yn hollbwysig. Heb hddi, gellid tanseilio fframwaith deddfwriaethol Cymru'n ddifrifol, fel yr amlinellodd y Cadeirydd yn glir yn ei araith agoriadol.

Mae ymateb Llywodraeth Cymru i adroddiad y pwyllgor wedi cael ei osod gerbron y Cynulliad. Yr ydym yn cytuno ag egwyddorion arweiniol adolygiad o Reolau Sefydlog; cafodd hyn ei gynnwys yn ymateb y Pwyllgor Busnes i'r adroddiad hwn a'i amlinellu gan William Graham brynhawn heddiw. Mae argymhellion y pwyllgor yn yr adroddiad yn cyd-fynd yn agos â'n sefyllfa a'n harferion presennol ac â'n dyheadau ar gyfer y Cynulliad, yn unol â chefnogaeth y refferendwm y llynedd. Yr oeddem yn falch o allu derbyn, neu dderbyn mewn egwyddor neu'n rhannol, y rhan fwyaf o argymhellion y pwyllgor, ond cadarnhaf i'r Pwyllgor Materion Cyfansoddiadol a Deddfwriaethol ac i Aelodau heddiw ein bod yn ymateb yn adeiladol i holl argymhellion yr adroddiad. Nawr, mae'n fater o weithio, yn enwedig gyda'r Pwyllgor Materion Cyfansoddiadol a Deddfwriaethol, drwy'r Pwyllgor Busnes, fel y dywedodd William Graham, i gyflawni argymhellion yr adroddiad hwn.

I droi at yr argymhellion, mae'n bleser gennyf ddweud ein bod, er enghraifft, yn derbyn yn rhannol argymhelliad 2, y cyfeiriodd y Cadeirydd ato. Yr ydym eisoes wedi cyflawni'r ymrwymiad o roi gwybod i'r Cynulliad am Filiau'r DU sy'n effeithio ar gymhwysedd y Cynulliad neu ar bwerau Gweinidogion Cymru ar ôl Araith y

Presiding Officer in that spirit on 17 May. We have also accepted recommendation 4, which recommends that the Welsh Government establishes a central unit that has the task of keeping abreast of legislative developments in Whitehall and Westminster that might affect Wales and the Assembly. I am sure that we would be interested to hear more about the examiner of statutory rules that Julie James learned about during her visit to Belfast last week and which she mentioned today.

I want to comment briefly on the response to some of the committee's recommendations, and to clarify points on which the Welsh Government response may have raised some concerns in relation to implementation. Therefore, to clarify in relation to recommendation 5, we support the change to Standing Orders to ensure that the consent of the Assembly is required for UK Parliament legislation on any matter affecting the legislative competence of the Assembly or the powers of Welsh Ministers. The timing needs to be considered and discussed with the UK Government, with a view to amending devolution guidance note 9, as it will need to be amended to align with the proposed changes to Standing Orders. I thank William Graham for acknowledging that on behalf of the Business Committee. We also need to consider when such a change could be introduced as a result of these discussions. We are commencing those discussions and negotiations and I will be reporting back to Members in due course.

On Standing Orders, it is beneficial to learn from the processes undertaken in Scotland, and we are certainly open to doing this. The Scottish Standing Orders are slightly different to ours, but we can now review them and consider how they work in practice, particularly in the working relationships, as the Chair has said, between the Scottish Government and the Scottish Parliament and between the Scottish Government and Whitehall departments. We can look to those to see how they can assist us in developing our process for advising the Assembly on relevant UK legislation through legislative consent memoranda and motions.

Frenhines; ysgrifennais at y Llywydd i gyfleu hynny ar 17 Mai. Yr ydym hefyd wedi derbyn argymhelliad 4, sy'n argymhell bod Llywodraeth Cymru'n sefydlu uned ganolog â'r dasg o gael y wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am ddatblygiadau deddfwriaethol yn Whitehall a San Steffan a all effeithio ar Gymru a'r Cynulliad. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai gennym ddiddordeb mewn clywed mwy am yr archwiliwr rheolau statudol y dysgodd Julie James amdano yn ystod ei hymweliad â Belfast yr wythnos diwethaf, ac y cyfeiriodd ato heddiw.

Hoffwn sôn yn gryno am yr ymateb i rai o argymhellion y pwyllgor, ac egluro rhai pwyntiau lle gallai ymateb Llywodraeth Cymru fod wedi codi rhai pryderon mewn perthynas â'u rhoi ar waith. Felly, fel eglurhad mewn perthynas ag argymhelliad 5, yr ydym o blaid newid Rheolau Sefydlog i sicrhau bod angen cydsyniad y Cynulliad ar gyfer deddfwriaeth gan Senedd y DU ar unrhyw fater sy'n effeithio ar gymhwysedd deddfwriaethol y Cynulliad neu ar bwerau Gweinidogion Cymru. Mae angen ystyried a thrafod yr amseru gyda Llywodraeth y DU, gyda golwg ar ddiwygio canllaw ar ddatganoli 9, gan y bydd angen ei ddiwygio i gyd-fynd â'r newidiadau arfaethedig i Reolau Sefydlog. Diolch i William Graham am gydnabod hynny ar ran y Pwyllgor Busnes. Mae angen inni hefyd ystyried pryd gellid cyflwyno newid o'r fath o ganlyniad i'r trafodaethau hyn. Yr ydym yn dechrau'r trafodaethau a'r negodi hynny ac adroddaf yn ôl i Aelodau gyda hyn.

O ran Rheolau Sefydlog, mae'n fuddiol dysgu o'r prosesau sy'n digwydd yn yr Alban, ac yr ydym yn sicr yn agored i wneud hyn. Mae Rheolau Sefydlog yr Alban ychydig yn wahanol i'n rhai ni, ond nawr gallwn eu hadolygu ac ystyried sut y maent yn gweithio'n ymarferol, yn enwedig yn y perthnasoedd gwaith, fel y dywedodd y Cadeirydd, rhwng Llywodraeth yr Alban a Senedd yr Alban a rhwng Llywodraeth yr Alban ac adrannau Whitehall. Gallwn edrych ar y rheini i weld sut y gallant ein cynorthwyo i ddatblygu ein proses ar gyfer cynghori'r Cynulliad am ddeddfwriaeth berthnasol y DU drwy gyfrwng memoranda a chynigion cydsyniad deddfwriaethol.

Recommendations 6 and 7 relate to the process for considering explanatory memoranda. I can assure the Chair of the Constitutional and Legislative Affairs Committee, and speakers in today's debate, that there is a great deal of common ground between us and the committee, as indicated through our response to the report. We have concerns that relate only to those situations where the parliamentary timetable is so tight that time for committee scrutiny is, perhaps, constrained before the LCM is considered in Plenary. However, we fully accept that Assembly scrutiny should normally be part of the process. We are happy to accept the principle and to work with the Business Committee to find a way forward to reflect this; you have my commitment to making this work and to delivering on that intention.

In response to Simon Thomas's point, we are willing to work with the Assembly on amendments to Standing Orders to ensure that the LCM process is as effective as possible in assisting committees to carry out their scrutiny. I will reflect further on the comments made in yesterday's debate as we review our processes for preparing legislative consent motions. I also acknowledge yesterday's statement by the Counsel General in the context of recommendation 10 on developing easily accessible information about Welsh laws.

We are content to accept in principle the proposal in recommendation 11 that Standing Orders should be amended to require Assembly consent for subordinate legislation made by UK Ministers alone but that has an impact on the Assembly's legislative competence. Eluned Parrott helpfully drew attention to this recommendation in her contribution this afternoon. Work is needed to identify the different types of subordinate legislation, accompanying processes and changes to DGN 9 that may be required. Procedures in the Assembly would have to be sufficiently flexible to deal with this.

Finally, I am pleased that today's debate has allowed Members the opportunity to

Mae argymhellion 6 a 7 yn ymwneud â'r broses o ystyried memoranda esboniadol. Gallaf sicrhau Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Materion Cyfansoddiadol a Deddfwriaethol, a siaradwyr yn nadl heddiw, bod llawer o dir cyffredin rhyngom a'r pwyllgor, fel y mae ein hymateb i'r adroddiad yn ei ddynodi. Mae ein hunig bryderon yn ymwneud â'r sefyllfaoedd hynny lle mae'r amserlen seneddol mor dynn nes y gall gyfyngu ar amser craffu pwyllgor cyn i'r cynnig cydsyniad deddfwriaethol gael ei ystyried mewn Cyfarfod Llawn. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn derbyn yn llawn y dylai craffu gan y Cynulliad fod yn rhan arferol o'r broses. Yr ydym yn fodlon derbyn yr egwyddor a chydweithio â'r Pwyllgor Busnes i ddod o hyd i ffordd ymlaen i adlewyrchu hyn; mae gennych fy ymrwymiad i wneud i hyn weithio a chyflawni'r bwriad hwnnw.

I ymateb i bwynt Simon Thomas, yr ydym yn fodlon cydweithio â'r Cynulliad ar ddiwygiadau i Reolau Sefydlog i sicrhau bod y broses cynigion cydsyniad deddfwriaethol mor effeithiol â phosibl o ran cynorthwyo pwyllgorau i wneud eu gwaith craffu. Rhoddaf ystyriaeth bellach i'r sylwadau a wnaethpwyd yn nadl ddoe wrth inni adolygu ein prosesau ar gyfer paratoi cynigion cydsyniad deddfwriaethol. Cydnabyddaf hefyd ddatganiad ddoe gan y Cwnsler Cyffredinol yng nghyd-destun argymhelliad 10 am ddatblygu gwybodaeth sydd ar gael yn rhwydd am gyfreithiau Cymru.

Yr ydym yn fodlon derbyn mewn egwyddor y cynnig yn argymhelliad 11 y dylid diwygio Rheolau Sefydlog i fynnu cydsyniad y Cynulliad ag is-ddeddfwriaeth a wneir gan Weinidogion y DU yn unig ond sy'n effeithio ar gymhwysedd deddfwriaethol y Cynulliad. Tynnodd Eluned Parrott sylw cynorthwyol at yr argymhelliad hwn yn ei chyfraniad brynhawn heddiw. Mae angen gwaith i adnabod y gwahanol fathau o is-ddeddfwriaeth, y prosesau cysylltiedig a'r newidiadau i ganllaw ar ddatganoli 9 y gallai fod eu hangen. Byddai angen i weithdrefnau'r Cynulliad fod yn ddigon hyblyg i ymdrin â hyn.

Yn olaf, yr wyf yn falch bod dadl heddiw wedi rhoi cyfle i Aelodau i gyfrannu eu

contribute their views so constructively on such important issues. It has helped to clarify the role and responsibilities of the Welsh Government in responding to the report, and to ensure that Welsh Ministers are appropriately held to account. I will be reflecting on that, as Leader of the House, in my consideration and negotiations in due course.

David Melding: I thank all Members who have taken part in what has been a very constructive debate. I will respond briefly to some of the comments made. Simon Thomas stressed the importance of the principle of all LCMs being referred to a committee. He then made the vital point that most, or at least many, would not require detailed scrutiny. However, it is for the committees to decide that. He also emphasised the need for early consideration—a point picked up by most speakers.

Suzy Davies emphasised that there are times when cross-border issues, or matters that are very much intertwined between England and Wales, require proceeding via Westminster legislation, so there is likely to be a continuing need for a robust LCM process. Indeed, even in Scotland, which does not face so many of these challenges, they have had lots of LCMs, so it is important that we remember the need for a good, robust and fit-for-purpose system. She reflected on yesterday's experience, when we looked at the Local Government Finance Bill LCM, which showed some of the difficulties that we have with LCMs and their timing.

Julie James emphasised the need to review and adapt Standing Orders on a continuous basis, and I agree with her on that. She even reflected on a very recent experience last week in Northern Ireland, when her eyes lit up when she saw the examiner of statutory rules. [*Laughter.*] It was not love at first; it was that she thought that that office was an excellent way of dealing with subordinate legislation and of sorting out what was really crucial from the routine. All sides have emphasised the need to look at our

safbwyntiau am faterion mor bwysig mewn modd mor adeiladol. Mae wedi helpu i egluro swyddogaeth a chyfrifoldebau Llywodraeth Cymru o ran ymateb i'r adroddiad, ac i sicrhau y caiff Gweinidogion Cymru eu galw i gyfrif yn briodol. Cofiaf hynny, fel Arweinydd y Tŷ, wrth ystyried a negodi gyda hyn.

David Melding: Diolch i bob Aelod sydd wedi cymryd rhan mewn dadl adeiladol iawn. Ymatebaf yn gryno i rai o'r sylwadau a wnaethpwyd. Pwysleisiodd Simon Thomas bwysigrwydd egwyddor cyfeirio pob cynnig cydsyniad deddfwriaethol at bwyllgor. Yna gwnaeth y pwynt hollbwysig na fyddai angen craffu'n fanwl ar y rhan fwyaf ohonynt, neu ar lawer ohonynt o leiaf. Fodd bynnag, lle'r pwyllgorau yw penderfynu hynny. Pwysleisiodd hefyd fod angen eu hystyried yn gynnar—soniodd y rhan fwyaf o siaradwyr am hynny.

Pwysleisiodd Suzy Davies y ceir adegau pan mae angen symud ymlaen â materion trawsffiniol, neu faterion sy'n berthnasol iawn i Gymru a Lloegr, drwy deddfwriaeth o San Steffan, felly mae'n debygol y bydd angen parhaus am broses gadarn ar gyfer cynigion cydsyniad deddfwriaethol. Yn wir, hyd yn oed yn yr Alban, lle nad ydynt yn wynebu cynifer o'r heriau hyn, maent wedi cael llawer o gynigion cydsyniad deddfwriaethol, felly mae'n bwysig ein bod yn cofio bod angen system dda, gadarn sy'n addas at ei diben. Adlewyrchodd hi ar brofiad ddoe, pan edrychasom ar gynnig cydsyniad deddfwriaethol y Bil Cyllid Llywodraeth Leol, a ddangosodd rai o'r anawsterau sydd gennym â chynigion cydsyniad deddfwriaethol a'u hamseru.

Pwysleisiodd Julie James fod angen adolygu a mabwysiadu Rheolau Sefydlog yn barhaus, a chytunaf â hi yn hynny o beth. Soniodd hyd yn oed am brofiad diweddar iawn yr wythnos diwethaf yng Ngogledd Iwerddon, pan oleuodd ei llygaid wrth weld yr archwiliwr rheolau statudol. [*Chwerthin.*] Nid oedd yn gariad ar unwaith; credodd hi fod y swydd honno'n ffordd ragorol o ymdrin ag is-ddeddfwriaeth a threfnu'r hyn sy'n wirioneddol hollbwysig yn y drefn. Mae pob ochr wedi pwysleisio bod angen edrych ar ein

procedures and see them evolve, so perhaps we may even go in that direction at some point—who knows? It is important to spot the key LCMs and statutory instruments that need examination.

Eluned emphasised that we cannot allow subordinate legislation to slip under the radar, because, while most of it is routine, some of it is really important and has extensive ramifications that could inadvertently end up eroding our powers in the Assembly. She mentioned the devolution guidance notes, which I did not have time to address in my speech, but I was grateful to you, Eluned, for emphasising that they are crucial in maintaining a good culture in the way that the Government here works with the Government in Westminster. If they get it right, we will have information on a timely basis.

I thank Antoinette Sandbach for her contribution; she was the only person who is not on the committee, other than the Minister, to have made a contribution. It was valuable to see our report attract the interest of the wider Assembly. It was apposite that she referred to the evidence that we had received from the FUW. We were so grateful to get that evidence. This can seem a dry subject, but a key organisation representing a key interest in farming saw the significance of this matter, and she was absolutely right to emphasise that. She was also right to emphasise the implications of the Public Bodies Act, which now means that subordinate legislation passed by UK Ministers—in effect, English Ministers—can have a direct effect on us. If they abolish an England and Wales body, what we currently have is going to be fundamentally changed, so there are lots of issues there.

William Graham gave a positive response on behalf of the Business Committee, for which we are very grateful. The tone of the response from the Business Committee was hugely helpful, and appreciated the challenge and the need to work on a basis of consensus on all sides. I am pleased that there has been widespread consensus. Finally, the Minister reflected this consensus. I thought that she

gweithdrefnau a'u gweld yn esblygu, felly efallai yr awn ninnau i'r cyfeiriad hwnnw rywbyrd—pwy a wŷyr? Mae'n bwysig canfod y cynigion cydsyniad deddfwriaethol a'r offerynnau statudol allweddol y mae angen eu harchwilio.

Pwysleisiodd Eluned na allwn adael i is-ddeddfwriaeth lithro islaw ein hymwybyddiaeth, oherwydd, er mai mater o drefn yw'r rhan fwyaf ohoni, mae rhywfaint ohoni'n wirioneddol bwysig ag israniadau helaeth a all erydu ein pwerau yn y Cynulliad ar ddamwain. Soniodd am y canllawiau ar ddatganoli—ni chefais amser i sôn am y rhain yn fy araith—ond yr oeddwn yn ddiolchgar ichi, Eluned, am bwysleisio eu bod yn hollbwysig o ran cynnal diwylliant da o ran sut y mae'r Llywodraeth hon yn cydweithio â'r Llywodraeth yn San Steffan. Os cânt hynny'n gywir, cawn wybodaeth yn amserol.

Diolch i Antoinette Sandbach am ei chyfraniad; hi oedd yr unig gyfrannwr nad yw ar y pwyllgor, heblaw'r Gweinidog. Yr oedd yn werthfawr gweld ein hadroddiad yn denu sylw'r Cynulliad yn ehangach. Yr oedd yn briodol ei bod wedi cyfeirio at y dystiolaeth a gawsom gan FUW. Yr oeddem yn ddiolchgar iawn am y dystiolaeth honno. Gall y pwnc hwn ymddangos yn un sych, ond gwelwyd arwyddocâd y mater gan sefydliad allweddol sy'n cynrychioli diddordeb allweddol, sef amaeth, ac yr oedd hi'n gwbl gywir i bwysleisio hynny. Yr oedd yn gywir hefyd i bwysleisio goblygiadau'r Ddeddf Cyrff Cyhoeddus, sydd nawr yn golygu y gall is-ddeddfwriaeth a basir gan Weinidogion y DU—Gweinidogion Lloegr, i bob diben—effeithio'n uniongyrchol arnom ni. Os ydynt am ddiddymu corff i Gymru a Lloegr, ceir newid sylfaenol i'r hyn sydd gennym ar hyn o bryd, felly mae llawer o faterion yn gysylltiedig â hynny.

Rhoddodd William Graham ymateb cadarnhaol ar ran y Pwyllgor Busnes; yr ydym yn ddiolchgar iawn amdano. Yr oedd tŷn yr ymateb gan y Pwyllgor Busnes yn gynorthwyol iawn, gan werthfawrogi'r her a'r angen i weithio ar sail consensws ar bob ochr. Yr wyf yn falch y cafwyd consensws cyffredinol. Yn olaf, adlewyrchodd y Gweinidog y consensws hwn. Credaf iddi

said something very important: that the Government was responding constructively to all the recommendations of the report, and would work through the Business Committee to ensure that the principles are put into effect. There are some issues on the practicalities, but the principles are accepted. That is very important. She concluded by saying that there are challenges when the parliamentary timetable is tight, but we can loosen that up a bit by anticipation, by getting better information and by ensuring that Whitehall—problems emanate more often there than from our end—appreciates what happens to the National Assembly as a result of its legislative action. I have great pleasure in commending this report to the Assembly.

The Temporary Deputy Presiding Officer:

The proposal is to note the Constitutional and Legislative Affairs Committee's report. Does any Member object? I see that there are no objections. Therefore, the motion is agreed in accordance with Standing Order No. 12.36.

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.

Motion agreed.

4.00 p.m.

Ymchwiliad y Pwyllgor Plant a Phobl Ifanc i Weithredu Mesur Dysgu a Sgiliau (Cymru) 2009

The Children and Young People Committee's Inquiry into the Implementation of the Learning and Skills (Wales) Measure 2009

Cynnig NDM5021 Christine Chapman

Motion NDM5021 Christine Chapman

Cynnig bod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

To propose that the National Assembly for Wales:

Yn nodi adroddiad y Pwyllgor Plant a Phobl Ifanc ar yr ymchwiliad i Weithredu Mesur Dysgu a Sgiliau (Cymru) 2009, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 8 Mai 2012.

Notes the report of the Children and Young People Committee on the inquiry into the Implementation of the Learning and Skills (Wales) Measure 2009, which was laid in the Table Office on 8 May 2012.

Christine Chapman: I move the motion.

This inquiry into the Learning and Skills (Wales) Measure 2009 is in itself a small piece of Assembly history. It is the first piece of post-legislative scrutiny undertaken by one of the Assembly's committees. I thank the committee clerks and the research staff team who supported us in producing this report.

Christine Chapman: Cynigiau y cynnig.

Mae'r ymchwiliad hwn i Fesur Dysgu a Sgiliau (Cymru) 2009 yn garreg filltir fach yn hanes y Cynulliad ar ei ben ei hun. Dyma'r enghraifft gyntaf o graffu ôl-ddeddfwriaethol gan un o bwyllgorau'r Cynulliad. Diolchaf i glercod y pwyllgor a thîm y staff ymchwil a'n helpodd i lunio'r adroddiad hwn.

The committee heard evidence from a wide range of organisations and education professionals, many of whom had also given evidence to the Stage 1 legislation committee in 2008. In addition, and importantly, 790 young people aged 14 to 19 filled in a short questionnaire for us. These were young people who were visiting the Assembly as part of schools visits, or in youth clubs, or who met individual committee members in their local schools. Some of them filled in the questionnaire online. We are very grateful to these young people for taking the time to tell us their views and about their experiences.

We are also very grateful to four young people who came to a formal meeting of the committee and told us about their experiences and answered our questions in person. We also produced a young-person-friendly version of our report so that these young people could see how their views influenced our conclusions and recommendations. I recommend that you look at it, if you get a chance to see the document that we produced.

I would like to thank the Minister for Education and Skills for his positive response to the committee's recommendations, and his acceptance, or acceptance in principle, of all but one of our recommendations. I hope that the evidence that we have heard will be useful to the Minister and will help to inform and influence the final stages of the implementation of the Measure.

We heard widespread agreement that the implementation of the Measure has been successful to a large extent and that it has increased the number and breadth of courses, particularly vocational courses for 14 to 19-year-olds. However, we also heard evidence that, in reality, this increase in the number of courses is not available to all 14 to 19-year-olds. The reasons for this are very varied: sometimes, there are small classes that are not viable and so the course does not run; some young people lack the confidence to travel to another school or college; some courses may not be available through the medium of Welsh; and there may be lengthy journeys between schools and colleges. We

Clywodd y pwyllgor dystiolaeth gan amrywiaeth eang o sefydliadau a gweithwyr addysg proffesiynol, yr oedd nifer ohonynt hefyd wedi rhoi tystiolaeth i'r pwyllgor deddfwriaeth Cam 1 yn 2008. Yn ogystal â hyn, mae'n bwysig nodi bod 790 o bobl ifanc rhwng 14 a 19 oed wedi llenwi holiadur byr ar ein cyfer. Roedd y rhain yn bobl ifanc a oedd yn ymweld â'r Cynulliad o'u hysgolion, neu fel aelodau o glybiau ieuencid, neu a gyfarfu ag aelodau o'r pwyllgor yn eu hysgolion lleol. Llanwodd rhai ohonynt yr holiadur ar-lein. Rydym yn ddiolchgar iawn i'r bobl ifanc hyn am roi o'u hamser i fynegi eu barn wrthym a sôn am eu profiadau.

Rydym hefyd yn ddiolchgar iawn i bedwar person ifanc a ddaeth i gyfarfod ffurfiol o'r pwyllgor a sôn wrthym am eu profiadau ac ateb ein cwestiynau eu hunain. Gwnaethom hefyd lunio fersiwn o'n hadroddiad sy'n hwylus i bobl ifanc fel y gallai'r bobl ifanc hyn weld sut yr oedd eu barn wedi dylanwadu ar ein casgliadau a'n hargymhellion. Rwyf yn eich annog i edrych arno, os cewch gyfle i weld y ddogfen a luniasom.

Hoffwn ddiolch i'r Gweinidog Addysg a Sgiliau am ei ymateb cadarnhaol i argymhellion y pwyllgor, ac am dderbyn, neu dderbyn mewn egwyddor, ein holl argymhellion namyn un. Gobeithiaf y bydd y dystiolaeth a glywsom yn ddefnyddiol i'r Gweinidog ac y bydd yn helpu i ffurfio a dylanwadu ar y camau terfynol ar gyfer gweithredu'r Mesur.

Roedd cytundeb cyffredin yn y dystiolaeth a glywsom fod y Mesur wedi'i weithredu'n llwyddiannus gan mwyaf a'i fod wedi cynyddu nifer ac ehangder cyrsiau, yn enwedig cyrsiau galwedigaethol i rai rhwng 14 a 19 blwydd oed. Er hynny, clywsom dystiolaeth hefyd nad yw pawb rhwng 14 a 19 blwydd oed wedi gweld cynnydd yn nifer y cyrsiau sydd ar gael iddynt. Mae'r rhesymau am hyn yn amrywiol iawn: weithiau, bydd dosbarthiadau bach nad ydynt yn hyfyw ac felly ni fydd y cwrs yn mynd ymlaen; nid yw rhai pobl ifanc yn ddigon hyderus i deithio i ysgol neu goleg arall; efallai na fydd rhai cyrsiau ar gael drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg; a gellir cael teithiau hir

heard some contradictory evidence, but we are concerned that, in a significant number of cases, the increased number of courses is in reality an 'illusion'. That is quoted in the report.

We also heard evidence that the requirement to provide a choice of 30 courses, of which five must be vocational, is an arbitrary number. Some witnesses told us that this was reasonable, but we also heard some genuine concerns about unintended consequences, for example, lower numbers of young people choosing modern foreign languages and a lower take-up of STEM subjects at post 16. The take-up of vocational courses has, however, definitely increased. We, therefore, welcome warmly the Minister's acceptance of our first recommendation and his commitment to review the local curriculum at key stage 4 in relation to the minimum number of courses offered.

Our second recommendation was the result of evidence from several witnesses about the difficulties of obtaining impartial advice easily about all the learning and training opportunities in the local area. There were comments, in particular, that some schools publicised their own courses over local college courses or work-based learning opportunities. We did, however, see some examples of good practice, which resulted in our second recommendation. We recommended that there should be Welsh Government guidance requiring the publication of a joint prospectus for each local curriculum area that would contain impartial advice on all education and training opportunities. Minister, you accepted this in principle, and agree with the sentiment. Personally, I am unsure whether publishing local curriculum offers at key stage 4 and post 16 on the Welsh Government website will attract widespread use by young people and parents. However, we welcome your offer to look at the feasibility of publishing combined prospectuses on the Careers Wales website, although I still wonder whether a locally produced booklet would be the most effective way of ensuring that young people and their parents can easily access comprehensive and impartial advice to

rhwng ysgolion a cholegau. Clywsom rywfaint o dystiolaeth groes, ond rydym yn pryderu, mewn cryn nifer o achosion, fod y cynnydd yn nifer y cyrsiau'n 'rhith'. Mae'r adroddiad yn crybwyll hynny.

Clywsom dystiolaeth hefyd fod y gofyniad i gynnig dewis o 30 o gyrsiau, y mae'n rhaid i bump ohonynt fod yn alwedigaethol, wedi'i seilio ar nifer mympwyol. Dywedodd rhai tystion wrthym fod hyn yn rhesymol, ond clywsom rai pryderon dilys hefyd am ganlyniadau anfwriadol, er enghraifft, niferoedd llai o bobl ifanc yn dewis ieithoedd tramor modern a nifer llai'n cymryd gwyddoniaeth, technoleg, peirianeg a mathemateg yn y cyfnod ôl-16. Er hynny, mae cynnydd pendant yn y nifer sy'n dilyn cyrsiau galwedigaethol. Felly, rydym yn falch iawn bod y Gweinidog wedi derbyn ein hargymhelliad cyntaf ac wedi ymrwmo i adolygu'r cwricwlwm lleol yng nghyfnod allweddol 4 o ran y nifer lleiaf o gyrsiau a gynigir.

Roedd ein hail argymhelliad yn ganlyniad i wrando ar dystiolaeth gan nifer o dystion am anawsterau wrth gael cyngor diduedd am yr holl gyfleoedd dysgu a hyfforddi sydd ar gael yn yr ardal leol. Cafwyd sylwadau, yn benodol, fod rhai ysgolion yn hysbysebu eu cyrsiau eu hunain ar draul cyrsiau mewn colegau lleol neu gyfleoedd dysgu seiliedig ar waith. Er hynny, gwelsom rai enghreifftiau o arfer da, a arweiniodd at ein hail argymhelliad. Ein hargymhelliad oedd y dylid cael canllawiau gan Lywodraeth Cymru a fydd yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol cyhoeddi prospectws ar y cyd ar gyfer pob ardal cwricwlwm lleol ac ynddo gyngor diduedd am yr holl gyfleoedd addysg a hyfforddiant. Weinidog, gwnaethoch dderbyn hyn mewn egwyddor, a chytuno â'r syniad. Yn bersonol, nid wyf yn sicr a fydd cyhoeddi arlwy'r cwricwlwm lleol yng nghyfnod allweddol 4 a'r cyfnod ôl-16 ar wefan Llywodraeth Cymru yn cymell nifer mawr o bobl ifanc a rhieni i'w defnyddio. Serch hynny, croesawn eich cynnig i ystyried a fydd yn bosibl cyhoeddi prospectysau cyfunedig ar wefan Gyrfa Cymru, er fy mod yn meddwl o hyd tybed ai llyfryn a gynhyrchir yn lleol fyddai'r ffordd fwyaf effeithiol o sicrhau bod pobl ifanc a'u rhieni'n gallu cael gafael yn rhwydd ar gyngor cynhwysfawr a diduedd i'w helpu i

inform their choices at key stage 4 and post 16.

We are pleased that the Minister, together with the Minister for Local Government and Communities, has agreed to review the impact of increased travel and transport as a result of the implementation of the Measure. Again, the committee was concerned that the impact was affecting some learners more than others, for example, those who live in rural areas or attend Welsh-medium provision. I would draw the Minister's attention to some practical difficulties that we heard about with regard to travel that impact on a young person's readiness to learn. We heard about younger learners who may lack confidence, students who may have to carry heavy bags on long journeys or may have to travel long distances, which sometimes eat into their breaks and so on, and students who may need additional supervision on the bus. These are very practical difficulties that we heard about.

A review of the increased travel demands and costs will be particularly timely following the Minister's publication of the review of digital classroom teaching materials, which should improve the quality and scope of the digital classroom products. Digital classroom materials rely on robust ICT infrastructure. We heard evidence that the ICT infrastructure is not currently reliable or capable of supporting quality digital classroom learning products in parts of Wales, for example, Ceredigion. We are pleased that the Minister agrees in principle with our recommendation that all schools should have access to next generation connectivity services. We note that the majority of Welsh schools will be connected by the end of this year, but I ask the Minister to continue to check that all schools are connected promptly. In some ways, it is the schools in rural areas, with greater distances to neighbouring schools and colleges, that are in greater need of excellent broadband services.

Talking to witnesses, it became evident very quickly that there is significant confusion about the roles of learning coaches and other

ddewis yng nghyfnod allweddol 4 a'r cyfnod ôl-16.

Rydym yn falch bod y Gweinidog, ynghyd â'r Gweinidog Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau, wedi cytuno i adolygu effaith y cynnydd o ran teithio a chludiant o ganlyniad i weithredu'r Mesur. Unwaith eto, roedd y pwyllgor yn pryderu bod mwy o effaith ar rai dysgwyr nag ar eraill, er enghraifft, y rheini sy'n byw mewn ardaloedd gwledig neu'n derbyn darpariaeth cyfrwng Cymraeg. Tynnaf sylw'r Gweinidog at rai anawsterau ymarferol o ran teithio y clywsom amdanynt sy'n effeithio ar barodrwydd y person ifanc i ddysgu. Clywsom am ddysgwyr iau a allai fod yn ddihyder, myfyrwyr a allai orfod cario bagiau trwm ar deithiau hir neu a allai orfod teithio'n bell, gan fod hynny weithiau'n mynd â'u hamser egwyl ac yn y blaen, a myfyrwyr a allai fod ag angen goruchwyliaeth ychwanegol ar y bws. Mae'r rhain yn anawsterau ymarferol iawn y clywsom amdanynt.

Bydd adolygiad o'r galwadau a chostau cynyddol am deithio'n neilltuol o amserol yn sgîl cyhoeddi'r adolygiad gan y Gweinidog o ddeunyddiau addysgu digidol yn yr ystafell ddosbarth, a ddylai wella ansawdd a chwmpas cyfleusterau digidol yn yr ystafell ddosbarth. Rhaid wrth seilwaith TGCh dibynadwy ar gyfer deunyddiau digidol yn yr ystafell ddosbarth. Clywsom dystiolaeth nad yw'r seilwaith TGCh presennol yn ddibynadwy ac nad yw'n gallu cynnal cyfleusterau dysgu digidol o ansawdd da yn yr ystafell ddosbarth mewn rhai rhannau o Gymru, er enghraifft, Ceredigion. Rydym yn falch bod y Gweinidog yn derbyn mewn egwyddor ein hargymhelliad y dylai pob ysgol gael ei chysylltu â gwasanaethau band eang y genhedlaeth nesaf. Rydym yn nodi y bydd y rhan fwyaf o ysgolion Cymru wedi'u cysylltu erbyn diwedd y flwyddyn hon, ond gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog barhau i sicrhau bod pob ysgol yn cael ei chysylltu'n brydlon. Mewn rhai pethau, ysgolion mewn ardaloedd gwledig, sy'n bellach oddi wrth ysgolion a cholegau yn eu hardal, sydd â'r angen mwyaf am wasanaethau band eang rhagorol.

Wrth siarad â thystion, daeth yn amlwg yn fuan iawn fod cryn ddrysych ynghylch rolau anogwyr dysgu a gwasanaethau cymorth

learning support services, despite the publication of Welsh Government guidance. It was also evident that the roles are delivered differently in different areas. The careers service provided us with clear descriptions of the roles, but we remain convinced that, in practice, there is significant confusion about the delivery of learner support services and significant differences in the delivery of these services. The effective delivery of these services is essential to the successful implementation of the Measure. We are pleased that the Minister has accepted our recommendation that there should be an urgent review of learner support systems and pastoral care.

We disagreed with the Minister over the use of learning pathway plans, and the Minister rejected our recommendation on this. The Minister says that approximately 25% of learners in Wales are using the Careers Wales online electronic learning pathways plan, and that all other learners have their own record that details the courses of study that they are entitled to follow and any learner support that will be provided to them. However, as I have already mentioned, Assembly staff helped us to collate 790 questionnaire responses from young people aged between 14 and 19. Of those, 43% of young people said that they had some form of planning document, such as a learning pathways plan, 52% said that they did not have a learning pathways plan or a similar document, and 5% did not know. Again, there may be some confusion. This result was also backed up in informal conversations between some of my committee colleagues and learners in their constituencies. It may be purely down to misunderstanding by learners, and there may be a need for better marketing and promoting of the documents that exist, so, again, I would welcome your response on that.

However, this was the only area on which we disagreed with the Minister. I am very pleased that he accepted or accepted in principle our recommendations on an evaluation of the impact of the Measure on vulnerable learners and effective employer engagement, the importance of promoting

dysgu eraill, er bod Llywodraeth Cymru wedi cyhoeddi canllawiau ar hyn. Roedd hefyd yn amlwg bod y rolau'n cael eu cyflawni'n wahanol mewn gwahanol ardaloedd. Rhoddodd y gwasanaeth gyrfaoedd ddisgrifiadau clir i ni o'r rolau, ond rydym yn dal yn sicr bod cryn ddryswch ynghylch cyflenwi gwasanaethau cymorth i ddysgwyr a gwahaniaethau sylweddol o ran cyflenwi'r gwasanaethau hyn. Mae'n hollbwysig cyflenwi'r gwasanaethau hyn yn effeithiol er mwyn gweithredu'r Mesur yn llwyddiannus. Rydym yn falch bod y Gweinidog wedi derbyn ein hargymhelliad y dylid cael adolygiad brys o systemau cymorth i ddysgwyr a gofal bugeiliol.

Gwnaethom anghytuno â'r Gweinidog ynghylch defnyddio cynlluniau llwybrau dysgu, a gwrthododd y Gweinidog ein hargymhelliad ar hyn. Dywed y Gweinidog fod tua 25 y cant o ddysgwyr yng Nghymru'n defnyddio cynllun llwybrau dysgu electronig ar-lein Gyrfya Cymru, a bod gan yr holl ddysgwyr eraill eu cofnod eu hunain sy'n rhestru'r cyrsiau astudio y mae ganddynt hawl i'w dilyn ac unrhyw gymorth i ddysgwyr a ddarperir iddynt. Fodd bynnag, fel yr wyf wedi sôn eisoes, gwnaeth staff y Cynulliad ein helpu i goladu ymatebion mewn 790 o holiaduron a gafwyd oddi wrth bobl ifanc sydd rhwng 14 a 19 oed. O'r rheini, dywedodd 43 y cant o bobl ifanc eu bod wedi cael rhyw fath o ddogfen gynllunio, fel cynllun llwybrau dysgu, dywedodd 52 y cant nad oedd ganddynt gynllun llwybrau dysgu neu ddogfen debyg, ac roedd 5 y cant nad oeddent yn gwybod. Unwaith eto, mae'n bosibl bod rhywfaint o ddryswch. Ategwyd y canlyniad hwn hefyd mewn sgyrsiau anffurfiol rhwng rhai o'm cyd-aelodau o'r pwyllgor a dysgwyr yn eu hetholaethau. Gellid ei briodoli'n llwyr i gamddealltwriaeth ar ran dysgwyr, ac efallai fod angen marchnata a hysbysebu'r dogfennau sydd ar gael yn well, felly, unwaith eto, byddwn yn falch o glywed eich ymateb i hynny.

Fodd bynnag, hwn oedd yr unig faes lle'r oeddem yn anghytuno â'r Gweinidog. Rwyf yn falch iawn ei fod wedi derbyn neu wedi derbyn mewn egwyddor ein hargymhellion ar werthuso effaith y Mesur ar ddysgwyr sy'n agored i niwed ac ymgysylltu effeithiol â chyflogwyr, y pwysigrwydd o hyrwyddo

positive action to challenge gender stereotyping in education and training, and the Measure's impact on Welsh-medium and bilingual education, including dual-stream schools.

Finally, I would like to thank everyone who contributed, and particularly the young people who took the time to tell us how the implementation of this important piece of legislation is affecting them. I hope that the work the committee has done on this will assist the Minister in reviewing and evaluating the successes and weaknesses of the implementation of this Assembly Measure to date, and help to ensure that all 14 to 19-year-olds benefit from increased opportunities as the Measure intended.

Angela Burns: I too would like to thank the Chair, the clerk and the many witnesses to the inquiry. I did not realise that we were such a significant part of history, but I felt that it was a very useful inquiry. Personally, I found it very interesting because we started this Measure in the last Assembly, in which I was present. It is good because there were three reasons why we needed to do this inquiry. In the last Assembly, there was a degree of uncertainty over the funding, not the objectives of the learning and skills Measure, but how the funding might pan out and how the pump-priming of authorities might work and how they would be able to conduct the implementation. Secondly, we needed the inquiry because of anecdotal evidence given to many Members by schools and colleges and trade unions. Thirdly, it was needed because we wish to be able to inform the skills and qualifications review that the Deputy Minister is undertaking. Like the Chair, I believe that the Government response was positive in the main, although I am always slightly sceptical about recommendations being agreed in principle. I believe that we will be scrutinising that in the years to come.

Minister, I note that you want to examine why some of the evidence given was so conflicting. I think that that is a really important question to ask. It begs the question of buy-in from schools and further education colleges and the support from local authorities because we had some very

camau pendant i herio stereoteipio ar sail rhyw mewn addysg a hyfforddiant, ac effaith y Mesur ar addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg a dwyieithog, gan gynnwys ysgolion dwy ffrwd.

Yn olaf, hoffwn ddiolch i bawb a gyfrannodd, ac yn enwedig y bobl ifanc a roddodd o'u hamser i ddweud wrthym sut y mae'r gweithredu ar y ddeddfwriaeth bwysig hon yn effeithio arnynt. Gobeithiaf y bydd y gwaith a wnaeth y pwyllgor ar hyn yn helpu'r Gweinidog wrth adolygu a gwerthuso llwyddiannau a gwendiau'r gweithredu ar y Mesur Cynulliad hwn hyd yma, ac yn helpu i sicrhau bod pawb rhwng 14 a 19 blwydd oed yn elwa o'r cynnydd mewn cyfleoedd yn unol â bwriad y Mesur.

Angela Burns: Hoffwn innau ddiolch i'r Cadeirydd, y clerc a'r nifer mawr o dystion a gyfrannodd i'r ymchwiliad. Ni sylwedolais ein bod yn cymryd rhan mor bwysig mewn hanes, ond teimlais ei fod yn ymchwiliad buddiol iawn. Yn bersonol, roedd yn ddiddorol iawn i mi gan ein bod wedi dechrau'r Mesur hwn yn y Cynulliad diwethaf, lle'r oeddwn yn bresennol. Mae'n beth da gan fod tri rheswm dros gynnal yr ymchwiliad hwn. Yn y Cynulliad diwethaf, roedd rhywfaint o ansicrwydd ynghylch y cyllid, nid amcanion y Mesur dysgu a sgiliau, ond sut y gallai'r cyllid ddatblygu a sut y gellid ysgogi awdurdodau a sut y gallent ei weithredu. Yn ail, roedd angen cynnal yr ymchwiliad oherwydd tystiolaeth anecdotaidd a roddwyd i nifer o Aelodau gan ysgolion a cholegau ac undebau llafur. Yn drydydd, roedd angen ei gynnal am ein bod yn dymuno cyfrannu i'r adolygiad o sgiliau a chymwysterau sy'n cael ei gynnal gan y Dirprwy Weinidog. Fel y Cadeirydd, credaf fod ymateb y Llywodraeth yn gadarnhaol ar y cyfan, er y byddaf braidd yn amheus bob amser ynghylch derbyn argymhellion mewn egwyddor. Credaf y byddwn yn craffu ar hynny yn y blynyddoedd nesaf.

Weinidog, sylwaf eich bod yn dymuno ymchwilio i weld pam yr oedd rhywfaint o'r dystiolaeth a roddwyd mor anghyson. Credaf fod hwnnw'n gwestiwn gwirioneddol bwysig. Mae'n ein harwain i ofyn am y gefnogaeth gan ysgolion a cholegau addysg bellach a'r cymorth gan awdurdodau lleol

conflicting evidence at times.

I would like to comment on three recommendations in particular. First, recommendation 1 refers to reviewing the decision to have more than 30 courses, including the five vocational courses. Of course, this was an area on which we had an awful lot of conflicting evidence. However, I am very keen to see this because a great deal of the evidence was, in the end, very telling about the balance between academic and vocational courses. There was a lot of feeling that people tended to pursue one route or another, and I think that the whole mix needs to be looked at, especially when we look at the levels of literacy and numeracy in our 14 and 16-year-olds, and consider how age-appropriate their skills are when they get to those ages and go out into the wider world. I notice that you have accepted this recommendation, but I am really keen that we look at this in a very rigorous manner.

Recommendation 3 deals with the extent and impact of the increased travel and transport. Again, this was an area of great conflict. I began the inquiry thinking that it pertained only to a constituency like mine, which is a very rural and children have to travel a long way. However, representatives from the cities point out that many children have to make two, sometimes three, transport changes to access the education they are seeking. I am particularly worried about the impact of travel and transport on younger learners. They are more immature and they have more of a tendency to lose focus as they move from school to further education college and back again. There was evidence that, sometimes, they do not actually reach their destination, but basically play hookey. I am worried about the physical impact on some of these children. Many of these youngsters travel an hour, sometimes an hour and 20 minutes or an hour and a half, to get to school. They are then in school for a couple of hours and we send them back out again. Very often, they are not wearing coats and they are carrying their entire school desks on their backs in their rucksacks. We need to look at the pastoral aspect of sending quite young people on these long journeys in order to get the education that they very strongly

oherwydd cawsom dystiolaeth a oedd yn anghyson iawn ar adegau.

Hoffwn wneud sylw am dri argymhelliad yn benodol. Yn gyntaf, mae argymhelliad 1 yn cyfeirio at adolygu'r penderfyniad i gael mwy na 30 o gyrsiau, gan gynnwys y pum cwrs galwedigaethol. Wrth gwrs, roedd hyn yn faes lle y cawsom lawer o dystiolaeth groes. Er hynny, rwyf yn awyddus iawn i weld hyn oherwydd cawsom lawer iawn o dystiolaeth a oedd yn rymus iawn, yn y bôn, ynghylch y cydbwysedd rhwng cyrsiau academiaidd a galwedigaethol. Roedd nifer yn teimlo bod pobl yn tueddu i ddilyn un llwybr neu'r llall, a chredaf fod angen edrych ar y cymysgedd cyfan, yn enwedig o ystyried lefelau llythrennedd a rhifedd ymysg rhai 14 a 16 flwydd oed, a pha mor addas i'w hoedran y mae eu sgiliau pan gyrhaeddant yr oeddrannau hynny a mynd allan i'r byd mawr. Sylwaf eich bod wedi derbyn yr argymhelliad hwn, ond rwyf yn awyddus iawn inni edrych ar hyn yn fanwl iawn.

Mae argymhelliad 3 yn ymwneud â graddau ac effaith y cynnydd o ran teithio a chludiant. Unwaith eto, roedd anghysondeb mawr yn y maes hwn. Ar ddechrau'r ymchwiliad tybiwn nad oedd yn berthnasol ond i etholaethau fel fy un i, sy'n etholaeth wledig iawn a'r plant yn gorfod teithio'n bell. Fodd bynnag, mae cynrychiolwyr o'r dinasoedd yn tynnu sylw at y ffaith bod llawer o blant yn gorfod newid cludiant ddwy waith, ac weithiau dair, er mwyn cael yr addysg y maent yn ei cheisio. Rwyf yn pryderu'n neilltuol am effaith teithio a chludiant ar ddysgwyr iau. Maent yn fwy anaeddfed ac mae mwy o duedd iddynt gollu'r gallu i ganolbwyntio wrth fynd o'r ysgol i goleg addysg bellach ac yn ôl. Roedd dystiolaeth na fyddant yn cyrraedd pen eu taith weithiau, a'u bod yn chwarae triwant. Rwyf yn poeni am yr effaith gorfforol ar rai o'r plant hyn. Bydd nifer o'r bobl ifanc hyn yn teithio am awr, weithiau awr ac 20 munud neu awr a hanner, i gyrraedd yr ysgol. Wedyn byddant yn yr ysgol am awr neu ddwy cyn inni eu gyrru allan eto. Yn aml iawn, ni fydd cotiau amdanynt a byddant yn cario eu holl bethau ysgol ar eu cefn mewn sach teithio. Mae angen inni ystyried yr agwedd fugeiliol ar anfon pobl eithaf ifanc ar deithiau hir o'r fath er mwyn cael yr addysg y maent yn awyddus i'w chael.

want.

4.15 p.m.

I also wonder whether the transport issues affect or reflect the delivery of the curriculum in the local area. That is very important. I note, Minister, that you are going to review this with the Minister for Local Government and Communities, but I am urging you to look at it in the round, not just in terms of statistics and whether we can get from A to B in a certain amount of time. We need to look at the effect that it has on children.

Finally, I want to touch on recommendation 8, that we should evaluate the impact of the Learning and Skills (Wales) Measure 2009 on vulnerable learners. I understand that you are going to look at this when the first cohort of learners comes out in 2014-15. I totally understand that. However, Minister, do you intend to do any in-flight audit along the way? It would be poor if we were just to say, 'Let's wait and see what happens then'. We may get to that point and find that it has not been as we had hoped, so it would be very useful if we had some more detail about how you are going to monitor it along the way to ensure that those vulnerable learners are not left out of this.

Simon Thomas: Hoffwn i hefyd ddiolch i bawb a fu'n ein helpu i gynnal yr ymchwiliad hwn. Mae'r ymchwiliad, fel sydd wedi ei nodi, yn bwysig gan ei fod yn dilyn deddfwriaeth. Wedi dweud hynny, rwy'n meddwl bod natur gymysg y dystiolaeth, o bosibl, yn adlewyrchu'r ffaith ein bod yn cynnal yr ymchwiliad hwn ychydig o amser yn unig ar ôl i'r ddeddfwriaeth ddod i rym yn llawn ac felly bod ymateb amrywiol ar draws y genedl tuag at weithredu'r ddeddfwriaeth hon. Rwy'n meddwl bod hynny'n cael ei adlewyrchu yn y dystiolaeth ac yn yr argymhellion, i raddau.

Rwy'n croesawu'r ffaith bod y Gweinidog a'r Llywodraeth wedi ymateb yn bositif, ac rwy'n gobeithio y bydd yr adroddiad hwn yn help iddynt wrth drafod sut maen nhw'n mynd i weithredu cynlluniau llwybrau dysgu

Byddaf hefyd yn meddwl tybed a yw'r anawsterau o ran cludiant yn adlewyrchu neu'n effeithio ar y ffordd y caiff y cwricwlwm ei gyflwyno yn yr ardal leol. Mae hynny'n bwysig iawn. Rwyf yn sylwi, Weinidog, eich bod yn mynd i adolygu hyn gyda'r Gweinidog Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau, ond rwyf yn eich annog i edrych arno o bob safbwynt, nid yn unig o ran ystadegau a'r gallu i fynd o un lle i'r llall o fewn cyfnod penodol. Mae angen inni ystyried ei effaith ar blant.

Yn olaf, rwyf am gyfeirio at argymhelliad 8, sef y dylem werthuso effaith Mesur Dysgu a Sgiliau (Cymru) 2009 ar ddysgwyr sy'n agored i niwed. Rwyf yn deall eich bod yn mynd i ystyried hyn pan ddaw'r cohort cyntaf o ddysgwyr allan yn 2014-15. Rwyf yn deall hynny'n iawn. Fodd bynnag, Weinidog, a ydych yn bwriadu cynnal archwiliad yn y cyfamser? Byddai'n wael pe byddem yn bodloni ar ddweud, 'Gadewch inni ddisgwyl a gweld beth a ddigwydd bryd hynny'. Gallem gyrraedd y pwynt hwnnw a gweld na fu cystal ag yr oeddem wedi gobeithio, felly byddai'n fuddiol iawn inni gael mwy o fanylion am y ffordd y byddwch yn monitro hyn yn y cyfamser i sicrhau na fydd dysgwyr sy'n agored i niwed yn cael cam.

Simon Thomas: I would also like to thank everyone who assisted us with this inquiry. As has been noted, this inquiry is important as it is post legislative scrutiny. Having said that, I think that the mixed nature of the evidence may reflect the fact that we were conducting this inquiry just a short time after the legislation had been implemented in full and that therefore the response was varied across the nation in terms of the implementation of this legislation. I think that that is reflected in the evidence that we received and in the recommendations, to a certain extent.

I welcome the fact that the Minister and the Government have responded positively and I hope that this report will assist them in discussing how they are to implement the learning pathways through the new consortia,

gyda'r consortia newydd, oherwydd y consortia, yn fwy na neb, a fydd yn gyfrifol am sicrhau llwyddiant yn hyn o beth.

Hoffwn ganolbwyntio ar dri neu bedwar peth sydd yn yr adroddiad, gan ddechrau gyda nifer y cyrsiau a'r effaith andwyol, heb fod yn fwiadol, ar gyrsiau eraill drwy gynnig y mathau hyn o gyrsiau. Pan fu'r Cynulliad yn trafod yr argymhellion deddfwriaethol yn y lle cyntaf, nid wyf yn cofio'r dystiolaeth dros gael 30 o gyrsiau. Roedd tystiolaeth o blaid ehangu a chynyddu nifer y cyrsiau galwedigaethol, yn sicr, ond nid wyf yn cofio, o dop fy mhen, pam ein bod wedi cyrraedd at 30 o gyrsiau. Os rwy'n cofio'n iawn, am gyfnod, roedd sôn am ddarparu 24 cwrs a mwy, gyda rhyw fath o hyblygrwydd i ganiatáu i awdurdodau, ysgolion a cholegau weithio tuag at 30 cwrs.

Mae cwestiwn yn cael ei ofyn yn yr adroddiad sy'n gwestiwn i'r Llywodraeth a'r awdurdodau ei ateb. Un peth hoffwn ei bwysleisio yw, beth bynnag sy'n digwydd o ran nifer y cyrsiau, dylid cadw'r gymhareb o ran y cyrsiau galwedigaethol a'r rhai academiaidd. Mae'n bwysig bod ystod o gyrsiau galwedigaethol yn cael eu cynnig i bob disgybl, a bod yr ystod honno'n ystyrlon a bod modd i ddisgyblion ymwneud â'r ystod honno.

Mae hynny'n dod â mi at fy ail bwynt, sef teithio. Sut yn y byd y byddwn yn gallu cludo disgyblion er mwyn iddynt gyrraedd y cyrsiau hyn? Mae Angela Burns wedi gwneud sawl pwynt pwysig o ran hyn. Hoffwn ganolbwyntio ar un peth a oedd, o bosibl, yn cael ei weld fel ateb i'r broblem hon wrth ddechrau'r ymchwiliad, sef dysgu digidol. Rydym wedi derbyn digon o dystiolaeth am hyn. Rwy'n cofio'n arbennig dystiolaeth gan Gyngor Sir Ceredigion nad yw dysgu digidol yn cyflawni popeth y dylid anelu ato yn y cyrsiau hyn. Hynny yw, mae dysgu digidol yn ychwanegol, yn atodol, ac yn cyfoethogi, ond ni all fod yn lle gosod disgybl ac athro yn yr un ystafell fel y gallant ymwneud fel bodau dynol a bod yn bobl go iawn a dysgu o'i gilydd fel hynny. Roedd y dystiolaeth gan gyngor Ceredigion yn sicr yn dweud, 'Defnyddiwch y dulliau digidol ar bob cyfrif, ond mae'n rhaid, weithiau, mynd â'r athro at ddisgybl neu ddisgyblion—dyna'r

because the consortia, more than anyone, will be responsible for ensuring the success of these proposals.

I would like to concentrate on three or four issues in the report, starting with the number of courses and the detrimental, if unintended, impact on other courses of offering these sorts of courses. When the Assembly discussed the legislative recommendations initially, I do not remember evidence in favour of the inclusion of 30 courses. There was certainly evidence for expanding and increasing the number of vocational courses, but I do not recall, off the top of my head, why we reached a figure of 30. If memory serves, for a time, there was talk of providing 24 courses or more, with some sort of flexibility to allow authorities, schools and colleges to work towards 30 courses.

A question is posed in the report that is a question for the Government and the authorities to answer. One thing that I would emphasise, whatever happens with the number of courses, the ratio of vocational courses to academic courses should be retained. It is important that a range of vocational courses is provided to all pupils and that that range is meaningful and that there is a way for pupils to engage with that range.

That brings me to my second point, that of travel. How will we be able to transport pupils so that they can access these courses? Angela Burns has made several important points on this. I want to concentrate on one thing that may have been seen as a solution to this problem as we entered the inquiry, and that is digital learning. We have received enough evidence on this. I particularly recall evidence from Ceredigion County Council that digital learning does not achieve everything that should be aimed at within these courses. That is, digital learning is additional and supplemental and it enhances learning, but it cannot replace having a pupil and a teacher in the same room so that they can engage as human beings and be real people and learn from each other in that way. The evidence from Ceredigion council certainly said, 'Do make use of the digital methods by all means, but, on occasion, the teacher has to be taken to the pupil or the

ffordd orau—er mwyn cyfoethogi'r profiad addysgu yn y ffordd honno'.

David Rees: I agree that digital learning enhances the opportunities that people get, but, with regard to the vocational aspect in particular, the ability to do things—which is what vocational education is about—on-site is crucial. That cannot be replaced by digital learning. The involvement of individual pupils in doing the job with the equipment at that place is an important aspect of any vocational training.

Simon Thomas: I thank David Rees for that intervention. I think that he was supporting me, on the whole, and he underlined the importance of having that hands-on experience and also of taking the tutor to the pupil as much as possible, because doing it the other way around is expensive in terms of travel. However, I accept that you need well-resourced workshops, kitchens or whatever it might be for that aspect of teaching.

Mae'r pwynt olaf rwyf eisiau ei wneud ynglŷn â dysgu cyrsiau drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Cawsom dystiolaeth yn yr ymchwiliad, ac unwaith eto yn y pwyllgor y bore yma, nad yw colegau eto yn Gymraeg eu cyfrwng. Mae cyrsiau Cymraeg mewn colegau ond nid yw'r colegau yn rhai cyfrwng Cymraeg. Yn sicr, mae'r pryder ynglŷn â gwendid yn natur dysgu ôl-14 yn y Gymraeg yn un o'r pethau sy'n cael eu hadlewyrchu yn yr adroddiad ac mae'n un o'r pethau mae'n rhaid i'r Llywodraeth eu hystyried yn ofalus. Wrth basio, rwyf hefyd eisiau crybwyll—mae yn yr adroddiad—fod dysgu Cymraeg fel ail iaith yn dioddef yn arbennig ar hyn o bryd. Rydym yn gorfodi ein disgyblion i ddysgu Cymraeg fel ail iaith o dri i 16 oed ac mae'r rhan fwyaf o'r bobl hynny yn gadael yr ysgol heb allu dweud brawddeg yn Gymraeg. Mae'n rhaid i ni fynd i'r afael â hyn yn fuan iawn gyda'r consortia newydd, awdurdodau addysg a'r Llywodraeth.

Aled Roberts: A gaf i hefyd ategu'r diolchiadau i'r rhai a fu'n ymwneud â'r ymchwiliad? Rwy'n meddwl bod pob un ohonom ar y pwyllgor wedi gweld yr ymchwiliad fel peth positif. Fel y Cadeirydd, rwy'n croesawu ymateb positif y

pupils—that is the best way—to enhance the educational experience in that way'.

David Rees: Cytunaf fod dysgu digidol yn rhoi gwell cyfleoedd i bobl, ond, gyda golwg ar yr agwedd alwedigaethol yn benodol, mae'r gallu i wneud pethau ar y safle—sef yr hyn y mae addysg alwedigaethol yn ei olygu—yn hollbwysig. Ni all dysgu digidol gymryd ei le. Mae cynnwys disgyblion unigol wrth ddefnyddio'r cyfarpar i wneud y gwaith ar y safle yn agwedd bwysig ar bob math o hyfforddiant galwedigaethol.

Simon Thomas: Diolchaf i David Rees am yr ymyriad hwnnw. Credaf ei fod yn fy nghefnogi, ar y cyfan, a thynnodd sylw at y pwysigrwydd o gael profiad ymarferol o'r fath a hefyd o fynd â'r tiwtor at y disgybl i'r graddau mwyaf posibl, gan ei bod yn ddrud ei wneud fel arall o ran teithio. Fodd bynnag, rwyf yn derbyn bod angen darpariaeth dda o weithdai, ceginau a pha beth bynnag arall ar gyfer yr agwedd honno ar addysgu.

The final point that I want to make is on the provision of courses through the medium of Wales. We received evidence in the inquiry, and once again in committee this morning, that colleges are not yet Welsh-medium. There are Welsh courses in some colleges, but the colleges are not Welsh-medium. Certainly, concern about weaknesses in post-14 teaching through the medium of Welsh is one of the things that is reflected in the report and is one of the things that the Government must consider carefully. In passing, I also want to mention—it is in the report—that Welsh as a second language is suffering at present. We are requiring our pupils to learn Welsh as a second language from three to 16, but most of them leave school without being able to say a sentence in Welsh. This is something that we need to address very soon with the new consortia, local authorities and the Government.

Aled Roberts: May I also endorse the thanks to those who were involved with this inquiry? I think that all of us on the committee found the inquiry to be a positive thing. Like the Chair, I welcome the Government's generally positive response to the committee's report. It

Llywodraeth yn gyffredinol i adroddiad y pwyllgor. Roedd yn glir, wrth inni drafod—mae'n cael ei adlewyrchu yn yr adroddiad—bod pob un o'r tystion bron yn cytuno bod gweithredu'r Mesur wedi ymestyn y dewis ar gael er bod nifer o'r tystion, fel y dywedodd Simon, erbyn hyn yn cwestiynu a yw'n ymarferol i barhau gyda darparu 30 o gyrsgiau. Rwy'n gwybod bod Gweinidogion yn barod i ailedrych ar y sefyllfa honno yn y pen draw.

Mae'n werth dweud hefyd bod nifer helaeth o'r tystion wedi cadarnhau ei bod yn ddyddiau cynnar o ran y broses o weithredu'r Mesur ac efallai y bydd yn ofynnol inni ailedrych ar y sefyllfa o ran rhai agweddau ar y broses ymhen ychydig. O ran teithio, bydd rhai o'r penderfyniadau sydd wedi cael eu gwneud gan y Llywodraeth am y gyllideb yn dylanwadu ar sut rydym yn symud ymlaen.

Mae'n rhaid imi ddweud hefyd fy mod yn cefnogi sylwadau'r Cadeirydd ynglŷn â phrosiectws ar y cyd. Roedd y dystiolaeth a gafodd y pwyllgor yn eithaf clir am y ffaith nad yw sefydliadau yn awyddus i rannu gwybodaeth, i ryw raddau o achos y ffordd mae ysgolion a cholegau yn cael eu cyllido ar gyfer y sawl sydd dros 16 oed ar hyn o bryd. Mae'r Gweinidog wedi derbyn argymhelliad y pwyllgor mewn egwyddor, ond, fel Christine Chapman, nid wyf yn credu bod y pwynt sy'n cael ei wneud gan y Gweinidog, sef bod manylion cyrsiau yn cael eu cyhoeddi ar wefan y Llywodraeth neu Gyrfa Cymru ar hyn o bryd, yn ffordd ymarferol ymlaen. Fy ngobaith, yn y pen draw, yw y bydd y Llywodraeth yn symud tuag at ystyried sefyllfa fel yr un a argymhellwyd gan y pwyllgor.

I gefnogi'r hyn a ddywedodd Simon Thomas, cawsom dystiolaeth gan Gyngor Sir Ceredigion yn benodol ynglŷn â phroblemau ymarferol gyda band eang mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Rwy'n gyfarwydd â phroblemau tebyg. Rydym yn ymwybodol o'r buddsoddiad presennol i estyn band eang, ond y ple a gawsom gan rai sy'n ymwneud â'r sefyllfa yw i ystyried sicrhau bod ysgolion ymysg y cyntaf yn y sector cyhoeddus i elwa ar y buddsoddiad hwnnw.

Wrth gloi, rhaid dweud fy mod yn siomedig nad yw'r Gweinidog wedi derbyn yr

was clear from our discussions—it is reflected in the report—that nearly all of the witnesses agreed that implementing the Measure did extend the choice that was available, although many are now, as Simon said, questioning whether it is practical to continue with providing 30 courses. I know that Ministers are ultimately willing to revisit that issue.

It is also worth saying that many witnesses confirmed that these are early days in the process of implementing the Measure and that it might be necessary before long to revisit some aspects of it. In terms of travelling, some of the decisions made by the Government on the budget will influence how we proceed.

I must also say that I support the Chair's remarks about a joint prospectus. The evidence given to the committee was fairly clear that institutions are not very keen on sharing information, to some degree because of the way that schools and colleges are currently funded for the over-16s. The Minister has accepted in principle the committee's recommendation, but, like Christine Chapman, I do not believe that the point made by the Minister, that course details are published on the websites of the Government or Careers Wales at present, is a practical way forward. My hope is that, ultimately, the Government will move towards looking at an arrangement like the one recommended by the committee.

To support what Simon Thomas said, we heard evidence from Ceredigion County Council specifically about the practical problems with broadband in rural areas. I am familiar with similar problems. We are aware of the investment currently being made in expanding broadband, but the plea from those who deal with the situation is that consideration be given to ensuring that schools are among the first in the public sector to benefit from this investment.

In closing, I must say that I am disappointed that the Minister has not accepted the

argymhelliad ynglŷn â dogfennau llwybrau dysgu. Mae'n glir bod y Llywodraeth yn derbyn tystiolaeth gan yr ysgolion a'r colegau, a chredaf i'r Dirprwy Weinidog ddweud gerbron y pwyllgor bod rhyw 80% o bennaethiaid ysgolion a cholegau yn dweud eu bod yn sicrhau bod y dogfennau hyn ar gael, ond rhaid imi gefnogi'r hyn a ddywedodd y Cadeirydd. Cawsom 790 o ymatebion i'r ymgynghoriad, a dywedodd 52% o'r rheini nad oes ganddynt ddogfen. Nid oedd aelodau'r pwyllgor—gan gynnwys Keith Davies a minnau, sydd â phrofiad personol o'r sefyllfa—yn ymwybodol bod y fath ddogfen ar gael. O siarad â'n plant, gwelsom nad yw'r plant ychwaith yn ymwybodol o'r ddogfen. Rwy'n derbyn safbwynt y Gweinidog a'r ffaith ei fod yn derbyn gwybodaeth oddi wrth y gwahanol sectorau, ond nid wyf yn meddwl bod hynny'n adlewyrchiad cywir o'r sefyllfa ar lawr gwlad. Mae angen i'r Llywodraeth edrych yn fanwl ar yr hyn sy'n digwydd yn ein hysgolion a'n colegau.

Nick Ramsay: I was not party to this inquiry as I do not sit on the committee, so I come at this debate from a slightly different angle, as the Chair of the Enterprise and Business Committee. Looking through some of the recommendations and the Government's response, I see that a couple of the recommendations were geared specifically towards the Minister for Business, Enterprise, Technology and Science. I will therefore make just a couple of points and perhaps ask a couple of questions that can be responded to afterwards.

I note that recommendation 4 specifically asks the Minister for business to work with the Minister for local government and the WLGA to ensure that schools are included as a priority for the rollout of next-generation broadband—I think that this was the point that Aled Roberts was touching on just as I was putting the translation kit down. I would be interested to hear what progress is being made on that.

I see that, with regard to the acceptance of the recommendation, it is 'accept in principle', which I always find a tricky one to get my head around. I assume that the Minister believes—[*Interruption.*] I think that it is

recommendation about learning pathway documents. It is clear that the Government receives evidence from schools and colleges, and I believe that the Deputy Minister said that some 80% of school and college principals said that they ensured that these documents were available, but I must support what the Chair said. We received 790 responses to the consultation, and 52% of those said that they do not have a document. Committee members—including me and Keith Davies, who have personal experience of this—did not know that such documents were available. From talking to our children, we learned that they too were unaware of such a document. I accept what the Minister says and that he receives information from the different sectors, but I do not believe that that is a true reflection of the situation on the ground. The Government needs to look in detail at what is happening in our schools and colleges.

Nick Ramsay: Ni chymerais ran yn yr ymchwiliad hwn gan nad wyf yn aelod o'r pwyllgor, felly rwyf yn edrych ar y ddaidl hon o safbwynt braidd yn wahanol, fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Menter a Busnes. Wrth edrych ar rai o'r argymhellion ac ymateb y Llywodraeth, gwelaf fod dau o'r argymhellion wedi'u cyfeirio'n benodol at y Gweinidog Busnes, Menter, Technoleg a Gwyddoniaeth. Felly gwnaf un neu ddau o bwyntiau ac efallai gofyn un neu ddau o gwestiynau y gellir ymateb iddynt wedyn.

Sylwaf fod argymhelliad 4 yn gofyn yn benodol i'r Gweinidog dros fusnes gydweithio â'r Gweinidog dros lywodraeth leol a CLILC i sicrhau bod ysgolion yn cael blaenoriaeth wrth gyflwyno band eang y genhedlaeth nesaf—credaf mai hwn oedd y pwynt yr oedd Aled Roberts yn cyfeirio ato wrth imi roi'r offer cyfieithu i lawr. Byddai o ddiddordeb imi glywed am y cynnydd ar hynny.

Rwyf yn gweld, o ran derbyn yr argymhelliad, ei fod wedi'i 'dderbyn mewn egwyddor', a byddaf bob amser yn ei chael yn anodd deall ystyr hynny. Cymeraf fod y Gweinidog yn credu—[*Torri ar draws.*]

very important. If you look through the evidence, there is a very good reason why schools were highlighted as a type of public building that should have access to next generation broadband, certainly in relation to the skills agenda.

The second point that I want to pick up on is that of ensuring that skills are relevant to the Welsh labour market, and there is a recommendation on that on page 42. I suppose that it is something that one would like to think is obvious, but, as is so often the case in this life, things are not always as obvious as they should be and it falls to committees such as this to make the situation clear and to ask the Government to act.

I was particularly pleased to see the reference to small and medium-sized enterprises in the part about making skills relevant to the Welsh labour market, because they are the lifeblood of our economy. Whereas you can have vocational skills taught that are suited to the self-employment sector, and needs are often met at the other end with regard to higher-end skills and larger corporate bodies getting what they want, too often, the SMEs that are left out, and I have had discussions with the Minister for business about ways to support SMEs and entrepreneurialism. The recommendations relating to that are particularly important.

Finally, there are the recommendations relating to careers advice. That should be looked at. In many areas, careers advice is very good and positive, but there are certainly areas where it does not quite meet the mark, and I would like to see the experience of businesses and SMEs reflected much earlier on in the careers advice process so that businesses really are getting the sort of skills that they want as an outcome.

4.30 p.m.

Very finally—and I know that that was supposed to be my final point—the Federation of Small Businesses comments in the report were among the most worrying aspects of this for me, namely that, too often, the skills that are provided or encouraged are those that teachers or skills providers have

Rwyf yn credu ei fod yn bwysig iawn. Os edrychwch ar y dystiolaeth, gwelwch fod rheswm da iawn dros nodi bod ysgolion yn fath o adeilad cyhoeddus a ddylai gael band eang y genhedlaeth nesaf, mewn cysylltiad â'r agenda sgiliau, yn sicr.

Yr ail bwynt yr wyf am ei godi yw'r angen i sicrhau bod sgiliau'n berthnasol i farchnad lafur Cymru, ac mae argymhelliad ar hynny ar dudalen 42. Tybiaf y byddai rhywun yn hoffi meddwl bod hyn yn beth amlwg, ond, fel y gwelir yn aml yn y byd sydd ohoni, nid yw pethau bob amser mor amlwg ag y dylent fod a rhaid i bwyllgorau fel hwn egluro'r sefyllfa a gofyn i'r Llywodraeth weithredu.

Roeddwn yn neilltuol o falch o weld y cyfeiriad at fusnesau bach a chanolig eu maint yn y rhan am wneud sgiliau'n berthnasol i farchnad lafur Cymru, oherwydd hwy yw calon ac enaid ein heconomi. Er y gellir gweld addysgu sgiliau galwedigaethol sy'n addas i'r sector hunangyflogaeth, a diwellir anghenion yn aml yn yr eithaf arall o ran sgiliau uwch a bodloni anghenion cyrff corfforaethol mwy, yn rhy aml, bydd busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint yn cael eu gadael allan, ac rwyf wedi cael trafodaethau â'r Gweinidog dros fusnes am ffyrdd o hybu busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint ac entrepreneuriaeth. Mae'r argymhellion ar hynny'n neilltuol o bwysig.

Yn olaf, mae argymhellion ar gyngor ar yrfaoedd. Dylid edrych ar hynny. Mewn nifer o feysydd, mae cyngor ar yrfaoedd yn dda iawn ac yn gadarnhaol ond, yn sicr, mae meysydd lle nad yw'n cyrraedd y safon yn llwyr, a hoffwn weld adlewyrchu profiadau busnesau o bob maint yn gynharach o lawer yn y broses cyngor ar yrfaoedd fel y bydd busnesau'n cael y math o sgiliau y mae arnynt eu hangen o ganlyniad.

Yn olaf un—a gwn mai hwnnw oedd y pwynt olaf yr oeddwn i fod i'w wneud—y sylwadau yn yr adroddiad gan Ffederasiwn Busnesau Bach oedd un o'r agweddau a oedd yn peri'r pryder mwyaf i mi, sef, yn rhy aml, mai'r sgiliau a gaiff eu darparu neu eu hyrwyddo yw'r rheini y mae athrawon neu ddarparwyr

the ability to provide, not what is best suited to the labour market outside.

This is a very good report. I hope that the recommendations are accepted and that we get some progress on the ground.

Suzy Davies: Thank you for the opportunity to take part in this debate on the report. I also record my thanks to the Chair, the clerk and her deputies, and the witnesses. I also thank Nick Ramsay for looking at this through the other end of the telescope, if you like—from a business and workforce point of view.

Minister, I am sure that we would agree that there is more to educating our young people than producing a workforce. In fact, it is a reasonable proposition that, if education leaves us with a workforce that feels undervalued, undermotivated or as though it is underachieving, it will not retain its productivity. That is why I have sympathy for the high proportion of young learners who are able and talented, and have not, according to Estyn, been able to fulfil their potential for development. It seems that they have maybe not benefited from this Measure in the way that you would have liked. I especially feel for those from more difficult backgrounds, who are not helped to overcome the barriers preventing them from flying onwards and upwards. While their loss is personal, what they might have achieved could also have been shared with us in Wales, and, in that sense, it is a loss for us as well.

While education is about personal enrichment and development, it would be disingenuous to say that it is not also about employment chances. Being able to work and to actively seek work is about self-worth and responsibility as much as financial security, and so the committee's findings regarding vocational qualifications and their ability to extend social mobility were of particular interest.

We heard from witnesses that a wider choice is certainly available, and is being taken up, but, for some, as Christine Chapman mentioned, that choice was effectively illusory. We also received mixed views on whether the Learning and Skills (Wales)

sgiliau'n gallu eu darparu, nid yr hyn sy'n fwyaf addas i'r farchnad lafur yn y byd mawr.

Mae hwn yn adroddiad da iawn. Rwyf yn gobeithio y caiff yr argymhellion eu derbyn ac y gwelwn rywffaint o gynnydd ar lawr gwlad.

Suzy Davies: Diolch i chi am y cyfle i gymryd rhan yn y ddatl hon ar yr adroddiad. Rwyf finnau'n cofnodi fy niolch i'r Cadeirydd, y clerc a'i dirprwyon, a'r tystion. Rwyf hefyd yn diolch i Nick Ramsay am edrych ar hyn o ben arall y telesgop, os caf ei roi felly—o safbwynt busnesau a'r gweithlu.

Weinidog, rwyf yn siŵr y cytunech fod addysgu ein pobl ifanc yn golygu mwy na chreu gweithlu. Yn wir, gosodiad rhesymol yw dweud, os bydd addysg yn rhoi inni weithlu sy'n teimlo nad yw wedi'i werthfawrogi neu ei ysgogi'n ddigonol neu ei fod yn tangyflawni, na fydd yn aros yn gynhyrchiol. Dyna pam yr wyf yn cydymdeimlo â'r gyfran fawr o ddysgwyr ifanc sy'n alluog ac yn dalentog, ac nad ydynt, yn ôl Estyn, wedi gallu gwireddu eu potensial i ddatblygu. Gallai ymddangos nad ydynt wedi elwa o'r Mesur hwn yn y ffordd y byddech wedi'i dymuno. Cydymdeimlaf yn neilltuol â'r rheini o gefndiroedd mwy anodd, sydd heb gael cymorth i chwalu'r rhwystrau sy'n eu hatal rhag mynd yn eu blaen. Er bod eu colled yn un bersonol, byddent hefyd wedi gallu rhannu'r hyn y byddent wedi'i gyflawni â ni yng Nghymru, ac, yn hynny o beth, mae'n golled i ni hefyd.

Er bod addysg yn ymwneud â chyfoethogi a datblygu, anonest fyddai dweud nad yw'n ymwneud â chyfleoedd gwaith hefyd. Mae'r gallu i weithio a chwilio am waith yn ymwneud â hunan-barch a chyfrifoldeb yn ogystal â diogelwch ariannol, ac felly roedd canfyddiadau'r pwyllgor ynghylch cymwysterau galwedigaethol a'u gallu i ymestyn symudedd cymdeithasol yn neilltuol o ddiddorol.

Clywsom gan dystion fod dewis ehangach ar gael, yn sicr, a'i fod yn cael ei gymryd, ond, yn achos rhai, fel y dywedodd Christine Chapman, roedd y dewis hwnnw'n un rhithiol i bob pwrpas. Roedd gwahaniaeth barn hefyd ynghylch a yw Mesur Dysgu a

Measure 2009 is helping to promote parity of esteem between academic and vocational courses. Minister, while you told us that the Welsh Government has doubled the number of vocational courses on offer over the past couple of years, Careers Wales told us that there was little evidence that young people were looking to enter higher education through a vocational subjects route, and were sticking to more traditional courses.

So, if these vocational courses, which really do suit some students' learning abilities and styles, are not proving attractive to aspiring HE students in HE institutions, are they proving attractive to employers? For example, we heard that students achieving level 1 qualifications were unable to really pursue their work goals without a level 2 qualification in their chosen field, but level 2 training was not necessarily available within an accessible distance. We also heard from the Employment and Skills Board that employers looking for employees with a higher level education may even prefer humanities students, prizing their skills more than technical or job-specific ones.

The Deputy Minister's skills review is considering the skills required by employers, of course, but a qualification is no use if the course content is out of date, a point echoed by National Training Federation Wales in our inquiry. However, the Minister also needs to consider that it is no good a school buying in a second-rate business course, for example, just because it is cheaper, or hastily brushing up a maths teacher's business skills so that they do not have to buy in expertise at all, or encouraging pupils to take courses that have more to do with the skills of the available teachers than the needs of local employers—and all because they want to keep a child in the school system rather than release them to pursue a better course in college.

Unfortunately, we received guarded evidence of that type. We understand that some sort of juggling is happening with vocational courses, so for some it does seem that it is all

Sgiliau (Cymru) 2009 yn helpu i hybu parch cydradd rhwng cyrsiau academiaidd a galwedigaethol. Weinidog, er i chi ddweud bod Llywodraeth Cymru wedi dyblu nifer y cyrsiau galwedigaethol a gynigir yn ystod y ddwy flynedd diwethaf, dywedodd Gyrfa Cymru wrthym nad oedd fawr o dystiolaeth bod pobl ifanc yn ceisio mynd i addysg uwch drwy ddilyn llwybr pynciau galwedigaethol, a'u bod yn glynu at gyrsiau mwy traddodiadol.

Felly, os nad yw'r cyrsiau galwedigaethol hyn, sy'n wirioneddol addas i alluoedd ac arddulliau dysgu rhai myfyrwyr, yn denu myfyrwyr addysg uwch uchelgeisiol mewn sefydliadau addysg uwch, a ydynt yn ddeniadol i gyflogwyr? Er enghraifft, clywsom nad oedd myfyrwyr a enillodd gymwysterau lefel 1 yn gallu anelu at eu nodau gwaith heb gael cymhwyster lefel 2 yn eu dewis maes, ond nad oedd hyfforddiant lefel 2 ar gael o fewn eu cyrraedd o reidrwydd. Clywsom hefyd gan y Bwrdd Cyflogaeth a Sgiliau y gallai fod yn well gan gyflogwyr sy'n chwilio am weithwyr a gafodd addysg lefel uwch gael myfyrwyr y dyniaethau hyd yn oed, gan eu bod yn gweld mwy o werth yn eu sgiliau hwy na rhai technegol neu rai ar gyfer swydd benodol.

Mae'r adolygiad o sgiliau gan y Dirprwy Weinidog yn ystyried y sgiliau y mae cyflogwyr yn gofyn amdanynt, wrth gwrs, ond nid oes gwerth mewn cymhwyster os yw cynnwys y cwrs wedi dyddio, ac ategwyd y pwynt hwn gan Ffederasiwn Hyfforddiant Cenedlaethol Cymru yn ein hymchwiliad. Fodd bynnag, mae angen i'r Gweinidog gofio hefyd nad yw'n fuddiol i ysgol gael cwrs busnes eilradd o'r tu allan, er enghraifft, dim ond am ei fod yn rhatach, neu loywi sgiliau busnes yr athro mathemateg fel nad oes rhaid iddi gaffael arbenigedd o gwbl, neu annog disgyblion i gymryd cyrsiau sy'n ymwneud yn fwy â sgiliau'r athrawon sydd ar gael nag anghenion cyflogwyr lleol—a hynny i gyd am ei bod am gadw plentyn yn y system ysgolion yn hytrach na'i ryddhau i ddilyn cwrs gwell mewn coleg.

Gwaetha'r modd, cawsom dystiolaeth ochelgar o'r math hwnnw. Rydym yn deall bod rhyw fath o jyglo'n mynd ymlaen â chyrtsiau galwedigaethol, felly, yn achos rhai,

about the money and very little about the best outcomes for the young person.

I am pleased with your response to our first two recommendations, Minister. Your acceptance of recommendation 9 in principle only is a bit of a disappointment, however. The work of the Deputy Minister, who recognised the need for improvement in his evidence to us, will be successful only if set against the backdrop of up-to-date labour market intelligence, and only if that information is available to all those involved in planning education and training provision. Perhaps in your response, you might be able to comment briefly on the project to enhance the use of labour market intelligence, which you agreed to in August 2011.

I wonder whether you could also address two further questions that are pertinent to both the curriculum and the economy. First, do you have any qualitative research to explain why, with notable exceptions in some institutions, 14 to 19-year-olds are reluctant to pursue vocational business and commerce courses? Secondly, do you have any qualitative research to show the effectiveness of current curricular provision for developing entrepreneurialism?

I began by talking about our able and talented children. Wales cannot afford to have our future wealth creators lost in a system that does not recognise and release that ability and talent.

The Minister for Education and Skills (Leighton Andrews): I welcome the publication of the Children and Young People Committee's report on its inquiry into the implementation of the Learning and Skills (Wales) Measure 2009. During the course of its inquiry, the committee gathered a wealth of information and opinion, which provides an invaluable insight into how the 14-19 learning pathways are being delivered across Wales.

As the Chair, my colleague, the Member for Cynon Valley, said, the Measure is significant for a number of reasons, not least because it was one of the first pieces of

mae'n ymddangos mai arian yw'r brif ystyriaeth ac mai ychydig iawn o sylw a roddir i'r canlyniadau gorau i'r person ifanc.

Rwyf yn fodlon ar eich ymateb i'n dau argymhelliad cyntaf, Weinidog. Mae'r ffaith eich bod yn derbyn argymhelliad 9 mewn egwyddor yn unig yn dipyn o siom, fodd bynnag. Yr unig fodd i sicrhau llwyddiant y gwaith gan y Dirprwy Weinidog, a gydnabu'r angen i wella yn ei dystiolaeth i ni, fydd ei ystyried yng nghyd-destun gwybodaeth gyfredol am y farchnad lafur, a gofalu bod y wybodaeth honno ar gael i bawb sy'n gysylltiedig â chynllunio'r ddarpariaeth o addysg a hyfforddiant. Efallai y gallech wneud sylw byr wrth ymateb am y prosiect i wella'r defnydd o wybodaeth am y farchnad lafur, y cytunasoch arno yn Awst 2011.

Tybed a allech hefyd ateb dau gwestiwn ychwanegol sy'n berthnasol i'r cwricwlwm ac i'r economi. Yn gyntaf, a oes gennych unrhyw waith ymchwil ansoddol sy'n egluro pam y mae rhai rhwng 14 a 19 blwydd oed, heblaw rhai eithriadau nodedig mewn rhai sefydliadau, yn amharod i ddilyn cyrsiau busnes a masnach galwedigaethol? Yn ail, a oes gennych unrhyw waith ymchwil ansoddol sy'n dangos pa mor effeithiol yw'r ddarpariaeth bresennol yn y cwricwlwm ar gyfer datblygu entrepreneuriaeth?

Dechreuais drwy sôn am ein plant galluog a thalentog. Ni all Cymru fforddio colli crewyr cyfoeth y dyfodol mewn system nad yw'n cydnabod ac yn rhyddhau'r gallu a'r doniau hynny.

Y Gweinidog Addysg a Sgiliau (Leighton Andrews): Croesawaf gyhoeddi adroddiad y Pwyllgor Plant a Phobl Ifanc ar ei ymchwiliad i weithredu Mesur Dysgu a Sgiliau (Cymru) 2009. Yn ystod ei ymchwiliad, casglodd y pwyllgor gyfoeth o wybodaeth a barn, sy'n cynnig mewnwelediad amhrisiadwy i'r ffordd y mae'r llwybrau dysgu 14-19 yn cael eu darparu ledled Cymru.

Fel y dywedodd y Cadeirydd, fy nghyd-Aelod, yr Aelod dros Gwm Cynon, mae'r Mesur yn arwyddocaol am nifer o resymau, yn anad dim am mai ef oedd un o'r eitemau

legislation to be developed by the Welsh Government and passed by the National Assembly for Wales. The Measure also marked a milestone in our commitment to develop a fit-for-purpose education system for Wales, one that meets the needs of our young people and ensures that they develop the skills and knowledge required to make Wales a high-skilled economy in the global market.

The Measure provides a legal framework for our 14-19 learning pathways policy and ensures that all learners, no matter where they live in Wales, have access to a wider choice of general and vocational courses at both key stage 4 and post 16. I want young people to have the opportunity to study courses that engage them and keep them engaged, courses that are relevant to their future, whether it be work or further study, and courses that excite them and inspire them to want to stay on in education or training. I want to ensure that young people's learning pathways are more tailored and more personalised to their interests, but that are still relevant to future study and valued by employers.

The Liberal Democrat spokesperson rightly recognised that it is too early to evaluate the overall delivery of the Measure, in respect of the number of courses, although the evidence is that most learning centres are on course to deliver it. However, while it may still be too early to evaluate the full impact, we can already see evidence that the policy is raising the attainment of learners. What we have to determine, however, is that the courses being offered are those that help our learners to develop the skills necessary for further learning or skilled employment. That was one of the underpinning objectives of the policy.

I believe that the review of qualifications for 14-19-year-olds in Wales, which is being led by my colleague, the Deputy Minister for Skills, will provide a focus for ensuring that learners follow appropriate courses that will help them to develop the skills and knowledge demanded by HEIs and employers. The Deputy Minister and Huw Evans, as chair of the review of

cyntaf o ddeddfwriaeth i gael ei datblygu gan Lywodraeth Cymru a'i phasio gan Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru. Roedd y Mesur yn garreg filltir hefyd o ran ein hymrwymiad i ddatblygu system addysg addas i'w diben i Gymru, un sy'n diwallu anghenion ein pobl ifanc ac yn sicrhau eu bod yn datblygu'r sgiliau a'r wybodaeth sy'n angenrheidiol i droi Cymru'n economi â sgiliau uwch yn y farchnad ryngwladol.

Mae'r Mesur yn darparu fframwaith cyfreithiol ar gyfer ein polisi ar lwybrau dysgu 14-19 ac yn sicrhau bod pob dysgwr, ym mha le bynnag y mae'n byw yng Nghymru, yn cael dewis ehangach o gyrsiau cyffredinol a galwedigaethol yng nghyfnod allweddol 4 a'r cyfnod ôl-16. Rwyf am weld pobl ifanc yn cael cyfle i ddilyn cyrsiau sy'n ennyn eu diddordeb ac yn ei gadw, cyrsiau sy'n berthnasol i'w dyfodol, boed mewn gwaith neu astudiaethau pellach, a chyrsiau sy'n eu cyffroi a'u hysbrydoli i aros mewn addysg neu hyfforddiant. Rwyf am sicrhau bod llwybrau dysgu pobl ifanc wedi'u haddasu a'u personoli i fwy o raddau yn ôl eu diddordebau, ond eu bod yn berthnasol o hyd ar gyfer astudio pellach ac yn cael eu mawrbriso gan gyflogwyr.

Roedd llefarydd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn gywir wrth gydnabod ei bod yn rhy gynnar i werthuso'r gweithredu cyffredinol ar y Mesur, o ran nifer y cyrsiau, er bod y dystiolaeth yn dangos bod y nod o fewn cyrraedd y rhan fwyaf o ganolfannau dysgu. Fodd bynnag, er y gallai fod yn rhy gynnar o hyd i werthuso'r effaith gyfan, gallwn weld dystiolaeth eisoes fod y polisi'n ymestyn cyrhaeddiad dysgwyr. Yr hyn y mae'n rhaid i ni ei bennu, fodd bynnag, yw bod y cyrsiau a gynigir yn helpu ein dysgwyr i ddatblygu'r sgiliau sy'n angenrheidiol ar gyfer dysgu pellach neu gyflogaeth grefftus. Hwnnw oedd un o amcanion sylfaenol y polisi.

Credaf y bydd yr adolygiad o gymwysterau ar gyfer rhai rhwng 14 a 19 blwydd oed yng Nghymru, sy'n cael ei arwain gan fy nghyd-Aelod, y Dirprwy Weinidog Sgiliau, yn fodd i ganolbwyntio ar sicrhau bod dysgwyr yn dilyn cyrsiau priodol a fydd yn eu helpu i ddatblygu'r sgiliau a'r wybodaeth y mae sefydliadau addysg uwch a chyflogwyr yn galw amdanynt. Gwnaeth y Dirprwy

qualifications, published a consultation on 14-19 qualifications on 31 May. I hope that Members will encourage all those with an interest to take the opportunity to respond to that important consultation. I very much welcome what the opposition spokesperson, the Member for Carmarthen West and South Pembrokeshire, said about that review. It will address the issues that were raised by the Member for Monmouth and the Conservative Member for South Wales West in respect of vocational skills. To add to the comments made by the Member for South Wales West, we have also, in the past couple of years, published the youth entrepreneurship strategy, which addresses a number of the issues that were of concern to her.

Returning to the Measure, while good progress with implementation has already been made, I accept that there is always room for further improvement. There is more work to be done by local authorities, schools, FE institutions and, as the Plaid Cymru spokesperson said, by the consortia going forward, as well as by the Welsh Government. The scrutiny of our policies is an important part of the implementation cycle. We will continue to monitor the implementation of the Measure to ensure that it is achieving its objectives. I believe that the recommendations will help the Welsh Government and its delivery partners to improve the implementation of the 14-19 learning pathways across Wales and ensure that all learners are able to get the best from their own learning pathway.

The opposition spokesperson raised the question of vulnerable learners and asked whether I would carry out an in-flight audit. I am glad that she does not want to change the pilot. [*Laughter.*] I must say that I am not in favour of tearing up a plant by the roots to see how it is growing, but I will certainly keep an eye on what is being done in respect of vulnerable learners.

The committee's recommendations cover a wide range of key policy areas in education that impact on learner experience and educational outcomes. A number of them call for a review of the existing policy or for an

Weinidog a Huw Evans, cadeirydd yr adolygiad o gymwysterau, gyhoeddi ymgynghoriad ar gymwysterau 14-19 ar 31 Mai. Gobeithiaf y bydd Aelodau'n annog pawb sydd â budd yn hyn i fanteisio ar y cyfle i ymateb i'r ymgynghoriad pwysig hwnnw. Rwyf yn croesawu'n fawr yr hyn a ddywedodd llefarydd yr wrthblaid, yr Aelod dros Orllewin Caerfyrddin a De Sir Benfro, am yr adolygiad hwnnw. Ymdriniaf â'r materion a gododd yr Aelod dros Fynwy a'r Aelod Ceidwadol dros Orllewin De Cymru ynghylch sgiliau galwedigaethol. Er mwyn ychwanegu at y sylwadau a wnaeth yr Aelod dros Orllewin De Cymru, rydym hefyd, yn y ddwy flynedd diwethaf, wedi cyhoeddi'r strategaeth entrepreneuriaeth ieuenctid, sy'n ymdrin â nifer o'r materion a oedd yn peri pryder iddi.

Gan droi'n ôl at y Mesur, er bod cynnydd da wedi'i wneud eisoes ar ei weithredu, rwyf yn derbyn bod lle i wella bob amser. Mae mwy o waith i'w wneud gan awdurdodau lleol, ysgolion, sefydliadau addysg bellach ac, fel y dywedodd llefarydd Plaid Cymru, gan y consortia, yn ogystal â Llywodraeth Cymru, o hyn ymlaen. Mae craffu ar ein polisiâu'n rhan bwysig o'r cylch gweithredu. Parhawn i fonitro'r gweithredu ar y Mesur i sicrhau ei fod yn cyflawni ei amcanion. Credaf y bydd yr argymhellion yn helpu Llywodraeth Cymru a'i phartneriaid cyflenwi i weithredu'r llwybrau dysgu 14-19 yn well ledled Cymru a sicrhau bod pob dysgwr yn gallu cael y budd mwyaf o'i lwybr dysgu ei hun.

Cododd llefarydd yr wrthblaid y mater o ddysgwyr sy'n agored i niwed a gofyn a fyddwn yn cynnal archwiliad cyn cyrraedd pen y daith. Rwyf yn falch nad yw am newid y peilot. [*Chwerthin.*] Rhaid i mi ddweud nad wyf o blaid codi planhigyn wrth ei wreiddiau i weld sut mae'n tyfu, ond byddaf yn sicr o gadw golwg ar yr hyn a wneir mewn cysylltiad â dysgwyr sy'n agored i niwed.

Mae argymhellion y pwyllgor yn cwmpasu ystod eang o feysydd polisi allweddol o ran addysg sy'n effeithio ar brofiad a chanlyniadau addysgol y dysgwr. Mae nifer ohonynt yn galw am adolygu'r polisi

evaluation of the impact that it is having on learners. I have accepted, or accepted in principle, the vast majority of the committee's recommendations. We take a different view from the committee on the area with which the Chair is acquainted. On that particular recommendation, we do not believe that the survey carried out by the committee was a scientifically based study, and the evidence that we have contradicts it.

I thank colleagues in the Chamber today for their positive statements about the recommendations and how we are taking them forward. The challenge now is to ensure that we deliver on the vision of 14-19 learning pathways in transforming education in Wales. I am sure that the findings and recommendations arising from the committee's inquiry will make a significant contribution to ensuring that the policy delivers, and I am sure that the committee will return to the subject in due course. The Conservative Member for South Wales West rightly raised the question of schools filling the requirement on vocational courses with poor-quality vocational provision, in some cases. She is right to raise that issue and it is an issue of concern to me. I want to see greater collaboration between schools and further education institutions, which may be better placed to provide that kind of learning.

Finally, I take this opportunity to thank the committee, under the guidance of my colleague, the Member for Cynon Valley, for this comprehensive report. We will study it and learn from it.

Christine Chapman: I put on record my thanks to my fellow committee members and to the Members who have contributed today. Working with children and young people is something that we are keen to do routinely as a committee. It is easy, as adults, to forget the people who are directly affected by our decisions, and this review emphasised the importance of listening to young people about what is really important to them and acting upon it.

I am not going to respond to every contribution made by Members, but I want to

presennol neu werthuso ei effaith ar ddysgwyr. Rwyf wedi derbyn, neu dderbyn mewn egwyddor, y mwyafrif helaeth o argymhellion y pwyllgor. Mae gennym farn wahanol i un y pwyllgor ar y maes y mae'r Cadeirydd yn gyfarwydd ag ef. Ynghylch yr argymhelliad hwnnw, nid ydym yn credu bod sail wyddonol i'r arolwg a gynhaliodd y pwyllgor, ac mae'r dystiolaeth sydd gennym yn mynd yn groes iddo.

Diolchaf i gyd-Aelodau yn y Siambr heddiw am eu datganiadau cadarnhaol am yr argymhellion a'r modd yr ydym yn symud ymlaen arnynt. Yr her yn awr yw sicrhau ein bod yn gwireddu'r weledigaeth o lwybrau dysgu 14-19 wrth drawsnewid addysg yng Nghymru. Rwyf yn siŵr y bydd y canfyddiadau ac argymhellion sy'n codi o ymchwiliad y pwyllgor yn cyfrannu'n helaeth at sicrhau bod y polisi'n cyrraedd y nod, ac rwyf yn siŵr y bydd y pwyllgor yn dychwelyd at y pwnc maes o law. Roedd yn briodol i'r Aelod Ceidwadol dros Orllewin De Cymru godi'r cwestiwn ynghylch ysgolion sy'n ateb y gofyniad am gyrsgiau galwedigaethol drwy gynnig darpariaeth alwedigaethol o ansawdd gwael, mewn rhai achosion. Mae'n briodol iddi godi'r mater hwnnw ac mae'n fater sy'n peri pryder i mi. Rwyf am weld mwy o gydweithredu rhwng ysgolion a sefydliadau addysg bellach, a allai fod mewn lle gwell i ddarparu dysgu o'r math hwnnw.

Yn olaf, achubaf ar y cyfle hwn i ddiolch i'r pwyllgor, o dan arweiniad fy nghyd-Aelod, yr Aelod dros Gwm Cynon, am yr adroddiad cynhwysfawr hwn. Byddwn yn ei astudio ac yn dysgu ohono.

Christine Chapman: Cofnodaf fy niolch i'm cyd-aelodau o'r pwyllgor ac i'r Aelodau sydd wedi cyfrannu heddiw. Rydym fel pwyllgor yn awyddus i gydweithio'n gyson â phlant a phobl ifanc. Mae'n hawdd inni anghofio, fel oedolion, y bobl y mae ein penderfyniadau'n effeithio arnynt yn uniongyrchol, a dangosodd yr adolygiad hwn pa mor bwysig yw gwrando ar bobl ifanc yn sôn am yr hyn sy'n wirioneddol bwysig iddynt a gweithredu ar sail hynny.

Nid wyf yn mynd i ymateb i bob un o'r cyfraniadau gan Aelodau, ond rwyf am

make a few points. A number of Members—Angela Burns, Simon Thomas and Aled Roberts, among others—talked about the courses in particular, and it would be fair to say that we picked up on some inconsistencies. These are obviously early days for the implementation of the Measure, but we need to keep that under review. Choice is important, and it should be as good in one part of the country as it is in another, but I am sure that the Minister will have heard that.

The second point is that we would all agree that education is about learning for life, about ensuring that young people have the skills to think. However, it is also about employment, and I was pleased that Suzy Davies and Nick Ramsay touched on that. The points that they make are right. It is about good-quality provision, good employer engagement and consistency and quality of provision.

Thirdly, a number of Members mentioned transport. I go back to my earlier point, when I said that if we do not address this properly, there will be real practical barriers for our young people, which could have an impact on their learning. I am, therefore, grateful for the Minister's response on that issue.

As I said, we agreed that these are very early days. The 14-19 learning pathways are an excellent vision, but the devil is in the detail. The Measure will deliver real changes for young people—indeed, it is delivering changes—but I think that on points of digital learning, Welsh-medium provision and vulnerable learners, we need to ensure that it is being effective.

As I said in my opening statement, when we began our inquiry, we recognised that the Measure had not been fully implemented, but we felt that it was timely to look at its impact so far and highlight any areas that we felt could be improved before its roll-out was complete. I hope that we have achieved that, and we will continue to monitor with interest the progress that the Minister is making with the full implementation of the Measure. I

wneud ychydig o bwyntiau. Soniodd nifer o Aelodau—Angela Burns, Simon Thomas ac Aled Roberts, ymysg eraill—am y cyrsiau'n benodol, a theg yw dweud ein bod wedi sylwi ar rai anghysonderau. Rydym mewn cyfnod cynnar wrth weithredu'r Mesur, wrth gwrs, ond mae angen inni ddal hynny o dan sylw. Mae dewis yn bwysig, a dylai fod cystal mewn un rhan o'r wlad ag y mae mewn rhan arall, ond rwyf yn siŵr y bydd y Gweinidog wedi clywed hynny.

Yr ail bwynt yw y byddem oll yn cytuno bod addysg yn ymwneud â dysgu ar gyfer byw, a sicrhau bod gan bobl ifanc sgiliau i feddwl. Fodd bynnag, mae hefyd yn ymwneud â chyflogaeth, ac roeddwn yn falch bod Suzy Davies a Nick Ramsay wedi cyfeirio at hynny. Mae'r pwyntiau y maent yn eu gwneud yn gywir. Mae'n ymwneud â darpariaeth o ansawdd da, ymgysylltu da â chyflogwyr a chysondeb ac ansawdd y ddarpariaeth.

Yn drydydd, soniodd nifer o Aelodau am gludiant. Af yn ôl at y pwynt a wneuthum yn gynharach, pan ddywedais y bydd rhwystrau ymarferol i'n pobl ifanc, os na ddeliwn â'r mater hwn yn iawn, a allai effeithio ar eu dysgu. Felly, rwyf yn ddiolchgar am ymateb y Gweinidog ar y mater hwnnw.

Fel y dywedais, cytunasom ein bod mewn cyfnod cynnar iawn. Mae'r llwybrau dysgu 14-19 yn weledigaeth ragorol, ond rhaid edrych ar y manylion. Bydd y Mesur yn sicrhau newidiadau gwirioneddol i bobl ifanc—yn wir, mae'n gwneud hynny eisoes—ond rwyf yn credu, ar bwyntiau sy'n ymwneud â dysgu digidol, darpariaeth cyfrwng Cymraeg a dysgwyr sy'n agored i niwed, fod angen inni sicrhau ei fod yn effeithiol.

Fel y dywedais yn fy natganiad agoriadol, wrth ddechrau ein hymchwiliad, cydnabuom nad oedd y Mesur wedi'i weithredu'n llawn, ond teimlem ei bod yn amserol ystyried yr effaith a gafodd hyd yma a thynnu sylw at unrhyw feysydd y teimlem fod modd eu gwella cyn ei roi ar waith yn llawn. Rwyf yn gobeithio ein bod wedi cyflawni hynny, a pharhawn i fonitro cynnydd y Gweinidog ar weithredu'r Mesur yn llawn, gan ymddiddori

thank everybody who contributed today, and I commend this report to the Chamber.

yn hynny. Diolchaf i bawb a gyfrannodd heddiw, a chymeradwyaf yr adroddiad hwn i'r Siambr.

4.45 p.m.

The Temporary Deputy Presiding Officer: The proposal is to note the Children and Young People Committee's report. Are there any objections? I see that there are none. Therefore, the motion is agreed in accordance with Standing Order No. 12.36.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd Dros Dro: Y cynnig yw nodi adroddiad y Pwyllgor Plant a Phobl Ifanc. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Gwelaf nad oes. Felly, derbynnir y cynnig yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 12.36.

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion agreed.*

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 4.45 p.m.
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 4.45 p.m.*

Dadl y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig Welsh Conservatives Debate

Iechyd Health

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I have selected amendments 1 and 3 in the name of Jane Hutt, and amendments 2 and 4 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. If amendment 3 is agreed, amendment 4 will be deselected.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Rwyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1 a 3 yn enw Jane Hutt, a gwelliannau 2 a 4 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Os derbynnir gwelliant 3, dad-ddetholir gwelliant 4.

Cynnig NDM5025 William Graham

Motion NDM5025 William Graham

Cynnig bod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

To propose that the National Assembly for Wales:

1. Yn cydnabod cryfder y teimlad yn erbyn cynigion i israddio gwasanaethau yn Ysbyty Llwynhelyg yn Sir Benfro ac yn mynegi pryder ynghylch yr ymgysylltiad â chlinigwyr a'r cyhoedd;

1. Recognises the strength of feeling against proposals to downgrade services at Withybush Hospital in Pembrokeshire and expresses concern over the engagement with clinicians and the general public;

2. Yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i weithio gyda Deoniaeth Cymru ac i adolygu'r arferion a ddefnyddir wrth gadw a hyfforddi meddygon iau;

2. Calls for the Welsh Government to work with the Wales Deanery and review the practices used in the retention and training of junior doctors;

3. Yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i weithio gyda'r Colegau Brenhinol i adolygu perthnasedd y canllawiau diogelwch clinigol a sicrhau bod y canllawiau hyn wedi'u teilwra ar gyfer amodau lleol, ac yn adlewyrchu amodau lleol, gan gynnal arfer gorau; a

3. Calls for the Welsh Government to work with Royal Colleges to review the applicability of clinical safety guidelines and ensure that these guidelines are tailored towards, and reflect, local conditions whilst maintaining best practice; and

4. Yn galw ar y Gweinidog Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol i egluro sefyllfa gyllido bresennol y Byrddau Iechyd Lleol yng Nghymru.

Paul Davies: I move the motion.

I am pleased to lead and take part in such an important debate today. This debate is timely and appropriate, given that residents from Pembrokeshire have been demonstrating outside this place today extremely concerned about the potential centralisation and downgrading of services at Withybush hospital. On this side of the Chamber, we believe in local health services for local people, and I welcome the Minister's announcements yesterday confirming a permanent renal facility at Withybush hospital, albeit the timing of the announcement is a little suspect given our debate today.

Patients should not have to travel further for life-saving care. Let me make it absolutely clear: we on this side of the Chamber oppose plans to downgrade hospitals and reject any proposals to cut accident and emergency departments and maternity services. I hope that the Minister will also make it crystal clear on behalf of the Government that she is against the downgrading of our district general hospitals and A&E departments. Minister, this is your chance to make that commitment to the people of Wales today. This part of the motion reiterates the importance of health services at Withybush hospital to communities in my constituency and expresses concern over the engagement with clinicians and the general public, and I am amazed that the Welsh Government would delete this point. Clearly, the Government does not recognise that my constituents are worried about future services at Withybush hospital.

Unfortunately, we in Pembrokeshire have suffered in the past from a lack of transparency, openness and confidence in our health board. I am sure that you will all be aware of a document that was released in 2010 called the 'Rural Health Services Strategy Spend to Save Plan', drawn up by

4. Calls on the Minister for Health and Social Services to clarify the current funding position of the LHBs in Wales.

Paul Davies: Cynigiau y cynnig.

Rwyf yn falch o arwain a chymryd rhan mewn dadl mor bwysig heddiw. Mae'r ddadl hon yn amserol ac yn briodol, gan fod preswylwyr o sir Benfro wedi bod yn gwrthdystio y tu allan i'r lle hwn heddiw oherwydd eu pryder am y posibilrwydd o ganoli ac israddio gwasanaethau yn ysbyty Llwynhelyg. Ar yr ochr hon i'r Siambr, credwn mewn gwasanaethau iechyd lleol i bobl leol, a chroesawaf y cyhoeddiadau a wnaeth y Gweinidog ddoe a oedd yn cadarnhau y byddai cyfleuster arenol parhaol yn ysbyty Llwynhelyg, er bod amseriad y cyhoeddiad yn amheus braidd yng nghyd-destun ein dadl heddiw.

Ni ddylai cleifion orfod teithio'n bellach i gael gofal i achub bywyd. Dywedaf hyn yn hollol glir: rydym ni ar yr ochr hon i'r Siambr yn gwrthwynebu cynlluniau i israddio ysbytai ac yn gwrthod unrhyw gynigion i dorri adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys a gwasanaethau mamolaeth. Gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog hefyd yn ei gwneud yn gwbl glir ar ran y Llywodraeth ei bod yn gwrthwynebu israddio ein hysbytai cyffredinol dosbarth ac adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys. Weinidog, dyma'ch cyfle i roi'r ymrwymiad hwnnw i bobl Cymru heddiw. Mae'r rhan hon o'r cynnig yn ailddatgan bod gwasanaethau iechyd yn ysbyty Llwynhelyg yn bwysig i gymunedau yn fy etholaeth ac yn mynegi pryder ynghylch yr ymgysylltu â chlinigwyr a'r cyhoedd, ac rwyf yn synnu bod Llywodraeth Cymru am ddileu'r pwynt hwn. Mae'n amlwg nad yw'r Llywodraeth yn cydnabod bod fy etholwyr yn pryderu am wasanaethau yn ysbyty Llwynhelyg yn y dyfodol.

Yn anffodus, rydym ni yn sir Benfro wedi dioddef yn y gorffennol oherwydd diffyg tryloywder, gweithredu agored ac ymddiriedaeth yn ein bwrdd iechyd. Rwyf yn siŵr bod pob un ohonoch yn cofio am ddogfen a gyhoeddwyd yn 2010 o'r enw 'Strategaeth Gwasanaethau Iechyd: Cynllun

the Hywel Dda Local Health Board, which talks about the centralisation of services away from Withybush General Hospital. I accept that that particular document was withdrawn immediately after it was released to the press, but things such as this do not instil confidence among local people. My constituents feel that they have suffered from a lack of transparency and consultation in the health service in the past, and the Welsh Labour Government must ensure that that does not take place again. Any changes to services in Withybush hospital and other hospitals should be subject to consultation, not only with key stakeholders, but directly with the population.

People and communities must be part of any consultation process, because holding limited consultation with only key stakeholders is unacceptable. In the Hywel Dda health board area, we have seen a pre-consultation exercise taking place with professionals and the public, which has included drop-in sessions and information sent to every household by DVD. However, not every household received this information. Where I live, I did not receive that DVD, and I know that there were other areas that did not receive this vital information. As well as the general public being dissatisfied with this consultation exercise, I received information from clinicians believing that services will be centralised regardless of their opinion. Professionals feel that some of their questions have not been answered, but deliberately evaded. As we now all know, another consultation exercise will take place in August. Call me cynical, but this starts in the middle of the holiday season. In my opinion, this should be delayed until after the holiday period. The Minister and the Government must ensure that any changes to services must not take place without full public consultation, and the public must be given that opportunity. Unfortunately, we have seen too much of this already in my area, having seen orthodontics and histopathology services disappear from Withybush hospital without any public consultation whatsoever. It is vital that local health boards work with the communities that they serve, and when LHBs do not conform, it is vital that they should be forced to do so. I give way to the Member for

Gwario i Arbed', a luniwyd gan Fwrdd Iechyd Lleol Hywel Dda, sy'n sôn am ganoli gwasanaethau drwy eu symud oddi wrth Ysbyty Cyffredinol Llwynhelyg. Rwyf yn derbyn bod y ddogfen honno wedi'i thynnu'n ôl yn syth ar ôl ei rhyddhau i'r wasg, ond nid yw pethau o'r fath yn ennyn hyder mewn pobl leol. Mae fy etholwyr yn teimlo eu bod wedi dioddef oherwydd diffyg tryloywder ac ymgynghori yn y gwasanaeth iechyd yn y gorffennol, a rhaid i Lywodraeth Lafur Cymru sicrhau na fydd hynny'n digwydd eto. Dylai unrhyw newidiadau mewn gwasanaethau yn ysbyty Llwynhelyg fod yn destun ymgynghori, nid yn unig â rhanddeiliaid allweddol, ond â'r boblogaeth yn uniongyrchol.

Rhaid cynnwys pobl a chymunedau ym mhob proses ymgynghori, gan nad yw'n dderbyniol cynnal ymgynghoriad cyfyngedig â rhanddeiliaid allweddol yn unig. Yn ardal bwrdd iechyd Hywel Dda, rydym wedi gweld ymarferiad cyn ymgynghori â gweithwyr proffesiynol a'r cyhoedd, sydd wedi cynnwys sesiynau galw heibio a gwybodaeth a anfonwyd i bob cartref ar DVD. Fodd bynnag, ni chafodd pob cartref y wybodaeth hon. Yn fy ardal i, ni chafais y DVD honno, a gwn fod ardaloedd eraill na chawsant y wybodaeth hanfodol hon. Yn ogystal â'r anfodlonrwydd gan y cyhoedd ar yr ymgynghoriad hwn, cefais wybodaeth oddi wrth glinigwyr sy'n credu y caiff gwasanaethau eu canoli beth bynnag fydd eu barn. Mae gweithwyr proffesiynol yn teimlo bod rhai o'u cwestiynau heb eu hateb, a'u bod wedi'u hosgoi'n fwriadol. Fel yr ydym i gyd yn gwybod bellach, cynhelir ymgynghoriad arall ym mis Awst. Gallech feddwl fy mod yn sinigaidd, ond mae hyn ar ganol tymor y gwyliau. Yn fy marn i, dylid gohirio hyn tan ar ôl y gwyliau. Rhaid i'r Gweinidog a'r Llywodraeth sicrhau na cheir unrhyw newidiadau mewn gwasanaethau heb ymgynghori'n llawn â'r cyhoedd, a rhaid i'r cyhoedd gael y cyfle hwnnw. Gwaetha'r modd, rydym wedi cael gormod o hyn yn fy ardal eisoes, ar ôl gweld gwasanaethau orthodonteg a histopatholeg yn diflannu o ysbyty Llwynhelyg heb unrhyw ymgynghori cyhoeddus o gwbl. Mae'n hollbwysig bod byrddau iechyd lleol yn cydweithio â'r cymunedau a wasanaethant, a phan nad yw BILlau yn cydymffurfio, mae'n hollbwysig

Mid and West Wales.

Simon Thomas: I am grateful to Paul Davies for giving way. I echo much of what he says, and his concerns are reflected in those of many people regarding the future of Prince Philip hospital in Llanelli and that of Bronglais. Call me an old cynic, but these proposals were supposed to be considered before the local elections in the area concerned, but somehow they were delayed at that stage as well. He has made a good point about engaging with local communities, but does he agree that the Minister has to take more responsibility for the £5 billion that is simply given over to the health boards with no accountability for how they spend it?

Paul Davies: I very much agree with the Member for Mid and West Wales on that point.

It has been suggested that politicians have been scaremongering when raising concerns about local health services. I am sure that Labour party supporters were not scaremongering when they were outside this building waving placards during the protest against downgrading Prince Philip Hospital some weeks ago. I am sure that the Member for Llanelli was not scaremongering when he said,

‘I will not stand by and watch anything else go from the hospital. But I want everyone to ask why are we in this position? Why, out of all of the hospitals in Hywel Dda has Prince Philip lost so much?’

Well, I will tell the Member for Llanelli why we are in this position. We are in this position because this Labour Government is cutting the Welsh NHS budget by £534 million in real terms over the next three years, and doing so at a time when one in eight people in Wales are on an NHS waiting list.

Indeed, the Minister for health’s own Cabinet paper, ‘Together for Health: Why change is needed’ states that

‘There is understandable concern and worry about the future of individual hospitals—

eu gorfodi i wneud hynny. Ildiaf i’r Aelod dros Ganolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru.

Simon Thomas: Rwyf yn ddiolchgar i Paul Davies am ildio. Ategaf lawer o’i sylwadau, ac mae llawer o bobl yn pryderu yn yr un modd ag ef am ddyfodol ysbyty’r Tywysog Philip yn Llanelli a dyfodol ysbyty Bronglais. Gallech feddwl fy mod yn sinigaidd, ond roedd y cynigion hyn i fod i gael eu hystyried cyn yr etholiadau lleol yn yr ardal dan sylw, ond rywsut fe’u gohiriwyd bryd hynny hefyd. Mae wedi gwneud pwynt da am ymgysylltu â chymunedau lleol, ond a yw’n cytuno bod rhaid i’r Gweinidog gymryd mwy o gyfrifoldeb dros y £5 biliwn a drosglwyddir i’r byrddau iechyd heb atebolrwydd am y ffordd y maent yn ei wario?

Paul Davies: Rwyf yn cytuno’n llwyr â’r Aelod dros Ganolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru ar y pwynt hwnnw.

Awgrymwyd bod gwleidyddion wedi codi bwganod wrth fynegi pryderon ynghylch gwasanaethau iechyd lleol. Rwyf yn siŵr nad oedd cefnogwyr y blaid Lafur yn codi bwganod pan oeddent y tu allan i’r adeilad hwn yn chwifio placardiau yn ystod y gwrthdystiad yn erbyn israddio ysbyty’r Tywysog Philip rai wythnosau’n ôl. Rwyf yn siŵr nad oedd yr Aelod dros Lanelli yn codi bwganod pan ddywedodd,

Ni wnaif sefyll o’r neilltu a gweld dim arall yn mynd o’r ysbyty. Ond rwyf am i bawb holi pam yr ydym yn y sefyllfa hon? Pam, o’r holl ysbytai yn ardal bwrdd Hywel Dda, y mae ysbyty’r Tywysog Philip wedi colli cymaint?

Wel, dywedaf wrth yr Aelod dros Lanelli pam yr ydym yn y sefyllfa hon. Rydym yn y sefyllfa hon am fod y Llywodraeth Lafur hon yn torri £534 miliwn o gyllideb GIG Cymru mewn termau real dros y tair blynedd nesaf, ac yn gwneud hynny pan yw un o bob wyth o bobl Cymru ar un o restrau aros y GIG.

Yn wir, mae papur Cabinet y Gweinidog iechyd ei hun, ‘Law yn Llaw at Iechyd—Pam fod angen Newid’ yn datgan

Mae pryder a gofid dealladwy ynghylch dyfodol ysbytai penodol—yn enwedig yn

especially in the area of Hywel Dda, where many support and lobby groups have been established.'

Given the comments of that paper, perhaps the Minister could explain why she thinks that there is 'understandable concern' about individual hospitals, if there are no plans to downgrade or centralise services. Why, therefore, does she seek to delete point 1 of our motion, given that she acknowledges in her own paper that there are worries and concerns.

The second point of our motion refers to recruitment. We are all aware that there are severe challenges to sustainable clinical services that are caused by difficulties with the recruitment and retention of junior and middle-grade doctors in Wales. By not employing more staff to cover local services, those services can become unsustainable, forcing patients to travel further afield for vital medical services. To move forward, I believe that the Welsh Government needs to do more to attract medical staff to areas such as Pembrokeshire, and I hope that the Minister will look to issue a recruitment strategy for attracting medical professionals to rural areas of Wales. I appreciate that there have been several initiatives from the Wales Deanery, the Welsh NHS Confederation, the BMA and Welsh Government to try to attract more junior doctors to Wales. However, it appears that recruiting certain staff in certain areas is not working. Therefore, perhaps it is now prudent to review the practices used in retaining certain staff, especially junior doctors. It is clear that the Welsh Government must now work even harder with the deanery to fill the vacancies for junior and middle-grade doctors in Wales.

The third point in our motion is to review the applicability of clinical safety guidelines and to ensure that these guidelines are tailored towards, and reflect, local conditions. I have said before that the Government must realise that the one-size-fits-all approach is not appropriate for all areas, because, naturally, rural areas are different from urban areas when it comes to delivering health services.

ardal bwrdd Hywel Dda, lle mae nifer o grwpiau cefnogi a llobio wedi'u sefydlu.

O gofio'r sylwadau yn y papur hwnnw, efallai y gallai'r Gweinidog egluro pam y mae'n credu bod 'pryder dealladwy' ynghylch ysbytai penodol, os nad oes bwriad i israddio neu ganoli gwasanaethau. Pam, felly, y mae'n ceisio dileu pwynt 1 yn ein cynnig, gan ei bod yn cydnabod yn ei phapur ei hun fod pryder a gofid.

Mae'r ail bwynt yn ein cynnig yn cyfeirio at recriwtio. Rydym i gyd yn ymwybodol bod heriau difrifol i wasanaethau clinigol cynaliadwy oherwydd anawsterau wrth recriwtio a chadw meddygon iau a gradd ganol yng Nghymru. Drwy beidio â chyflogi mwy o staff i gyflenwi gwasanaethau lleol, gall y gwasanaethau hynny fynd yn anghynaliadwy, fel bod cleifion yn gorfod teithio ymhellach i gael gwasanaethau meddygol hanfodol. Er mwyn symud ymlaen, credaf fod angen i Lywodraeth Cymru wneud mwy i ddenu staff meddygol i ardaloedd fel sir Benfro, a gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn ystyried cyhoeddi strategaeth recriwtio i ddenu gweithwyr meddygol proffesiynol i ardaloedd gwledig Cymru. Sylweddolaf fod nifer o fentrau wedi'u cynnal gan Ddeoniaeth Cymru, Conffederasiwn GIG Cymru, Cymdeithas Feddygol Prydain a Llywodraeth Cymru i geisio denu mwy o feddygon iau i Gymru. Er hynny, mae'n ymddangos na chafwyd llwyddiant wrth ddenu staff penodol i ardaloedd penodol. Felly, efallai y bydd yn ddoeth cynnal adolygiad yn awr o'r arferion a ddefnyddir i gadw staff penodol, yn enwedig meddygon iau. Mae'n amlwg bod rhaid i Lywodraeth Cymru gydweithio'n galetach byth yn awr â'r ddeoniaeth i lenwi'r swyddi gwag ar gyfer meddygon iau a gradd ganol yng Nghymru.

Mae'r trydydd pwynt yn ein cynnig yn galw am adolygu perthnasedd y canllawiau diogelwch clinigol a sicrhau bod y canllawiau hyn wedi'u teilwra ar gyfer amodau lleol, ac yn adlewyrchu amodau lleol. Rwyf wedi dweud o'r blaen bod rhaid i'r Llywodraeth sylweddoli nad oes ateb sy'n addas i bob ardal, oherwydd, wrth gwrs, mae ardaloedd gwledig yn wahanol i ardaloedd trefol, o ran

While the numbers of doctors training in Wales increased between 2007 and 2011, the number of hours worked per week fell as a result of the European working time directive and changes to the consultant contract.

Clearly, there are also tensions between the need of the NHS for doctors in training to keep services viable, and the obligations of the postgraduate deanery, the General Medical Council, the royal colleges and others to ensure adequate levels of training, appropriate experience and career progression. That is why it is essential that some of these clinical guidelines are reviewed to ensure the viability of services in certain areas, especially in our rural communities. If this review does not take place then some services will be lost in some of our communities forever. It is high time that we recognise that delivering health services in some areas will be substantially different from how it is done in others.

The Welsh Institute for Health and Social Care analysis states clearly that outcomes improve significantly if patients receive the right care and treatment within the first golden hour of falling ill or getting injured. However, for patients in rural areas, such as Pembrokeshire, it is highly unlikely that they will receive the right care and treatment within the first hour of falling ill if critical services are not based in Pembrokeshire. Quite simply, that could mean the difference between life and death for my constituents. Let me once again quote a retired surgeon from Withybush General Hospital, Peter Milewski, who said

‘If you have a heart attack in St David’s or fall and rupture your spleen, are you really going to get to Glangwili in Carmarthen in time? You can save plenty of money centralising services at very little cost—just the death of two or three young people.’

The final part of our motion calls for the Minister to clarify the current funding

cyflenwi gwasanaethau iechyd. Er bod nifer y meddygon o dan hyfforddiant yng Nghymru wedi codi rhwng 2007 a 2011, bu gostyngiad yn nifer yr oriau a weithiwyd ym mhob wythnos o ganlyniad i'r gyfarwyddeb oriau gwaith Ewropeaidd a newidiadau yng nghontract y meddygon ymgynghorol.

Mae'n amlwg bod tensiynau hefyd rhwng angen y GIG am feddygon o dan hyfforddiant i gadw gwasanaethau'n hyfyw, a'r rhwymedigaeth sydd ar ddeoniaeth yr ôl-raddedigion, y Cyngor Meddygol Cyffredinol, y colegau brenhinol ac eraill i sicrhau hyfforddiant digonol, profiad priodol a chamu ymlaen mewn gyrfaoedd. Dyna pam y mae'n hanfodol adolygu rhai o'r canllawiau clinigol hyn i sicrhau y bydd gwasanaethau'n hyfyw mewn ardaloedd penodol, yn enwedig yn ein cymunedau gwledig. Os na cheir adolygiad o'r fath, collir rhai gwasanaethau mewn rhai o'n cymunedau am byth. Mae'n hen bryd inni gydnabod y bydd y ffordd o gyflenwi gwasanaethau iechyd mewn rhai ardaloedd yn dra gwahanol i'r ffordd o'u cyflenwi mewn ardaloedd eraill.

Mae'r dadansoddiad gan Athrofa Iechyd a Gofal Cymdeithasol Cymru yn datgan yn glir fod y canlyniadau i gleifion yn well o lawer os byddant yn cael y gofal a'r driniaeth gywir o fewn yr awr dyngedfennol gyntaf ar ôl mynd yn sâl neu gael eu hanafu. Fodd bynnag, yn achos cleifion mewn ardaloedd gwledig, fel sir Benfro, mae'n annhebygol iawn y byddant yn cael y gofal a'r driniaeth gywir o fewn yr awr gyntaf ar ôl mynd yn sâl os na fydd gwasanaethau hanfodol ar gael yn sir Benfro. Yn hollol syml, gallai hynny olygu'r gwahaniaeth rhwng byw a marw i'm hetholwyr. Gadewch imi ddyfynnu unwaith eto eiriau llawfeddyg sydd wedi ymddeol o Ysbyty Cyffredinol Llwynhelyg, Peter Milewski, a ddywedodd

Os cewch drawiad ar y galon yn Nhyddewi neu ddisgyn a rhwygo'r dduwg, a fyddwch yn cyrraedd Glangwili yng Nghaerfyrddin mewn pryd? Gallwch arbed llawer o arian drwy ganoli gwasanaethau am gost fach iawn—heblaw am farwolaeth dau neu dri o bobl ifanc.

Mae rhan olaf ein cynnig yn galw ar y Gweinidog i egluro sefyllfa gyllido bresennol

position of LHBs in Wales. We all share the concerns of the Auditor General for Wales that the cash brokerage—or bailouts, as we see them—from the Welsh Government to local health boards are not sustainable in the long-term. It is not acceptable to be told that LHBs are breaking even, when some are allowed to draw down cash from the following financial year, and we are now told that one has already had additional funding via a loan. The Welsh Government must demonstrate greater responsibility for the performance of local health boards, and the Minister must provide much needed leadership on this issue.

In closing, I hope that this debate will motivate the Welsh Government to come clean and fully explain its intentions for the health service in the Hywel Dda Local Health Board area, and in other areas as well. My constituents' concerns and those of other Members' constituents are understandable, and we look today to the Minister for answers. I urge Members to support our motion.

Gwelliant 1 Jane Hutt

Dileu pwynt 1.

Gwelliant 3 Jane Hutt

Dileu pwynt 3.

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Lesley Griffiths): I move amendments 1 and 3 in the name of Jane Hutt.

Gwelliant 2 Jocelyn Davies

Cynnwys ar ddiwedd pwynt 2:

'gyda'r nod o sicrhau bod yna lefelau staffio digonol ym mhob rhan o Gymru'

Gwelliant 4 Jocelyn Davies

Ym mhwynt 3 ar ôl 'adlewyrchu amodau lleol' cynnwys ' yn enwedig mewn ardaloedd gwledig ac ymylol,'

Elin Jones: I move amendments 2 and 4 in

y byrddau iechyd lleol yng Nghymru. Rydym i gyd yn rhannu pryderon Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru na fydd y froceriaeth ariannol—neu'r camau achub, fel yr ydym ni'n eu gweld—gan Lywodraeth Cymru i fyrddau iechyd lleol yn gynaliadwy yn y tymor hir. Nid yw'n dderbyniol cael ein hysbysu bod byrddau iechyd lleol yn cwrdd â'u costau, pan fo rhai ohonynt yn cael tynnu arian i lawr o'r flwyddyn ariannol ddilynol, a dywedir wrthym yn awr fod un wedi cael arian ychwanegol eisoes drwy fenthyciad. Rhaid i Lywodraeth Cymru ddangos mwy o gyfrifoldeb dros berfformiad y byrddau iechyd lleol, a rhaid i'r Gweinidog roi arweiniad mawr ei angen ar y mater hwn.

I gloi, rwyf yn gobeithio y bydd y ddadl hon yn cymell Llywodraeth Cymru i gyffesu'r cyfan ac egluro ei holl fwrddau ar gyfer y gwasanaeth iechyd yn ardal Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Hywel Dda, ac mewn ardaloedd eraill hefyd. Mae'r pryderon sydd gan fy etholwyr i a chan etholwyr Aelodau eraill yn ddealladwy, a disgwyliwn gael atebion gan y Gweinidog heddiw. Anogaf Aelodau i gefnogi ein cynnig.

Amendment 1 Jane Hutt

Delete point 1.

Amendment 3 Jane Hutt

Delete point 3.

Y Gweinidog Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Lesley Griffiths): Cynigïaf welliannau 1 a 3 yn enw Jane Hutt.

Amendment 2 Jocelyn Davies

Insert at end of point 2:

'with the aim of ensuring an adequate level of staffing for all parts of Wales'

Amendment 4 Jocelyn Davies

In point 3 after 'local conditions' insert ' particularly in rural and peripheral areas,'

Elin Jones: Cynigïaf welliannau 2 a 4 yn

the name of Jocelyn Davies.

Plaid Cymru will support the motion in its entirety, and our amendments seek to add some emphasis on staffing issues and access to services for rural and peripheral communities. It seems that I started a bit of a trend a few months ago in laying a motion on future services at Bronglais hospital. Today, we have Withybush hospital. I am now looking forward to a backbench debate proposed by Keith Davies on Prince Philip Hospital in Llanelli. Plaid Cymru will be pleased to work with Keith Davies on a cross-party basis, should he wish to sponsor such a debate.

Hywel Dda Local Health Board has confirmed that it intends to publish its plans and start its consultation on 6 August. This is definitely not the best time for the public in west Wales, as Paul Davies outlined, but it no doubt suits Hywel Dda Local Health Board quite well. I have little interest in asking Hywel Dda LHB to delay its consultation—it could perhaps extend it—but I do not want to see it being delayed again, because the public and the staff in west Wales want to know the health board's intention. I noted the Member for Llanelli's call on the First Minister yesterday to ask Hywel Dda LHB to delay formal consultation. I suspect that he may want to see it delayed until after the election in 2016.

Withybush is a hospital that serves my constituency as well serving the people of the Teifi valley and Cardigan area. It provides emergency, medical and surgical services for a wide rural area. As we have rehearsed in this Chamber, everyone in Wales deserves to be within the golden hour of access time to full A&E services and emergency surgical intervention in order to save lives. In a 2007 study of over 10,000 patients who were rushed into hospital, the University of Sheffield found a direct link between distance to hospital and poor health outcomes, with increased journey distance having an increased risk of mortality.

The motion refers to the role of the royal colleges in advising on safe service configuration. Clinical safety guidelines from

enw Jocelyn Davies.

Bydd Plaid Cymru yn cefnogi'r cynnig cyfan, a phwrpas ein gwelliannau yw rhoi mwy o bwyslais ar faterion staffio a mynediad at wasanaethau ar gyfer cymunedau gwledig ac ymylol. Mae'n ymddangos imi gychwyn tuedd ychydig fisoedd yn ôl wrth gyflwyno cynnig ar wasanaethau yn ysbyty Bronglais yn y dyfodol. Heddiw, rydym yn sôn am ysbyty Llwynhelyg. Edrychaf ymlaen yn awr at weld cynnig dadl o'r meinciau cefn gan Keith Davies ar Ysbyty'r Tywysog Philip yn Llanelli. Bydd Plaid Cymru yn falch o gydweithio'n drawsbleidiol â Keith Davies, os bydd am gynnig dadl o'r fath.

Mae Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Hywel Dda wedi cadarnhau ei fod yn bwriadu cyhoeddi ei gynlluniau a dechrau ei ymgynghoriad ar 6 Awst. Yn sicr, nid hon yw'r adeg orau i bobl gorllewin Cymru, fel y nododd Paul Davies, ond mae'n siŵr o fod yn hwylus iawn i Fwrdd Iechyd Lleol Hywel Dda. Nid oes gennyf fawr o ddiddordeb mewn gofyn i BILl Hywel Dda ohirio ei ymgynghoriad—efallai y gallai ei ymestyn—ond nid wyf am weld ei ohirio eto, gan fod y cyhoedd a'r staff yng ngorllewin Cymru am wybod beth yw bwriad y bwrdd iechyd. Nodais yr alwad ddoe gan yr Aelod dros Lanelli ar y Prif Weinidog i ofyn i BILl Hywel Dda ohirio'r ymgynghoriad ffurfiol. Rwyf yn amau ei fod am weld ei ohirio tan ar ôl yr etholiad yn 2016.

Mae ysbyty Llwynhelyg yn gwasanaethu fy etholaeth i yn ogystal â phobl dyffryn Teifi ac ardal Aberteifi. Mae'n darparu gwasanaethau meddygol, llawfeddygol a brys i ardal wledig eang. Fel yr ydym wedi dweud o'r blaen yn y Siambr hon, mae pawb yng Nghymru'n haeddu cael mynediad at wasanaethau damweiniau ac achosion brys a llawfeddygaeth frys llawn o fewn yr awr dyngedfennol er mwyn achub bywydau. Mewn astudiaeth yn 2007 o fwy na 10,000 o gleifion a ruthrwyd i'r ysbyty, canfu Prifysgol Sheffield fod cysylltiad uniongyrchol rhwng y pellter i'r ysbyty a chanlyniadau iechyd gwael, a bod teithiau hwy'n arwain at fwy o berygl o farwolaeth.

Mae'r cynnig yn cyfeirio at rôl y colegau brenhinol wrth gynghori ar ffyrdd diogel o ad-drefnu gwasanaethau. Mae canllawiau

the royal colleges specify that to maintain a safe level of service, a particular unit must deal with a certain number of cases each year. This argument is often used as justification for the centralisation of units. However, such guidelines often provide an exception for hospitals in rural communities since they are unable to attract a sufficient number of patients. The recent Welsh NHS Confederation-sponsored Marcus Longley report on number of different specialties accepts, in relation to paediatric units for instance, that professional guidance from the royal colleges and child health standards recommend that small paediatric units admitting fewer than 1,800 children each year should not continue to exist, unless they are geographically isolated. Hence our amendment 4 today.

Finally, I wish to refer to amendment 2, which calls on the Welsh Government to have an

‘aim of ensuring an adequate level of staffing for all parts of Wales’.

5.00 p.m.

I was pleased that the Minister agreed earlier this afternoon to press health boards to release their risk registers. I want the Minister to require the release of these risk registers before consultation on NHS reconfiguration begins. However, I have already seen some of these risk registers, and where I have seen high risk identified it has often been as a consequence of a lack of adequate and appropriate staffing cover. There are many short-term staffing pressures in the NHS. Some are a result of an inability to recruit, and some are a result of a lack of funds to recruit or a recruitment freeze. However, we also need to plan our workforce for the NHS in the long term. The British Medical Association this week in Bournemouth passed an interesting motion, specifying that it wants the Welsh Government specifically to ensure that it is local population need and not the availability or otherwise of junior doctors that decides the configuration of local services. The BMA is right in this respect in that we do not want to see local health boards using deanery-led training reconfiguration to

diogelwch clinigol y colegau brenhinol yn nodi bod rhaid i uned benodol ddelio â nifer penodol o achosion bob blwyddyn er mwyn cynnal gwasanaeth diogel. Defnyddir y ddadl hon yn aml i gyfiawnhau canoli unedau. Fodd bynnag, bydd canllawiau o'r fath yn aml yn eithrio ysbytai mewn cymunedau gwledig gan nad ydynt yn gallu denu nifer digonol o gleifion. Mae'r adroddiad diweddar gan Marcus Longley a noddwyd gan Gonffederasiwn GIG Cymru sy'n ymdrin â nifer o arbenigaethau gwahanol yn derbyn, mewn cysylltiad ag unedau pediatrig er enghraifft, fod canllawiau proffesiynol gan y colegau brenhinol ac mewn safonau iechyd plant yn argymhell na ddylai unedau pediatrig bach barhau os ydynt yn derbyn llai na 1,800 o blant y flwyddyn, oni bai eu bod mewn ardal anghysbell. Dyma ein rheswm dros gynnig gwelliant 4 heddiw.

Yn olaf, rwyf am gyfeirio at welliant 2, sy'n galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i fabwysiadu'r

‘nod o sicrhau bod yna lefelau staffio digonol ym mhob rhan o Gymru’.

Roeddwn yn falch bod y Gweinidog wedi cytuno'n gynharach y prynhawn yma i bwysu ar y byrddau iechyd i gyhoeddi eu cofrestrau risgiau. Rwyf am i'r Gweinidog fynnu bod y cofrestrau risgiau hyn yn cael eu cyhoeddi cyn dechrau'r ymgynghori ar ad-drefnu'r GIG. Fodd bynnag, rwyf eisoes wedi gweld rhai o'r cofrestrau risgiau hyn, a lle'r wyf wedi gweld bod risg uchel wedi'i bennu, mae hynny'n ganlyniad yn aml i ddiffyg staffio digonol a phriodol. Mae nifer o bwysau staffio tymor byr yn y GIG. Mae rhai'n ganlyniad i anallu i recriwtio, a rhai'n ganlyniad i ddiffyg cyllid i recriwtio neu rewi recriwtio. Fodd bynnag, mae angen hefyd inni gynllunio ein gweithlu ar gyfer y GIG yn y tymor hir. Gwnaeth Cymdeithas Feddygol Prydain basio cynnig diddorol yr wythnos hon yn Bournemouth, yn nodi ei bod yn dymuno i Lywodraeth Cymru sicrhau'n benodol mai anghenion y boblogaeth leol ac nid argaeledd neu ddiffyg argaeledd meddygon iau a fydd yn penderfynu'r ffordd o drefnu gwasanaethau lleol. Mae'r gymdeithas yn gywir yn hyn o beth gan nad

justify the downgrading of local services.

What I want to see is that, first, you decide on the configuration of your NHS locally and then you recruit, train and plan your workforce to deliver that service and not the other way around.

William Graham: The Welsh Conservatives believe in local health services for local people. Patients should not have to travel further for life-saving care. Therefore, we oppose plans to downgrade hospitals and reject any proposals to cut accident and emergency departments and maternity services. The Welsh Government has stated that forthcoming changes are financially driven. 'Together for Health' states that

'there will be slower funding growth in the future. This means the NHS must use every penny even more carefully than now and will demand careful housekeeping...and sometimes significant service change.'

This change comes in the guise of cuts to the health budget of £534 million in real terms over the next three years. Despite repeated assurances from the Welsh Government that services will not be downgraded, campaigners were here today demonstrating against proposals to downgrade services at Withybush hospital, and campaigners protested outside that hospital on 29 March calling for orthopaedic and accident and emergency services to be safeguarded. More than 1,000 people attended public meetings as part of a listening and engagement exercise. The Save Withybush Action Team and its chairman, Dr Chris Overton, said that it is frankly disgusting that they are trying to move autopsy and cellular pathology on the quiet. SWAT always said that there was never really a plan for any real meaningful consultation, engagement or listening. It issued a paper in response to the lack of real consultation at health board level in west Wales.

ydym am weld byrddau iechyd lleol yn cyfiawnhau israddio gwasanaethau lleol ar sail yr ad-drefnu ar hyfforddiant o dan arweiniad y ddeoniaeth.

Yr hyn yr wyf am weld yw, yn gyntaf, penderfynu ynghylch ad-drefnu'r GIG yn lleol ac wedyn recriwtio, hyfforddi a chynllunio'r gweithlu i gyflenwi'r gwasanaeth hwnnw ac nid fel arall.

William Graham: Mae'r Ceidwadwyr Cymreig yn credu mewn gwasanaethau iechyd lleol i bobl leol. Ni ddylai cleifion orfod teithio'n bellach i gael gofal sy'n achub bywyd. Felly, rydym yn gwrthwynebu cynlluniau i israddio ysbytai ac yn gwrthod unrhyw gynigion i dorri adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys a gwasanaethau mamolaeth. Mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi datgan bod ysgogiad ariannol i newidiadau sydd yn yr arfaeth. Mae 'Law yn Llaw at Iechyd' yn datgan y bydd

'twf mewn cyllid yn arafach o hyn allan yn y dyfodol. Mae hyn yn golygu bod yn rhaid i'r GIG ddefnyddio pob ceiniog hyd yn oed yn fwy gofalus nag y mae ar hyn o bryd. Bydd hynny'n galw am gynnal a chadw gofalus...ac weithiau am newid gwasanaethau'n sylweddol.'

Bydd y newid hwn ar ffurf toriadau yn y gyllideb iechyd o £534 miliwn mewn termau real yn ystod y tair blynedd nesaf. Er bod Llywodraeth Cymru wedi ein sicrhau droeon na chaiff gwasanaethau eu hisraddio, roedd ymgyrchwyr yma heddiw'n gwrthdystio yn erbyn cynigion i israddio gwasanaethau yn ysbyty Llwynhelyg, a gwrthdystiodd ymgyrchwyr y tu allan i'r ysbyty hwnnw ar 29 Mawrth gan alw am ddiogelu gwasanaethau damweiniau ac achosion brys a gwasanaethau orthopedig. Daeth mwy na 1,000 o bobl i gyfarfodydd cyhoeddus a oedd yn rhan o ymgyrch gwranddo ac ymgysylltu. Dywedodd Tîm Gweithredu Achub Llwynhelyg a'i gadeirydd, Dr Chris Overton, ei bod yn warthus eu bod yn ceisio symud gwasanaethau awtopsi a phatholeg gellog yn y dirgel. Mae Tîm Gweithredu Achub Llwynhelyg wedi dweud erioed nad oedd byth fwriad i gynnal unrhyw ymgynghori, ymgysylltu neu wrando ystyrlon. Cyhoeddodd bapur mewn ymateb i'r diffyg

ymgyngori dilys ar lefel y bwrdd iechyd yng ngorllewin Cymru.

I wish to draw Members' attention to the issue of the critical care centre scheduled to be built in Torfaen. Already several years in the planning, the development has been slowed by the economic downturn, and it still requires approval by the Welsh Government through the business case process. While it remains the centrepiece of a long-term programme for modernising health services in Gwent, the Welsh Government needs to assure the public that it will not simply be a case of robbing Peter to pay Paul with regard to future regrouping of service provision in the South Wales East area.

Dymunaf dynnu sylw Aelodau at fater y ganolfan gofal critigol sydd wedi'i hamserlennu i'w hadeiladu yn Nhor-faen. Er ei bod yn yr arfaeth ers nifer o flynyddoedd, mae'r datblygiad wedi'i arafu oherwydd y dirywiad economaidd, ac mae angen ei gymeradwyo o hyd gan Lywodraeth Cymru drwy broses yr achos busnes. Er ei bod yn gonglfaen o hyd mewn rhaglen hirdymor i foderneiddio gwasanaethau iechyd yng Ngwent, mae angen i Lywodraeth Cymru sicrhau'r cyhoedd na fydd hyn yn enghraifft o ddwyn o'r naill law i dalu'r llall wrth ailgrwpio gwasanaethau yn ardal Dwyrain De Cymru yn y dyfodol.

BMA Cymru has repeatedly warned over recent years that patient safety and the viability of services could be at risk unless the shortage of doctors in Welsh hospitals was urgently addressed. There are 164 vacancies for junior doctors in A&E departments, and there are currently more than 200 vacancies generally. Hywel Dda Local Health Board had 62 vacant posts in July and made the comment that we are facing unprecedented levels of a lack of middle grade and junior doctors right across Wales. The Welsh NHS spent £41 million on locum doctors in 2010-11 and Hywel Dda health board spent £5.5 million, a rise of nearly 50% on the year before. There were more than 300 locums working in Cardiff and the Vale, Carmarthenshire, Pembrokeshire and Ceredigion in August last year. The Welsh deanery has also recruited junior doctors from abroad to try to fill the vacancies; 51 doctors from India came to work in Wales on a two-year contract. Cwm Taf Local Health Board hired 11 doctors from Dubai, and more than 40% of doctors working in Welsh hospitals are from overseas. Clearly, more needs to be done to encourage indigenous talent.

Mae BMA Cymru wedi rhybuddio droeon yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf y gallai diogelwch cleifion a hyfywedd gwasanaethau gael eu peryglu os na roddir sylw ar frys i'r prinder meddygon yn ysbytai Cymru. Mae 164 o swyddi gwag i feddygon iau mewn adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys, ac mae mwy na 200 o swyddi gwag ar hyn o bryd yn gyffredinol. Roedd 62 o swyddi gwag ym Mwrdd Iechyd Lleol Hywel Dda ym mis Gorffennaf a dywedodd ein bod yn wynebu'r prinder mwyaf erioed o feddygon iau a gradd ganol ledled Cymru. Gwariodd GIG Cymru £41 miliwn ar feddygon locwm yn 2010-11 a gwariodd bwrdd iechyd Hywel Dda £5.5 miliwn, bron 50 y cant yn fwy nag yn y flwyddyn flaenorol. Roedd mwy na 300 o feddygon locwm yn gweithio yng Nghaerdydd a'r Fro, sir Gaerfyrddin, sir Benfro a Cheredigion ym mis Awst y llynedd. Mae deoniaeth Cymru hefyd wedi recriwtio meddygon iau o wledydd tramor i geisio llenwi'r swyddi gwag; daeth 51 o feddygon o India i weithio yng Nghymru ar contract dwy flynedd. Cyflogodd Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Cwm Taf 11 o feddygon o Dubai, ac mae mwy na 40 y cant o'r meddygon mewn ysbytai yng Nghymru wedi dod o wledydd tramor. Mae'n amlwg bod angen gwneud mwy i feithrin doniau brodorol.

David Rees: I recognise that there is a shortage of doctors in Wales, but do you recognise that it is an issue in the whole of the UK? It is not just Wales. There are

David Rees: Rwyf yn cydnabod bod prinder meddygon yng Nghymru, ond a ydych yn cydnabod ei bod yn broblem i'r DU gyfan? Nid yng Nghymru'n unig y mae hyn. Mae

problems in the health service across the UK in trying to recruit doctors.

William Graham: I accept the point that you make, but this is the debate where we question the Welsh Government. It does not seem to be doing enough, and that is the thrust of our argument today.

With the critical care centre on the horizon, vacancies are a major issue in Gwent. The Aneurin Bevan Local Health Board's medical director, Grant Robinson, has highlighted that emergency care is an area of concern. He said:

'A lack of specialist paediatricians is an issue, and there will be pressure in this and other areas because doctors in their early years are not allowed to practise unsupervised. Medical trainees is an issue generally however, and there's a risk because in some specialties there are challenges in terms of finding enough, but then it can also be a quality issue.'

It seems, therefore, that quality as well as quantity needs to be addressed.

Six of Wales's seven local health boards face a combined deficit of around £230 million this financial year. Cardiff and Vale University Local Health Board alone has a funding gap of £66.8 million, and Betsi Cadwaladr University Local Health Board has a funding gap of £64.6 million. Health boards will have to cope with reduced budgets in future years, with funding for the Welsh NHS to be cut. This is the greatest funding cut to the Welsh NHS since devolution, with impending downsizing, failure to attract and retain senior and junior doctors and drastic budget cuts. Clarification of the funding position for LHBs in Wales must be a priority, and we hope to hear that from the Minister today.

Kirsty Williams: I will begin by stating that the Welsh Liberal Democrats will support the motion today and the Plaid Cymru amendments. The Minister for health must recognise that there is public concern, distrust

problemau yn y gwasanaeth iechyd ledled y DU o ran ceisio recriwtio meddygon.

William Graham: Rwyf yn derbyn y pwynt yr ydych yn ei wneud, ond hon yw'r ddadl lle'r ydym yn holi Llywodraeth Cymru. Nid yw'n ymddangos ei bod yn gwneud digon, a dyna fyrdwn ein dadl heddiw.

Gan fod y ganolfan gofal critigol ar y gorwel, mae swyddi gwag yn fater sy'n peri pryder mawr yng Ngwent. Mae cyfarwyddwr meddygol Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Aneurin Bevan, Grant Robinson, wedi nodi bod gofal brys yn destun pryder. Dywedodd:

Mae prinder pediatregwyr arbenigol yn fater sy'n peri pryder, a bydd pwysau yn yr ardal hon ac mewn ardaloedd eraill am nad yw meddygon yn eu blynyddoedd cynnar yn cael ymarfer heb oruchwyliaeth. Mae meddygon o dan hyfforddiant yn fater sy'n peri pryder yn gyffredinol, fodd bynnag, ac mae perygl yn codi oherwydd, mewn rhai arbenigaethau, mae heriau o ran dod o hyd i ddigon ohonynt, ac wedyn gall ansawdd fod yn ystyriaeth hefyd.

Mae'n ymddangos, felly, fod angen rhoi sylw i ansawdd yn ogystal â niferoedd.

Mae chwech o'r saith bwrdd iechyd lleol yng Nghymru'n wynebu diffyg o £230 miliwn gyda'i gilydd yn y flwyddyn ariannol hon. Mae bwlch ariannu o £66.8 miliwn gan Fwrdd Iechyd Lleol Prifysgol Caerdydd a'r Fro yn unig, a bwlch ariannu o £64.6 miliwn gan Fwrdd Iechyd Lleol Prifysgol Betsi Cadwaladr. Bydd yn rhaid i fyrdau iechyd ymdopi â chyllidebau llai yn y blynyddoedd i ddod, gan fod cyllid GIG Cymru i'w dorri. Dyma'r toriad mwyaf yng nghyllid GIG Cymru ers dyfodiad datganoli, gyda bygythiad i gwtogi gwasanaethau, methiant i ddenu a chadw meddygon iau a h^yn a thoriadau sylweddol mewn cyllidebau. Rhaid rhoi blaenoriaeth i egluro'r sefyllfa ariannu i BILlau yng Nghymru, ac rydym yn gobeithio clywed hynny gan y Gweinidog heddiw.

Kirsty Williams: Dechreuaf drwy ddatgan y bydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn cefnogi'r cynnig heddiw yn ogystal â gwelliannau Plaid Cymru. Rhaid i'r Gweinidog iechyd gydnabod bod pryder,

and fear about potential changes to local health services in Pembrokeshire and, indeed, throughout Wales. While the Minister may argue that there are no plans to downgrade services, she has been in public life long enough to know that perception is everything. There is a widespread perception that that is what will happen to people's services.

Of course, this atmosphere of distrust has not been helped by delays in the publication of plans. Let us be clear: the need for health boards to produce these plans was initially agreed by the previous administration. We have seen a number of documents leaked to the press and then denied by their authors and delay after delay in coming forward with plans. That has done little to facilitate a debate about the future of the Welsh NHS in an atmosphere of mutual trust and understanding of the very real issues that face us as a nation.

The Welsh Liberal Democrats believe that we now need clarity and openness from the LHBs about their plans. We also need national leadership, because I have grave concerns that, as these plans are published piecemeal over the next eight to nine months, we will potentially end up with a health service that looks only at individual areas rather than a national health service that adequately covers all the people of Wales. If the Minister for health is convinced that these plans are right, and that change needs to happen, she needs to make the case for change and not just simply say that it is a matter for individual local health boards.

We also need that openness and transparency with regard to NHS finances. The bailout that never was and further subsequent details about NHS budgets released by the audit commission demonstrate that the current system is not sustainable. We have all heard, time and again, from people who have given evidence, that the money allocated to the Welsh NHS is not all spent wisely. The now infamous £1 billion being spent on the wrong

drwgdybiaeth ac ofn ymysg y cyhoedd ynghylch newidiadau posibl mewn gwasanaethau iechyd lleol yn sir Benfro ac, yn wir, ledled Cymru. Er y gallai'r Gweinidog ddadlau nad oes cynlluniau i israddio gwasanaethau, mae wedi bod yn rhan o fywyd cyhoeddus yn ddigon hir i wybod bod canfyddiadau'n hollbwysig. Mae canfyddiad cyffredinol mai hyn fydd yn digwydd i wasanaethau pobl.

Wrth gwrs, nid yw'r awyrgylch drwgdybus hwn wedi'i leddfu gan yr oedi wrth gyhoeddi cynlluniau. Gadewch inni fod yn glir: y weinyddiaeth flaenorol a gyfunodd yn wreiddiol ar yr angen i fyrddau iechyd gynhyrchu'r cynlluniau hyn. Rydym wedi gweld datgelu nifer o ddogfennau i'r wasg a'u hawduron yn gwadu eu cynnwys wedyn, ac oedi ar ben oedi wrth gyflwyno cynlluniau. Nid yw hynny wedi gwneud fawr ddim i hwyluso dadl am ddyfodol GIG Cymru wedi'i seilio ar gydymddiriedaeth a chyd-ddealltwriaeth o'r problemau gwirioneddol yr ydym yn eu hwynebu fel cenedl.

Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn credu bod arnom angen eglurder ac ymagwedd agored yn awr ar ran y BILlau ynghylch eu cynlluniau. Mae arnom angen arweiniad cenedlaethol hefyd, gan fy mod yn pryderu'n fawr, wrth i'r cynlluniau hyn gael eu cyhoeddi fesul un yn yr wyth neu naw mis nesaf, y gallem gael gwasanaeth iechyd yn y diwedd sy'n edrych ar ardaloedd penodol yn unig yn hytrach na gwasanaeth iechyd cenedlaethol sy'n darparu'n ddigonol ar gyfer holl bobl Cymru. Os yw'r Gweinidog iechyd wedi'i hargyhoeddi bod y cynlluniau hyn yn iawn, a bod angen newid, mae angen iddi gyflwyno'r ddadl o blaid newid ac nid dweud mai mater i fyrddau iechyd lleol unigol yn unig yw hwn.

Mae arnom angen ymagwedd agored a thryloyw o'r fath mewn cysylltiad â sefyllfa ariannol y GIG hefyd. Mae'r camau achub a wadwyd a'r manylion pellach a gyhoeddwyd wedyn am gyllidebau'r GIG gan y comisiwn archwilio yn dangos nad yw'r system bresennol yn gynaliadwy. Rydym i gyd wedi clywed, dro ar ôl tro, gan dystion, nad yw'r holl arian a ddyrennir i GIG Cymru yn cael ei wario'n ddoeth. Nid yw'r hanes gwarthus am

thing is not something that has gone away overnight. Now, more than ever, we need to make sure that every single penny that goes into the Welsh NHS is spent correctly.

However, of course, money is not the only pressure. Clinical governance issues cannot be ignored. Clinical standards are clinical standards, regardless of where you live; that is where I take issue with some of what Paul Davies said. My constituents, regardless of where they live, deserve the right to the same clinical standards. However, how you deliver those standards may indeed vary, depending on where you are within Wales. There are different ways of delivering services, but the standards should always be the same.

Let us be clear about the role of royal colleges, which are often used as an excuse by organisations to look to move services. They are not immune to the realities of practising medicine in rural areas and they understand that, often, some of their gold standards cannot be applied in rural areas, because there simply is not enough population to support them, and they understand that, sometimes, there has to be a compromise between issues of access and issues of gold-standard provision. Therefore, we must be clear about what the royal colleges are saying and not use them as an excuse to get rid of services in certain areas.

There are real issues with the recruitment and retention of clinical staff, starting with our junior doctors. This Government and previous ones have spent a lot of money on medical education in Wales, but the reality is that the General Medical Council service for trainee doctors both in 2010 and in 2011 in many specialties put Wales as the lowest ranking experience for junior doctors' training. These people speak to each other. Why would someone training at a medical school here want to stay here if they know that the training opportunities provided are not the best? What will the Government do to address this difficulty in providing good-quality training for our junior doctors, because that is the only way to solve our

wario £1 biliwn ar rywbeth anghywir yn rhywbeth sydd wedi'i anghofio dros nos. Yn awr, yn fwy nag erioed, mae angen inni sicrhau bod pob un geiniog a aiff at GIG Cymru yn cael ei gwario'n gywir.

Serch hynny, nid arian yw'r unig beth sy'n achosi pwysau, wrth gwrs. Ni ellir diystyru materion sy'n ymwneud â llywodraethu clinigol. Yr un yw'r safonau clinigol ymhle bynnag yr ydych yn byw; dyna lle yr anghytunaf â rhai o sylwadau Paul Davies. Mae fy etholwyr i, ymhle bynnag y maent yn byw, yn haeddu'r un safonau clinigol. Er hynny, mae'n wir y gallai'r ffordd o sicrhau'r safonau hynny amrywio o ardal i ardal yng Nghymru. Mae gwahanol ffyrdd o gyflenwi gwasanaethau, ond dylai'r safonau fod yr un fath bob amser.

Gadewch inni fod yn glir ynghylch rôl y colegau brenhinol, sy'n cael eu defnyddio'n esgus yn aml gan sefydliadau i geisio symud gwasanaethau. Nid ydynt yn anwybodus o'r agweddau ymarferol ar feddygaeth mewn ardaloedd gwledig ac maent yn deall na ellir cymhwyso rhai o'u safonau uchaf mewn ardaloedd gwledig mewn llawer achos, am nad yw'r boblogaeth yn ddigon mawr i'w cynnal, ac maent yn deall bod rhaid dal y ddysgl yn wastad weithiau rhwng yr angen am fynediad a'r angen i ddarparu gwasanaeth o'r safon uchaf. Felly, rhaid inni fod yn glir ynghylch beth y mae'r colegau brenhinol yn ei ddweud a pheidio â'u defnyddio'n esgus i gael gwared â gwasanaethau mewn ardaloedd penodol.

Mae anawsterau gwirioneddol ynghylch recriwtio a chadw staff clinigol, a meddygon iau'n fwy na dim. Mae'r Llywodraeth hon a rhai blaenorol wedi gwario'n helaeth ar addysg feddygol yng Nghymru, ond y gwir yw bod gwasanaeth y Cyngor Meddygol Cyffredinol i feddygon o dan hyfforddiant, yn 2010 ac yn 2011, mewn nifer o arbenigaethau, wedi rhoi Cymru yn y safle isaf o ran safon y profiad i feddygon iau o dan hyfforddiant. Mae'r bobl hyn yn siarad â'i gilydd. Pam y byddai rhywun sy'n cael ei hyfforddi mewn ysgol feddygol yma'n dewis aros yma pe gwyddai nad yw'r cyfleoedd hyfforddi gyda'r gorau? Beth a wnaiff y Llywodraeth i ddelio â'r anhawster hwn o ran darparu hyfforddiant o ansawdd da i'n

recruitment and retention problems?

Antoinette Sandbach: I will concentrate my contribution on points 2 and 3 of the motion and perhaps pick up where Kirsty Williams left off. As Professor Longley's recent report illustrated, north Wales has had the worst problem in recruiting doctors, and the situation is rapidly becoming a crisis. Doctors and the BMA are warning that there is a real risk that some services will collapse because of staff shortages. North Wales has the worst vacancy rate in Wales; it is almost double the national average. In effect, one in 10 positions are left unfilled, which equates to 26 consultant posts and 41 middle-grade positions that are currently unfilled. The total Welsh bill for locum doctors is more than £41 million, with £13.3 million being spent in north Wales, which is more than double any other health board in Wales. This situation is unsustainable.

The Welsh Government must commit itself to working in partnership with the deanery to make whatever changes are necessary to attract junior doctors to Wales, and to north Wales in particular. I appreciate that some steps have been taken, improving the marketing and offering accommodation to doctors, but there need to be viable rotas that provide good cover and do not leave services understaffed or without oversight from a senior colleague. There need to be opportunities for junior doctors to make it through to the consultant level and to build a career in Wales.

I appreciate that the European working time directive has made complying with clinical guidelines more difficult for health boards, but the Government must find a way to look at the rotations that the doctors are on. In a recent meeting with the BMA in north Wales, its representatives pressed me to press the Welsh Government to ensure that it works with the colleges so that there is a rotation that deals with the needs of north Wales—in other words, a rotation that includes hospitals in Liverpool and Manchester. At the moment,

meddygon iau, oherwydd dyma'r unig ffordd i ddatrys ein problemau o ran recriwtio a chadw staff?

Antoinette Sandbach: Canolbwyntiaf yn fy nghyfraniad ar bwyntiau 2 a 3 yn y cynnig a mynd ymlaen, efallai, ar yr un trywydd â Kirsty Williams. Fel y dangosodd yr adroddiad diweddar gan yr Athro Longley, yng ngogledd Cymru y cafwyd y broblem waethaf o ran recriwtio meddygon, ac mae'r sefyllfa'n prysur droi'n argyfwng. Mae meddygon a Chymdeithas Feddygol Prydain yn rhybuddio bod gwir berygl y bydd rhai gwasanaethau'n methu oherwydd prinder staff. Yn y gogledd y mae'r gyfradd waethaf o ran swyddi gwag yng Nghymru; mae bron dwywaith y cyfartaledd cenedlaethol. I bob pwrpas, mae un swydd ym mhob 10 heb ei llenwi, ac mae hyn yn cyfateb i 26 o swyddi meddygon ymgynghorol a 41 o swyddi gradd ganol sy'n wag ar hyn o bryd. Mae cyfanswm y bil am feddygon locwm yng Nghymru'n fwy na £41 miliwn, a gwarir £13.3 miliwn yn y gogledd, sy'n fwy na dwywaith cymaint ag unrhyw fwrdd iechyd arall yng Nghymru. Mae'r sefyllfa hon yn anghynaliadwy.

Rhaid i Lywodraeth Cymru ymrwymo i weithio mewn partneriaeth â'r ddeoniaeth i wneud pa newidiadau bynnag sy'n angenrheidiol i ddenu meddygon iau i Gymru, ac i'r gogledd yn benodol. Sylweddolaf fod rhai camau wedi'u cymryd, drwy farchnata'n well a chynnig llety i feddygon, ond mae angen rotâu dichonadwy sy'n sicrhau bod darpariaeth dda ac na fydd gwasanaethau heb eu staffio'n ddigonol neu heb eu goruchwyllo gan gydweithwyr uwch. Mae angen cyfleoedd i feddygon iau gyrraedd lefel y meddyg ymgynghorol a datblygu gyrfa yng Nghymru.

Sylweddolaf fod y gyfarwydddeb oriau gwaith Ewropeaidd wedi'i gwneud yn fwy anodd i fyrddau iechyd gydymffurfio â chanllawiau clinigol, ond rhaid i'r Llywodraeth ganfod ffordd i edrych ar y trefniadau ar gyfer cylchdroi meddygon. Mewn cyfarfod â Chymdeithas Feddygol Prydain yn y gogledd yn ddiweddar, pwysodd ei chynrychiolwyr arnaf i bwysu ar Lywodraeth Cymru i sicrhau ei bod yn cydweithio â'r colegau fel y ceir trefniadau cylchdroi sy'n diwallu anghenion y gogledd—hynny yw, cylchdroi sy'n

if you are training to be a doctor in Wales, you have to rotate between Cardiff, Swansea and north Wales. A more imaginative solution is called for. It is clear that, over the last 10 years and more of devolution, the Welsh Government has failed to address this problem. It has failed. There is no use constantly reconfiguring services, which does not lead to an improvement in services, because five years later there is another reconfiguration that downgrades hospitals yet again. When I first came into politics, I can remember responding to 'Designed for Life', which was the consultation that looked at exactly these types of issues at that time.

Until you deal with the training and rotation issues, you will not deal with the problems of recruitment in hospitals. I hope that the Minister and her Cabinet colleagues fully appreciate the gravity of the situation and are willing to avert what the BMA and other doctors consider a looming crisis in patient care at Welsh hospitals.

5.15 p.m.

Rebecca Evans: I am grateful to the Minister for the announcement of the £7.5 million investment in the new renal dialysis unit at Withybush hospital—I am sure that Members across the Chamber will join me in welcoming that. It is a really positive and welcome development that will have a real and tangible effect on the quality of life of dialysis patients and their families in west Wales. It is a strong sign that the Welsh Government is committed to improving services and investing in them to make them safe and sustainable, now and into the future. I am pleased that this announcement is just one part of a programme of investment and development in renal dialysis care that will take place at a number of sites across Wales to increase capacity for dialysis in response to the growth in demand.

Minister, you have made it clear that you expect health boards to consult closely and widely with communities in an open fashion

cynnwys ysbytai yn Lerpwl a Manceinion. Ar hyn o bryd, os ydych yn hyfforddi'n feddyg yng Nghymru, rhaid ichi gylchdroi rhwng Caerdydd, Abertawe a'r gogledd. Mae angen ateb mwy dyfeisgar. Mae'n amlwg bod Llywodraeth Cymru wedi methu â delio â'r broblem hon yn y 10 mlynedd a mwy ers dyfodiad datganoli. Mae wedi methu. Nid oes gwerth mewn ad-drefnu parhaus ar wasanaethau, nad yw'n arwain at wella gwasanaethau, oherwydd ymhen pum mlynedd ceir ad-drefnu arall sy'n israddio ysbytai eto byth. Pan ddeuthum i wleidyddiaeth am y tro cyntaf, rwyf yn cofio ymateb i 'Cynllun Oes', sef yr ymgynghoriad a oedd yn ymwneud â'r union un math o faterion bryd hynny.

Rhaid delio â'r materion sy'n ymwneud â hyfforddi a chylchdroi meddygon, cyn gallu delio â phroblemau recriwtio mewn ysbytai. Rwyf yn gobeithio bod y Gweinidog a'i chyd-aelodau o'r Cabinet yn llawn ddeall difrifoldeb y sefyllfa a'u bod yn barod i osgoi'r argyfwng y mae Cymdeithas Feddygol Prydain a meddygon eraill yn ei ragweld yng ngofal cleifion mewn ysbytai yng Nghymru.

Rebecca Evans: Rwyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Gweinidog am gyhoeddi'r buddsoddiad o £7.5 miliwn yn yr uned dialysis arenol newydd yn ysbyty Llwynhelyg—rwyf yn siŵr y bydd Aelodau ym mhob rhan o'r Siambr yn ymuno â mi i groesawu hynny. Mae'n ddatblygiad cadarnhaol a derbyniol iawn a gaiff effaith bendant a sylweddol ar ansawdd bywyd cleifion dialysis a'u teuluoedd yng ngorllewin Cymru. Mae'n arwydd clir o ymrwymiad Llywodraeth Cymru i wella gwasanaethau a buddsoddi ynddynt i'w gwneud yn ddiogel a chynaliadwy, yn awr ac yn y dyfodol. Rwyf yn falch bod y cyhoeddiad hwn yn un o nifer mewn rhaglen ar gyfer datblygu a buddsoddi mewn gofal dialysis arenol mewn nifer o safleoedd ledled Cymru er mwyn cynnig mwy o gyfleusterau dialysis mewn ymateb i'r galw cynyddol.

Weinidog, rydych wedi egluro eich bod yn disgwyl i fyrddau iechyd ymgynghori'n fanwl ac yn eang â chymunedau wrth iddynt

as they go about planning any changes. Now that the listening and engagement phase has come to an end in the Hywel Dda health board area, this is a good opportunity for us to pause and reflect, and to ask how satisfied you are that Hywel Dda health board has consulted closely, widely and in an open fashion. I attended a number of the public fora in the Hywel Dda health board area, and it is fair to say that they were mixed in terms of how successfully they engaged with local people and how well they were attended. The Pembroke Dock forum was one of the less well attended events, but having said that, at other events, it was standing room only. As we move into the more formal consultation phase, it will be important to explore how this kind of face-to-face engagement can be improved, to maximise the benefit of the upcoming consultation.

On a more positive note, 818 questionnaires and 500 pieces of correspondence were submitted to the listening and engagement exercise, which I think is a positive indication of public engagement in the process and a clear sign of how passionately people care about their health services. The most important thing is that people's views are genuinely listened to and that people feel that they are being listened to and that their ideas and concerns are being taken seriously.

I understand that, last week, the health board gave a presentation on emerging themes from the listening and engagement exercise to key clinicians, healthcare professionals and representatives from the community health council. I should be grateful if the Minister could update us on any discussions that she has had regarding these emerging themes and encourage the health board to share its findings more widely with stakeholders and outline how the listening and engagement exercise has shaped or changed its thinking on the way forward. For the listening and engagement exercise to be seen as legitimate and genuine, people will need to see their views, experiences, ideas and concerns responded to or reflected in the way forward.

gynllunio unrhyw newidiadau. Gan fod y cyfnod o wrando ac ymgysylltu wedi dod i ben bellach yn ardal bwrdd iechyd Hywel Dda, mae hyn yn gyfle da inni aros a meddwl, a gofyn pa mor fodlon yr ydych fod bwrdd iechyd Hywel Dda wedi ymgynghori'n fanwl, yn eang ac yn agored. Euthum i nifer o'r fforymau cyhoeddus yn ardal bwrdd iechyd Hywel Dda, a theg yw dweud eu bod yn amrywio o ran pa mor llwyddiannus yr oeddent wrth ymgysylltu â phobl leol a'r niferoedd a oedd yn bresennol. Roedd llai'n bresennol yn y fforwm yn Noc Penfro nag yn rhai o'r digwyddiadau eraill ond, wedi dweud hynny, roedd y lle dan ei sang. Wrth inni symud ymlaen at y cyfnod o ymgynghori mwy ffurfiol, bydd yn bwysig ystyried sut y gellir ymgysylltu'n well wrth gwrdd â phobl wyneb yn wyneb fel hyn, er mwyn cael y budd mwyaf o'r ymgynghori nesaf.

Ar nodyn mwy cadarnhaol, cyflwynwyd 818 o holiaduron a 500 o ohebiaethau yn yr ymarferiad gwranddo ac ymgysylltu, a chredaf fod hyn yn arwydd clir bod y cyhoedd wedi'i gynnwys yn y broses ac yn dangos pa mor bwysig iddynt yw eu gwasanaethau iechyd. Y peth pwysicaf yw bod barn pobl yn cael ei hystyried o ddifrif a bod pobl yn teimlo eu bod yn cael gwrandawriad a bod eu syniadau a'u pryderon yn cael eu cymryd o ddifrif.

Rwyf yn deall bod y bwrdd iechyd wedi rhoi cyflwyniad, yr wythnos diwethaf, ynghylch y themâu sydd wedi codi o'r ymarferiad gwranddo ac ymgysylltu i glinigwyr allweddol, gweithwyr gofal iechyd proffesiynol a chynrychiolwyr y cyngor iechyd cymuned. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallai'r Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i ni am unrhyw drafodaethau y mae wedi'u cael ynghylch y themâu hyn ac annog y bwrdd iechyd i rannu ei ganfyddiadau'n fwy eang â rhanddeiliaid a disgrifio sut y mae'r ymarferiad gwranddo ac ymgysylltu wedi newid neu ddylanwadu ar ei syniadau am y ffordd ymlaen. Er mwyn i'r ymarferiad gwranddo ac ymgysylltu gael ei weld yn ddilys a dibynadwy, bydd angen i bobl weld ymateb i'w barn, eu profiadau, eu syniadau a'u pryderon neu weld bod hynny wedi'i adlewyrchu yn y ffordd ymlaen.

Members will be aware of the demonstration outside the Senedd today, and I took the opportunity, with other Members, to speak to some of the protesters. It is more than clear how much people value Withybush hospital. I would therefore be grateful, Minister, if you could provide us with assurances today that the Welsh Government is committed fully to Withybush hospital and that there will be no downgrading of it.

Nick Ramsay: I am pleased to contribute to this debate on an emotive subject, made all the more emotive when AMs' constituents have been outside the building campaigning, and not just today, but in previous months as well. Whether it is perception or not, there is a feeling among those people that they have been, in some way, let down.

I can look forward to the end of this debate, when the Minister will respond, and anticipate the sort of comments that we are going to get back; they will include, 'You are not interested in moving forward', and, 'You don't believe that there should ever be any change in the health service'. We have heard it in previous debates and I am sure that we will hear it again. [*Interruption.*] Maybe that is not the case; maybe I have anticipated too much. Nevertheless, let us put that to rest. At the end of the day, we all accept that change happens. Change has to happen—it should be organic and controlled where possible, but it will happen. In fact, AMs such as William Graham, Mohammed Asghar and I have, in the Gwent area, supported a degree of reconfiguration and a degree of change. However, in south-east Wales, there is a certain set of issues and there was a very good Clinical Futures consultation that included members of the public, doctors, and all the necessary stakeholders, and it carried people with it. That was an example of how reconfiguration can be done.

Paul Davies spoke about the need to avoid a one-size-fits-all approach, and we all know from previous debates the problems with rural and urban areas, and making sure that there are policies for each. So, a one-size-fits-all approach simply does not work, and I do not know why, time and again, Governments come back to this—it is not just this

Bydd Aelodau'n ymwybodol o'r gwrthdystiad y tu allan i'r Senedd heddiw, a manteisiais ar y cyfle, ynghyd ag Aelodau eraill, i siarad â rhai o'r gwrthdystwyr. Mae'n amlwg iawn pa mor werthfawr yw ysbyty Llwynhelyg yng ngolwg pobl. Felly byddwn yn ddiolchgar, Weinidog, os gallech roi sicrwydd i ni heddiw fod Llywodraeth Cymru yn gwbl ymroddedig i ysbyty Llwynhelyg ac na chaiff ei israddio.

Nick Ramsay: Rwyf yn falch o gyfrannu i'r ddadl hon ar bwnc sy'n emosiynol, ac yn fwy emosiynol byth os yw etholwyr Aelodau o'r Cynulliad wedi bod y tu allan i'r adeilad yn gwrthdystio, nid yn unig heddiw, ond mewn misoedd blaenorol hefyd. Pa un a yw'n ganfyddiad neu beidio, mae'r bobl hynny'n teimlo eu bod wedi cael cam mewn rhyw ffordd.

Gallaf edrych ymlaen at ddiwedd y ddadl hon, pan fydd y Gweinidog yn ymateb, a rhagweld y math o sylwadau a gawn; rhai ohonynt fydd, 'Nid oes gennych ddi-ddordeb mewn symud ymlaen', a, 'Nid ydych yn credu y dylid cael unrhyw newid byth yn y gwasanaeth iechyd'. Rydym wedi clywed hynny mewn dadleuon blaenorol ac rwyf yn siŵr y clywn hynny eto. [*Torri ar draws.*] Efallai nad felly y bydd; efallai y caf fy siomi o'r ochr orau. Fodd bynnag, gadewch inni ei adael ar hynny. Yn y pen draw, rydym i gyd yn derbyn y bydd newid. Rhaid cael newid—dylai fod yn organig ac yn rheoledig os yw'n bosibl, ond bydd yn digwydd. Yn wir, mae Aelodau o'r Cynulliad fel William Graham, Mohammed Asghar a minnau wedi cefnogi rhywfaint o ad-drefnu a rhywfaint o newid yn ardal Gwent. Fodd bynnag, yn ne-ddwyrain Cymru, mae anawsterau penodol a chafwyd ymgynghoriad da iawn o dan adain Dyfodol Clinigol a oedd yn cynnwys aelodau o'r cyhoedd, meddygon, a'r holl randdeiliaid hanfodol, ac roedd pobl yn ei gefnogi. Roedd yn esiampl o'r ffordd y gellir ad-drefnu.

Soniodd Paul Davies am yr angen i beidio â cheisio cynnig yr un ateb i bawb, ac rydym i gyd yn gwybod o ddadleuon blaenorol am y problemau ynghylch ardaloedd gwledig a threfol, a sicrhau bod polisiau ar gyfer y ddwy. Felly, ni fydd ymgais i gynnig yr un ateb i bawb yn llwyddo, ac ni wn pam y mae Llywodraethau'n dod yn ôl at hyn dro ar ôl

Government, to be fair—and seem to think that reconfiguration is the answer. However, I have listened to some of the people who have been speaking outside, and it is clear that they are worried.

I was pleased to hear the Minister talk about upgrading in her earlier comments. I do not doubt that, in some cases, where the new services are provided, ‘upgrading’ is probably a reasonable term to use, in the sense that good services could be provided. However, what the Welsh Government is repeatedly failing to understand is the importance of locality in the delivery of services. There is absolutely no point in being able to provide an excellent service if, as was said in previous speeches, people are unable to get there. I heard what the Minister said about upgrading and I think that, partially, there were good things in that, but it is a question of balance, and I would urge the Welsh Government to make sure that it has that balance right. It seems to me that a lot of people who are concerned about these issues do not think that the balance is right at the moment. Is it for us to tell them that they are wrong? I really do not think that it is.

Today, we heard a new comment: when is a bailout not a bailout? When it is a loan. It caught us all by surprise, actually, the news of the recent Cardiff and Vale University Local Health Board loan. I believe that the amendment stands, so clearly the Minister wants to clarify that situation later, and that is all that we are calling for here. However, there is a problem with the budget. There is a significant deficit in the health board budget, which we are told is a health board responsibility, and then suddenly money is thrown at them, so that cannot be the case. There is a deficit. Going back to that issue of perception, it seems that this is unsustainable. I do not know whether that is the case or not, but I suspect that it is ultimately unsustainable. Sooner or later, the Welsh Government will have to address this. It will have to realise that, with a dwindling NHS budget—dwindling because of a policy decision that the Government took, and admittedly had a right to take, whereby it took more money than it needed to out of the

tro—ac nid y Llywodraeth hon yn unig, a bod yn deg—a thybio mai ad-drefnu yw’r ateb. Fodd bynnag, rwyf wedi gwrandao ar rai o’r bobl sydd wedi siarad y tu allan, ac mae’n amlwg eu bod yn poeni.

Roeddwn yn falch o glywed y Gweinidog yn sôn am uwchraddio yn ei sylwadau cynharach. Nid wyf yn amau, mewn rhai achosion, lle y darperir y gwasanaethau newydd, nad yw ‘uwchraddio’ yn air rhesymol, yn ôl pob tebyg, yn yr ystyr y gellid darparu gwasanaethau da. Fodd bynnag, yr hyn y mae Llywodraeth Cymru’n methu â’i ddeall dro ar ôl tro yw pwysigrwydd yr ardal leol wrth gyflenwi gwasanaethau. Nid oes diben o gwbl mewn darparu gwasanaeth rhagorol os nad yw pobl yn gallu ei gyrraedd, fel y dywedwyd mewn areithiau blaenorol. Clywais sylwadau’r Gweinidog am uwchraddio ac rwyf yn credu bod rhai pethau da yn yr hyn a ddywedodd, ond mae’n fater o gydbwysedd, a byddwn yn annog Llywodraeth Cymru i sicrhau bod y cydbwysedd yn gywir. Mae’n ymddangos i mi fod llawer o’r bobl sy’n poeni am y materion hyn yn credu nad yw’r cydbwysedd yn gywir ar hyn o bryd. Ai ein lle ni yw dweud wrthynt eu bod yn anghywir? Nage, yn fy marn i.

Heddiw, clywsom sylw newydd: pa bryd nad yw cam achub yn gam achub? Pan yw’n fenthyciad. Nid oedd yr un ohonom wedi disgwyl y newydd am y benthyciad diweddar i Fwrdd Iechyd Lleol Prifysgol Caerdydd a’r Fro. Credaf fod y gwelliant yn sefyll, felly mae’n amlwg bod y Gweinidog am egluro’r sefyllfa honno’n ddiweddarach, a dyna’r cwbl yr ydym yn galw amdano yma. Er hynny, mae problem ynghylch y gyllideb. Mae diffyg sylweddol yng nghyllideb y bwrdd iechyd, y dywedir wrthym ei fod yn gyfrifoldeb i’r bwrdd iechyd, ac wedyn, yn fwyaf sydyn, teflir arian ato, felly rhaid nad yw hynny’n wir. Mae diffyg. A sôn am ganfyddiadau eto, nid yw’n ymddangos bod hyn yn gynaliadwy. Nid wyf yn gwybod a yw hynny’n wir neu beidio, ond yr wyf yn amau na fydd yn gynaliadwy yn y pen draw. Yn hwyr neu’n hwyrach, bydd yn rhaid i Lywodraeth Cymru ddelio â hyn. Bydd yn rhaid iddi sylweddoli, gan fod cyllideb y GIG yn lleihau—yn lleihau oherwydd penderfyniad polisi gan y Llywodraeth, ac un

NHS budget this year—these health boards are in a position that very few people in the Government seem to be willing even to acknowledge. If you are not going to acknowledge it, then you are not going to get to grips with it and deal with it.

I am pleased to hear that there is cross-party support for our motion, and I agree with many of the comments that Elin Jones made earlier. Amendments aside, if they are passed, there are still points in this motion that need to be supported. Let us reassure people, get the balance right and provide good-quality services, but let us make sure that they are accessible to the people who they are meant to serve.

Bethan Jenkins: I am glad to take part in this debate. The Minister has probably guessed that I will use this opportunity to contribute by discussing the situation at Neath Port Talbot Hospital. Of course, we can spend our time here getting into a semantic debate about what it means to downgrade services, but the people who use this particular hospital, and who come to me on a regular basis to tell me that they have been in to the hospital only to find that the service they were expecting is no longer there, and who have had to travel to hospitals in Swansea in a situation of general chaos, do not care what it is called, quite frankly, they just want treatment. It is therefore all the harder for them to understand why this relatively new, state-of-the-art building is having services shunted to older sites, and why this is happening to a flagship hospital.

Of course, I will be meeting the chief executive and the chairman of Abertawe Bro Morgannwg University Local Health Board soon, but it is worth debating what might be in the background where this particular hospital is concerned. We have to start with the eye-watering cost of the hospital, built under a PFI scheme with a capital value of £66 million, but with unitary charge payments over the life of the project that total £353.5 million. The finance alone costs close to one and a half times the value of the project. Facilities and maintenance account for a further 42% of the total cost. Given that

yr oedd ganddi hawl i'w wneud yn sicr, fel ei bod yn cymryd mwy o arian nag yr oedd arni ei angen o gyllideb y GIG eleni—fod y byrddau iechyd hyn mewn sefyllfa nad yw llawer yn y Llywodraeth yn barod i'w chydabod hyd yn oed, yn ôl pob golwg. Os na fyddwch yn ei chydabod, ni fyddwch yn mynd i'r afael â hi.

Rwyf yn falch o glywed bod cefnogaeth drawsbleidiol i'n cynnig, a chytunaf â nifer o'r sylwadau a wnaeth Elin Jones yn gynharach. Ar wahân i'r gwelliannau, os cânt eu pasio, mae pwyntiau yn y cynnig hwn y mae angen eu cefnogi o hyd. Gadewch inni dawelu meddwl pobl, sicrhau'r cydbwysedd cywir a darparu gwasanaethau o ansawdd da, ond gadewch inni sicrhau eu bod yn hygyrch i'r bobl y maent i fod i'w gwasanaethu.

Bethan Jenkins: Rwyf yn falch o gymryd rhan yn y ddadl hon. Mae'n debyg bod y Gweinidog wedi rhagweld y byddaf yn manteisio ar y cyfle hwn i drafod y sefyllfa yn Ysbyty Castell-nedd Port Talbot. Wrth gwrs, gallem dreulio ein hamser yma'n dadlau ynghylch union ystyr israddio gwasanaethau, ond, a dweud y gwir, nid yw hynny o bwys i'r bobl sy'n defnyddio'r ysbyty hwn, ac yn dod ataf yn gyson i ddweud iddynt fod yn yr ysbyty a darganfod nad yw'r gwasanaeth yr oeddent yn ei geisio ar gael yno bellach, ac sydd wedi gorfod teithio i ysbytai yn Abertawe wedi drysu'n lân: y cwbl y mae arnynt ei angen yw triniaeth. Felly mae'n fwy anodd byth iddynt ddeall pam y mae gwasanaethau'n cael eu symud o'r adeilad rhagorol a chymharol newydd hwn i safleoedd hŷn, a pham y mae hyn yn digwydd yn un o'n prif ysbytai.

Wrth gwrs, byddaf yn cwrdd cyn hir â phrif weithredwr a chadeirydd Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Prifysgol Abertawe Bro Morgannwg, ond mae'n werth trafod cyd-destun posibl yr ysbyty hwn. Rhaid inni edrych yn gyntaf ar y crocbris a godwyd am yr ysbyty, a adeiladwyd o dan gynllun menter cyllid preifat ac iddo werth cyfalaf o £66 miliwn, ond taliadau unedol sy'n dod i gyfanswm o £353.5 miliwn yn ystod oes y prosiect. Mae'r cyllid ei hun yn costio bron unwaith a hanner gwerth y prosiect. Mae costau cyfleusterau a gwaith cynnal a chadw'n ychwanegu 42 y cant at y cyfanswm. Gan fod ceisiadau

the freedom of information requests to English hospital trusts unearth such examples as £13,000 spent on installing three garden lights and £8,450 on installing a dishwasher, patients should be expected to wonder whether anything similar has happened under the PFI schemes here. I will certainly ask Abertawe Bro Morgannwg health board about the matter when I meet it, because there are real questions about how health funding is spent. If the board is struggling to fund key positions because it is bound by these kinds of commitments, then it needs to be brought out in the open and debated, with the help of—

David Rees *rose*—

Bethan Jenkins: No, I will not take an intervention; you can make your own speech, if you want to.

Another potential headache for the Welsh Government reared its head this week with the English health Secretary, Andrew Lansley, announcing plans to put three London hospitals into a form of financial administration after they ran up debts of £150 million. Here in Wales, six of our seven local health boards are predicting a combined deficit of around £230 million this financial year, and only Abertawe Bro Morgannwg health board has not provided a figure.

It was widely reported that English health trusts placed the blame for their current financial woes on the high cost of repaying PFI. Some have even said that repaying these contracts would be unsustainable. The Minister, of course, may dismiss what I say today as speculation, but here are some of the facts: constituents are almost continuously coming to me complaining about services at Neath Port Talbot Hospital; a formal admission on the part of the UHB that services are being changed both this year and beyond it; the board must pay for a hospital that is costing in excess of five times what was spent on building it; and the board is the only one in Wales not to declare whether it is running a deficit. We need transparency and we need to know whether this PFI scheme is causing problems for the board's finances and we need to see the figures to do that.

rhyddid gwybodaeth i ymddiriedolaethau ysbytai yn Lloegr wedi datgelu enghreifftiau fel gwariant o £13,000 i osod tair lamp mewn gardd ac £8,450 i osod peiriant golchi llestri, mae gan gleifion le i ofyn a yw pethau tebyg wedi digwydd o dan gynlluniau menter cyllid preifat yma. Byddaf yn sicr o holi bwrdd iechyd Abertawe Bro Morgannwg am hyn yn ein cyfarfod, gan fod cwestiynau pwysig i'w gofyn am wariant gan gyrff iechyd. Os yw'r bwrdd yn ei chael yn anodd ariannu swyddi allweddol am ei fod wedi'i rwympo gan rwymedigaethau o'r fath, mae angen datgelu hynny a'i drafod, gyda chymorth—

David Rees *a gododd*—

Bethan Jenkins: Ni dderbyniaf ymyriad; cewch wneud eich araith eich hun, os ydych yn dymuno.

Daeth rhywbeth arall i'r golwg yr wythnos hon a allai roi pen tost i Lywodraeth Cymru pan gyhoeddodd Ysgrifennydd iechyd Lloegr, Andrew Lansley, gynlluniau i roi tri ysbyty yn Llundain o dan ryw fath o weinyddiaeth ariannol wedi iddynt fynd i ddyledion o £150 miliwn. Yma yng Nghymru, mae chwech o'n saith bwrdd iechyd lleol yn rhagweld diffyg ar y cyd o tua £230 miliwn yn y flwyddyn ariannol hon, a dim ond bwrdd iechyd Abertawe Bro Morgannwg sydd heb ddarparu ffigur.

Roedd nifer o adroddiadau bod ymddiriedolaethau iechyd yn Lloegr yn rhoi'r bai am eu trafferthion ariannol presennol ar y gost uchel o ad-dalu am fentrau cyllid preifat. Mae rhai wedi dweud y byddai ad-dalu ar y contractau hyn yn anghynaliadwy hyd yn oed. Wrth gwrs, gallai'r Gweinidog wfftio'r hyn a ddywedaf heddiw a dweud mai dyfalu yr wyf, ond dyma rai o'r ffeithiau: mae etholwyr yn dod ataf yn gyson bron gan gwyno am wasanaethau yn Ysbyty Castell-nedd Port Talbot; cyfaddefiad ffurfiol gan y bwrdd iechyd prifysgol fod gwasanaethau'n cael eu newid y flwyddyn hon ac wedyn; rhaid i'r bwrdd dalu am ysbyty sy'n costio mwy na phum gwaith yr hyn a wariwyd i'w adeiladu; a'r bwrdd yw'r unig un yng Nghymru sydd heb ddatgan a oes ganddo ddiffyg. Mae arnom angen tryloywder ac mae angen inni wybod a yw'r cynllun menter

cyllid preifat hwn yn amharu ar sefyllfa ariannol y bwrdd ac mae angen inni weld y ffigurau ar gyfer hynny.

At present, the figures that the Welsh Government presents to this Assembly as part of its budget scrutiny are woefully inadequate. While this Minister may say that it is a matter for the board—and I will, of course, be making those points to the board—the Welsh Government is administering the public finances for it. It must, therefore, play a part in ensuring that the PFI scheme is not a disaster waiting to happen for health services in Neath Port Talbot.

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Lesley Griffiths): I thank Members for their contributions. I would also like to comment on the very poor quality of the motion tabled by the Conservatives. The people of Wales rightly expect better from the official opposition than this unfocused, patchwork of political gripes. That said, as always, I intend to be positive, and I will be supporting points 2 and 4 of the motion.

Andrew R.T. Davies *rose*—

Lesley Griffiths: No, I will not take an intervention; I have only just started. [*Laughter.*]

Junior doctors and NHS financial sustainability are matters of importance to the Government and are central to my drive for improved services. The drafting of points 1 and 3 demonstrate a complete misunderstanding of the policy context. For that reason, I will be opposing these points and welcome the Government amendments to delete them.

Point 1 of the motion talks of the strength of feeling against service changes at Withybush hospital. Let me repeat once again, for the record, that I of course understand how strongly people feel about their local hospital services and can assure everyone that no district general hospital in Wales will be closed, nor will their services be downgraded, under this Government. I also say to William Graham that 90% of all health contacts in

Ar hyn o bryd, mae'r ffigurau y mae Llywodraeth Cymru'n eu cyflwyno i'r Cynulliad hwn er mwyn craffu ar ei chyllideb yn druenus o annigonol. Er y gallai'r Gweinidog hwn ddweud bod hyn yn fater i'r bwrdd—a byddaf yn cyfleu'r pwyntiau hynny i'r bwrdd, wrth gwrs—Llywodraeth Cymru sy'n gweinyddu'r cyllid cyhoeddus ar ei gyfer. Felly, rhaid iddi chwarae rhan wrth sicrhau na fydd y cynllun menter cyllid preifat yn achosi trychineb i wasanaethau iechyd yng Nghastell-nedd Port Talbot.

Y Gweinidog Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Lesley Griffiths): Diolchaf i Aelodau am eu cyfraniadau. Hoffwn wneud sylw hefyd am ansawdd gwael iawn y cynnig sydd wedi'i gyflwyno gan y Ceidwadwyr. Mae pobl Cymru'n haeddu gwell gan yr wrthblaid swyddogol na'r clytwaith annelwig hwn o gwynion gwleidyddol. Wedi dweud hynny, rwyf yn bwriadu bod yn gadarnhaol, fel y byddaf bob amser, a byddaf yn cefnogi pwyntiau 2 a 4 yn y cynnig.

Andrew R.T. Davies *a gododd*—

Lesley Griffiths: Ni dderbyniaf ymyriad; rwyf newydd ddechrau. [*Chwerthin.*]

Mae meddygon iau a chynaliadwyedd ariannol y GIG yn faterion o bwys i'r Llywodraeth ac yn allweddol i'm hymdrech i wella gwasanaethau. Mae'r drafftio ar bwyntiau 1 a 3 yn dangos camddealltwriaeth llwyr o'r cyd-destun polisi. Oherwydd hynny, byddaf yn gwrthwynebu'r pwyntiau hyn ac yn croesawu gwelliannau'r Llywodraeth i'w dileu.

Mae pwynt 1 yn y cynnig yn sôn am gryfder y teimlad yn erbyn newid gwasanaethau yn ysbyty Llwynhelyg. Gadewch imi ddweud unwaith eto, er mwyn bod yn glir, fy mod yn deall, wrth gwrs, pa mor gryf yw teimladau pobl am y gwasanaethau yn eu hysbyty lleol a gallaf sicrhau pawb na chaer yr un ysbyty cyffredinol dosbarth yng Nghymru, ac na chaiff eu gwasanaethau eu hisraddio, o dan y Llywodraeth hon. Dywedaf hefyd wrth

Wales are in a primary care setting, not in hospitals. Hospitals do not equate to the NHS in Wales. Kirsty Williams is right to say that public perception is important and I hope that I have addressed that now.

Only yesterday, I announced £7.5 million funding from the Welsh Government for a major upgrade at Withybush hospital, which will pay for a 21-station renal dialysis unit. I am sorry that Paul Davies feels that that is a bit suspect given the timing. I thought that you would have been aware, as we have many discussions, that that decision was imminent. So, I am afraid that I will also call you cynical in relation to your comments about Hywel Dda starting its formal consultation on 6 August. It will be a 12-week consultation—August, September and October—and I do not think that anyone takes a three-month holiday.

Our job is to ensure safe, high-quality services and to place them on a sustainable footing. For that reason, the Government has tabled an amendment to delete point 1 of the motion.

Turning to point 2 of the motion, the deanery was recently assessed by the General Medical Council. The GMC confirmed that, overall, the deanery is performing well; its quality management processes are embedded and well understood by key partners, and the deanery is identifying and managing concerns appropriately. It was impressed by the efforts made by the deanery in promoting Wales as the smart choice to improve recruitment to training programmes, particularly those in more rural areas. All Members are aware of the medical recruitment campaign.

5.30 p.m.

The deanery's performance support unit provides good support for trainees in less than full-time training, which has been recognised by a national award from the

William Graham fod 90 y cant o'r holl gcontractau iechyd yng Nghymru ar gyfer lleoliadau gofal sylfaenol, nid ysbytai. Nid yw ysbytai'n gyfystyr â'r GIG yng Nghymru. Mae Kirsty Williams yn iawn wrth ddweud bod canfyddiadau'r cyhoedd yn bwysig ac rwyf yn gobeithio fy mod wedi ymateb i hynny'n awr.

Ddoe ddiwethaf, cyhoeddais y bydd Llywodraeth Cymru yn darparu £7.5 miliwn ar gyfer uwchraddiad pwysig yn ysbyty Llwynhelyg, a fydd yn talu am uned dialysis arenol ac ynddi 21 o leoedd. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf fod Paul Davies yn teimlo bod hynny braidd yn amheus oherwydd yr amseriad. Roeddwn yn meddwl y buasech yn ymwybodol bod y penderfyniad hwnnw ar fin cael ei wneud, gan ein bod yn cael llawer o drafodaethau. Felly, mae arnaf ofn y byddaf hefyd yn dweud eich bod yn sinigaidd yn eich sylwadau am y ffaith bod bwrdd iechyd Hywel Dda yn dechrau ei ymgynghoriad ffurfiol ar 6 Awst. Bydd yn ymgynghoriad 12 wythnos o hyd—mis Awst, mis Medi a mis Hydref—ac ni chredaf fod neb yn cymryd gwyliau am dri mis.

Ein gwaith ni yw sicrhau gwasanaethau diogel o ansawdd uchel a'u rhoi ar sylfaen gynaliadwy. Oherwydd hynny, mae'r Llywodraeth wedi cyflwyno gwelliant i ddileu pwynt 1 yn y cynnig.

Gan droi at bwynt 2 yn y cynnig, cafodd y ddeoniaeth ei hasesu'n ddiweddar gan y Cyngor Meddygol Cyffredinol. Cadarnhaodd y cyngor fod y ddeoniaeth yn perfformio'n dda, at ei gilydd; mae ei phrosesau rheoli ansawdd wedi ymsefydlu ac mae partneriaid allweddol yn eu deall, ac mae'r ddeoniaeth yn adnabod ac yn rheoli materion sy'n peri pryder yn briodol. Canmolodd ymdrechion y ddeoniaeth i hyrwyddo Cymru fel y dewis call er mwyn denu mwy i raglenni hyfforddi, yn enwedig y rheini mewn ardaloedd mwy gwledig. Mae'r holl Aelodau'n ymwybodol o'r ymgyrch recriwtio feddygol.

Mae uned cymorth perfformiad y ddeoniaeth yn darparu cymorth da i hyfforddeion nad ydynt mewn hyfforddiant amser llawn, ac mae hyn wedi'i gydnabod drwy ddyfarnu

Medical Women's Federation. However, I recognise that the UK-wide shortage of doctors in some specialities is causing real difficulty for a number of junior-doctor rotas across Wales. The deanery and Welsh Government will continue to work closely with health boards to mitigate any impact on patient care and the training being delivered to junior doctors.

With regard to point 3, I have said before in this Chamber that I cannot and will not allow people to be treated by services that are anything less than safe and high quality. We all have a part to play in preventing unnecessary concern and fear among our constituents. We must ensure that they are not being misled. We have a responsibility to encourage local engagement and debate, and yet some Members are fixated on the notion of hospitals being downgraded—to go back to Rebecca Evans's point, change does not mean that services will be downgraded. I expect change to show service improvement. I expect change to show better outcomes. People cannot have it both ways. The people of Wales deserve health services comparable with the best anywhere in the world. That is what I and this Government want.

We must strive to meet the guidance that the royal colleges and others provide. I will not accept a position of variable standards for Wales, let alone different parts of Wales—a point that Kirsty Williams raised. All patients have the right to expect the highest standards of safe, effective treatment. The challenge is to find innovative ways of ensuring delivery of care that best fits local circumstances. We all have to accept that we cannot have every service available in every town in Wales. It is not possible.

The Government supports point 4 of the motion, and I welcome the opportunity to clarify again the current funding position for local health boards in Wales. I took the decision, early in the last financial year, to break the cycle that the NHS had been used to in previous years of providing additional

gwobr genedlaethol gan y Ffederasiwn Menywod Meddygol. Er hynny, rwyf yn cydnabod bod prinder meddygon ledled y DU mewn rhai arbenigaethau'n achosi anawsterau gwirioneddol wrth drefnu nifer o rotâu i feddygon iau ledled Cymru. Bydd y ddeoniaeth a Llywodraeth Cymru'n parhau i gydweithio'n agos â byrddau iechyd i liniaru unrhyw effaith ar ofal cleifion a'r hyfforddiant a ddarperir i feddygon iau.

Gyda golwg ar bwynt 3, rwyf wedi dweud o'r blaen yn y Siambr hon na allaf ac na fyddaf yn caniatáu i bobl gael eu trin gan wasanaethau sydd heb fod yn gwbl ddiogel ac uchel eu hansawdd. Mae gan bob un ohonom ran i'w chwarae wrth atal pryder ac ofn diangen ymysg ein hetholwyr. Rhaid inni sicrhau na chânt eu camarwain. Mae gennym gyfrifoldeb i hyrwyddo ymgysylltu a dadlau lleol, ac eto mae gan rai Aelodau obsesiwn â'r syniad bod ysbytai'n cael eu hisraddio—gan fynd yn ôl at y pwynt a wnaeth Rebecca Evans, nid yw newid yn golygu y caiff gwasanaethau eu hisraddio. Disgwyliaf i newid arwain at welliant mewn gwasanaethau. Disgwyliaf i newid arwain at ganlyniadau gwell. Ni all pobl ei chael y ddwy ffordd. Mae pobl Cymru'n haeddu gwasanaethau iechyd sydd gyda'r gorau yn y byd. Dyna fy nymuniad i a'r Llywodraeth hon.

Rhaid inni ymdrechu i gydymffurfio â'r canllawiau sy'n cael eu darparu gan y colegau brenhinol ag eraill. Ni dderbyniaf sefyllfa lle y mae safonau amrywiadwy ar gyfer Cymru, heb sôn am wahanol rannau o Gymru—pwynt a gododd Kirsty Williams. Mae gan bob claf yr hawl i ddisgwyl y safonau uchaf o driniaeth ddiogel ac effeithiol. Yr her yw darganfod ffyrdd arloesol o gyflenwi gofal sy'n fwyaf addas i amgylchiadau lleol. Rhaid i bob un ohonom dderbyn na allwn drefnu i bob gwasanaeth fod ar gael ym mhob tref yng Nghymru. Nid yw'n bosibl.

Mae'r Llywodraeth yn cefnogi pwynt 4 yn y cynnig, ac rwyf yn croesawu'r cyfle i egluro eto beth yw sefyllfa gyllido bresennol y byrddau iechyd lleol yng Nghymru. Yn gynnar yn y flwyddyn ariannol ddiwethaf, penderfynais dorri'r cylch yr oedd y GIG wedi arfer ag ef mewn blynyddoedd

funding to cover deficits close to the year end. This historical approach had led to a culture of expectation by NHS organisations that the Government would bail them out if they failed to manage their budgets. In October, we provided NHS organisations with an additional £145 million above their initial settlements for the last financial year. The decision to provide this additional funding was based on the evidence from the health boards' initial financial plans, which identified the significant financial challenges and cost pressures that they were facing. The additional allocations, including a £12 million allocation to Cardiff and Vale University Local Health Board, were formally reported by the Welsh Government in October, and have been referred to on a number of occasions since, including in the Minister for Finance's evidence on the supplementary budget to the Finance Committee in February.

Turning to the financial position at the end of last year, after Christmas, it became clear that a small number of health boards would be marginally short of delivering the savings required to break even at the year end. Consequently, I made provision in my budget for a very limited amount of funding—£12.4 million—to enable three health boards to bring forward some of their 2012-13 allocation to meet their statutory financial targets in 2011-12.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Is it fair to say, Minister, that those three health boards were not expecting that money, and that, when you sanctioned it, it was, in effect, new money coming to them in the last quarter of the last financial year?

Lesley Griffiths: No. I will explain.

As a proportion of the total NHS budget for the year, that flexibility amounted to 0.2% of the budget. I will repeat here, as I have done on several occasions, that it was not a bailout. By requiring these organisations to repay—*[Interruption.]* If you will let me explain, by requiring these organisations to repay that

blaenorol a oedd yn golygu darparu cyllid ychwanegol i dalu am ddiffygion yn agos i ddiwedd y flwyddyn. Roedd y dull hanesyddol hwn wedi arwain at ddiwylliant lle'r oedd cyrff y GIG yn disgwyl y byddai'r Llywodraeth yn eu hachub o drafferthion os methent â rheoli eu cyllidebau. Ym mis Hydref, darparasom £145 miliwn ychwanegol i gyrff y GIG ar ben eu setliadau cychwynnol ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol ddiwethaf. Roedd y penderfyniad i ddarparu'r cyllid ychwanegol hwn wedi'i seilio ar dystiolaeth o gynlluniau ariannol cychwynnol y byrddau iechyd, a nodai'r heriau ariannol sylweddol a'r pwysau oherwydd costau yr oeddent yn eu hwynebu. Cofnodwyd y dyraniadau ychwanegol, gan gynnwys dyraniad o £12 miliwn i Fwrdd Iechyd Lleol Prifysgol Caerdydd a'r Fro, yn ffurfiol gan Lywodraeth Cymru ym mis Hydref, a chyfeiriwyd atynt ar nifer o achlysuron ers hynny, a hynny'n cynnwys cyfeiriad gan y Gweinidog Cyllid yn ei thystiolaeth ar y gyllideb atodol i'r Pwyllgor Cyllid ym mis Chwefror.

Gan droi at y sefyllfa ariannol ar ddiwedd y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, ar ôl y Nadolig, daeth yn glir y byddai nifer bach o fyrddau iechyd yn methu o ychydig â sicrhau'r arbedion a oedd yn angenrheidiol i dorri'n wastad ar ddiwedd y flwyddyn. O ganlyniad, gwneuthum ddarpariaeth yn fy nghyllideb ar gyfer swm bach iawn o gyllid—£12.4 miliwn—i alluogi tri bwrdd iechyd i ddwyn ymlaen rhywfaint o'u dyraniad ar gyfer 2012-13 i gyrraedd eu targedau ariannol statudol yn 2011-12.

Andrew R.T. Davies: A yw'n deg dweud, Weinidog, nad oedd y tri bwrdd iechyd hynny'n disgwyl yr arian hwnnw a'i fod, i bob pwrpas, pan wnaethoch ei gymeradwyo, yn arian newydd ar eu cyfer yn chwarter olaf y flwyddyn ariannol ddiwethaf?

Lesley Griffiths: Nac ydyw. Egluraf hynny.

Fel cyfran o gyfanswm cyllideb y GIG ar gyfer y flwyddyn, roedd yr hyblygrwydd hwnnw'n 0.2 y cant o'r gyllideb. Dywedaf eto yma, fel yr wyf wedi dweud ar nifer o achlysuron, nad oedd hyn yn gam achub. Drwy fynnu bod y cyrff hyn yn ad-dalu—*[Torri ar draws.]* Os gwnewch adael imi

funding this year, and by subjecting them to an external review, I have taken the necessary and proportionate—that is the important word—action to hold their senior management to account.

For the current financial year, I issued the 2012-13 revenue allocations to health boards in December. I made it clear in my letter to chairs that I hold them to account for the development and delivery of a balanced financial plan within this funding.

The figures referenced in the auditor general's reports are simply a confirmation of the statement that we made at the time of the draft budget last October that the NHS would need to find savings of about £250 million each year to meet unavoidable increases in cost.

The critical point, which the media and, sadly, some Members in this Chamber totally missed, is that, with the exception of Hywel Dda Local Health Board, all NHS organisations now have plans to deliver the required level of savings to cover these cost increases and achieve financial balance at the end of this year. I know that the Welsh Conservatives and the Welsh Liberal Democrats do not like to be reminded about the damage that the UK Government is doing to the NHS in England, but what do we see today, as Bethan Jenkins referred to, but the first English NHS trust being put into administration? The press is reporting that another 30 health trusts are in a critical condition. That is not the case in Wales and we should all—[*Interruption.*]

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order, order. I cannot hear a word that is being said, only roaring from each side of the Chamber. Please, the Minister is concluding, and I want to hear the concluding remarks.

Lesley Griffiths: Thank you, Deputy Presiding Officer. In conclusion, it is normal, prudent and sensible financial management to maintain a small level of contingency funds to safeguard against risks, and I am making

egluro, drwy fynnu bod y cyrff hyn yn addalu'r cyllid hwnnw eleni, a'u gwneud yn destun adolygiad allanol, rwyf wedi cymryd y camau angenrheidiol a chymesur—dyna'r gair pwysig—i ddal eu huwch-reolwyr yn atebol.

Ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol gyfredol, cyhoeddais y dyraniadau refeniw i'r byrddau iechyd ar gyfer 2012-13 ym mis Rhagfyr. Fe'i gwneuthum yn glir yn fy llythyr at gadeiryddion fy mod yn eu dal yn atebol am ddatblygu a darparu cynllun ariannol cytbwys o fewn y cyllid hwn.

Y cwbl yw'r ffigurau y cyfeiriwyd atynt yn adroddiad yr archwilydd cyffredinol yw cadarnhad o'r datganiad a wnaethom ar adeg y gyllideb ddrafft fis Hydref diwethaf y byddai angen i'r GIG sicrhau arbedion o tua £250 miliwn bob blwyddyn i gwrdd â chynnydd mewn costau na ellir ei osgoi.

Y pwynt hanfodol, ac un yr oedd y cyfryngau a rhai Aelodau yn y Siambr hon, gwaetha'r modd, wedi'i fethu'n llwyr yw bod holl gyrff y GIG, heblaw Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Hywel Dda, yn meddu ar gynlluniau bellach i sicrhau'r arbedion sy'n angenrheidiol i dalu am y cynnydd hwn mewn costau a mantoli'r gyllideb ar ddiwedd y flwyddyn hon. Gwnad yw'r Ceidwadwyr Cymreig a Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn hoffi cael eu hatgoffa am y drwg y mae Llywodraeth y DU yn ei wneud i'r GIG yn Lloegr, ond beth a welwn heddiw, fel y nododd Bethan Jenkins, ond yr ymddiriedolaeth GIG gyntaf yn Lloegr yn cael ei rhoi yn nwylo'r gweinyddwyr? Mae'r wasg yn dweud bod 30 o ymddiriedolaethau iechyd eraill mewn cyflwr critigol. Nid felly y mae yng Nghymru a dylem oll—[*Torri ar draws.*]

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Ni allaf glywed gair o'r hyn sy'n cael ei ddweud, dim ond rhuo o ddwy ochr y Siambr. Os gwelwch yn dda, mae'r Gweinidog yn gorffen, ac rwyf am glywed ei sylwadau terfynol.

Lesley Griffiths: Diolch ichi, Ddirprwy Lywydd. I gloi, peth doeth, synhwyrol ac arferol mewn rheolaeth ariannol yw cadw swm bach o gyllid wrth gefn i ddiogelu rhag risgiau, ac rwyf yn darparu ar gyfer hyn yn fy

provision for this within my budget for this financial year. My officials are working on a new NHS finance regime to be published later this year that will consolidate this progress and provide a framework for financial sustainability going forward as services are redesigned and improved.

Angela Burns: Minister, I would like to very quickly remind you that the Welsh Labour Government is visiting £534 million in real-terms cuts on the NHS, and that the PFI contracts that you referred to are PFI contracts that were taken out by the UK Labour Government, not the coalition Government. Nick Ramsay nailed this when he said that we are not afraid of change. We are not afraid of change. This politician is not afraid of change. If I thought that something was genuinely unsafe and was no longer sustainable or sensible to deliver in my local district general hospital, I would be very happy to tell any of my constituents, colleagues or anybody else that. I would stand up and be counted. I have done that on a number of issues when people have come to me and asked why they cannot have this or that treatment in Withybush hospital or in Glangwili. What I have a problem with—Elin Jones said this very clearly—is the fact that we are being so reactive. We need to decide what services we want in our local hospitals and then figure out how we are going to deliver them and tool up for that.

Minister, I want to bring you back to one point where you were very critical of our motion. You accused us of looking for unsafe clinical practices. That is simply not the case. As Antoinette Sandbach said, we talk to royal colleges and to doctors all the time about what we need in order to deliver safe clinical practices. I will give you one example in relation to accident and emergency provision. By the way, in relation to A&E, in the last 18 months we have been able to recruit only one consultant into Wales. That is the scale of the issue before us and the scale of the battle that we must fight to provide better services. Doctors say that all that the royal colleges are concerned with are the hyperacute cases—basically, the people who go into big, inner-

nghyllideb ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol hon. Mae fy swyddogion yn gweithio ar gyfundrefn gyllid newydd i'r GIG i'w chyhoeddi'n ddiweddarach eleni a fydd yn ategu'r cynnydd hwn ac yn darparu fframwaith ar gyfer cynaliadwyedd ariannol yn y dyfodol wrth ailddylunio a gwella gwasanaethau.

Angela Burns: Weinidog, hoffwn eich atgoffa'n fyr iawn fod Llywodraeth Lafur Cymru yn torri £534 miliwn o gyllideb y GIG mewn termau real, a bod y contractau menter cyllid preifat y cyfeiriasoch atynt yn gontractau a wnaethpwyd gan Lywodraeth Lafur y DU, nid y Llywodraeth glymblaid. Gwnaeth Nick Ramsay daro'r hoelen ar ei phen pan ddywedodd nad ydym yn ofni newid. Nid ydym yn ofni newid. Nid yw'r gwleidydd hwn yn ofni newid. Pe credwn fod rhywbeth yn wirioneddol anniogel ac nad oedd bellach yn gynaliadwy nac yn synhwyrol ei ddarparu yn yr ysbyty cyffredinol dosbarth lleol, byddwn yn fodlon iawn dweud hynny wrth bob un o'm hetholwyr, fy nghyd-Aelodau a phawb arall. Byddwn yn barod i ddangos fy ochr. Rwyf wedi gwneud hynny ar nifer o faterion wedi i bobl ddod ataf a gofyn pam na allant gael rhyw driniaeth yn ysbyty Llwynhelyg neu yn ysbyty Glangwili. Yr hyn yr wyf fi'n ei wrthwynebu—gwnaeth Elin Jones gyfleu hyn yn glir iawn—yw ein bod mor adweithiol. Mae angen inni benderfynu pa wasanaethau yr ydym am eu cael yn ein hysbytai lleol ac wedyn dod i ddeall sut y byddwn yn eu cyflenwi a pharatoi ar gyfer hynny.

Weinidog, rwyf am ddod â chi'n ôl at un pwynt lle'r oeddech yn feirniadol iawn o'n cynnig. Gwnaethoch ein cyhuddo o geisio arferion clinigol anniogel. Nid yw hynny'n wir. Fel y dywedodd Antoinette Sandbach, byddwn yn siarad yn aml â cholegau brenhinol a meddygon am yr hyn y mae arnom ei angen i sicrhau arferion clinigol diogel. Rhoddaf un enghraifft i chi mewn cysylltiad â gwasanaethau damweiniau ac achosion brys. Gyda llaw, mewn cysylltiad â gwasanaethau damweiniau ac achosion brys, yn y 18 mis diwethaf, dim ond un meddyg ymgynghorol yr ydym wedi ei ddenu i Gymru. Dyna faint y broblem sydd o'n blaen a maint y frwydr y mae'n rhaid inni ei hymyladd i ddarparu gwasanaethau gwell.

city hospitals bleeding from every orifice because they have suffered some terrible trauma. They make up 5% of all A&E cases. The remaining 95% is the ambulatory community, and they are the kind of people who drift into places such as Withybush. They do not come in in the same numbers, or, most of the time, with the same life-threatening illnesses. We are asking you—the Welsh Government—to challenge the royal colleges and talk to them about what criteria they put into place when they make these decisions. The doctors tell us that the royal colleges determine everything on the basis of the worst-case scenario, but that is simply not the reality. If you are an A&E consultant in a hospital in Liverpool, you might be one of five consultants, you would have 10 junior doctors and a host of other people working with you, and you would have 1,000 people a day coming through your doors. We simply do not get that in many of our hospitals, but that is no excuse as to why we cannot provide a really good A&E service.

Let me bring you to paediatrics in the Hywel Dda area. It is actually served pretty well. They work collectively and collegiately across the four hospitals and provide a good service. They are content with it, they are doing it very well for the patients, and the patients are content with it. However, technically, they do not meet royal college guidelines, because they do not have quite enough people in quite enough grades. Again, as we have to scrutinise you, we are asking you, Minister, to scrutinise the royal colleges, to challenge them and to ask them about this. This is not about saying let us not bother or let us give people a sub-standard service, but about saying let us work with the royal colleges to review the guidelines, to challenge them and to make sure that they are absolutely spot on. I fail to see what the problem is with that.

I will very quickly turn to funding. I know that you talked about funding, Minister, but I want to talk about a different type of funding: the funding gap that we will have a result of the £534 million shortfall in the NHS in

Dywed meddygon mai unig ddiddordeb y colegau brenhinol yw'r achosion aciwt iawn —yn y bôn, pobl sy'n cyrraedd ysbytai mawr yng nghanol dinasoedd yn gwaedu o bob agen yn eu corff am eu bod wedi cael rhyw drawma ofnadwy. Maent yn 5 y cant o'r holl achosion brys. Y 95 y cant sy'n weddill yw'r bobl grwydrol, sef y math o bobl sy'n crwydro i mewn i leoedd fel Llwynhelyg. Nid ydynt mor niferus nac yn dioddef clefydau sy'n berygl i fywyd. Rydym yn gofyn i chi—Lywodraeth Cymru—herio'r colegau brenhinol a siarad â hwy am y meini prawf a osodant wrth wneud y penderfyniadau hyn. Dywed meddygon wrthym fod y colegau brenhinol yn gwneud pob penderfyniad ar sail y senario gwaethaf posibl, ond nid honno yw'r wir sefyllfa. Os ydych yn feddyg ymgynghorol mewn adran ddamweiniau ac achosion brys yn Lerpwl, gallech fod yn un o bum meddyg ymgynghorol, a byddai 10 o feddygon iau gennych a llu o gydweithwyr eraill, a byddai 1,000 o bobl yn dod drwy'r drysau bob dydd. Ni welwn hynny mewn llawer o'n hysbytai ni, ond nid yw hynny'n esgus dros beidio â darparu gwasanaeth damweiniau ac achosion brys gwirioneddol dda.

Gadewch imi sôn wrthy ch am bediatreg yn ardal bwrdd iechyd Hywel Dda. Mae darpariaeth eithaf da. Maent yn cydweithio'n golegol rhwng y pedwar ysbyty ac yn darparu gwasanaeth da. Maent yn fodlon arno, maent yn cynnig gwasanaeth da iawn i'r cleifion, ac mae'r cleifion yn fodlon arno. Fodd bynnag, yn dechnegol, nid ydynt yn cydymffurfio â chanllawiau'r coleg brenhinol, am nad oes ganddynt ddigon o bobl mewn swyddi o radd ddigon uchel. Unwaith eto, gan fod rhaid inni'ch holi, rydym yn gofyn i chi, Weinidog, ddal y colegau brenhinol dan sylw, eu herio a'u holi am hyn. Nid yw hyn yn golygu na ddylem boeni neu y dylem gynnig gwasanaeth is-safonol ond, yn hytrach, y dylem gydweithio â'r colegau brenhinol i adolygu'r canllawiau, eu herio a sicrhau eu bod yn fanwl gywir. Ni allaf weld gwrthwynebiad i hynny.

Trof yn gyflym iawn at gyllido. Gwn eich bod wedi sôn am gyllid, Weinidog, ond rwyf am sôn am gyllid o fath gwahanol: y bwllch ariannu a gawn o ganlyniad i'r diffyg o £534 miliwn yn y GIG yng Nghymru.

Wales. I will again concentrate for a moment on A&E, because it is so easy to visualise. Minister, we need to be far more creative. We need to look at what Scotland does, for example. Scotland has A&E services and it also has a helicopter service, supported and funded by the Government, that can get someone who is in dire straits from their local hospital to a major trauma unit. Therefore, I want everyone to have another think about this motion and to support it. I thank the Liberal Democrats and Plaid Cymru for their support.

Canolbwyntiaf eto, am eiliad, ar wasanaethau damweiniau ac achosion brys, gan eu bod yn hawdd eu disgrifio. Weinidog, mae angen inni fod yn fwy creadigol o lawer. Mae angen inni edrych ar yr hyn a wneir yn yr Alban, er enghraifft. Mae gan yr Alban wasanaethau damweiniau ac achosion brys ac mae ganddi wasanaeth hofrenyddion hefyd, sy'n cael ei gynnal a'i ariannu gan y Llywodraeth, sy'n gallu mynd â rhywun sydd mewn argyfwng o'i ysbyty lleol i uned drawma fawr. Felly, rwyf am i bawb feddwl eto am y cynnig hwn a'i gefnogi. Diolchaf i'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ac i Blaid Cymru am eu cefnogaeth.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The proposal is to agree the motion without amendment. Are there any objections? I see that there are. Therefore, voting on this item will be deferred until voting time, which now follows. Before we proceed with the votes, are there three Members who wish for the bell to be rung? I see that there are not.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Y cynnig yw derbyn y cynnig heb ei ddiwygio. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Gwelaf fod. Felly, gohirir y pleidleisio ar yr eitem hon tan y cyfnod pleidleisio, sy'n dilyn yn awr. Cyn i ni fynd ymlaen at y pleidleisio, a oes tri Aelod sy'n dymuno i'r gloch gael ei chanu? Gwelaf nad oes.

*Gohiriwyd y pleidleisio tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.
Voting deferred until voting time.*

Cyfnod Pleidleisio Voting Time

*Cynnig NDM5025: O blaid 20, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 23.
Motion NDM5025: For 20, Abstain 0, Against 23.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Asghar, Mohammad
Burns, Angela
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Paul
Davies, Suzy
Finch-Saunders, Janet
George, Russell
Graham, William
Gruffydd, Llyr Huws
Isherwood, Mark
Jenkins, Bethan
Jones, Elin
Parrott, Eluned
Powell, William
Roberts, Aled
Sandbach, Antoinette
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Thomas, Simon
Whittle, Lindsay
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Antoniw, Mick
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davies, Alun
Drakeford, Mark
Evans, Rebecca
Gething, Vaughan
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hedges, Mike
Hutt, Jane
James, Julie
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Julie
Neagle, Lynne
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny

Rees, David

*Gwrthodwyd y cynnig.
Motion not agreed.*

*Gwelliant 1 i NDM5025: O blaid 23, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 20.
Amendment 1 to NDM5025: For 23, Abstain 0, Against 20.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Antoniw, Mick
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davies, Alun
Drakeford, Mark
Evans, Rebecca
Gething, Vaughan
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hedges, Mike
Hutt, Jane
James, Julie
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Julie
Neagle, Lynne
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Rees, David

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Asghar, Mohammad
Burns, Angela
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Paul
Davies, Suzy
Finch-Saunders, Janet
George, Russell
Graham, William
Gruffydd, Llyr Huws
Isherwood, Mark
Jenkins, Bethan
Jones, Elin
Parrott, Eluned
Powell, William
Roberts, Aled
Sandbach, Antoinette
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Thomas, Simon
Whittle, Lindsay
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment agreed.*

*Gwelliant 2 i NDM5025: O blaid 43, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 2 to NDM5025: For 43, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Antoniw, Mick
Asghar, Mohammad
Burns, Angela
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davies, Alun
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Paul
Davies, Suzy
Drakeford, Mark
Evans, Rebecca
Finch-Saunders, Janet
George, Russell
Gething, Vaughan
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Gruffydd, Llyr Huws

Hart, Edwina
 Hedges, Mike
 Hutt, Jane
 Isherwood, Mark
 James, Julie
 Jenkins, Bethan
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Lewis, Huw
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Julie
 Neagle, Lynne
 Parrott, Eluned
 Powell, William
 Price, Gwyn R.
 Rathbone, Jenny
 Rees, David
 Roberts, Aled
 Sandbach, Antoinette
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Thomas, Simon
 Whittle, Lindsay
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment agreed.*

*Gwelliant 3 i NDM5025: O blaid 23, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 20.
 Amendment 3 to NDM5025: For 23, Abstain 0, Against 20.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
 Antoni, Mick
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davies, Alun
 Drakeford, Mark
 Evans, Rebecca
 Gething, Vaughan
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Griffiths, Lesley
 Hart, Edwina
 Hedges, Mike
 Hutt, Jane
 James, Julie
 Jones, Carwyn
 Lewis, Huw
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Julie
 Neagle, Lynne
 Price, Gwyn R.
 Rathbone, Jenny
 Rees, David

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment agreed.*

*Cafodd gwelliant 4 ei ddad-dethol.
 Amendment 4 deselected.*

Cynnig NDM5025 fel y'i diwygiwyd:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Asghar, Mohammad
 Burns, Angela
 Davies, Andrew R.T.
 Davies, Paul
 Davies, Suzy
 Finch-Saunders, Janet
 George, Russell
 Graham, William
 Gruffydd, Llyr Huws
 Isherwood, Mark
 Jenkins, Bethan
 Jones, Elin
 Parrott, Eluned
 Powell, William
 Roberts, Aled
 Sandbach, Antoinette
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Thomas, Simon
 Whittle, Lindsay
 Williams, Kirsty

Motion NDM5025 as amended:

Cynnig bod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

To propose that the National Assembly for Wales:

1. Yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i weithio gyda Deoniaeth Cymru ac i adolygu'r arferion a ddefnyddir wrth gadw a hyfforddi meddygon iau gyda'r nod o sicrhau bod yna lefelau staffio digonol ym mhob rhan o Gymru;

1. Calls for the Welsh Government to work with the Wales Deanery and review the practices used in the retention and training of junior doctors with the aim of ensuring an adequate level of staffing for all parts of Wales;

2. Yn galw ar y Gweinidog Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol i egluro sefyllfa gyllido bresennol y Byrddau Iechyd Lleol yng Nghymru.

2. Calls on the Minister for Health and Social Services to clarify the current funding position of the LHBs in Wales.

*Cynnig NDM5025 fel y'i diwygiwyd: O blaid 43, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion NDM5025 as amended: For 43, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Antoniw, Mick
Asghar, Mohammad
Burns, Angela
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davies, Alun
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Paul
Davies, Suzy
Drakeford, Mark
Evans, Rebecca
Finch-Saunders, Janet
George, Russell
Gething, Vaughan
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Gruffydd, Llyr Huws
Hart, Edwina
Hedges, Mike
Hutt, Jane
Isherwood, Mark
James, Julie
Jenkins, Bethan
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Lewis, Huw
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Julie
Neagle, Lynne
Parrott, Eluned
Powell, William
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Rees, David
Roberts, Aled
Sandbach, Antoinette
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Thomas, Simon

Whittle, Lindsay
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig NDM5025 fel y'i diwygiwyd.
Motion NDM5025 as amended agreed.*

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The short debate scheduled for today is postponed. That concludes today's business.
Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Mae'r ddadl fer sydd wedi'i hamserlennu ar gyfer heddiw wedi'i gohirio. Daw hynny â thrafodion heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.44 p.m.
The meeting ended at 5.44 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau
Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)
Antoniw, Mick (Llafur – Labour)
Asghar, Mohammad (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Burns, Angela (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)
Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)
Davies, Alun (Llafur – Labour)
Davies, Andrew R.T. (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Davies, Byron (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Davies, Keith (Llafur – Labour)
Davies, Paul (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Davies, Suzy (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Drakeford, Mark (Llafur – Labour)
Elis-Thomas, Yr Arglwydd/Lord (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Evans, Rebecca (Llafur – Labour)
Finch-Saunders, Janet (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
George, Russell (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Gething, Vaughan (Llafur – Labour)
Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)
Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)
Griffiths, Lesley (Llafur – Labour)
Gruffydd, Llyr Huws (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)
Hedges, Mike (Llafur – Labour)
Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
James, Julie (Llafur – Labour)
Jenkins, Bethan (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)
Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)
Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)
Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)
Millar, Darren (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Morgan, Julie (Llafur – Labour)
Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)
Parrott, Eluned (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Powell, William (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Price, Gwyn R. (Llafur – Labour)
Ramsay, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)

Rathbone, Jenny (Llafur – Labour)
Rees, David (Llafur – Labour)
Roberts, Aled (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Sandbach, Antoinette (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)
Skates, Kenneth (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Thomas, Simon (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Watson, Joyce (Llafur – Labour)
Whittle, Lindsay (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)